

**CABINET RESPONSE TO THE REPORT OF THE POLICY
REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
ENTITLED 'SCRUTINY IMPACT ASSESSMENT MODEL'**

**FINANCE, MODERNISATION AND PERFORMANCE
(COUNCILLOR CHRIS WEAVER)**

AGENDA ITEM: 2

Reason for this Report

1. To set out the Cabinet's response to the report of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee, entitled 'Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model'.

Background

2. As part of its 2019/20 work programme, the Council's Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee established a Task and Finish Inquiry to review the impact of the Council's Scrutiny function to date and to develop a model to capture the benefits of scrutiny in the future.
3. On 11 March 2020, the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee resolved to agree the report of the Task and Finish Inquiry and to forward it on for consideration by the Cabinet at its earliest opportunity; however, the subsequent onset of the Covid-19 pandemic and related UK-wide lockdown meant that consideration of this report was delayed.

Issues

4. The report of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee, entitled 'Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model', was received formally by the Cabinet on 17 September 2020, which agreed that a response would be prepared within the usual timescales (i.e. two Cabinet reporting cycles).
5. The report made a total of seven recommendations and a draft response by the Cabinet to each of these recommendations is set out in **Appendix A** to this report.
6. These recommendations, and the Cabinet's response to these, will assist in improving the Council's governance arrangements by embedding a

systematic approach to responding to recommendations emerging from Scrutiny Committees. This will also strengthen the Council's position in relation to the new performance and governance requirements set out in Part 6, Chapter 1 of the Local Government and Elections (Wales) Bill.

Reason for Recommendations

7. To approve the Cabinet's response to the recommendations of the report of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee, entitled 'Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model'.

Financial Implications

8. There are no direct financial implications arising from this report, but if any additional unforeseen costs arise as a result of implementation then the funding source needs to be identified prior to implementation.

Legal Implications

9. The Wellbeing of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 requires the Council to consider how its proposed decisions will contribute towards meeting the wellbeing objectives set out in the Corporate Plan. Members must also be satisfied that proposed decisions comply with the sustainable development principle, which requires that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.
10. The Local Government and Elections (Wales) Bill, which was agreed by the Senedd on 18th November 2020, will, when it comes into force, introduce new performance and governance requirements for Councils (in Part 6, Chapter 1), involving self-assessments of performance. As noted in the body of the report (paragraph 6 above), the recommendations of this report should support compliance with the new legislative provisions as and when they come into force.
11. There are no other direct legal implications arising from the recommendations of the report.

HR Implications

12. There are no HR implications arising from this report.

Property Implications

13. There are no property implications arising from this report.

RECOMMENDATION

Cabinet is recommended to approve the draft response to the recommendations of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee report, entitled 'Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model' as set out in Appendix A to this report.

SENIOR RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	Paul Orders Chief Executive
	11 December 2020

The following appendix is attached:

Appendix A: Cabinet Response to the Recommendations of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee report, entitled 'Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model' (draft)

The following background paper has been taken into account:

[Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee report, entitled 'Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model' \(May 2020\)](#)

[Local Government and Elections \(Wales\) Bill \(as passed, 18 November 2020\)](#)

This page is intentionally left blank

APPENDIX A

Cabinet Response to the Recommendations of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee report, entitled ‘Scrutiny Impact Assessment Model’ (draft)

Recommendation	Cabinet Response	Lead Cabinet Member	Lead Officer
<p>1. That Cabinet <u>adopts this Model</u> for capturing the impact of scrutiny acknowledging that it represents early compliance with the self-assessment requirements set out in the forthcoming Local Government Election (Wales) Bill. This self-assessment has implications for each Scrutiny Committee, the Scrutiny Function, and for the Service Areas / Directorates accepting scrutiny recommendations that require implementation.</p>	<p>Accepted. The Cabinet supports the proposed implementation of the Model in order to support the self-assessment requirements of Part 6, Chapter 1 of the Local Government and Elections (Wales) Bill, which relates to the performance and governance of principal councils.</p>	<p>Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance</p>	<p>Head of Performance & Partnerships</p>
<p>2. That the <u>Scrutiny Function pilots the Model</u> developed by the committee to provide a framework and database on which a quantitative assessment of its impact on Council services can be captured and reported to Full Council annually. This pilot should be reviewed one year from implementation. In addition to the quantitative assessment a non-quantifiable</p>	<p>Accepted. This is a non-executive matter for the Council’s Scrutiny function; however, the Cabinet supports the implementation of the Model on a pilot basis for 12 months initially and would be interested in the findings of the assessment.</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>Head of Democratic Services</p>

Recommendation	Cabinet Response	Lead Cabinet Member	Lead Officer
assessment of scrutiny should add value to the overall evaluation of impact, embracing the achievements of all five scrutiny committees.			
3. An <u>extension of the governance arrangements</u> currently in place for responding to the recommendations of a scrutiny inquiry, to recommendations generated by the committee in correspondence following scrutiny of a matter at a formal committee. Cabinet is currently required to respond to scrutiny inquiry recommendations as soon as is practicable. Where a scrutiny committee is making a recommendation to a Cabinet Member, that recommendation will be stated clearly at the end of the letter. The Cabinet Member is requested to respond to the letter as a whole, and clearly indicate their response to any recommendations included as being accepted, partially accepted or rejected.	Accepted. The Cabinet welcomes the need for any recommendations arising from consideration of matters by Scrutiny Committees to be stated clearly in any correspondence from Chairs that is sent subsequently to Cabinet Members for a response.	All Cabinet Members	All Directors
4. That the Cabinet Office and Service Areas make arrangements to <u>track and report on</u>	Partially Accepted. The Cabinet believes that the responsibility for	Cabinet Member for Finance,	All Directors

Recommendation	Cabinet Response	Lead Cabinet Member	Lead Officer
<p><u>the implementation of accepted scrutiny recommendations</u>. A progress report on recommendations made via report or letter would be expected to be available for presentation to the scrutiny committee within 6 months of the report being approved by Cabinet.</p>	<p>tracking and follow-up reporting of the implementation of recommendations from Scrutiny Committees that have been accepted by the Cabinet/Cabinet Members should sit with the Council's Scrutiny function, with support where appropriate being provided by the Council's Corporate Performance team. However, the principle is accepted and the Council's performance reporting framework can support this process.</p>	<p>Modernisation & Performance</p>	
<p>5. That <u>Directors are accountable for reporting progress</u> on the implementation of accepted scrutiny recommendations.</p>	<p>Accepted. This will be integrated as part of the Council's performance reporting framework, with Directors being responsible for monitoring and reporting on progress to implement any recommendations from Scrutiny Committees that have been accepted by the Cabinet/Cabinet Members. The relevant Cabinet Member and Director would attend Scrutiny Committee meetings to report back on progress against recommendations as appropriate.</p>	<p>All Cabinet Members</p>	<p>All Directors</p>

Recommendation	Cabinet Response	Lead Cabinet Member	Lead Officer
<p>6. That service area tracking of the implementation of accepted scrutiny recommendations needs to <u>integrate with the Council's planning and performance framework</u>. This will enable recommendations to be monitored and their successful implementation evidenced.</p>	<p>Accepted. This will be integrated as part of the Council's performance reporting framework, with Directors being responsible for monitoring and reporting on progress to implement any recommendations from Scrutiny Committees that have been accepted by the Cabinet/Cabinet Members.</p>	<p>Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance</p>	<p>Head of Performance & Partnerships</p>
<p>7. That Cabinet endorse and <u>support the development and branding</u> of this model as the Cardiff Scrutiny Impact Model for potential sharing as best practice with other public bodies, and other local authorities through a variety of scrutiny networks. This would be offered when the model has been fully piloted and evaluated.</p>	<p>Accepted. This is a non-executive matter for implementation by the Council's Scrutiny function; however, the Cabinet recognises the good reputation of the Council's Scrutiny function, which has been developed in the last 20 years and the positive impact and contribution made by Scrutiny to policy development and performance management within the Council.</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>Head of Democratic Services</p>