

DRAFT MINUTES

# DRAFT MINUTES

Meeting ID	8222
Committee	Environmental Scrutiny Committee
Date	11/01/2024
Attendees	Councillor Owen Jones (Chair)
	Councillor Bob Derbyshire (Committee Member)
	Councillor Andrea Gibson (Committee Member)
	Councillor Jamie Green (Committee Member)
	Councillor John Lancaster (Committee Member)
	Councillor Helen Lloyd Jones (Committee Member)
	Councillor Jacqueline Parry (Committee Member)
	Councillor Bethan Proctor (Committee Member)
	Councillor Ashley Wood (Committee Member)
	Erica Painter (Principal Scrutiny Officer)
	Chris Kelsey (Clerk)
	Graham Porter (Clerk)
	Mandy Farnham (Notify)
	Davina Fiore (Monitor)
	Gary Jones (Monitor)
	Kate Rees (Monitor)
	Angela Holt (Notify)
	Nicola Newton (Notify)
	Naomi Tomic (Notify)
	Alison Jones (Notify)
	Jon Childs (Notify)

Item ID	500000202
Item Title	Apologies for Absence
Summary	Apologies were received from Councillor Lloyd-Jones and Shifa Shazad the Young Persons representative

Item ID	500000203
Item Title	Declarations of Interest
Summary	Councillor Owen Jones declared a personal interest in Item 4 as a non-Executive Director of Cardiff Bus.

Item ID	500000204
Item Title	Minutes
Summary	The minutes of the meeting held on 12 December 2024 were approved by the Committee as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

Item ID	500000205
Item Title	Transport for Wales - Bus Station Update
Summary	<p>RESOLVED – That the following item was confidential and exempt from publication as it contained exempt information of the description contained in paragraph 14 of Part 4 and paragraph 21 of Part 5 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 and that the public be excluded from the meeting by resolution of the Committee pursuant to Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972 during discussion of this item.</p> <p>The Committee received a confidential update on the Cardiff Bus Interchange project. Officers from Transport for Wales were invited to the meeting to provide Members with a presentation and respond to questions raised during a question and answer session.</p> <p>RESOLVED: That the Chairperson writes to Transport for Wales on behalf of the Committee to convey any comments, observations and recommendations made during the way forward.</p>

Item ID	500000206
Item Title	City Parking Plan
Summary	<p>The Committee received a report providing Members with an opportunity to consider the proposed City Parking Plan which was due to be considered by Cabinet on 18 January 2024. Members were advised that the Parking Policy 2016 was to be reviewed following the publication of the Council's Transport White Paper and national parking strategies in order to align with the needs of the city. The proposed City Parking Plan has the following objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Support the objectives of the Cardiff Transport White Paper;</li> <li>• Create new parking policies that are easily understood by all;</li> <li>• Support the parking need of residents and businesses;</li> <li>• Reorganise kerbside parking, to meet the needs of local communities;</li> <li>• Address unmanaged kerbside parking;</li> <li>• Support blue badge holders and residents parking by reducing commuter parking;</li> <li>• Focus on the climate emergency and air quality to encourage active and sustainable travel modes.</li> </ul> <p>The proposed plan was developed following a review of comparator cities, which revealed that Cardiff is an outlier in that it does not currently have a 'zonal' approach to parking. The City Parking Plan proposals for the introduction of 4 zonal Parking Management Areas covering the entire city were set out in the report.</p>

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Dan De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning and officers from the Planning, Transport and Environment Directorate to the meeting. Following a statement from the Cabinet Member, Officers were invited to deliver a presentation on the proposals.

The Chairperson opened the debate on this item. Members were invited to comment, seek clarification or raised questions on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- A Member stressed the importance of having public transport alternatives in place prior to the introduction of the Parking Plan in order to enable residents to conveniently and affordably travel around the city and the wider region. The Member considered that many commuters are using private vehicles due to the lack of a viable alternative.
- Officers were asked to explain how the Parking Plan would benefit the local economy. Members were advised that the plan would provide the capacity for a turnover of vehicles in local commercial areas which would stimulate local businesses, rather than having vehicles park on-street all day. A number of studies have been undertaken that support this view.
- A Member asked how the Parking Plan would distinguish between residents, shoppers and non-residents. The Cabinet Member stated that residents would be provided with a parking permit and visitors will be provided with a digital visitors parking permit. Non-residents would be welcome to use parking bays in commercial areas but their stays would be time limited. Enforcement would take place on non-residents for exceeding time limits. It was anticipated that these schemes will also reduce congestion from people driving around areas in search of a parking space and, consequently, improve air quality.
- A Member noted that many commuters work unsocial hours and they can only drive a private vehicle because there are no public transport alternatives available at those times. Officers stated that those commuters would have an opportunity to park in non-residential bays outside the hours of control. There are also private car parking facilities available.
- Responding to a question, Officers confirmed that Parking Management Areas would be south of the A48 and these could become parking zones in the future. Any locations outside of that area that currently have parking controls in place will retain those controls. Furthermore, residents in areas that do not currently have controls in place will still be able to request the introduction of control schemes.
- The Cabinet Members stated that there is a regional approach to expanding car club provision and an announcement regarding car clubs was anticipated in the next few weeks.

- A Member asked for further details regarding enforcement and how that would be deployed across the whole city, including the likely cost to the authority. Officers stated that any new parking zone or parking area that is being considered will be subject to a full business case and enforcement will be included within those considerations, along with traffic orders, signage, road markings and infrastructure necessary to support such schemes. The Cabinet Member reminded Members that enforcement is already currently city-wide and a recent move away from a reactive service has resulted in thousands of additional Penalty Charge Notices (PCNs) being issued. The enforcement regime is robust and the introduction of the Parking Plan will further strengthen it.
- A Member noted that there will be no loading permitted and no permits issued for the Central Parking Management Zone. Officers were asked to explain the likely effect on businesses in the area. Officers advised that there will be specific loading bays available in the Central area. Much of the area is already pedestrianised. The roads around it will retain existing disabled bays and loading bays for businesses will be maintained or introduced that will allow businesses within the area to function. No residents bays or limited waiting bays will be introduced.
- Officers confirmed that residents living in outlying wards, with few restrictions, will not see any change to the current parking controls, unless they or their ward councillors request the introduction of further parking controls measures.
- A Member advised that a current scheme operating within their ward was working well. However, resident permit bays are controlled from 0800 hours to 2200 hours but short stay bays area controlled from 0800 to 1800 hours. That effectively means that commuters from UHW in a neighbouring ward, which has parking controls, come into the Member's own ward and fill up the short stay bays in the early evening. The Member asked whether the two-hour short stay limit could be extended to 2200 hours. Officers stated that one option would be to expand the number of residents bays and reduce the number of short stay bays if that was appropriate. The zones would be reviewed and those sorts of issued would be considered as part of that review.
- A Member raised concerns regarding the electronic visitor permit system and in particular regarding the confusion elderly residents were having with the system. The Member welcomed to proposals to have a daily visitor permit replacing the hourly visitor permit and asked whether the electronic visitor permit scheme would be reviewed. Officers stated that account has been taken over the feedback received and accepted the electronic visitor permits were difficult for some people to manage and the proposal for a daily permit was proposed as a result. In special cases an annual paper permit would be possible for those meeting a defined set of criteria.

- Members noted that carers will be able to apply for permits and asked whether the consultation exercise will be used to identify other exemptions for trades people and other occupations. Officers confirmed that this will be the case.
- A Member asked whether there was an opportunity to consider the introduction of 'double red' lines on major arterial routes in the city as part of the roll out of the Parking Plan to address problematic roadside parking. Officers accepted the point and stated that 'red' routes are being considered but do not form part of the City Parking Plan.
- Members asked how the range of views from all respondents will be captured during the consultation period. Officers advised that the consultation will seek to gain the widest possible range of views from all users of parking in the city. Primarily, the parking plan is seeking to support residents in the City and reduce parking problems caused to residents by commuters. It was anticipated that commuters would be less in favour of the proposals but residents need to be able to park near where they live and be able to use local amenities. Assurances were provided that colleagues from local authorities within the wider 'travel to work' area would be provided with the means to direct their residents to the consultation.
- A Member commented that the views of students living in the city would also be useful in terms of informing any future decisions, particularly those who may need to travel to placements as a part of their studies.

RESOLVED: That the Chairperson writes to the Cabinet Member on behalf of the Committee to convey any comments, observations and recommendations made during the way forward.

Item ID	33615
Item Title	Delivery of the Recycling Strategy for Cardiff
Summary	<p>The Committee received a report providing Members with an informal update on progress and issues arising from the roll out of the Recycling Strategy for Cardiff.</p> <p>Members were advised that the Recycling Strategy for Cardiff 2021-25 was considered by this committee prior to Cabinet and Council in September 2022. The Assistant Director Street Scene – Waste provided an update in relation to the roll out of the Strategy in March 2023. A Cabinet report providing an update and the proposed next steps was scheduled in November, however this was deferred due to industrial action. The report was due to be re scheduled in January, however further industrial action was called.</p> <p>Members were asked to also note the recent announcement of the budget consultation that would take place between 8 January and 4 February 2024</p>

and which contains the following proposals on waste collection and recycling:

- Considering charging for collection of garden waste
- Considering charging for all bulky waste collections, as some are currently free; • Saving money by collecting black bin/bag waste once every three weeks instead of every fortnight
- Reduced frequency of street cleaning
- Removal of bins from residential streets, placing them in alternative locations
- Changes to the Local Action Teams that work in and around areas with high numbers of council homes.

The Chairperson invited the Assistant Director Street Scene – Waste to deliver a presentation, following which the Chairperson opened the debate on this item. Members were invited to comment, seek clarification or raised questions on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- A Member noted the criticisms from pilot areas regarding the light weight of the canvas sacks provided which can blow away after being emptied. Officers were asked what improvements have been made. The officer stated that the sacks are weighted in accordance with best practice. Similar containers are used across many local authorities and Cardiff's weighted sacks are at the higher end of the scale. Furthermore, staff will be trained regarding how those sacks are returned to households once emptied. The Committee was advised that whilst some comments have been received about the weight of these sacks, there have not been significant numbers of these.
- Members noted the graph illustrating the effectiveness of the changes to overall recycling performance which resulted in a 1.6% uplift. It was also noted that a number of wards are already exceeding recycling performance targets. A Member asked whether the additional expenditure should be used for better enforcement in those areas that are not reaching the targets instead of introducing segregated recycling across the city. The Assistant Director stated that 1.6% uplift would have a significant impact in relation to carbon reduction. Welsh Government has achieved high rates of recycling performance and the move towards a circular economy will build resilience, is more sustainable and less effected by global events, such as the war in Ukraine affecting the price of oil and gas. The 1.6% uplift represents considerable tonnage. However, enforcement and education are important. The move towards segregated recycling with improved behaviours by removing contamination from recycling and removing recycling from residual waste.
- A Member welcomed the proposal for weekly collections of Absorbent Hygiene Products (AHP). However, the member raised concerns regarding 3 weekly collections and in particular the risk that residents

may be tempted to fly tip their additional residual waste, for example from the Christmas period, rather than recycle properly or whether 3-weekly collections would exacerbate problems with vermin. The Member sought assurances that the recycling separation scheme would be rolled out across the whole city before 3-weekly residual was collections were considered. Officers recognised that there are exceptional circumstances and there were mechanisms within the strategy that would allow for reviews for large families or people with large numbers of pets. The Strategy aims to remove items that can be recycled from the residual waste stream for the majority of residents. Most materials are recyclable and there is very little that needs to be disposed of as residual waste, the exceptions being pet waste and some plastics bags or similar plastics.

- A Member asked what impact the continued industrial action was having on recycling performance. The Assistant Director stated that industrial action will always have some impact on service delivery. In terms of tonnage collected the impact is minimal but there will be times when the materials being presented, e.g. cardboard, becomes wet and therefore unsuitable for recycling. Members were advised that the delays experienced in waste collection in some wards are not related to the industrial action but are due to the large increase in the volume being presented and collected during the Christmas period.
- A Member noted that 60% of all residual waste presented in Cardiff can be recycled, but there are barriers to residents recycling their waste, such as the lack of a recycling centre in Cardiff North, as many Cardiff North residents consider that Lamby Way and Bessermer Close are too far to travel to. There was also a risk that garden waste would be presented as residual waste should the authority decide to charge for garden waste services. The Member also recounted from personal experience a 2-month delay between registering for AHP waste collection and the collections beginning. Officers were asked how residents can overcome these barriers. The Assistant Director stated that 43% of residual waste can be presented at the kerbside and collected as recycling. The officer considered that Cardiff was lucky in terms of its geographical size and the HWRCs are accessible. The location of community recycling hubs are published on the Council's website along with the materials that can be presented at them.
- A Member stated that a leaflet provided with the report stated that the roll out of segregated recycling in their ward was to commence on 20 February 2024. The Member stated that he had not previously been advised of this prior to the meeting and it was requested that information about the proposed changes be provided to members in affected wards in a more timely manner. The officer stated that information packs along with the necessary caddies and sacks would be distributed to residents between the end of January and the 20 February 2024 ahead of the commencement of the scheme.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Responding to a question regarding composite materials, where non-recyclable plastics are inter-twined with recyclable cardboard for example, the Assistant Director that manufacturers will have a responsibility for their products so if a product comes in packaging that is difficult to recycle then they will be taxed at a higher rate for that item and that additional tax revenue will be ringfenced toward supporting recycling in local authorities. It is anticipated that there will be a drive, therefore, to improve the recyclability of items and packaging being manufactured.</li> </ul> <p>RESOLVED: That the Chairperson writes to the Cabinet Member on behalf of the Committee to convey any comments, observations and recommendations made during the way forward.</p>
--	--

Item ID	500000208
Item Title	Urgent Items (if any)
Summary	No urgent items.

Item ID	500000209
Item Title	Date of next meeting
Summary	The next meeting of the Committee is scheduled to take place on 26 February 2024 at 10.00am (TBC).

Item ID	33725
Item Title	Correspondence Following the Committee Meeting
Summary	