

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 18 July 2019 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 12 July 2019.

Present: County Councillor De'Ath (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Asghar Ali, Bale, Berman, Bowden, Bowen-Thomson, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke-Davies, Carter, Cowan, Cunnah, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Ford, Gibson, Goodway, Gordon, Henshaw, Philippa Hill-John, Hinchey, Howells, Hudson, Jacobsen, Jenkins, Jones-Pritchard, Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Lancaster, Lay, Lent, Lister, Mackie, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Molik, Naughton, Owen, Parkhill, Jackie Parry, Patel, Phillips, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sandrey, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Lynda Thorne, Walker, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong and Wood

41 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillors Dilwar Ali, Elsmore, Goddard, Gordon, Gavin Hill-John, McEvoy, Linda Morgan and Keith Parry.

42 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were received in accordance with the Members Code of Conduct: -

<b>Councillor</b>	<b>Item</b>	<b>Interest</b>
All Councillors	Item 25 – Members' Schedule of Remuneration 2019-20 to be published in line with the requirements of the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales.	Personal interest as Councillors in receipt of remuneration set by the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales.
Councillor Bale	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Berman	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.

Councillor Boyle	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Cowan	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor De'Ath	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Driscoll	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Ford	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Gibson	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member in receipt of a pension from the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund
Councillor Goodway	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor P Hill-John	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Howells	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Hudson	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Jones-Pritchard	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Mackie	Item 9 Cardiff Council Statutory Well-being report 2018-19	Personal interest as family member is Head of Integrated Care.

Councillor McKerlich	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Merry	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Michael	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund.
Councillor Naughton	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Owen	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Parkhill	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Phillips	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Rees	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Robson	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Sandrey	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund
Councillor Singh	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund

Councillor Taylor	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund
Councillor Graham Thomas	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Huw Thomas	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund
Councillor Walker	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Wild	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund
Councillor Williams	Item 22 Motion 2	Personal and Prejudicial interest as a Member of the Cardiff and Vale Pension Fund. The Member left the meeting during consideration of this item.

#### 43 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 20 June 2019 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

#### 44 : CYNCOED BY-ELECTION

A warm welcome was extended to Councillor Robert Hopkins to his first meeting of the Council as the newly elected Member for the Cyncoed following the by-election on 16 July 2019. Councillor Hopkins was invited to speak.

Councillor Hopkins paid tribute to the late Councillor Wendy Congreve and her dedication to citizens of the area over many years.

Councillor Hopkins thanked the Returning Officer and his team for the effective and efficiently run election and count, and thanked all the other candidates for their courtesy and professional approach to the campaign.

Councillor Hopkins was grateful for the trust given to him by the residents of Cyncoed and the privilege to be their Councillor and an Elected Member of Cardiff Council. Councillor Hopkins underlined the importance to him of acting with integrity and respect and undertook to work hard to represent the interests of every individual in the ward as well as the interests of the citizens of Cardiff as a whole.

45 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

Public Question – *Nerys Lloyd-Pierce*

Cardiff has lost more than 34 hectares of trees in the last five years – that’s about 30 rugby pitches – and the destruction shows no sign of abating. Mature trees are irreplaceable, providing clean air, mitigating against climate change, and enhancing the health and well-being of the city’s entire population. What, therefore, is Cardiff Council doing to protect them?

Reply – *Councillor Bradbury*

I would like to reassure you that in terms of our planting programmes, on a citywide basis, the number of trees that we plant exceeds the number felled.

The Council takes its responsibilities for tree management very seriously and recognises the vital contribution that Cardiff’s tree stock makes to the health of our city.

Whilst a previous desktop study undertaken by Natural Resources Wales, referring to tree canopy loss in Cardiff from 2009 to 2013, was informative and sheds light on some very important issues, I do not agree with your assertion in terms of the size of the area of trees lost in the city.

The study had recognised limitations in that no ground-truthing was undertaken and new & replacement tree planting was not factored in.

The study also identified that this trend was common across the majority of urban areas in Wales and did not relate the tree loss to the impacts of new development, but to the loss of mature trees more generally.

Clearly, trees do have a limited life expectancy and there should be no surprise that some trees of the late Victorian and Edwardian era are coming to the end of their natural lifespan.

With this in mind, the Council is committed to ensuring the vitality and diversity of its tree stock and you will be aware of our well established Annual Replacement and New Tree Planting Programme.

In 2018/19, in the region of 250 heavy standard trees and 1,400 whips were planted throughout the Council’s land holdings, which – as I said earlier in this answer – is more than the number of felled trees across the city.

Furthermore, additional, more robust data regarding tree coverage is currently being gathered through a collaborative project involving the Welsh Government, Cardiff Council, NRW and Forestry Commission utilising i-Tree Eco, a tool that assesses and values urban forests to inform their management.

An important theme as we look ahead is for the Council to consider how to manage the transition of an ageing tree stock to a future situation with a range of appropriate species.

Such coverage can be achieved through our replanting programmes and wider land management, but also by securing new planting as part of future development proposals.

Finally, you will be happy to know that the number of trees in Council ownership is estimated to be 420,000, and the total number of trees within the city, located on both public and private land, is estimated to be 1.4 Million.

**Supplementary Question – *Nerys Lloyd-Pierce***

The UK has one of the worst rates of asthma deaths in Europe and many of these deaths are related to poor air quality, mature trees are known to improve the quality of the air we all breathe.

As the Cabinet Member responsible for tree protection, can you commit to working with your Cabinet colleagues to introduce strong Supplementary Planning Guidance to properly protect our mature trees?

**Reply – *Councillor Bradbury***

It is an important issue and I think the public question deserves a full answer.

I commit to looking into this with my Cabinet colleagues. It is important that we are improving in planting new trees. In fact, new trees planted makes the air quality better, but we also have to protect, where possible, those older trees and I will work with you and Civic Society and other groups - including the Woodland Trust and NRW - to ensure that we are making environmentally sound decisions that are at the heart of this administration's policy.

I have voted for every climate motion that has come to this Council and I expect I will for the one later on. The protection of our planet is vitally important and I thank you for your work.

**Public Question – *Mia Rees***

Last year, a person died following a collision with a vehicle on Merthyr Road, outside Ararat Baptist Church, as she stepped out to cross the road. Ararat Baptist Church is popular and runs many activities from its large and successful Centre for the Community, drawing people from all parts of the area. Many, young and old, come from the large housing area to the south of Merthyr Road, using the paths across the common and have to cross the wide and busy Merthyr Road to get to the centre. There is a refuge in the centre of the road, but it is about 40m away from the end of the path and in the opposite direction. PACT and local councillors are asking for a crossing, but the community needs improved safety at this crossing urgently.

How quickly will the council agree to the provision of a simple zebra crossing linking the paths both sides of the common and provide the necessary finance?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

Following the tragic incident at this location, officers carried out a road safety investigation responding to the concerns raised and the request for additional pedestrian crossing facilities.

The investigation considers data relating to traffic conditions and pedestrian movements at the location and other factors relating to safety.

We use a consistent method for all investigations that enables officers to assess the road safety problems against others in the city and then rank and prioritise locations for engineering measures in an objective and fair way.

In this instance, the assessment has shown that there are other locations in city, which are deemed to have more serious safety issues and are in greater need of improvements through the use of limited road safety funding.

There are existing signal controlled crossing facilities at the junction of Merthyr Road and College Road, together with two pedestrian refuge crossings.

The road safety investigation did identify that a number of improvements could be made to this section of Merthyr Road, in particular, to the cycling facilities and pedestrian access to the bus stops. We will seek to identify improvements such as this as we undertake our next phase of our INN, which is statutory walking, and cycling mapping.

Supplementary Question – *Mia Rees*

I welcome the acknowledgement on the need to improve the cycling facilities on Merthyr Road, as cycling lanes in a major city should not require a full suspension bike in order to navigate the potholes, drains and slalom weave between the parked cars - as is the case currently on Merthyr Road.

However, I am very disappointed that a citizen of our city dying is not urgent enough to make this stretch of road a priority. Just one crossing on this busy part of the city, well used by pedestrians is not good enough in my view.

Will the Cabinet Member urgently review this decision? All we are asking for is a simple zebra crossing to link a well-used green space and make an accessible area for everyone.

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

I am pleased to hear your ambition that I also share around cycling and improving cycling provision in Cardiff.

In terms of that stretch, I have asked officers to look at it. They have looked at it, and what I think people in this chamber would want to know and the public would want to know is, that we treat things fairly and objectively across the city and if there are other areas in the city that are deemed to be less safe, then these should be where priorities are - not where I get pressured by yourselves, other public or other Elected Members. It has to be done fairly and I think the public and people in this Chamber will be pleased to know that we do that properly.

46 : PETITIONS

There were no petitions for presentation to this meeting.

47 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair of Standards and Ethics, Mr Richard Tebboth

This was the last Council meeting for the Chair of Standards and Ethics, Mr Richard Tebboth as his term of office will end on 22 September 2019.

On behalf of the Council, the Lord Mayor thanked Richard for his contributions and diligent work in steering the Standards and Ethics Committee during his time in office, and for his balanced and measured approach to the ethical standards of the Council. Elected Members wished him all the very best for the future.

Mike Doel

It was with sadness that Elected Members were advised that Mike Doel formerly the Corporate Policy and Member Support Manager for both South Glamorgan County Council and Cardiff Council had passed away. Sincere sympathy was extended to his wife and close family for their sudden loss.

Lord Mayor's Charity Fund Raising

Welsh Women's Aid had advised that they have some places available for anyone wishing to join their team to run the Cardiff Half Marathon on Sunday 6 October 2019.

48 : BUDGET STRATEGY 2020/21 AND THE MEDIUM TERM

The Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance proposed the Budget Strategy 2020-2021 report agreed by Cabinet on 11 July 2019.

The report detailed Cabinet proposals to consolidate and update the Council's financial strategy in readiness for the preparation of the 2020/21 revenue and capital budgets. Included in the report was the timetable for the budget process to enable the 2020/21 budget to be considered by Council in February 2020, as well as an update in relation to the Council's financial resilience measures.

The Cabinet Member detailed the strategy assumptions to address the ongoing challenges to meet the medium term financial funding gap for 2020/21 of £25m. The strategy assumed a 0.5% reduction in cash funding from the Welsh Government, and had been predicated on established modelling that drew on a combination of a cap on growth in schools budgets - but still allowing a 4.9% cash increase for schools;

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

operating efficiency savings; ceasing non-essential services; use of earmarked reserves; and an assumption of a 4.5% rise in Council Tax to provide £6.4m of the £25m required.

Directorates had been asked to identify saving proposals to assist in addressing the gap. This was increasingly challenging for the schools and social services directorates because of demand, an increase in prices, other pressures, and requirements to fulfil statutory duties.

A further review of the Budget Strategy and the financial resilience will be undertaken to reflect emerging issues, and any adjustments required following the announcement of the Provisional Settlement in October 2019.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Huw Thomas seconded the proposal referring to the increase demands for services; increasing complex requirement to support vulnerable and citizens in need in the city, increasing prices and the continued challenge for public services to do more with less.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Strategy.

During the debate Councillor Rodney Berman proposed a Reference Back in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 25 (a) (iv) to enable the Cabinet to - firstly re-work its assumption on the analysis of the gap to move away from setting a high level of Council Tax; and secondly so that the Strategy clearly builds in the funding that will be required to progress the outcomes from the recent decision by this Council to declare a climate emergency.

The Leader of the Liberal Democrat Group, Councillor Joe Boyle seconded the reference back. Requesting that the Cabinet reshape the strategy priorities so that it included reference to Climate Change and Wellbeing of the city and its citizens with fresh and bold ideas similar to other international city regions.

A number of matters were raised during the debate in relation to: -

- consultation and engaging with young people and hard to reach community groups;
- the proposed level of Council Tax and how this is calculated;
- income generation assumptions;
- levels of borrowing and loan payments;
- the need to once again lobby Welsh Government about the formula used to allocate business rates;
- the costs of high levels of absenteeism;
- the need for efficiency savings to be achieved in year and if not then in year savings to be made.

A request was made to all Councillors to work together in bringing forward ideas and sustainable solutions, rather than rehearsing on an annual basis the same old arguments.

Following the debate the Cabinet Member responded to issues raised around the funding of Councils underlining the work achieved by Cardiff Council in transforming services with £220m savings in the last ten years.

The Strategy aims were aligned with the Corporate Plan and Wellbeing priorities for the Council that included ongoing work with all citizens on tackling climate change and working with young people in the city. The strategy for the preparation of the budget proposals was always a case of modelling all aspects of the budget and is an ongoing process. The administration would always seek to balance the rise in Council tax and keep as affordable as possible.

The Cabinet Member commended the proposals.

A vote was taken on the Reference back. The Reference back was LOST

A vote was taken on the recommendations.

The recommendations were APPROVED.

RESOLVED –That

1. the Budget Timetable Framework set out in Appendix 2 was approved and adopted, and
2. the work outlined be progressed with a view to informing budget preparation.

#### 49 : CARDIFF COUNCIL STATUTORY WELL-BEING REPORT 2018-19

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Huw Thomas presented Cardiff Council Statutory Well-being Report 2018-19 for approval by Council. The Council's annual performance report is an assessment of the progress made in the delivery of the administration's Capital Ambition priorities as expressed within the Corporate Plan 2018-21. This report ensures that the Council discharges its statutory obligation as required by the Well-Being of Future Generations Act 2015 and meets the requirement under the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2009 to publish an annual report. It also reflects on the levels of services provided and gives a qualitative and quantitative view on performance.

The report had been prepared earlier this year so that it could better reflect the outcomes from the previous monitoring year. This is only one of the tools used to measure performance and other key measurements include financial monitoring, assessment of corporate risk, the Ask Cardiff Survey and feedback from the external regulators and statutory bodies.

The core purpose and content of the report was to demonstrate progress and identify the risks and challenges going forward. The Leader thanked the Chair and Members of the Policy and Performance Scrutiny Committee for the work undertaken to provide robust and fair challenge of performance and the indicators and targets. The Leader commended the report to Council.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

The Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance seconded the report was set in the context of significant priorities and difficult budget challenges.

The Lord Mayor opened the item for debate and observations were made in relation to wellbeing objectives - tackling family poverty, providing equal access to services, social mobility, support for loneliness and the provision of dementia facilities across the city not just in the southern arc.

Members raised concerns around the delivery of waste and street cleaning services; air pollution; air quality and the effect on health, the attainment and life chances for children and young people and those in care or who are carers themselves.

The Lord Mayor invited the Leader to respond. The Leader responded to issues raised and the work being taken forward in partnership with the Local Health and Public Service Boards and highlight key areas and indicators to address inequality and provide life chances to vulnerable citizens the majority of whom lived in the most southern parts of the city.

A vote was taken on the recommendation

The vote on the recommendation was CARRIED

RESOLVED – That approved the Cardiff Council Statutory Well-being Report 2018-19.

## 50 : LOCAL AUTHORITY SOCIAL SERVICES ANNUAL REPORT 2018/19

The Cabinet Member, Children and Families, Councillor Graham Hinchey proposed [Local Authority Social Services Annual Report 2018/19](#). This is the 10<sup>th</sup> Annual Report of Local Authority Social Services and the third such report since the implementation of the Social Services and Well-Being (Wales) Act 2014 in April 2016.

The report would be submitted to the Care Inspectorate Wales (CIW). The Regulation and Inspection of Social Care (Wales) Act 2016 places the Annual Report on a statutory footing and CIW no longer produce an individual performance evaluation report for each council.

CIW do send each local authority an annual letter which provides feedback on inspection and performance evaluation activity completed by CIW during the year; reports on progress the local authority has made in implementing recommendations from inspections and/or child and adult practice reviews; and outlines their forward work programme. The 2018/19 letter acknowledges the good level of corporate support for social services in Cardiff.

The report had been prepared and finalised following engagement with social services managers and staff; senior management, Members of the Children & Young People and Community and Adult Scrutiny Committees face to face challenge sessions with young people and feedback from stakeholder organisations.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Councillor Bridgeman seconded the report.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report. Members raised issues around recruitment and retention, the impact of Brexit, delivery plans, and future challenges. The Lord Mayor invited the Cabinet Member to respond in which he thanked the Chairs of Scrutiny for the work of their Committees and advised that further details on service structure would be reported to Members in due course. Councillor Hinchey commended the report to Council.

RESOLVED – That the Local Authority’s Social Services Annual Report 2018/19 was received and noted.

51 : PUBLIC SPACE PROTECTION ORDER - DOG CONTROLS DRAFT  
ORDER

The Cabinet at its meeting on 11 July 2019, approved a draft Cardiff Public Spaces Protection (Dog Control) Order 2019, and agreed that this matter should be reported to full Council.

The Cabinet Member for Leisure and Culture, Councillor Peter Bradbury presented the report which detailed the process undertaken since the consultation in early autumn 2018 and the proposals as agreed by Cabinet to make arrangements for the introduction of the Public Spaces Protection (Dog Control) Order 2019 to

1. Prohibit dog fouling (unless it is immediately removed) in all public spaces owned and/or maintained by the Council.
2. Require a dog owner to have a means of clearing dog fouling.
3. Exclude dogs in all enclosed playgrounds and schools, which are owned and / or maintained by Cardiff Council.
4. Require dogs to be kept on a lead within all cemeteries owned and / or maintained by Cardiff Council.
5. Allow authorised officers to give a direction that a dog (s) be put and kept on a lead if necessary.
6. Introduce a fixed penalty notice charge for a breach of a Public Spaces Protection Order for dog controls, as set out above, is set at £100.

The dog controls will be exempt for persons who have a disability that affects the person’s mobility, manual dexterity, physical co-ordination or ability to lift, carry or otherwise move everyday objects, in respect of a dog trained by a registered charity and upon which the person relies for assistance.

Councillor Michael seconded the report.

Members were invited to comment on the Draft Order, which was seen as a welcomed outcome following the consultation process last autumn, which had received a wide variety of response. .

RESOLVED – That the draft Cardiff Public Spaces Protection (Dog Control) Order 2019 and the arrangements to be made for its implementation were noted and approved

52 : STANDARDS & ETHICS COMMITTEE - INDEPENDENT MEMBER RE-APPOINTMENT

The report was to inform the Council of the expiry of the term of office of one of the independent members of the Standards and Ethics Committee; and to recommend his re-appointment.

RESOLVED – That the re-appointment of Dr James Downe as an Independent Member of the Standards and Ethics Committee for a further consecutive term, expiring on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2021 was approved.

53 : ALL PARTY COUNCIL GROUP - URBAN RESILIENCE

The All Party Council Group - [Urban Resilience](#) 1<sup>st</sup> Annual Report was submitted for information. Members with any questions or comments were invited to contact the Chair of the Group, Councillor Phil Bale directly.

54 : ALL PARTY COUNCIL GROUP- CARING 4K9'S

The All Party Council Group- [Caring 4K9's](#) was submitted for information. Members with any questions or comments were invited to contact the Chair of the Group, Councillor Dilwar Ali directly.

55 : CHILDREN & YOUNG PEOPLE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2018 - 19

The Chair of Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee, Councillor Lee Bridgeman presented the Committee's [Annual Report](#) detailing the investigatory and scrutiny work undertaken by the Committee in 2018–19 for noting.

56 : COMMUNITY & ADULT SERVICES SCRUTINY COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2018 - 2019

The outgoing Chair of Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee, Councillor McGarry presented the Committee's [Annual Report](#) detailing the items covered by the Scrutiny Committee in its Work Plan for 2018-19. The report was for noting.

Members of the Committee, the Chair of the Community and Adult Scrutiny Committee, Councillor Shaun Jenkins appointed in May 2019 and lead Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities, Councillor Lynda Thorne thanked Councillor McGarry for her excellent work as Chair of the Committee over a number of years. Members were delighted that Councillor Mc Garry would remain a member of the

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Committee and contributing with her expertise and knowledge to the work of the Committee going forward.

57 : ECONOMY AND CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT  
2018 - 2019

The Chair of Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee, Councillor Nigel Howells presented the Committee's [Annual Report](#) detailing the work of the Scrutiny Committee in 2018–19 for noting.

58 : ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2018 -  
2019

The Chair of Environmental Scrutiny Committee, Councillor Ramesh Patel presented the Committee's [Annual Report](#) detailing the investigatory and scrutiny work undertaken by the Committee in 2018–19 for noting.

59 : POLICY REVIEW & PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE ANNUAL  
REPORT 2018 - 2019

The Chair of Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee, Councillor David Walker presented the Committee's [Annual Report](#) detailing the work of this overarching Scrutiny Committee in 2018–19 in particular on going work around assessing the impact and outcomes from the five Scrutiny Committees as well as working with other committee in assessing overall performance of the Council. The report was for noting.

60 : LEADER AND CABINET MEMBER STATEMENTS

The following statements were received and questions were invited from Members on matters within the statement.

1 [The Leader's Statement](#)

The Leader responded to questions on

- The key areas of collaboration discussed within the Powerhouse for the West;
- The transport infrastructure and outcomes from the Active Travel Conference
- Delivery of the Metro
- Brexit and the preparedness of the Council in case of a no deal
- The earmarking of capital sums for transport infrastructure project in light of the decision by Welsh Government not to go ahead with the M4 Relief Road, and assurances that projects will be taken forward quickly.

2 [Cabinet Member, Children & Families Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions relating to:

- Tackling Exploitation and also the need to tackle knife crime and drugs

- The Cardiff Children's Services Strategy 2019 -22;
- The launch of the Fostering Service website and marketing campaign the details of which would be circulated to all Members.

3 [Cabinet Member, Social Care, Health & Well-being Statement](#)

There were no questions on this statement.

4 [Cabinet Member, Strategic Planning & Transport Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to a number of questions on the Transport Vision and the Council's 'big ideas' including:

- A new park and Ride at junction 32 of the Ma to connect with the new Circle Train line;
- How the Cardiff Circle line will be completed and made into dual track;
- Rapid Bus Transport Network and integration schemes
- The routing of the Cycle super highway in Llandaff
- Next bike reporting of abandoned and vandalised bikes
- Pavement parking.

5 [Cabinet Member, Investment & Development Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions relating to:

- Investment & Development and the Climate Change Emergency and tangible contributions to that agenda. In particular members raised questions around the sustainable transport plan for the new Cardiff Arena in the Bay;
- Heritage Buildings and the re-development of the former Post Office/ Inland Revenue building on Westgate Street;
- Development of Callaghan square details of which will be brought forward in September.

6 [Cabinet Member, Culture & Leisure Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions relating to:

- Cardiff International White water Official drinking water refill station ;
- Summer Events Programme and the need to co-ordinate the timing of events.

7 [Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member , Education, Employment & Skills Statement](#)

The Deputy Leader responded to questions on

- International School linking and the project focused on Challenging Extremism;
- Cardiff 2030 and the need to capture the voices of children and young people
- Admission levels for schools
- The success of the Diverse Dance Mix

8 [Cabinet Member, Finance Modernisation & Performance Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions relating to

- Digital medias and the need to offer alternatives to those residents who are less comfortable using this media to contact the council

9 [Cabinet Member, Housing & Communities Statement](#)

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

The Cabinet Member responded to questions relating to

- The work of the Homeless Multi-Disciplinary Outreach team and the challenges of the hot summer weather and the work to develop safe shelters.
- Welcomed a recent visit to the Huggard Centre
- New build housing and the Cardiff Living programme which provides quality, sustainable and affordable homes.

10 [Cabinet Member, Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Statement](#)

The Cabinet Member responded to questions relating to

- The scheduling of the refurbishment of the chapels at Thornhill Crematorium
- Low Emission Transport Strategy and the provisioning and location of the Electric Vehicle charging points in the city and consultation and notification to resident. The pilot was encouraged but citizens needed to be involved in the process.

61 : MOTION 1

A notice of motion proposed by Councillor Lancaster and seconded by Councillor Parkhill had been received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 22 (b) and had been included on the Summons for the meeting. No amendments had been received to the motion.

Councillor Lancaster was invited to propose the motion as follows:

This Council notes:

- 1) That many young people have their own mobile phone (including smartphones) and that many choose to take them into school;
- 2) There is evidence that mobile phones distract children from learning in the classroom. One study\* indicates that banning mobile phones in the classroom significantly increased performance in high stakes exams and that increases in achievement are driven by the lowest performing students, thereby reducing educational inequality;
- 3) In Llanishen High School, the use of mobile phones has been banned on school premises and the result has been an overall improvement in pupil behaviour;
- 4) There are instances where mobile phones are needed in school by pupils and that each school is best placed to make the decision.

This Council calls on the Executive to bring forward a report considering the advantages and disadvantages of schools banning the use of phones on school premises for pupils up to and including Year 11. The report should contain a clear recommendation asking Governing bodies to consider this in their school. Any such ban should complement existing teaching of pupils in the safe and responsible usage of mobile devices.

*\*Beland, L & Murphy R: Ill Communication: Technology, Distraction & Student Performance. London School of Economics and Political Science, Centre for Economic Performance Discussion Paper 1350 (May 2015).*

Councillor Parkhill formally seconded the Motion

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion.

During the debate Councillor Goodway in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 26 (a) (i) - Closure Motion moved that the question be put. This was seconded by Councillor Bowen-Thomson.

The Lord Mayor using his discretion under Council Procedure Rule 26 ruled that the remaining three speaker could contribute to the debate.

At the end of the debate, the Lord Mayor invited Councillor Lancaster to respond to items raised during the debate.

A vote was taken on the Motion as proposed.

The Motion was LOST.

## 62 : MOTION 2

*(In accordance with the Code of Conduct the following Members declared a personal and prejudicial interest and left the meeting during consideration of this item: - Councillors Cowan, Driscoll, P Hill-John, Hudson, Jones – Pritchard, McKerlich, Naughton, Owen, Parkhill, Phillips, Rees, Robson, Graham Thomas, Walker and Williams)*

*(Also not present during the debate were Councillors Ford\*, Gibson, Jenkins, Kelloway and Lancaster).*

*[\*NOTE Cllr Ford had been taken unwell during the meeting]*

A notice of motion proposed by Councillor Stubbs and seconded by Councillor Lay had been received in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 22 (b) and had been included on the Summons for the meeting.

No amendments had been received to the motion.

Councillor Stubbs was invited to propose the motion as follows:

This Council:

- Notes the conclusions of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change that *“we are already seeing the consequences of 1°C of global warming through more extreme weather, rising sea levels and diminishing Arctic sea ice”*;
- Notes the Panel’s finding that *“warming of 1.5°C or higher increases the risk associated with long-lasting or irreversible changes, such as the loss*  
*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

*of some ecosystems,” and that “limiting global warming to 1.5°C would require ‘rapid and far-reaching’ transitions in land, energy, industry, buildings, transport, and cities. Global net human-caused emissions of carbon dioxide (CO2) would need to fall by about 45 percent from 2010 levels by 2030, reaching ‘net zero’ around 2050.”;*

- Notes the campaigning and research by Friends of the Earth, and others, on the holdings Local Government Pension funds, including Cardiff & the Vale, have in fossil fuel companies;
- Welcomes the recent decision of the Pension Committee to move 10% (approx. £200 million) of fund assets to a fund tracking a Global Low Carbon index; and
- Welcomes the Pension Committee’s recent decision to state its “*support in principle for divestment in companies engaged in fossil fuel extraction, subject to this being consistent with its fiduciary duties and regular assessment of the impact of such an investment decision; and states its support for further development of Climate Change Investment Policy to reflect this work and ensure investment decisions are consistent with the aims of the Paris Agreement*”

This Council calls on the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund to:

- Continue the work to apply the principle of divestment in companies engaged in fossil fuel extraction, in order to divest from direct ownership of equities and corporate bonds, as well as any comingled funds, of companies engaged in fossil fuel extraction
- Continue the work to apply the principle of divestment in companies engaged in; and
- seek to have divested within a period of five years.

Councillor Lay seconded the Motion

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion. During the debate it was clear that there was agreement across the Chamber on the motion. The Lord Mayor ensure that contributions were received from the parties and independent member present in the chamber before inviting Councillor Stubbs to respond to items raised during the debate.

A vote was taken on the Motion as proposed.

The Motion was CARRIED.

63 : ORAL QUESTIONS

Question – *Councillor Robson*

With the news that shops in Wales had the worst June footfall in 20 years, what more can the Council do encourage shoppers back to the high street?

Reply – *Councillor Thomas*

The position in the High Streets nationally, is one that we should all be concerned with. It ties in perhaps with the discussion on mobile phone use and increasing use of online shopping.

However I am pleased to be able to reassure you that Cardiff bucked the trend, the figures for June 2018 and June 2019, show a close to 10% increase in footfall in Cardiff over that period.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Robson*

That is good news - I missed that - I saw the Wales wide statistics.

As you will know, recently a protest group took up residence outside Cardiff Castle and caused congestion by blocking access for vehicular traffic. This would have had - to a greater or lesser extent - some impact over those three days on the shops, particularly those opposite the castle as well as the reputation of the city being closed in effect for those days further afield.

Now that they have dispersed, they have suggested that they might come back at some point what more as a Council can we do to ensure that if they come back, we can deal with it even more effectively and protect our businesses.

Reply – *Councillor Thomas*

I think it is fair to acknowledge that it was disruptive to some of the shops, in particular from the feedback I have seen, it was actually to do with their workers not being able to come into work rather than just the footfall numbers.

As I indicated, the footfall figures have increased for Cardiff. They have in fact increased by over 300,000 over the month of June, a 3.64 million recorded footfall in Cardiff during the June period. I think in part that reflects a deliberate strategy and I paid tribute to Councillor Joyce once and I will do so again, to the way under her leadership, the Council very deliberately adopted the strategy of locating businesses, shops and workplaces within the city centre. I think that inherently gives strength to the retail sector because people are now working and living in the city centre is not just something that you have to travel to.

To address your particular question, and I am going to give a similar answer to Councillor Williams' - you need to maintain good relations with those involved and respecting their right to protest and I think that is where I think the police struck the right balance in achieving a good balance - the right to protest and the right to access.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Question – *Councillor Carter*

What is the Council planning to do to tackle the huge number of void council properties?

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

As of 14 July, there were 342 void council properties, which is 2.52%, out of a total council housing stock of 13,552 properties.

As you know, following your previous question to me on this issue in October last year, one of the three contractors appointed to deal with building maintenance works on void properties quit their contract at the end of September last year.

One of the existing contractors has already increased its workforce and has taken on properties from the areas that were left by the former contractor. It was frustrating that we had to wait until the new financial year to appoint a new contractor, but they have now commenced work and are performing well and gearing up to take on more properties.

Our small in-house team of 9 operatives, which was formed in October last year, is performing well and completing properties in 43 days on average. A business case is being considered for the in-house team to expand further in order to be able to complete more voids; however, this solution will take some time to put in place.

Consideration is also being given to using other contractors using the national procurement services framework, which Welsh public sector organisations can use, either by direct award or by a mini competition depending on how the individual framework has been set up.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Carter*

I think you will agree with me that any vacant property for that length of time is a tragedy. In my own ward of Pentwyn and Llanedeyrn, barely a week goes by when we do not get more casework regarding properties that have been left abandoned - be it houses or flats - because of the void procedure.

So whilst it is reassuring that obviously we have now retendered and have seen an increase in our in-house capacity, it is still a concern and remains a tragedy I think when we have over 8000 people on the housing waiting list who could be in these homes right now.

Going forward, with a new contractor in place and we have sorted those arrangements out, what will you be doing to ensure those targets are being met and actually we complete this financial year with our company's intact and they all keep their promises/.

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

I totally agree with you, and I am more frustrated probably than you because I receive letters from AM's, MP's, Councillors and even from my own ward, and it is dreadful when people are desperately waiting to see vacant properties sitting there.

We are going to continue to do what we have always done which is to monitor carefully and to monitor our contractors because although it is important to get those properties back, is also important to make sure that that work is completed properly so that when we offer a home, it is in a standard which is acceptable and so we will do everything we possibly can to bring them in and the numbers have increased over the last two weeks partly because of new properties which have been returned from the developers for us to let and from new vacancies so there is a slight increase but we are hoping that once we get those lets done that will start to go down.

Question – *Councillor Lister*

The Welsh Government has recently issued new statutory guidance for school uniforms, which will come into effect in September. What is Cardiff Council doing to support schools in ensuring that uniform policies are in place and provide equal opportunities for all pupils?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

I welcome the recent changes that the Welsh Government has put in place and new guidance on school uniform and appearance policies in Wales.  
The timing of these changes just before the summer holidays, which does not enable schools to amend current policies in time for the new Academic Year, is unfortunate.

I have therefore asked officers to start working with schools in early September to ensure that every School Governing Body in Cardiff reviews their current policy during the Autumn Term and puts in place the necessary changes as quickly and practically as possible.

This exercise will also include the identification of good practice and the exploration of working with other agencies to promote and encourage the recycling of used uniform and equipment where possible.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Lister*

Thank you Councillor Merry really appreciate that response and welcome the guidance just as you do.

I was just wondering if you could share any examples of good practice in Cardiff that you are aware of with the Chamber so that we can in our roles as Governors go back to our own schools and promote good examples.

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

I know that Cathays High school organised its own school shop for pre-loved school uniform and PE kit, which they have requested donations from parents, and the money raised, will be used to further benefit learning at school.

I was also pleased to read recently about a mother of two from Pentwyn who last year set up a Facebook uniform donations page and she has had a massive response with tens of thousands of items of clothing being donated and collected. She has also organised an event in Cardiff on the 11th August supported by volunteers from Cardiff University Students' Union when people can turn up on the day to collect unwanted items of school uniform that have been donated local barbers and hairdressers will also be offering free back to school haircuts at the event.

Question – *Councillor Philippa Hill-John*

Can the Cabinet Member please confirm the cost to the Council caused by reduced access to 'void' housing as a result of contractor delays?

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

The void rent loss for 2018/19 was £1,197,874, which represented an increase of 71% in comparison with 2017/18.

As I outlined earlier in reply to the previous question from Councillor Carter, we are working to reduce the number of void properties and improve performance in this area by potentially expanding our in-house team and ensuring that our contractors are working effectively to fulfil their contractual obligations.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Philippa Hill-John*

I am shocked by the figure that you just quoted there but am pleased to hear that there is alternative procurement methods that you are considering. There are many local small businesses and the operate within Cardiff that I know would welcome this additional work. Is there no way that the Council could consider finding a way to use their services to recover this sort of debt.

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

We have to go through procurement processes, which I personally would have really loved if it were quicker.

I wrote to the Chair of the Policy and Performance Review Scrutiny Committee to ask if they would look into the process to see if there was any way particularly in emergencies that we could actually shorten that. Therefore, I would not disagree with you but the Chair of PRAP said they had already scrutinised that issue and so declined to look at it. However if there is any way that we can actually improve performance and provide jobs for local businesses I would be happy to look at yes.

Question – *Councillor Berman*

Whilst the installation of electric vehicle charging points in Penylan is very much welcome, some residents are concerned about the amount of pavement space these need to occupy and the knock-on effect this has on its availability for other users. Is the council therefore still pursuing the possibility of fitting electric vehicle charging points within existing street lighting columns, as I previously suggested, or alternatively looking at the possibility of pop-up charging points which do not need to take up pavement space when not in use?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

This allows me to expand on the answer I gave earlier on. The installation of the Electric Vehicle charge points across the city as part of the OLEV grant funded project has been thorough in considering the impact on pavements. None of the installations has reduced the pavement space below the minimum requirement.

Equality and access advice was sought and provided throughout the process and many potential sites were rejected on assessment as having insufficient pavement width.

Early consideration was also given to the use of lamp post based charge points, but the Distribution Network Operator (Western Power Distribution) has advised that they will not support the introduction of these units at present as they do not comply with their technical safety guidelines. Should these become acceptable in the future, then they will of course be reconsidered.

With regard to pop-up chargers, we are aware that Oxford City Council has recently commenced a scheme to trial this new technology. Solutions such as this would be more appropriate as part of a wider rollout, which is currently being developed by officers.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Berman*

It is disappointing that the feedback we have had from Western Power is that we cannot put them into existing street columns. I think we did share the concerns from Councillor Cunnah earlier that some residents are unhappy about the amount of pavement space being taking up. We have to make sure that we can make this work without impacting on wheelchair users, mothers with pushchairs who need the pavement space as well.

What steps will you now take to make sure that we do carry on looking at what other options we could pursue to try to find ways where we can get the network of points that we will need and still be manageable within streets where there isn't maybe the appropriate pavement space to achieve what we want with the current infrastructure that's going in now.

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

This is still Phase 1 where we are currently talking to procurement about trying to find a citywide partner where we can actually get these out across the whole of the city. We are also looking at fast charging we have seen other places that have tried this kind of technology at an early stage and have had to take them back out. Therefore, you have to be careful and not dive in and put these everywhere to then find they are not the right ones.

Therefore, I think we have done a good job so far it is still early days. 30 to 35 of these will be going in soon.

I am as disappointed in Western Power Distribution, but we continue working with them and we are very careful about finding the right places for them. We are trying to link demand in with this so we do not just flood the city with them. I think the work that we are doing will lead to some good work over the next year or two as electric cars are sold in greater numbers then we shall have the chargers out there for them. Of course, there is also the personal chargers. We are working with developers to have these available at new housing developments as well as those who have taken them privately through OLEV.

Question – *Councillor Gibson*

Rightacres' consultants AECOM predict excessive amounts of NO<sub>2</sub> when the new bus station at Central Square is opened. What steps is the council taking to ensure NO<sub>2</sub> limits are not exceeded in and near the new bus station when it opens?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

The report by AECOM actually shows that all but 2 of the 24 locations modelled in the City Centre the levels comply with legal standards for NO<sub>2</sub>. Compared to the 2016 baseline results the assessment actually shows an overall decrease in the average levels of NO<sub>2</sub> across the modelled locations.

However, more importantly this modelling does not account for any of the changes we would see because of our Clean Air plan for the city centre. In particular, the move to electric and cleaner buses will have a notable impact on these assumptions.

Question – *Councillor Owen-Jones*

What powers do the Council have to deal with Rogue Traders?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

The term 'rogue trader' is an interesting one. They are perhaps best described as opportunists who never miss a chance to rip consumers off. They make repairs that do not need doing; they talk people into buying unwanted products or services, and, when something goes wrong, they are nowhere to be seen.

In terms of how the Council deals with them, the answer will lie in the nature of the con or fraud they have perpetrated or the law they are breaking. Tackling certain wide-ranging frauds sometimes requires the Council to work with others. This approach is becoming more common because, despite the sophistication of some scams, between us we will have the capability to bring those rogues to book.

Of course, we then have to rely on the law courts to impose appropriate sentences. You will have seen in the media recently a number of cases prosecuted by the Council following an investigation by our Shared Regulatory Service.

Many of these are included in the Service's recently published Annual Report and have seen a number of people imprisoned for their unlawful activities.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Owen-Jones*

Touching on Councillor Robson's question in terms of footfall on high streets, Clifton Street in my ward there are some traders who seem to be flaunting every single rule that we hold on our books be it Planning Parking Environmental Health. This is a huge frustration to traders who are plying their trade legally and it is a question of can we accumulate all our powers as they seem to be breaking every single one of them, to get action far more quickly because it is frustrating for traders who are obeying the rules when they see that action is slow.

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

I would be happy to get Shared Regulatory Services, Planning and all the other services involved in taking action against anyone we find breaking the law; happy to meet with you, happy to take the names and the evidence and happy to start the ball rolling.

Question – *Councillor Williams*

In Cardiff if you park on double yellow lines you risk being issued with a traffic fine. In Cardiff if you drive in a bus lane or stop on a yellow box you also, risk being issued with a traffic fine. In Cardiff if you overstay the time on your parking you risk being issued with a parking ticket. In Cardiff, there are rules and whether we like them or not they are applied to all in Cardiff, at least it would seem.

However it would appear that an unlawful protest shutting down the City Centre has not only been met with silence by Cardiff Council but with the Council formally shutting roads and using council resources to allow the protest to take place. Lawful protest and right of assembly is an important right of any free and democratic society.

There have been reports that workers have had their pay docked due to being late as a result of these protests and thousands of commuters have been unreasonably disrupted with many unable to get to work due to bus route cancellations and taxi diversions.

How can it be fair and just that the Council you lead has allowed these protests to happen and would you now call on South Wales Police to formally notify the protesters (and commit to doing so in any subsequent unlawful protests), giving them instructions to vacate the highway?

Reply – *Councillor Huw Thomas*

A week is a long time in history and I am pleased that the protesters have now moved on and I think that underlines the correctness of the strategy undertaken by South West Policing engaging with dialogue. I think you need to look at the experiences of Bristol to see the level of disruption that could have been experienced in Cardiff had the Police followed a different strategy.

As I said to the BBC last night, Councillor Wild and myself visited, the protesters on the site Monday ask them to move off the highway but had a very constructive discussion and I am pleased that the matter has been resolved.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Williams*

The Leader will of course be familiar with the Public Order Act 1986 section 11, which governs the protests and marches taking place that includes the highway. Now those provisions include, and I am looking at the Monitoring Officer, so I hope I have got the statutory provision right or otherwise I am going to look really silly, six days' notice has to be given out before any march or protest takes place and this is so residents, businesses and individuals can plan for the process.

We are not anti-protests but we are pro lawful protest so will you take this opportunity to advise anyone Planning future protests in this city to comply with the statutory regulations and provisions in place to ensure that businesses communities and individuals face minimal disruption thank you.

Reply – *Councillor Huw Thomas*

I would urge anyone thinking of having a process to comply with that legislation. My wife and I have spoken of nothing else this week. On the subject of protests, the Councillor may be too young to remember the fuel protests of the year 2000 where protesters complained and brought disruption to millions of people calling for cheaper petrol.

The Leader of Tory Party at the time described them as fine upstanding citizens despite causing an estimated £1 billion of costs to businesses, the Welsh Conservatives made one of the ringleaders an Assembly Member and then in his first budget David Cameron aided by his coalition colleagues instantly implemented a freeze on fuel duty tax escalator so why is the Tory Party so quick to condemn the people who were protesting to call for action on climate change and yet so willing to back the people who wanted to have cheaper fuel subsidising the motion and contributing to climate change could it be that on every major issue that this country has faced in the last hundred with some honourable exceptions, the Tory Party has been on the wrong side of history wrong on appeasement, wrong on the NHS, wrong on gay rights, wrong on the minimum wage and today wrong on climate change.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Question – *Councillor Molik*

We understand that there are plans for new school builds; however, we question whether the Cabinet decision not to address admissions issues until those matters are settled is right. What is happening to address the current, very real issues around lack of school places in Cardiff High School, Rhydypenau Primary and Lakeside Primary to cater for local children and general shortfall in school places in the northern side of the city?

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

You will be aware from previous replies that the Council has included the expansion of Cardiff High School within Band B of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Schools programme, which started in April this year. Within the central area of Cardiff, we recognise that in the longer term, there will be a shortfall of 8 forms of entry and that is provided for within that building programme but obviously we have to rank those buildings and prioritise quite rightly those that are in a significant danger of failing to meet standards. I am sure you would approve of that.

I am slightly bemused by your questions, it seems to me if you are attempting to match the demand within a catchment area to the school places, there are 2 options, you expand the school, which we are seeking to do at the appropriate time, or you reduce the catchment area. If you are bringing forward a proposal to reduce the catchment area of Cardiff High to its current admissions number, I would advise you to put that in writing to me.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Molik*

Siblings being split friends being split children being placed in schools out of the Neighbourhood travelling a distance to get education but in some cases having to learn a different language.

Starting school or progressing to secondary school, as you would know, is challenging for parents but more importantly for the children themselves and the current situation with the shortfall in school places in the northern arc of the City is making that challenge even more difficult for young children.

Do we not need to prioritise these concerns in the northern side of the City, I understand you have a programme but it is about prioritising that demand need.

Reply – *Councillor Merry*

I will make no apology in this Chamber for prioritising the needs of children in the poorest areas of the city who have been left to be educated in schools that were substandard because of the previous prioritisation by the last administration. I make no apologies for that but in terms of actually admissions to Cardiff High all of the people who are actually resident within the catchment area of Cardiff High within Cyncoed and Lakeside who applied to Cardiff High at the appropriate time got their places.

Those who were resident in the south part of the school's catchment area, places were available if they had applied properly at the time at both Cathays High School and Willows High school.

It would be helpful if the opposition Members, in fact all Members in this Chamber, could actually learn the admissions policy and apply it. We consult on the admissions policy and siblings from outside a catchment area are not given a higher priority and I have not seen any suggestion from the Lib Dems that they should leap over people who live in the catchment area.

You cannot pick and choose to suit the argument that you are trying to make. The other schools are closer and I will tell you what I was proud to send my son to Cathays High school and I would be happy to advise any parent that they could send their child to Cathays or Willows, which are often schools, are closer to them.

Question – *Councillor Hudson*

Have plans been formed for a new County Hall and if so, will we be working in partnership with other agencies?

Reply – *Councillor Goodway*

The Councillor will be aware that the need to rationalise the Council's core office requirement was first identified by the previous Labour Administration in its policy document entitled *Fewer But Better Buildings*. The current Administration has been reviewing the council's core office requirement and it is intended to bring forward a report in the autumn of this year.

The Councillor will also appreciate that the Council already enjoys close working relationships with a range of other public sector partner organisations a number of which have indicated that there are significant benefits to be gained from the co-location of their respective teams. We are, therefore, working closely with those partners to identify the overall requirement necessary to support a public sector hub that will best serve the needs of Cardiff residents.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Hudson*

So the Council will know in September?

Reply – *Councillor Goodway*

The Council will know in the autumn.

Question – *Councillor Sandrey*

What was the rationale behind the change in layout for this year's Food and Drink festival?

Reply – *Councillor Bradbury*

The main reason was due to budget constraints, but I'm pleased that officers were able to work with food producers to find a solution and maintain free entry to the event. The response to this year's event has been overwhelmingly positive.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Sandrey*

The reason I brought this up was because I had some anecdotal feedback from people that they found that the way it was laid out this time was not as nice as previous years and have said they might not go back next year, including myself I suffer with anxiety and I just found the way it was all condensed together just made it a worse experience for me personally that's why I brought it up.

Reply – *Councillor Bradbury*

It is a change to what we are used to, and I can understand if people are not fussed with a change, but I did ask before the question was asked how was the response to the food festival because I was for the first time in years unable to attend this year because of a personal issue, and the response has been overwhelmingly positive. I have been told that the providers and customers and the attendances were in line with what they have been in other years. Thank you for passing on this anecdotal evidence, and I will pass it onto Officers. However, the reason why we made the decisions we have to do is due to the cut in the Harbour Authority budget so that is where we are with that.

Question – *Councillor Cowan*

What is the current availability of floor space provision for those experiencing homelessness in Cardiff and what has been the monthly availability (by percentage and numerical) over the last six months?

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

The Council operates 18 floor spaces that are available for those in need of services in an emergency. This is in addition to the other 41 emergency spaces that are available across the city.

In the event of any sudden increase in demand, we also have contingency provisions to respond to any increases for additional spaces in the short term.

The average void or vacancy rate for these 59 emergency spaces over the last 6 months has been 2.1%, which has ranged from 1.2% in January to 3.23% in June, most likely due to seasonal weather conditions.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Cowan*

I am just eluding to the information - what you are saying is that we have never run out of floor space at all - so we can just put that on record just to clarify that and also

people who have got additional needs when they present as homeless what additional support do we give to them.

Reply – *Councillor Thorne*

We do try to and the outreach team assess every individual and there are lots of different provisions I can probably provide you with that information I don't have it offhand but I think I've said to you before, there are huge number of hostels, probably around 1600 spaces provided lots of different types of supported accommodation so I can get that information for you.

Question – *Councillor Molik*

This is the second consecutive year that Roath Park Lake (Cardiff beauty spot and tourist attraction) is closed on health and safety grounds due to blue-green algae during the summer period. The increasing traffic around the park and neglect of the park is making the Roath Park Lake unsafe for people to visit, what effort is being put in place to ensure Roath Park Lake is the most attractive and safe summer visiting place for families and all?

Reply – *Councillor Bradbury*

I do not accept that Roath Park is either unsafe or neglected. These are unsubstantiated claims in your question that only serve to do the park down, at a time when it has retained its Green Flag award once again in recognition of it being a well-managed park.

As you indicate, this is the second consecutive year that we have seen Blue Green Algae in the lake and the advice that I provided to you last year on this has not changed.

The re-occurrence of Blue Green Algae is in no way connected with the management of the park. It is a natural occurrence, which the Council has no control over whatsoever and is a result of the hot and dry weather conditions that have been experienced over the summer months.

We have taken the necessary steps to notify ward Members and park users to help ensure public safety in terms of the use of the lake.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Molik*

I do mention the Lake. The lake is the water part of Roath Park and has the blue-green algae. I did take your point last year and I am hearing it again but you do need to look into why blue-green algae is occurring. It has been biologically and scientifically proven why these things happen, and yes, you can manage it and you can resolve the issue. You need to invest in our lake and it needs urgent attention. Therefore, I will just tell you the deterioration around the park and a focus and lack of investment has led to this stage and I just ask you for urgent attention really.

Reply – Councillor *Bradbury*

With respect, I am not to blame for climate change. I am not to blame for unseasonably hot summers, and I am not to blame for blue-green algae in your lake. It would have helped if your party in 2005/06 had not cut the money that we put away under the previous Cabinet Member Councillor Michael to de-silt the lake every year that was cut under the Liberal Democrat administration.

I am sick and tired of hearing Liberal Democrats in this Chamber having a go at Roath park it is the highest performing park in terms of Green Flag Awards, I would be proud if that was in my ward and I am really disappointed once again that Liberal Democrats are doing this park down.

Question – Councillor *Williams*

Many months ago, it was reported in the press that a number of Officers in Cardiff Council are under investigation by South Wales Police, with a number of suspensions taken place in the Council's Waste Dept. Whilst suspended these Officers will be in receipt of full pay and pension contributions. Suspension from duty is a neutral act.

Can you provide an update to Council on the progress of the internal investigations and outline a timeline for concluding these ongoing matters as Cardiff Council taxpayers are footing the bill to the sum of hundreds of thousands of pounds in suspension costs and agency fees?

Reply – Councillor *Michael*

The Council has a disciplinary policy and procedure, which has been adhered to in relation to this matter.

I am advised that all internal investigations into these historic matters have concluded. For those investigations recommending disciplinary hearings, these have been arranged.

There continues to be close liaison with the Police in respect of any criminal investigations.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Williams*

I understand that we do have statutory processes in place, but the fact is that the number of suspensions that have taken place and the length of time throughout those suspensions has meant that we have spent hundreds of thousands of pounds of taxpayers' money bringing in agency and people to replace those suspended. I understand we have a statutory process.

Can you confirm what you have done personally as Cabinet Member to ensure that these investigations are dealt with swiftly supporting natural justice and are compliant with the relevant policies because it is, I think, disappointing that under your watch

we have seen lengthy investigations, which have cost the Cardiff taxpayer an awful lot of money.

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

The word historic was used there, all of these investigations are extremely serious these are people's lives people's jobs this is a really serious matter and it is a great pity that you choose to try to make political points of something this serious and I'm really disappointed in you.

Question – *Councillor Berman*

How does the Council defend repeatedly turning down a family in my ward for a disabled parking space when they live in a terraced street which is heavily parked in the evenings, meaning they regularly have substantial difficulty when taking their disabled daughter, who is a wheelchair user, to evening activities because they most often cannot park close enough to their home on their return?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

Whilst we don't normally comment on individual cases in the Chamber, I can confirm that the application has been approved in principle and the family have been advised of the outcome; however, any changes on-street are subject to consultation through the TRO process.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Berman*

It is incredible I tabled this question on Monday and there was a bit of adverse publicity also in the media and the decision was reversed as we understand from the family in question yesterday although they heard it from journalists which is a bit unfortunate, but nonetheless they are pleased that the decision has been changed.

Can we look at reviewing the procedure here because it does seem to be something wrong with the way this was previously determined in that I cannot fathom and nor can the residents of the street fathom, why it could have been judged that there was not a parking problem in the street in the evenings unless the assessments were being undertaken too early in the evenings before a lot of people were home.

I think we really need to look into that, and also why wasn't there a process by which the Council has a proper conversation with applicants because if they had the might have understood that this particular family has a car with a ramp from the back which they use to get the wheelchair and therefore requires a bit more space than might normally be the case for another car. Now that the Council knows the facts it has come to a different decisions so could we review the process so this sort of thing does not happen again.

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

Yes, I mean I think that is exactly what we did and that is why the decision was made that way so I think we have done exactly as you have asked us to do.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Question – *Councillor Graham Thomas*

Have the Council considered utilising the bus lanes in the city to help the promote climate friendly initiatives such as allowing Ultra Low Emission Vehicles and or allowing cars with 2 or more persons to use them?

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

You asked me about whether we should let ultra-low emission cars into our bus lanes and I think we do need to look at how we make electric cars also car-sharing, car clubs, how we make them more appealing but at this moment what we are looking to do and I am convinced that the priority for our bus lanes which obviously we let taxis use but the priority is get the buses in and out as quick as possible and I think allowing electric cars at this stage could be a mistake, even one car pulled over in the morning when people trying to get to work, forty people behind them on a bus can really cause a problem so I don't think it's advisable at this stage.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Graham Thomas*

With the week that we have had in Cardiff, and we will have all seen umpteen politicians in front of the cameras commenting that climate change needs to be high on the agenda at all levels of government - so what transport initiatives were bringing forward as a local Council to encourage and guide residents to reducing their carbon footprint.

Reply – *Councillor Wild*

I do not think anyone else in this Chamber wants me to read out the statement that I made earlier on all of the answers and many of the headlines we are doing are there and it was in the Leader's statement as well, so I refer you to my statement.

Question – *Councillor Cowan*

What is the proposed timescale and location for a replacement household waste recycling site in Cardiff North?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

The Council has yet to identify a suitable site for a new recycling centre in North Cardiff.

Supplementary Question – *Councillor Cowan*

I am sure you will remember this report but the Environmental Scrutiny on the 3 July 2018 not 2019, 2018, the Committee asked at that time for an update on the replacement site and the Committee were assured that the Planning Transport Environmental Department would receive details of a potential site within the next six to eight weeks.

So we have had a delay of nearly a year.

Can you tell me why there has been a delay and can you give me a timescale when we will have some information because people are asking on the doorstep throughout Rhiwbina and Cardiff North and we deserve to give them a response?

Reply – *Councillor Michael*

Councillor Cowan has asked me this question on numerous occasions I have always be straight. I am going to give the same answer now, when I have something important to announce, I will do it.

64 : URGENT BUSINESS

No notification of urgent business had been received for this meeting.

65 : MEMBERS' SCHEDULE OF REMUNERATION 2019 - 2020

The Council was requested to approve the Members' Schedule of Remuneration 2019 – 2020 agreed at Annual Council 23 May 2019 and in accordance with the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales Regulations for publication by 31 July 2019.

RESOLVED – That

1. the Members' Schedule of Remuneration 2019-2020 was approved for publication by 31 July 2019; and
2. delegated authority be granted to the Monitoring Officer to update the Members' Schedule of Remuneration and to make necessary amendments to the 2019-2020 Schedule (published within the Constitution) from time to time during the municipal year in order to reflect any changes in membership of the Council, Cabinet or Committee's or as a result of any Supplementary Reports issues by the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales.

66 : COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS

The Council was requested to approve nominations to vacancies in accordance with political group wishes and as reported on the amendment sheet for Council.

RESOLVED – That the following appointments to Committee vacancies be approved in accordance with Party Group wishes:

<b>Committee</b>	<b>Appointment</b>
Audit Committee	Cllr Rod McKerlich
Employment Conditions Committee	Cllr Mike Jones Pritchard
Works Council	Cllr Mike Jones Pritchard
Planning Committee	Cllr Susan Goddard

Vacancies remain on the following Committees: -	
Corporate Parenting Advisory Committee	2 vacancies
Planning Committee	1 vacancy
Public Protection	1 vacancy
Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee	1 vacancy
Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny	2 vacancies

67 : APPOINTMENTS OF REPRESENTATIVES TO OUTSIDE BODIES

The Council was requested to approve appointments of representatives to Outside Bodies in accordance with political group wishes and as reported on the amendment sheet for Council.

<b>Body</b>	<b>Appointment</b>
Cardiff University Court	Cllr Mackie
Vacancies remain on the following Outside Bodies: -	
Cardiff & Vale of Glamorgan Community Health Council	1 vacancy
Willie Seager Memorial Homes Trust	1 vacancy

68 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with the Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) [Written Questions](#) received for consideration and response had been published.

*The meeting ended at 9.40pm*