



DINAS A SIR CAERDYDD
CITY AND COUNTY OF CARDIFF

COUNCIL SUMMONS

THURSDAY, 28 MARCH 2019

GWYS Y CYNGOR

DYDD IAU, 28 MAWRTH 2019,

SUPPLEMENTAL PAPERS

Item	Description and Page Number(s)
Item 22	Written Questions and Answers (<i>Pages 3 – 38</i>)

Davina Fiore
Director of Governance & Legal Services

County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

28 March 2019

This page is intentionally left blank

WRITTEN QUESTIONS

CLEAN STREETS, RECYCLING AND ENVIRONMENT
(COUNCILLOR MICHAEL MICHAEL)

W1 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS

Since 2012 how many incidents of fly tipping have been reported across the City and how many of these incidents have led to successful prosecutions? (Please provide an annual breakdown of fly tipping incidents and an annual breakdown of successful prosecutions).

Reply

The total number of fly-tipping incidents recorded per year since 2012 are as follows:

Year	Reported Incidents	Prosecutions
2018-19 (to Dec. 2018)	3911	2
2017-18	5928	2
2016-17	7993	0
2015-16	6214	0
2014-15	3905	2
2013-14	4621	11
2012-13	10957	12

In October 2017, there was a change in legislation to enable the issuing of £400 fixed penalties for small scale fly-tipping. We began issuing Fixed Penalty Notices (FPNs) in August 2018 following the adoption of this provision and, to date; we have issued 165 FPNs for small scale fly-tipping.

W2 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS

Since 2012 how many complaints have been made about missed bin collections in our City? (please provide an annual breakdown).

Reply

Since 2012, the service has completed over 168 million domestic waste collections and logged 2,250 complaints (approximately 0.001%) for missed collections as formal complaints, of which an annual breakdown is set out below:

Year	Number of Complaints
2012-13	266
2013-14	189
2014-15	319
2015-16	390
2016-17	210
2017-18	337
2018-19 (<i>April-February</i>)	539
Total	2250

W3

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY

Missed waste collections seem to be becoming a more regular occurrence, with sometimes whole estates missed. This seems to be a growing problem across Pentwyn. What work has been done to assess whether there might be capacity, logistics and/or resource issues, which could be affecting waste collections?

Reply

There is always a need to review service needs and resources to ensure effective waste collections across the city. In this context, we continue to review the round sizes as demands change and work is ongoing to improve the service delivery across the city. Officers are currently looking at various options around re-organising future collections to meet the increasing demands of our growing city.

Where issues do occur, officers are focused on prioritising missed collections, as and when they become apparent, and I would ask Members and residents to report these as they occur so that any issues can be highlighted and addressed.

I am aware of operational issues relating to the fleet, which have impacted on collections in this area on the afternoon shift, with breakdowns delaying collections from time to time, but these have now been addressed.

	<p>Some commercial rounds have now been moved to a morning, which has led to changes to crews as a result of the commercial impacts, and there will be occasions where the crews have been unfamiliar with the rounds, thus resulting in some missed and delayed collections, but this has also now been addressed.</p>
W4	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE</u></p> <p>What progress has the Council made towards installing electric vehicle charging points in north Cardiff?</p> <p>How will the Council promote the standardisation of vehicle charging infrastructure in the city?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The Council is involved in work to install the first points in a residential Electric Vehicle (EV) chargepoint network using grant funding obtained through the UK Government Office for Low Emission Vehicle (OLEV) residential chargepoint scheme. This scheme is intended to meet the needs of those residents who are unable to charge at home due to a lack of off street parking. OLEV required evidence to support the application (e.g. letters from residents in houses with no off street parking) and a survey was undertaken to gather feedback from the public to support the application.</p> <p>Currently, there are no locations planned for the north of Cardiff; however, additional locations will be reviewed following completion of the current scheme as part of the wider EV charging programme, which includes developing proposals for rolling out EV charging facilities across the city.</p> <p>Residents with off street parking can already apply for grants via the Electric Vehicle Homecharge Scheme (EVHS), which provides grant funding of up to 75% towards the cost of installing electric vehicle chargepoints at domestic properties across the UK.</p> <p>It is anticipated that standardisation will be provided via the wider programme referenced above, which will involve a solution developed through an approach to the market in due course.</p>
W5	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR NAUGHTON</u></p>

Could you provide a breakdown of the number of cases there has been in the last 3 months where the council had to return to the same location to collect Fly Tipping which had already been reported that it had been cleared?

Reply

All fly-tipping is recorded and follows a robust audit trail, which is validated and submitted through WasteDataFlow on a quarterly basis. All incidents of fly-tipping are recorded through this process. Where there are duplicate reports at the same location, this is only recorded as one incident.

Reports of fly-tipping via the App are validated and, in many cases, not all reports are categorised as fly-tipping; some may relate to waste collections, private land accumulations or street cleansing.

All fly-tipping incidents are attended to and we aim to remove them within 5 working days. The visit and the record of action(s) taken is recorded. Where the details of the request and/or location provided are incorrect, then this is recorded as 'No waste found'.

The statistics from April to December 2018 show that there were 3,911 fly-tipping incidents, of which 3,892 were removed within less than 5 days; 18 within 6 to 10 days and 1 in more than 10 days.

W6

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR NAUGHTON

Can a ward-by-ward breakdown of the number of missed waste collections in the last 3 months be published?

Reply

Ward	Non Collection Reports		
	December 2018	January 2019	February 2019
Adamsdown	32	39	29
Butetown	26	34	6
Caerau	63	107	40
Canton	112	144	83
Cathays	65	59	81
Creigiau/St. Fagans	24	53	30
Cyncoed	42	57	47
Ely	78	138	120

Fairwater	89	107	86
Gabalfa	39	30	30
Grangetown	76	133	92
Heath	69	91	128
Lisvane	19	24	42
Llandaff	78	94	49
Llandaff North	54	39	31
Llanishen	122	159	242
Llanrumney	151	79	100
Pentwyn	110	105	104
Pentyrch	29	77	51
Penylan	51	102	36
Plasnewydd	92	90	92
Pontprennau/Old St. Mellons	63	97	195
Radyr	50	82	55
Rhiwbina	46	121	89
Riverside	39	129	106
Rumney	54	63	50
Splott	86	80	87
Trowbridge	109	106	82
Whitchurch & Tongwynlais	79	139	174
Total Reports	1,947	2,578	2,357

These figures need to be considered in the context of the 1,986,816 waste collections that were undertaken in the city in each of the last three months. It is also worth noting these figures include calls where members of the public got the day wrong or where we haven't collected due to contaminated recycling, blocked access, suspended collections or delays due to bad weather.

W7

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOOD

When bags of waste are dumped in rear lanes or on other public land, what criteria is used to decide if the waste is considered as 'fly-tipping' or 'mis-presented waste'? Has this criteria changed in the last 10 years?

Reply

The following would constitute a single fly-tipping incident:

- Waste deposits that are too large to be removed by a normal hand-sweeping barrow
- A single bag or more of waste
- Several carrier bags of rubbish that are dumped together
- The illegal deposit of waste
- Waste deposited in a location where there is no collection point (e.g. in lanes).

Incorrectly presented waste is where waste is presented at a collection point on the adopted highway at the wrong time or date.

In October 2017, there was a change in legislation to enable the issuing of fixed penalties for 'small scale' fly-tipping. The list below provides guidance on what constitutes 'small scale':

- First time non-habitual offenders only
- Non-hazardous waste only
- Up to a car boot load
- Up to 8 black bags
- One or two bulky items (e.g. furniture, white goods)

W8

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR

Will the administration join UK100 by pledging to secure the future of our communities by shifting to 100% clean energy by 2050?

Reply

The UK100 pledge includes the ambition to make member towns and cities across the UK 100% clean before 2050 in line with the commitments made nationally and internationally as part of the 2015 Paris Climate Agreement. Alongside other Core Cities, the Council is supportive of the UK100 agenda and is already active in a range of areas relevant to this pledge, including:

- energy efficiency improvements to housing through the ARBED Programme;
- action on our air quality planning;
- reduction of our dependence on imported fossil fuels through green tariffs;
- local renewable generation schemes; and
- strategic actions around planning, sustainable travel and sustainable food.

Our energy purchasing policies already require us to purchase electricity using green tariffs and Welsh Government rules require 40% of this to be sourced from renewable energy generators in Wales. This target is set to increase to 70%.

The Welsh Government also has an ambition for all public sector organisations in Wales to be carbon neutral by 2030 and we have committed to developing a strategy around this in the coming financial year.

W9	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR</u></p> <p>What steps are being taken to improve the safety and cleanliness of subways and the Interchange footways on North Road?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The city centre based cleansing team rounds are currently being reviewed to reflect the issues in the subways on North Road. The current proposals are as follows.</p> <p>Monday – Friday A litter picker to attend during the 06:00-14:00 shift. A mechanical sweeper to attend during the 15:00-23:00 shift.</p> <p>Sunday – Thursday A mechanical sweeper to attend during the 23:00-07:00 night shift.</p> <p>Saturday & Sunday A litter picker to attend between 10:00-18:00. A mechanical sweeper to attend between 05:00-10:00.</p> <p>This will be monitored over the coming weeks to establish the effectiveness of this approach and to address any issues.</p> <p>The subways at Gabalfa Interchange are currently cleansed on a weekly basis by a High Speed Route team. However, we are reviewing the cleansing rounds across the city and I will ask officers to monitor this area to establish if further cleanses are required in addition to the current weekly schedule.</p>
W10	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR</u></p> <p>What consideration has there been of the authority joining other councils in declaring a climate emergency?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>This matter will be considered accordingly during the debate on a related motion to the Council at its meeting on 28th March 2019. Climate change is also highlighted as a risk on the Council’s corporate risk register and a range of actions are underway, both to mitigate and adapt this risk. These include:</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Energy demand reduction projects to reduce the Council’s carbon footprint; • A programme to deliver local renewable energy projects; • Flood defence actions and strategies; • Sustainable travel strategies and initiatives; and • Emergency management strategies for extreme weather conditions.
W11	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR</u></p> <p>What investment is the council making in improving drainage across the city?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The Council is in the process of capturing drainage asset records, including information such as GPS locations, dimensions, structural condition and service defects. This information is then recorded in an asset database to ensure that the information is recorded in perpetuity.</p> <p>We are responsible for a vast drainage network but, in addition to our own assets, we are also the risk management authority for surface water flooding and, as such, are recording data on flood risk assets such as culverted watercourses on private land as a statutory requirement. We are undertaking CCTV surveys of assets in areas of flooding where demand for investigation is high.</p> <p>Where structural condition or service defects score poorly, remedial works will be undertaken to maintain the asset. As the data set grows, scheduled inspection and maintenance will be implemented on a drainage catchment basis and this will be managed through software systems. Funding for the inspection and maintenance of assets has been sourced successfully through Welsh Government funding opportunities in addition to the use of internal budgets.</p> <p>From January 2019, the Council has also become a Sustainable Drainage Approval Body (SAB). All new developments of an area of 100 square metres and over now require a sustainable drainage solution approved by the Authority. Such an approach reduces the volume of surface water entering drainage systems that are already at capacity, improves water quality and provides an improved natural environment for managing surface water.</p> <p>Greener Grangetown is one example of a sustainable drainage solution that was recently introduced. By introducing rain gardens into the highway network, the surface water has been removed from</p>

<p>the existing system and now discharges straight into the River Taff, thus removing the need to pump the water many kilometres. The area has been transformed with an increase in local green infrastructure and an improved environment for residents and visitors.</p>
--

EDUCATION, EMPLOYMENT AND SKILLS
(COUNCILLOR SARAH MERRY)

W12

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR LENT

How many pupils in Cardiff's schools are currently on reduced timetables?

What are the main reasons for pupils currently being placed on reduced timetables and how is the Council supporting these pupils?

Reply

This information is held by schools as it is a school-based intervention (Pastoral Support Plan/PSP) to help pupils to better manage their behaviour and to identify any support mechanisms that need to be put in place. This is referred to in the Inclusion and Pupil Support Guidance (No.203/2016).

The Local Authority is not required to collect this data and figures are known to fluctuate on a daily basis, which would make it challenging to report on this.

The main reason for children and young people being placed on a PSP is that their behaviour is causing a health and safety concern and there is a risk of further fixed term exclusions or even permanent exclusion. A PSP does not automatically include a reduced timetable.

The guidance on Exclusions from Schools and Pupil Referral Units provided by the Welsh Government includes the following advice about when a reduced timetable or PSP may be appropriate:

1.5 Alternatives to exclusion

1.5.1 Exclusion should not be used if alternative solutions are available. Examples include the following.

- *Pastoral Support Programmes (PSPs) for learners who are not responding to schools' general actions to combat disengagement and disaffection and are in need of longer-term intervention. PSPs are plans for learners to better manage their behaviour and should be drawn up using a multi-agency approach (including the learner and parents/carers) and reviewed on a regular basis.*

W13

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK

Do we have plans and timeline for Cardiff High extension?

Reply

We are planning to expand Cardiff High School as part of Band B of the 21st Century School Programme. This project will form part of the third batch of school schemes and it is proposed that this work would be completed by September 2023.

Plans have not yet been developed for the extension. Officers are currently progressing the schemes for the three “D” condition High Schools in the city (Fitzalan, Willows and Cantonian High Schools), which take priority within the programme.

FINANCE, MODERNISATION AND PERFORMANCE
(COUNCILLOR CHRIS WEAVER)

W14	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS</u></p> <p>The Council is currently engaged in a dispute with HMRC regarding a waste disposal matter. The cost of external advice the Council is receiving in this matter is rumoured to be costing approximately £1,000 PER HOUR, is this correct?</p> <p>Please confirm how much money has been spent in this financial year (2018/19) on management consultants and consultant reports like the example provided above.</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The total spend on consultants across all Council services in 2018/19 was £729,000 up to the end of December 2018. This reflects a range of work, including the specialist support that has been provided to the Council in relation to the dispute with HMRC on waste disposal, which accounted for almost half of this figure. I am unable to confirm the details of the cost of any hourly rates as this information is commercially sensitive.</p>
W15	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS</u></p> <p>Since 2012 how many NDA's (non disclosure agreements) have the Council entered into with former employees and what is the total cost of these so-called 'gagging orders'? (please provide an annual breakdown of the number of agreements entered into and an annual breakdown of the costs for these agreements).</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The table below shows the number of Settlement Agreements that have been signed by employees (including schools employees) since 2012.</p> <p>The vast majority of the Settlement Agreements are linked to the voluntary redundancy process and, therefore, the costs shown below include the voluntary redundancy payment that the employee is entitled to under both legislation and council policy.</p>

Financial Year	Total number of settlement agreements (including school employees)	Cost (including voluntary redundancy figure in VR cases)
2012/13 *	288	£3,709,943.82
2013/14 *	547	£9,825,652.49
2014/15 *	677	£12,399,095.44
2015/16 **	13	£347,208.00
2016/17 **	12	£312,966.00
2017/18 **	16	£436,583.40
2018/19 **	16	£233,606.80

**The numbers prior to 2015 are significantly higher due to the Council requiring Settlement Agreements to be agreed with all employees who exited the Council by way of voluntary redundancy at that time.*

***In the Cabinet report of 26th January 2015 the routine use of Settlement Agreements was ceased with immediate effect so that unnecessary expenditure was avoided.*

W16

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR LENT

What activities will the Council support during Gypsy, Roma and Traveller history month in July?

Reply

I'm pleased to report that the Council's Culture, Venues Tourism & Events service will be supporting a Gypsy, Roma & Traveller History Month Children's Festival at St David's Hall (free to attend), in partnership with the Romani Cultural and Arts Company. We will also be promoting the history month via social media and to employees via the Council's Intranet.

W17

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK

It was a positive move to raise council tax on empty residential properties to ensure they are returned to use, what is the council doing to ensure empty business properties are put back into use to serve the local community?

Reply

Business rates were nationalised in 1990 and local authorities bill and collect the tax on behalf of Central Government (now Welsh Government). If a business becomes empty, there is a short exemption of either 3 or 6 months depending on the type of business and, after this period, 100% empty rates are chargeable. This charge has been set by Government and it is set at this level to encourage rate payers to ensure that their properties are occupied.

From an economic development perspective, when empty industrial and office units become available, if they are not taken up immediately, the Council has been encouraging their utilisation for temporary pop up uses. For example, officers have worked for some time with local businesses and artists to help utilise vacant premises in the city for up to 28 days on a no trading basis. Another recent example is the use of property at St David's House by the "Pop Up Business School", an organisation which focused on providing business mentoring to the general public.

This administration wants to see vacant or underused floorspace brought into beneficial use and, whilst we do not have powers over business rates, will continue to promote that as part of our economic strategy.

W18

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR TAYLOR

What steps is the administration taking to divest local authority pension funds from arms and fossil fuels?

Reply

Capital Ambition set out our commitment to work with the Pensions Committee to consider divesting Council investments from fossil fuel companies.

The Council's responsibilities as the Administering Authority of the Cardiff & Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund are discharged through the Pensions Committee, which I currently chair. At its last meeting in January 2019, the Committee considered a report presenting progress to date in developing a Climate Change Investment Policy and setting out actions which could contribute to reducing the Pension Fund's exposure to environmental risks, and the Committee asked for further work to be done to explore the potential impact of a range of changes. This will be returned to at the next meeting of the Committee.

I personally believe it is important to recognise the potentially disastrous impact of climate change, and the impact that will have within the lifetime of pension scheme members if it is not addressed. Whatever strategy is developed must be compatible with the Council's fiduciary duty to manage the Pension Fund on behalf of its members and other stakeholders.

The Committee has not considered specifically the issue of investment in arms related companies. The Fund's investment managers are expected to consider all factors which might impact the long term performance of a company, including environmental, social and governance (ESG) issues.

The Council is also a constituent authority of the Wales Pension Partnership (WPP), which oversees the pooling of investments by the eight Local Government Pension Scheme (LGPS) fund authorities in Wales. The Pensions Committee and relevant officers are collaborating with the other WPP authorities to ensure that investment managers continue to consider and report on ESG issues as investments are transferred into the pool.

HOUSING AND COMMUNITIES
(COUNCILLOR LYNDA THORNE)

W19	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WILLIAMS</u></p> <p>Since 2017 how many meetings have Senior Officers (Chief Officers) held with partner agencies regarding homelessness in Cardiff?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Since January 2017, there have been 25 meetings with partner agencies relating specifically to homelessness in Cardiff, which have been led by senior officers of the Council at either Assistant Director, Corporate Director or Chief Executive level. These include regular Homeless Partnership Meetings, which are held every two months, and other individual or task & finish meetings.</p> <p>There have also been 8 multi-agency workshops relating to redesigning services for homeless clients and a Council organised homelessness conference that was attended by 100 people from 30 different organisations.</p> <p>The figure provided does not include any meetings where homelessness is discussed at the meetings, but where it is not the primary reason for the meeting. For example, the regular meetings that are held with other social landlords in Cardiff where homelessness is a standing item on the agenda, but is not the sole reason for the meetings.</p>
W20	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY</u></p> <p>As of August, due to a decision by the public service board, the council will no longer have someone working in the city to support off street sex workers. It is estimated there are 100 off street sex workers in Cardiff. Who will support these potentially vulnerable people with this position gone?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>I should point out that this was not a direct decision of the Cardiff Public Services Board (PSB), but related to the cessation of funding by the Cardiff & Vale University Health Board and the Council.</p> <p>The Cardiff Community Safety Leadership Board has also reviewed its priorities for the coming year and will be recommending to the PSB that the board focus on a smaller number of key strategic</p>

workstreams.

One of identified key areas of work is to further develop the response of the partnership to address the contextual safeguarding of vulnerable individuals who are, or who are likely to be, the victims of exploitation. This approach recognises and seeks to create safety by addressing the situations, contexts and relationships in which exploitation thrives. This approach will focus on interventions to try to prevent the adverse experiences that can lead to sex work.

There is close working between the Community Safety Partnership and both of the Regional Safeguarding Adults and Children's Boards. Whilst the former leads strategically on contextual safeguarding, the Safeguarding Boards focus on the strategic and operational actions to safeguard children and adults at risk. The Safeguarding Boards are working together to develop an exploitation strategy, which sets out how partners will work together, building on the really positive outcomes in safeguarding children at risk or experiencing child sexual exploitation, to support adults and children at risk of all forms of exploitation. Anyone who is concerned that a child or adult at risk is being exploited has a duty to report their concerns through the Multi Agency Safeguarding Hub (MASH).

Partners are working to ensure a clear pathway for referrals and self-reporting into the refreshed partnership safeguarding arrangements. It is important that we support all our workforce to understand their duty to report, and the signs of vulnerability, as many council officers will come into contact with vulnerable people, such as sex workers. Officers such as those in trading standards are key in this respect. The refreshed Corporate Safeguarding Policy, and supporting structures, also support improved practice in this respect. In addition, the expertise of those who specialise in safeguarding and exploitation is developing across agencies. This systemic approach will ensure the sustainability of our service interventions for this vulnerable group and ensure that we are complying fully with our legal responsibilities.

W21

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY

I recently visited a resident in a council property in my ward at their request, and was shocked to see and hear how the damp and mould was affecting the health of their family, including a young mother and a baby who had both recently been hospitalised as a result. Is the council aware of how many council properties are causing similar health problems for residents in Cardiff and what is it doing about it?

Reply

Mould can result from poor ventilation or when a home is not heated appropriately. In a smaller number of cases, there may be more fundamental issues with the property. When an issue of damp is reported to the Council, a property inspection will be arranged by a technical manager who will diagnose the problem and raise the necessary works order to rectify any issues. I would urge any tenant with issues of mould or damp to report this immediately by contacting C2C.

Of the 65,770 repair requests received by the Council since 1st April 2018, there were 1,056 reports of damp and condensation. Works orders were raised for 711 of these cases, which represents approximately 5% of the total housing stock. A third of referrals were resolved without the need for any works by providing appropriate advice.

Officers will be carrying out further work to develop a strategy covering these issues during 2019/20. This will include a review of works orders by area/property type to identify if there are any underlying issues with property construction or the local environment.

Where appropriate, properties will have more intrusive investigations. This may include the installation of monitoring equipment at specific properties that measure moisture level, effectiveness of heating and ventilation and thermal investigations. These studies will help identify bespoke property improvements to eradicate specific problems. We are being supported in this by the British Research Establishment (BRE) who are the recognised experts in this field. They will be reviewing specific properties and advising on best practice.

These issues should be seen in context and, generally, the condition of our housing stock is very good. Cardiff was the first Council in Wales to achieve the Welsh Housing Quality Standard (WHQS) and a recent review by the Wales Audit Office commended the work being done to maintain the quality of our housing stock. The average SAP rating for our housing is 71.2, well above the WHQS requirement of 65. Given the age of our housing stock, this is performance is very good.

W22

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

A study by The Albert Kennedy Trust has found that up to 24% of young people at-risk of homelessness are LGBTQ+, despite only 4% of young people in the UK identifying as LGBTQ+ in 2017. What

measures are in place in the city to try and address the housing and homelessness-related needs of this hugely over-represented group and the intersecting issues they face?

Reply

We are aware that young people identifying as LGBTQ+ face additional challenges and can be more likely to face homelessness. Fortunately, the Council has excellent services in place for young people facing homelessness.

The Young Persons Gateway in Cardiff is a partnership between Children's Services, Housing and Llamau, a third sector organisation which focuses on providing support to young people. The Gateway gives access to a range of services, including family mediation, supported accommodation and support within the young person's own home. The accommodation and support services provided to young people through the Gateway have recently been recommissioned. The specification for these services set out very clearly the need to understand the effects of sexual orientation on young people who are LGBTQ+ and to have clear policies and procedures in place for meeting their needs.

Going forward, the monitoring arrangements for these contracts will include feedback from young people and particular attention will be paid to the feedback from this very vulnerable client group.

W23

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

A YouGov survey commissioned by Shelter Cymru found that 3% of female private tenants and 2% of male private tenants in Wales have been offered 'sex for rent' by a landlord within the last five years. This suggests there could be around 6,900 women and 4,600 men who have been offered 'sex for rent' across the country over this period. What are the Council and its partners able to do to publicise the illegality of this practice, to make tenants aware of the organisations that are able to help if they find themselves in such a position, and to punish landlords guilty of perpetrating this activity?

Reply

The practice of using social media platforms to advertise sex for rent is a disturbing new phenomenon that has been highlighted recently by organisations such as Housing Women Cymru, who launched a campaign on this subject in December 2018.

The Crown Prosecution Service (CPS) confirmed in January 2019 that 'sex for rent' can be considered a criminal offence under section 52 or 53 of the Sexual Offences Act 2003. To date, however, there is no record of any successful prosecution having been taken for this offence in these circumstances and there was a debate in Parliament last year on whether there should be a reliance on current criminal provisions or if new legislation is required to deal with the matter. There is a possibility of a test case being taken in Brighton to gauge the likelihood of securing a conviction using the current legislation.

In relation to the Council, apart from lending support to campaigns that publicise this issue, Rent Smart Wales has and will continue to make it clear that this practice is an illegal activity and is in discussions with the Welsh Government to amend the Rent Smart Wales Code of Practice to make this explicit. In order to hold a licence, a landlord must be assessed as being a "fit and proper person" under Section 20 of the Housing (Wales) Act 2014. Engaging in activity of this type would certainly put their licence at risk. Similarly, any landlord who holds a HMO licence issued by the Council and who was found guilty of such an offence would also be subject to a review of their fitness and propriety.

INVESTMENT AND DEVELOPMENT
(COUNCILLOR RUSSELL GOODWAY)

W24	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH</u></p> <p>With the help of the GMB union and the Wales Co-operative Centre, nine self-employed Cardiff taxi drivers have recently launched a new taxi co-operative aiming to give its drivers a fairer share of the profits. What support are we, as a Cooperative Council, able to offer them?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>As per any business or social enterprise that seeks council support, officers would happy to meet and review their plans. We would also usually signpost them to support provided by partners such as the Wales Co-operative Centre. It is important to note that all support is discretionary.</p> <p>From a licensing perspective, I understand that the new taxi co-operative has been issued with a private hire operator licence. Officers from Shared Regulatory Services have also been in discussion with the company to offer any advice as requested. However, in its role as a regulator, the Council must ensure that all businesses are treated equitably and cannot favour one business model over another.</p>
W25	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOOD</u></p> <p>The budget identified that funds of up to £25000 are available to prepare a property prior to a community asset transfer (CAT) to community groups. Could the council confirm if these funds can be used to carry out work on the Mynachdy Institute prior to conclusion of the current CAT process and what the criteria for use of the funding are?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The Community Asset Transfer budget allows for groups, which have been awarded a lease for a former Council asset under an asset transfer, to seek funding for capital projects up to a maximum of £25,000. The criteria within which funding can be awarded are strict in relation to the timing of the application being prior to entering into the lease and the works being health and safety orientated. This budget is at the Council's full discretion and, given leases are for 25 years, it is therefore allocated for long term occupiers.</p>

W26

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK

For what purpose has the council felt the need to spend over £400K on the purchase of a property next to Rhydypenau primary school?

Reply

The property was purchased to safeguard any future access requirements to the school.

Rhydypenau Primary School will make use of the property until September 2020, when its strategic importance will be reviewed. The school will use it for teacher training and preparation, extended opportunities for the pupils and as an after school club.

In the Autumn of 2020, if the site is no longer deemed to be of strategic importance, it is likely that it will be disposed of.

LEADER
(COUNCILLOR HUW THOMAS)

W27

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOYLE

In a recent report, the Welsh Audit Office said that '[w]hile some public bodies have done a lot of preparation, others reported that continuing uncertainty meant they had made only limited preparations so far.' Did the WAO have Cardiff Council in mind when it made that observation and what advice have we received from them in terms of improving our preparedness for a no-deal Brexit?

Reply

As you will be aware, the Wales Audit Office has also acknowledged in a report published in February this year that "*most public bodies across Wales are clearly taking their 'No Deal' Brexit planning seriously*".

The WLGA recently confirmed that Cardiff is "ahead of the game" in many ways in terms of Brexit preparations, having already undertaken a detailed assessment, which was reported to Cabinet in October 2018, and by ensuring a coordinated approach for the city through the Cardiff Public Services Board.

In addition, the Council has undertaken detailed contingency planning by reviewing long-standing business continuity plans in the context of Brexit. This has included all directorates engaging with their suppliers and supply chains to discuss any potential risks in the event of the UK leaving the EU with No Deal, and identifying appropriate mitigation. The Council's Emergency Management Unit has also been alerted to the identified risks. This process drew on the Council's established risk management arrangements and will help inform the national command, control and communication measures that have been established by the Westminster Government and Welsh Government to manage a No Deal Brexit.

STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT
(COUNCILLOR CARO WILD)

W28	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GIBSON</u></p> <p>Could you provide a detailed breakdown of highways expenditure per ward over the past 5 financial years?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Unfortunately, this information is not available by ward as, amongst other things, many roads form ward boundaries or go through the middle of some wards in the city.</p> <p>If you have concerns about the condition of any specific roads in your ward, then I would encourage you to raise these issues with highways officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment directorate, if you have not already done so.</p>
W29	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY</u></p> <p>Earlier this month 4 council officers attended a car parking awards ceremony, with hospitality provided, as disclosed on the recently published officer register of gifts and hospitality for this financial year. At a time when this administration is supposedly promoting sustainable transport options, what message does this send about the priorities of the council, in terms of celebrating innovation and success in the transport sector in Cardiff?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The British Parking Awards are a celebration of best practice and innovation across all facets of parking in the UK. I am pleased that the Council's hard working and dedicated team were shortlisted for an award. It also recognised our initiatives and progressive policies to transform parking enforcement in the city, particularly through the use of technology, which play an integral part in delivering sustainable transport solutions in Cardiff.</p> <p>The awards also provided an important networking opportunity for officers to meet with suppliers and other companies at the forefront of parking initiatives and technologies, as well as seeing what other local authorities across the UK are implementing in terms of technology and other best practice initiatives to help solve parking issues. This would include potential solutions for addressing your concerns about problem parking outside schools, which you have</p>

	<p>raised in your next question.</p>
W30	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDREY</u></p> <p>Problem parking by parents outside schools is a regular issue in Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn, and no doubt across the whole city. What work is being done to enable a desperately needed culture change around how children get to school?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>I am aware of the problems caused by parents parking outside schools in a number of areas of the city. Whilst I appreciate the pressures on working parents to combine the school run with commuting to work, I am very concerned about the impact on the safety and health of school children from heavy traffic and problem parking outside schools in the mornings and afternoons.</p> <p>To address this issue, we are investigating the feasibility of introducing vehicle access restrictions at drop-off and pick-up times on roads outside schools where these problems are occurring. We are also working on a programme of engagement with schools to support the development of Active Travel Plans, which will include educational and promotional activities to support walking and cycling to school, as well as physical improvements beyond the school gates to make active travel safer and more attractive to both parents and school children.</p>
W31	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE</u></p> <p>What discussions has the Council had with Caerphilly Council and/or CADW about the preservation of historic Castell Morgraig, near Thornhill?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Officers are not aware of any discussions relating to Castell Morgraig, the Scheduled area of which falls partially within Cardiff Council's boundary. It should be noted that the ruined castle itself lies within the boundaries of Caerphilly County Borough Council.</p> <p>It should also be noted that Scheduled Monuments are regulated and administered by Welsh Ministers. Any discussions that may have taken place would have been between the landowner and Cadw.</p>

W32

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE

How does the Council plan to build on the Cardiff Car Free Day initiative?

Reply

Following the last year's successful event, Car Free Day 2019 will take place on Sunday 12th May.

The event will again be combined with the HSBC Let's Ride, a free cycle ride for cyclists of all ages and abilities, which will follow a closed road route via Cathays Park, Castle Street, High Street, St Mary Street and Westgate Street. The closed streets will play host to a wide range of activities and entertainment, focusing on Castle Street, which will seek to create a festival atmosphere.

We are in process of engaging with public transport operators with a view to maximising opportunities to promote the use of public transport for travel to and from the city centre on the day.

We also want the event to have a strong community dimension. To this end, we are working closely with key stakeholders and community groups to help facilitate their participation.

I am fully aware of the demand in some quarters for car free days to take place more regularly. We will be evaluating the impact of the event and, as part of this, I am keen that we seek people's views about the idea of staging car free days more frequently, possibly on a smaller scale than the event planned for May.

In considering this matter, we would obviously need to take account of the views of city centre businesses and transport operators. A key issue is also the cost to the Council of more frequent closures, particularly in light of the calls on our budgets to support other community events, as well as continuing budgetary pressures.

W33

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE

What criteria has the Council set for the location of Nextbike Cycle Docking Stations and what proportion of the current Nextbike sites are within free public wi-fi zones?

Reply

The Council worked closely with nextbike during the network

development and the criteria used to assess hire station locations are as follows:

A: CITYWIDE NETWORK considerations:

- Commercial viability
- Area Mapping
- Location proposal mapping
- Network Gap analysis

B: LOCAL NETWORK considerations:

Demand Assessments including:

- Trip attractors/generators
- Population served

Local connectivity to districts including:

- Distance
- Geography
- Severance issues

C: INDIVIDUAL SITE features including:

- Space
- Accessibility
- Infrastructure
- Pedestrian flow
- Scheme security
- Scheme Visibility
- Configuration of infrastructure on street (including service access points and drainage etc.)
- Surface condition
- Trees
- GPS connectivity
- Impacts on other road users

With regard to the locations of hire stations with access to free wi-fi, the following hire stations are located within the city centre free public wi-fi zone:

- Cardiff City Hall (outer edge of the mapped area)
- Cathays Park
- Churchill Way (outer edge of the mapped area)
- St John Street
- St Mary Street

In Cardiff Bay, only the Wales Millennium Centre location is within

	the free public wi-fi zone.
W34	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BALE</u></p> <p>What is the default brightness level set for LED street lights in Cardiff and which locations in Llanishen and Thornhill have had LED street lights set to levels above or below this default level and why?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Street lighting levels are set in accordance with the road on which they are situated and are governed by the type of road – its width, locality of junctions or other conflict areas, height of columns etc. For the majority of LED installations, the lighting levels will have been set to a very similar level to that of the lighting it replaced.</p> <p>To assist in the management of street lighting, a central management system was commissioned at the time of the LED scheme installation. This system has enabled the Council to raise or lower levels, where appropriate, in reaction to received reports or requests.</p> <p>We currently underrun the LED lighting via the central management system to mitigate for excessive glare that can be experienced from LED streetlights. This also supports our energy saving initiatives and provides the flexibility required to address concerns. In addition, the LEDs in Cardiff have a lighting warmth level of 3000 Kelvin; again, to reduce glare and provide an improved environment.</p> <p>I can confirm that the lighting levels were raised at Thornhill Road, in close proximity to the Crematorium entrance, due to a report of traffic safety concerns relating to an existing traffic island.</p>
W35	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOOD</u></p> <p>When did the council become aware that the owner of the old coal yard site (Mederco Ltd) entered administration and consequently what are the implications for the S106 agreement relating to the Mynachdy Institute?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>There is no reason for the Council as the Local Planning Authority to have been notified by the Administrator that Mederco (Cardiff) Limited is in administration. From the Companies House website, it</p>

	<p>would appear that Mederco (Cardiff) Limited entered into administration on 17 January 2019. That company [not Mederco Limited, which is also in Administration] is the owner of the Mynachdy Road site for which planning permission has been granted (Ref: 17/01963/MJR).</p> <p>The section 106 agreement dated 13 July 2018 relating to the planning permission has been registered as a local land charge and a Land Registry restriction has been registered against the title to the site, which requires the Council's consent to a disposal of the site. The Administrator has a duty to try to save the Company and it is a matter for them as to how to proceed with regard to the site.</p>
W36	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOOD</u></p> <p>Can the council confirm if it supports the future Gabalfa train station being located to the south of Western Avenue (e.g. between Mynachdy Estate & Talybont student residences)?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Through the Wales and Borders rail franchise, Transport for Wales is committed to building new stations in Cardiff at Crwys Road, Loudoun Square and Cardiff Bay by 2023, as well as a new Gabalfa station by 2028.</p> <p>Transport for Wales will be preparing the business case to inform the decision about where the new Gabalfa station is to be located. There will be a number of delivery and operational issues, opportunities and constraints for the business case to consider before the preferred location of the station is decided.</p> <p>It is envisaged that Transport for Wales will seek input from the Council at the appropriate time to help inform the business case and the decision making process. The Council will consider the merits of the business case for each location before recommending a preference.</p>
W37	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOOD</u></p> <p>The road surface on Talygarn Street has for a long time been in a poor state of repair and has known structural issues. Can the council confirm the necessary carriageway reconstruction work will be carried out in the 2019-20 financial year?</p>

	<p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Talygarn Street in Gabalfa will be reassessed in the new financial year to determine its current condition and where it will sit within the scheme priority list. Safety inspections will continue to be carried out and any actionable safety defects will be recorded and repaired as required.</p>
W38	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DRISCOLL</u></p> <p>Following a recent release of the Cardiff Highway Improvement Programme 2018, between 30th July 2018 and 30th October 2018, how many roads in Riverside were resurfaced with Carriageway surface treatment and Carriageway re-surfacing?</p> <p>Collectively over this period, how many days work do all these schemes add up to in Riverside?</p> <p>For the same periods, how many roads in Llandaff Ward have received Carriageway surface treatment and Carriageway resurfacing?</p> <p>For comparison, how many days work do the jobs add up to in Llandaff Ward and what is the percentage difference?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>I am not prepared to provide ward-by-ward breakdowns for arbitrary periods of time, which could provide a misleading snapshot, as quite obviously different areas will be worked during different months for efficiency.</p> <p>It is also worth noting that the Highway Improvement Programme is based on a survey of road condition, which determines the most appropriate treatment to be applied. As such, the lengths of time taken to undertake these works will depend on the state of the road.</p> <p>If you have concerns regarding the current methodology or prioritisation of these works, then I would be happy to meet with you to discuss this matter further.</p>
W39	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DRISCOLL</u></p> <p>How long has the bus lane on Llantrisant Road, Llandaff outside the BBC been installed and, since the introduction of camera enforcement of this bus lane, how much has been collected in fines?</p>

For comparison, how much in fines have been collected in the bus lane on Cathedral Road, Pontcanna in the Cabinet Member for Transport's ward and what is the difference in percentage with Llandaff?

Reply

The bus lane on Llantrisant Road outside the BBC building in Llandaff was completed in June 2015. Since the introduction of camera enforcement, £143,569.99 has been received in fines as of 18th March 2019.

In comparison, the Cathedral Road bus lane is a relatively new scheme. Surveys will be carried out to assess the level of misuse and whether further enforcement measures would be appropriate at this location.

W40

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DRISCOLL

Residents have expressed that they are being unnecessarily fined for inadvertently veering into the bus lane outside the BBC on Llantrisant Road, Llandaff because of poor layout, bad road markings, badly positioned and poor maintenance of unclear signage, which is compounded when traffic is as often moving slowly. Will you look into the layout of the bus lane and signage with Highways officers to see if this is the case that this road layout needs re-adjustment?

Also, I know that fines have to be dealt with through the proper appeals process as set out on the ticket, but if it is the case that the road layout needs to be changed or additional road markings and signage be added, do you agree that the people already wrongly fined should be reimbursed?

Also, do you agree that, in future, anyone inadvertently veering into this bus lane for the first time should initially receive a warning?

Reply

I can confirm that all Penalty Charge Notices (PCNs) issued to vehicles found to be in contravention of the restrictions at this location have been issued correctly. The location is lined and signed correctly and complies fully with legislation. We would only issue warning letters to drivers during the initial period of operating any new enforcement scheme prior to the commencement of the charging regime.

We operate a robust, but fair, traffic enforcement function and every motorist has the right to appeal against a PCN; however, they must do so within the legislative timeframes as stated on the PCN itself. All cases are decided on their own merit and, if a motorist offers mitigating circumstances for breaching the regulations (i.e. why they veered into a bus lane), then those will be considered as part of their appeal.

If a motorist disagrees with the decision returned by the Council, then they have the legal right to make further representations to the independent Traffic Penalty Tribunal, where an adjudicator will consider a case based on the evidence provided by both the Council and the motorist. Cases can only be registered with the Tribunal if the correct legal process has been correctly adhered to.

A number of cases for PCNs issued at this location have been heard by the Tribunal and it has been confirmed that the restrictions are clearly and correctly lined and signed and this has been reflected in the decisions returned.

I would add that any future works, amendments or the refreshing of lines and signs at any location, after a PCN has been issued, does not invalidate PCNs previously issued to vehicles at any location. The same would apply to this location and, therefore, refunds for PCNs previously issued would not be given.

W41

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DRISCOLL

Six Nations Rugby Travel Advice on the council website says to book online for parking in Council Car Parks before travelling, alternatively, drivers will have to pay £15.00 cash only as is the case for Sophia Gardens car park. Why in this digital age are we not providing the option to pay by card at these car parks?

Also, are we unnecessarily exposing our staff to the dangers of having to collect cash and what are we doing to provide safety for these staff?

Reply

The facility to provide mobile card payments within the car parks is being pursued with the Council's Finance team and it is hoped that this will be operational for a trial exercise by the end of May 2019.

I can confirm that the Major Events team will be part of the trial, meaning that payment by card at event car parks will also be

	<p>available from the end of May 2019. On completion of the trial, provided that there are no problems, the facility will be made available for every event at all the car parks managed by the Council.</p> <p>In terms of cash collection, staff operate in line with the Council's guidelines to ensure that they do not work alone and the amount of cash they are handling at any one time is limited.</p>
W42	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK</u></p> <p>Should proposed highways public consultation be accessible and include speaking to public to explain the scheme and listen to residents views?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>Major highway and transportation schemes would go through public consultation where there is a fundamental change.</p> <p>The highway resurfacing and surface treatment programme prioritisation process is based primarily on condition. The majority of the work is replacement or improvement to the highway surface, with no fundamental change of use. However, during the process, other relevant information is reviewed, including public and elected member requests, links to other council schemes and strategies and collaboration wherever possible.</p>
W43	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MOLIK</u></p> <p>Whilst we are calling for people to take up active sustainable travel and the need to address loneliness and promote wellbeing within our communities, is it right for bus services to be stopped in an area with a high number of elderly residents?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The decision to withdraw certain bus services was, under the current legislation, a matter for Cardiff Bus, and was done on the grounds that insufficient revenue was being generated by passengers to cover the services running costs.</p> <p>I can confirm that, as a result of funding being agreed in the Council's budget for 2019/20 and 2020/21, tenders have been sought and awarded by the Council to keep bus services running in the areas of the city that were affected by the service withdrawals. In order to</p>

	<p>retain these services over the longer term, it is vital that people use them.</p>
W44	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOWELLS</u></p> <p>At the last Adamsdown PACT meeting, concern was raised about the numerous potholes on Broadway. Can the Council confirm whether Broadway will be included in the carriageway repair programme for 2019/2020?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The 2019/20 resurfacing and treatment programme will be developed early in the new financial year and Broadway will be assessed and considered for inclusion. In the short term, an inspection of the carriageway will be undertaken and any identified localised areas of deterioration can be addressed within the current minor works programme.</p>
W45	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DILWAR ALI</u></p> <p>What action has the Council taken to protect the route of the proposed 'Coryton Loop' rail extension in north Cardiff from future development?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>The adopted Local Development Plan 2006-2026 includes Policy T9: Cardiff City Region 'Metro' Network, which seeks – through the development management process – to either secure provision of the necessary infrastructure as part of the development or safeguard the land and space required to accommodate the route and potential mode options in the future. This will include requiring a development to be designed in a way that does not prejudice the future development of the 'Metro' route and would enable it to be incorporated within the development at a later date.</p> <p>With regard to recent developments in the vicinity of the potential route, planning permission (ref: 17/01735/MJR) has been granted for the access roads into the proposed new Velindre Cancer Hospital, with the details for the design of the hospital to be submitted for later consideration. The Velindre NHS Trust is confident that the development would not prejudice a potential metro scheme.</p> <p>Through the Wales and Borders rail franchise, Transport for Wales</p>

	<p>has made no commitment to build an extension to the railway line in Cardiff that currently terminates at Coryton station. However, the Council will work closely with Transport for Wales and the Welsh Government on any potential rail extensions in the city, including options beyond Coryton station, and also with developers to protect alignment options. Any such rail extensions will require business cases to be developed in order to bid for funding and/or generate investment interest.</p>
W46	<p><u>WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DILWAR ALI</u></p> <p>What action has the Council taken to protect the land needed for the proposed Llandaff North/Gabalfa metro train station in north Cardiff from future development?</p> <p><u>Reply</u></p> <p>I would refer you again to Policy T9 in the adopted LDP, which I outlined in response to your previous Written Question. Through the Wales and Borders rail franchise, Transport for Wales is committed to providing a new Gabalfa train station by 2028. Whilst the exact details of the proposed station are yet to be confirmed, the Council will work closely with Transport for Wales at the appropriate time to help inform the development of a business case and the decision making process.</p>

This page is intentionally left blank