# THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on Thursday 26 September 2013 to transact the business set out in the Council Summons dated 20 September 2013.

# Present: County Councillor Derek Morgan (Lord Mayor in the Chair);

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, Corria, Cowan, Kirsty Davies, Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Evans, Ford, Furlong, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Graham, Groves, Hinchey, Howells, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Knight, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Lent, Lloyd, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Michael, Mitchell, Merry, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Simmons, Benjamin Thomas, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walker, Walsh, Weaver, Williams and Woodman

Apologies: County Councillors Manzoor Ahmed, Hawkins, Holden, Holland, Hudson, and Sanders.

#### 54 : WEBCASTING AND RECORDING OF PROCEEDINGS

Members were reminded of a decision of the Constitution Committee on 10 July, 2008 to webcast the Council meeting. Members were also reminded that the Constitution Committee had previously agreed that Council proceedings be recorded for administrative purposes.

Formal approval to record the proceedings was agreed.

#### 55 : MINUTES - 25 JULY 2013

The minutes of the meeting held on 25 July 2013 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

#### 56 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chairman reminded Members of their responsibility under Article 16 of the Members' Code of Conduct to declare any interest, and to complete Personal Interest forms, at the commencement of the item of business.

The following declarations were made:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Interest</u>
Councillor Cowan	Unopposed Business: Item 17 – Urgent Decision Taken by Cabinet in respect of Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone.	Prejudicial interest as family friend involved in Item 17.
Councillor Mitchell	General	As Chair of the Riverside Advice Limited as a Third Sector advice service.
Councillor Robson	Unopposed Business: Item 17 – Urgent Decision Taken by Cabinet in respect of Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone.	Prejudicial interest as family friend involved in Item 17.
Councillor Walsh	Item 11 – Statement of Accounts	Personal Interest in receipt of Council Pension

#### 57 : ANNOUNCEMENTS

#### (i) <u>Sir Geoffrey Inkin</u>

It was with great sadness that Members learned that Sir Geoffrey Inkin had passed away on 22 August, 2013. Sir Geoffrey played a very influential part in the redevelopment of Cardiff and its promotion on the international stage during his time as Chairman of the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and was a great supporter of business in Cardiff. The Lord Mayor had on behalf of Members passed on sincere condolences to Sir Geoffrey's his widow Susan and all the family.

153

#### (ii) Former Councillor Fred Hornblow

The Lord Mayor advised that he had on behalf of Members sent sincere condolences to Iris Hornblow and her family following the sad news that former Councillor Fred Hornblow had passed away on 12 August, 2013.

Councillor Hornblow represented the Cathays Ward for the City Council from 1983 to 1995 and Cardiff County Council from 1995 – 2004, and was an active member of the Castle Management, Personnel and Housing Committees.

(iii) <u>New Directors</u>

The Lord Mayor formally welcomed the new Directors to Cardiff Council. Members would be working closely with them in the coming year.

#### (iv) The National Service of Remembrance for Wales

Members were advised that the National Service of Remembrance for Wales would be held on Sunday 10 November 2013 at the Wales National War Memorial in Alexandra Gardens, Cathays Park. The Service would commence at 10.58 am prior to the observance of the Two Minute Silence at 11.00 am.

#### (v) European Capital for Sport 2014

The Lord Mayor was delighted to have been invited to accept the Award for the 'European Capital for Sport 2014' on behalf of the City of Cardiff. The award gives recognition to Cardiff as a Capital for Sport alongside some of the great cities in Europe.

#### (vi) Congratulations

The Lord Mayor on behalf of Members congratulated Councillor Gretta Marshall and best wishes to all the family following the birth of her first grand-daughter on 9 August 2013.

(vii) <u>The Leader</u>

The Lord Mayor advised that the Leader had asked that her apologies be noted for the start of the meeting as she was attending

a meeting with the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport regarding city regions. The Deputy Leader would cover any matters in her absence.

## (viii) Awards

## Celebrating the opening of new schools

This month had seen the transfer of three schools to new locations:

- Ysgol Gymraeg Treganna opened a brand new site on Sanatorium Road in Canton and welcomed more than 600 pupils aged 3 -11. A major investment which has transformed the Welsh-medium primary school into a three form entry school with a nursery. As well as new starters joining the school this term, pupils have transferred from Ysgol Tan-Yr-Eos and the old Ysgol Treganna onto the new site.
- Ysgol Bro Edern has also moved from its temporary site shared with Ysgol Glantaf to its permanent site on Llanedeyrn Road. The school is on the site of the former St Teilo's school and is undergoing phased refurbishment which will be completed in 2014.
- Students in St Teilo's Church in Wales High School have moved to a new purpose built site in Llanedeyrn. The £23 million investment includes recreational facilities which will benefit the local community as well as the school.

In addition work has been undertaken over the summer to ensure the new Eastern High opened on the former Rumney High site.

Thanks to all those involved in ensuring these projects were delivered in time for the start of the new school year.

#### Nine Green flags flying high across the city

Cardiff successfully retained its nine Green Flag sites for another year. These sites include six parks, two cemeteries and the Barrage. The first Green Flag award was achieved in 2002 for Roath Park followed by Victoria Park (2003), Grange Gardens (2004), Bute Park (2008), Cardiff Bay Barrage (2009), Cathays Cemetery (2009), Rumney Hill Gardens (2010), Thornhill Crematorium (2011) and most recently Parc Cefn Onn (in 2012).

Credit should be given to the Friends of Hailey Park who have been awarded a Green Flag Community Award for the second year running for their work in maintaining and developing the wild flower meadow in Hailey Park.

Green Flag is the UK national quality award scheme for parks and green spaces which is now managed by Keep Wales Tidy. Sites are independently assessed each year and the award of a green flag recognizes their high quality and sustainable management.

Congratulations to everyone who has worked to achieve this fantastic achievement.

#### Association of Public Services Awards

The Lord Mayor congratulated the Cardiff's Street Cleansing Team for winning the National Association for Public Service Excellence (APSE) Best Service Team award for Street Cleansing and Street-scene. It is a very competitive national award between every Local Authority and Fire Service in the UK and 375 entries were submitted. The entire team should be highly commended for their fantastic efforts, and for playing their role in showcasing the city to the world and it is tremendous to have their work recognised nationally.

#### Cardiff Story Museum

Congratulations to The Cardiff Story Museum, who are one of three finalists in the Small Employer of the Year category in this year's Apprenticeship Awards Cymru 2013 shortlisted from 170 applications.

The Apprenticeship Awards Cymru celebrates the outstanding achievements of learners, employers and providers involved in the delivery of quality apprenticeships across Wales. Showcasing excellence in skills development in Wales, the awards are organised jointly by the Welsh Government and the National Training Federation for Wales (NTfW). The Apprenticeship Awards Cymru aim to recognise and celebrate employers, learners and providers who commit to developing their workforce through Apprenticeships and supporting their employees during their training.

156

Awards will be presented on Friday 18th October 2013 at the Celtic Manor Resort, Newport. We wish the team the good luck.

## 58: PUBLIC QUESTIONS

#### Public Question 1

The Lord Mayor advised that in accordance with the Council Procedure Rule 18 (i), as the public questioner was absent the question was deemed to be withdrawn.

#### Public Question 2

#### Question: Mr Joel Williams

By direction of the Labour administration in Cardiff, it is proposed to adopt an LDP that will see many of Cardiff's rolling green fields destroyed and concreted over forever, shattering opportunities for future generations to relish and enjoy. The proposed LDP will see 14,000 homes built on green fields across the city, including 1,300 build west of Old St Mellons, to the strong objection of local residents. Could you please answer to claims made by the electorate that the administration has broken their pre election manifesto pledge which promised to "Protect Cardiff's great green spaces"?

Could you comment on why the Labour administration decided not to adopt "Plan C" as its preferred LDP?

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

The question falls within my portfolio and I have discussed this issue with the Leader.

The previous administration produced a Plan which was not based on evidence and had to be withdrawn by the Council. The resultant delay has left the Council with an insufficient land supply and vulnerable to 'ad hoc' planning applications in the countryside. We're only too well aware of appeals which have been lost, together with others in the pipeline where the Council and local communities have limited control on the location, infrastructure and facilities provided.

The current administration is preparing a Plan which is based on evidence and provides the new jobs and homes which are needed in Cardiff. Measures are also set out to ensure new development brings with it new infrastructure and facilities. Furthermore, the Plan protects open spaces within the city, our valued river valleys and also designates a Green Belt on strategically important land north of the M4, which can be enjoyed by future generations.

#### Supplementary Question: Mr Joel Williams

Firstly, can I express my concern that the Leader of this Council couldn't answer my question, as my question was initially targeted at her; and thanks to Councillor Keith Jones' Twitter, it does actually contain the Labour administration's pre-election pledges which promised not to build on greenfields.

I would like to know what it would have taken for this Council to adopt Plan C as its preferred strategy. 75% of members of the public chose Plan C, citing that it was a more realistic and achievable plan.

This administration has let the people of Cardiff down.

I would like to know - why is it you are not listening to the hard working people of Cardiff where, in the Local Development Plan report, 89% of people have said that this figure is too large; and why is it that you will not adopt a brownfields-first policy?

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Thank you. As you can see, the Leader is not here today so obviously can't respond, but, in her absence, I would suggest that once we get into the debate at this meeting on the Local Development Plan, perhaps that might become fairly evident.

# 59 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were submitted:

1. <u>Councillor Lloyd</u> - from 161 residents calling on Cardiff Council to take all necessary steps to ensure Llanishen Reservoir is refilled.

- 158
- 2. <u>Councillor Walker</u> from over 3220 signatories calling on Cardiff Council to take all necessary steps to ensure Llanishen Reservoir is re-filled.
- 3. <u>Councillor Bradbury</u> from over 1385 residents opposed to the closure of Ty Newydd Care Home, Caerau.
- 4. <u>Councillor Clark</u> from 44 residents opposed to the proposed change to parking restrictions Marlborough Terrace Blackweir (notice C2063, dated 16.09.13).
- 5. <u>Councillor Bridges</u> from over 150+ residents calling on the Council to fully resurface Heathfield Road and Heathfield Place Gabalfa as a matter of urgency.
- 6. <u>Councillor Richard Cook</u> from 180 residents requesting the reinstatement of the recording of cats killed as a result of road traffic accidents and subsequently picked up and disposed of by waste.
- 7. <u>Councillor Parry</u> from 56 residents asking the Council to assess the site and implement robust safety measures at the junction of Ty Fry Road and Claremont Ave Rumney.
- 8. <u>Councillor Lent</u> from 152 residents in relation to refuse Issues in Bangor Street, Roath.
- 9. Councillor Lent from 152 residents health and safety issues in Bangor Street.
- 10. <u>Councillor Patel</u> 314 residents against the withdrawing of the number 33 bus through Canton.

#### 60 : STANDARDS AND ETHICS ANNUAL REPORT 2012/13

The Lord Mayor welcomed the Chair of the Standards and Ethics Committee, Mr Akmal Hanuk to the meeting to present the Committee's 9<sup>th</sup> Annual Report and his last as Chair of the Committee as he will be standing down in November 2013. On behalf of the Members of the Council, the Lord Mayor thanked Mr Hanuk for his dedication and championing of Standards and Principles in Public Life in Cardiff; for his

diligence in taking matters forward in Committee and responding to Members at meetings and Full Council. In addition he thanked Mr Hanuk for his role in the Annual Standards Conference held in Cardiff on two occasions and for imparting his knowledge and advice to other Members and Monitoring Officers during the seminars and break out sessions.

The Chair thanked Members for their support during his 8 years as a member and 7 years as Chair of the Standards and Ethics Committee.

This was the 9<sup>th</sup> Annual Report and the Committee had again conducted and considered important matters relating to Governance and Standards in the Council. During the last 8 years the Committee had been involved in the National Standards Conference in 2009 and 2010; reviewed the threshold value for Hospitality, Gifts and other Benefits; considered the Council's Whistle blowing Policy; brought forward the Planning Code of Practice.

In 2012 -13 the Committee had developed and implemented the introduction of the new Local Resolution Protocol to deal with low level Member on Member complaints relating to conduct issues. The Committee had worked closely with Members to develop the new protocol, which had been welcomed and aimed to speed up resolution of complaints. The adoption of the protocol had resulting in a revision to the Cardiff Undertaking at Annual Council in May 2013.

The Chair reiterated the importance of the promotion of good governance and the need to ensure confidence in those that hold public office. All Members of this administration had receive mandatory training on the Code of Conduct as part of the Member Induction and Development Programme, and work was ongoing with in collaboration with Democratic Services Committee to develop a programme of the Member training for 2013/14.

Finally Mr Hanuk thanked the Committee past and present; the Secretariat and lead officers; and all Councillors for their support over the years.

The Lord Mayor invited contributions from Members during which a number of matters were highlighted including Social Media for Members; Training and Development; welcoming the opportunity for earlier

160

resolution of complaints; governance matters in relation to confidential documents and access or disclosure of key information to Members following requests.

The Lord Mayor on behalf the Council wished Mr Hanuk all the very best for the future.

RELOVED – That the Standards and Ethics Committee Annual report 2012-13 be noted.

#### 61 : AUDIT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2012/13

The Lord Mayor welcomed Professor Maurice Pendlebury who would present the Audit Committee Annual Report 2012/13 as the Chair of the Audit Committee, Sir Jon Shortridge was unable to attend because of a prior commitment.

Professor Pendlebury introduced the first Annual report of the Audit Committee established as a full Committee under the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011. Cardiff Council's is unique in Wales in establishing a Committee of 12 Members – 4 Independent Members and 8 Elected Members, and to ensure continuity, the 4 existing Independent Panel Members were afforded the opportunity of continuing on the new Committee for this term of the Council.

Professor Pendlebury thanked all Members of the Committee for being actively engaged in investigating and providing independent assurance of the Council's Audit, Risk Management and Financial Procedures. In addition he thanked Senior Officers of the Council; the Deputy Auditor General and Senior Officer at the Wales Audit Office; and Internal Audit for their support and work in ensuring that the Committee had been focussed on issues during the year.

The Committee had during the year considered a wide range of topics both standard and specific items, and at each meeting the work programme had been reviewed to include new matters identified by the Committee.

In looking forward to 2013 - 14 and beyond, and given the continued financial pressures facing the Council, the importance of an effective Audit Committee was critical. The report identified some key areas of

focus including the Budgetary challenges 2014/15; update on Senior Management arrangements; Updates on Business Change programmes; Contract Management and Procurement Review of Procedures; Update on Council's Attendance and Wellbeing Policy and Sickness Absence; as well as receiving regular reports and letters from Wales Audit Office as detailed in the report.

All Members were encouraged to bring any audit related matters of concern to the attention of the Chair so that the Committee can take account of changing risks and priorities.

The Lord Mayor thanked Professor Pendlebury for presenting the report and invited contributions from Members. Members recognised the budgetary challenges going forward and the need for robust internal control and governance. It was noted that the Committee would monitor the financial position; investigate in depth unsound and unsatisfactory audits, and non compliance and probity in contract management and procurement; receive updates on attendance and PPDR's.

RESOLVED – That the Annual Audit Committee report 2012/13 be noted.

# 62 : COMMUNITY & NEIGHBOURHOOD REGENERATION AND SOCIAL JUSTICE STATEMENT

#### Prior Information Notice

The Cabinet Member advised that the Council had published a Prior Information Notice (PIN) to the Official Journal of the European Union giving outline details of the Housing Partnership Scheme. This would allow the Council to test the market and work with potential developers to help shape the Council's approach to delivering this important strategic project.

Ward Member consultations had already taken place on potential sites for the new homes and the Council was keen to hear from prospective development partners to progress the Council's ambition of making Cardiff a more attractive place to live and raise a family.

The Council is investing £33m in the scheme and a number of councilowned brownfield sites have been identified as potentially suitable for

development for at least 1,000 properties, up to 40 per cent of which will be new Council homes for rent and low cost home ownership. There are additional sites that with further investigation could also be suitable for redevelopment.

The Prior Information Notice will allow the Council to carry out an appropriate market testing exercise by inviting all interested parties to attend an Open Day in October when senior officers and advisors will be available to discuss the project in more detail and answer questions.

#### Free School Meals

The responsibility for Free School Meals was passed over to Benefit Assessment earlier this year. Benefit records show that approx 1,245 children in Cardiff are eligible for, but not receiving FSM. We are in the process of contacting these families to encourage take up. The Local Authority receives £450 extra funding from the Welsh Assembly Government for each child in receipt of FSM, therefore this represents a potential increase of approx £560,000 funding for schools. The service can now be accessed across the 11 Hubs and area offices throughout the City and can also be claimed on the same form as Housing Benefit and Council Tax Reduction.

The Advice Team at the City Centre Hub can help customers with budgeting, debt advice, and income maximisation to ensure that all are financially included. Team members are experts in welfare reform issues and can advise on the various options available to those affected by the under occupation rules ('bedroom tax') and the Benefit Cap. The Advice Team is also able to refer and signpost customers to partners that offer specialist help.

The Advice Team can also help customers to complete welfare benefit forms, which they often find very daunting and are not able to complete on time. Delays in making applications can lead to a subsequent delay in benefits being awarded and entitlement being reduced or stopped.

Up to the end of August 2013, the Advice Team had helped nearly 1800 customers. They saved customers in excess of £100,000 by assisting with backdated benefit claims, helping to write off fuel debts and ensured that council tax discounts are correct. In addition to this, they also helped customers to claim, on average, £8,000 a week in previously unclaimed,

ongoing benefits. One Member took a resident to the Hub and had provided feedback to say that the service they received was excellent. The resident in question was pleased with the help that they received from the Advice Team and went away with more assistance than they went in for.

The Cabinet Member expressed her support for the valuable work that the Advice Team undertaken at the City Centre Hub and she would ensure that senior managers pass on this positive feedback to those staff on the front line in delivering such important advice services to Cardiff residents.

# Connect to Cardiff

The Cabinet Member advised of a minor change to the Connect to Cardiff service. The Council's contact centre had changed its welcome message and menu options to significantly reduce the time taken to get through to an advisor. The welcome message holds information that is necessary to tell customers legally, and the menu options help the Council understand demand for services so it can plan resources, so whilst they need to remain in place for the time being the Cabinet Member was pleased with the changes that had been made, and was a step forward in improving the customer experience for the citizens of Cardiff, and there are more improvements to come.

As well as improving the experience of contacting the Council by phone, customers can access a wide range of services on a face to face basis through the network of hubs in local communities. The Council was working on plans to make accessing services on line far easier, more efficient and more cost effective – which is what customers want - and using the web is more cost effective for the Council. Members would be aware that the web site is currently being refreshed, once this work has been completed the service will be moving forward with our on-line services.

#### End Racism this Generation

As part of the Cabinet's commitment to equalities, the Cabinet Member wished to raise awareness of the campaign 'End Racism this Generation'. The forthcoming campaign led by race equality think tank 'the Runnymede Trust' and supported by Race Council Cymru in partnership

164

with other Black Asian Minority Ethnic (BAME) organisations working in Wales.

The campaign will be launched in September and will run for 3 years across England and Wales. It will seek to:

- Inspire individuals and organisations to take concerted effort to tackle racial inequality;
- Support innovative activity/ collaboration to tackle racism;
- Create lasting solutions to racial injustice.

The campaign would be supported by a range of interactive materials, providing the opportunity for people to engage in discussion and share knowledge and practice. There would be a selection of specially commissioned films, online seminars and Interviews, along with events taking place across Wales, including a number of debates, youth-led events.

A pop up 'ideas' shop would also be launched in April 2014 in Cardiff.

The Cabinet Member hoped that Council would work with the Cabinet to pledge support for the 'End Racism This Generation' campaign.

# 63 : ENVIRONMENT STATEMENT

#### The Future of Waste and Recycling

The Cabinet Member stated that the Council Environment Departments throughout Wales were facing demands like never before, and some authorities had already highlighted the risks around environmental service objectives in the face of severe financial pressures. He advised that this administration is keen to ensure that it continues to ask for more, and strive for better in the midst of this financial challenge, and provide improved services to Cardiff residents. If the balance, is wrong the Council would not only fail to meet its environmental commitments but fail the people of Cardiff.

The Cabinet Member advised that to this end he was developing a robust and encompassing long term Waste Strategy for Cardiff. It was vital that the Council finds the right balance between its legal, financial and service delivery pressures and the residents of Cardiff come first in that service review. The short term quick wins have gone and as the financial

pressures intensify, the current system become more untenable with greater impact on the Council budgets, and most importantly the residents.

It is now the real challenge begins. In this movement for change the Council can't hold a blinkered or narrow view; no topic is off the limits as it takes the first steps to begin honest and open debate on the options open to Cardiff. Everything is up for debate.

The Cabinet Member was pleased to launch "The Future of Waste and Recycling Consultation Paper – a 2025 Vision for Cardiff", an advanced copy of which will be circulated after Council with the bilingual consultation formally beginning 30 September 2013. The Cabinet Member looked forward to debating these topics and welcomed feedback that will help inform the new Waste and Recycling Strategy for Cardiff towards 2025.

# CYD Cymru

Assisting the most vulnerable people within communities is a clear priority for this administration, and within the Environment portfolio, there is a particularly focus on fuel poverty, which is a significant issue for many people across the country. We know that the price of energy has been going up over recent years. According to Ofgem and ONS figures, energy bills rose by as much as 24% between 2009 and 2012, causing some households to be facing very difficult decisions this winter. This is why last year the Council committed to developing an action plan to deal with this and this is just small part of that plan.

The "Cyd Cymru" initiative, or "Wales Together", could help people get a better deal by buying energy as a collective. It is a scheme developed in collaboration with the Vale of Glamorgan, but it is open to everyone across Wales. Collective energy buying provides the possibility for households and businesses to make compelling savings on their bills. Whilst not everyone is guaranteed to save, by buying energy together, participants of previous collective switching schemes in other areas have saved between £60 and £250 per household per year.

The Cabinet Member was pleased to announce that the Cyd Cymru scheme will be launched this autumn . The registration period for participation will go live on 21<sup>st</sup> October, and the Council was currently

166

working with national stakeholders to ensure that they are in a position to get behind the scheme.

To get the most out of the scheme within Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan, the Council will work closely with the Energy Saving Trust as research suggests that those most likely to benefit from collective switching are the least likely to take part. The Energy Saving Trust will assist in undertaking targeted engagement work within our communities to make sure that the people that would benefit the most do get involved.

Communication and marketing material produced will be shared with partners across Wales to help everyone be part of the scheme. This is important because the more people that take part, the more attractive the group of customers are likely to be to the energy suppliers. This then increases the chances of a better deal.

Further information will be available on the website <u>www.cydcymru-</u><u>energy.com</u>, within local community hubs and through other media in the coming weeks. A series of engagement events designed to get people, particularly vulnerable groups, involved will also be programmed.

The first switch will take place before Christmas, with another two scheduled for early in the New Year. Again, the more people involved, the better the deal. The Cabinet Member encourage Members to get the message out to your communities.

# 64 : CHILDREN'S SERVICES STATEMENT

#### Recruitment and Retention of Social Workers

A motivated and productive workforce is essential to the Council to discharge its statutory duties for children in Cardiff. There has been a historical recruitment and retention issue within Children's Services and the vacancy rate is currently 17%. The Cabinet Member advised that a fully staffed department was a priority for the administration and would result in lower case loads, lower sickness rates and better quality services for children and families.

The Corporate Director for Children's Services since coming into post has reviewed the recruitment strategy in addition to replacing interim managers with existing staff members. This provided experienced staff

the opportunity to 'act up' and demonstrate to colleagues that commitment to the organisation will enable staff to address their continuing professional development and pursue career opportunities. Cardiff Council is committed to achieving effective Social Worker recruitment and retention so that people with the right level of experience and skill are recruited as efficiently and safely as possible; and retained as part of a workforce who are professional, motivated, and committed.

The forthcoming budget will be challenging for all service areas, including Children's Services. It is important that the profile of Children's Services is raised so that Members and the public have a clear understanding of the type of work undertaken within the department.

The Cabinet Member advised that she would be shortly be sending out dates for briefing sessions for Members which will assist Members in understanding the challenging work undertaken by front line social workers and support staff. The subjects are as follows:

- Neglect
- Sexual Exploitation
- Child Protection
- Emotional abuse
- Assessing children and families
- Family Support and Intervention
- Improving the outcomes for looked after children

•

65 : CARDIFF LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN 2006-2026: DEPOSIT PLAN

The Council received the Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006 – 2026: Deposit Plan, together with the Final Sustainability Appraisal report to approve for the purposes of consultation.

The Lord Mayor invited the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Transport, County Councillor Hinchey introduced the report. He thanked Members for their contributions as individuals; ward groups; and at all Member presentations; and for the two way open and frank dialogue. The views expressed had been noted and considered and would be taken into account, and it was hoped that Members would support the collective Draft LDP Deposit Plan before them.

168

The Cabinet Member confirmed that he had in recent weeks visited all the major sites; met with Welsh Government Officials; and that the aim was to have a workable plan in place as soon as possible.

The LDP aimed to continue the legacy of transformation in Cardiff and to ensure it maintained its status as a genuine destination worthy of its Capital City Status. The plan needed to meet the demand for new jobs; housing - especially affordable accommodation; have strategic sustainable transport systems; provide for infrastructure and community facilities; and protect the river valleys and country backdrop of the city. The plan was required to allow for an addition 5 year period and ensure that there is sufficient land for development. The evidence- led approach would move away from an uncontrolled planning vacuum where open countryside was vulnerable to development. The plan aimed to protect the green belt areas of Caerphilly and Garth mountains; work to independently verified growth levels – housing and jobs.

A more detailed master plan setting out the strategy for deliver and supporting documentation would be worked up for detailed examination with Supplementary Planning Guidance and sustainable transport solutions. The Cabinet Member underlined the need to work with neighbouring Local Authorities whose LDP were at the same stage, and the need for a strategic approach across the South East Wales region.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the on the Deposit Plan. As part of the discussion County Councillor Williams proposed a reference back to Cabinet for further consideration. The reference back as proposed was seconded by County Councillor Dianne Rees.

As part of the debate comments and observations were made on issues relating to regional collaboration; infrastructure and transport links; growth predictions; green belt; green field and brown field development land; sustainable communities; and economic growth and city region approach.

The Cabinet Member in summary emphasised the need for the plan to be robust and evidence-led to ensure that the housing; transportation and infrastructure needs of the city are met going forward. He commended the Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006 - 2026: Deposit Plan and the proposed consultation process to Council.

169

Following a request for a recorded vote on the reference back, voting was as follows:

For (26)

County Councillors Aubrey, Bowden, Boyle, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Cowan, Kirsty Davies, Ford, Graham, Howells, Hyde, Margaret Jones, Kelloway, Lloyd, McEvoy, McKerlich, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Graham Thomas, Walker, Williams and Woodman

Against (40)

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Ali, Bale, Bradbury, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, Corria, Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Evans, Furlong, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Groves, Hinchey, Hunt, Javed, Keith Jones, Knight, Lent, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Patel, Phillips, Simmons, Benjamin Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walsh and Weaver.

The Reference back was lost.

Following a request for a recorded vote on the recommendations of the Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006 - 2026: Deposit Plan, voting was as follows:

For (41)

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Ali, Bale, Bradbury, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, Corria, Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Evans, Furlong, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Groves, Hinchey, Hunt, Javed, Keith Jones, Joyce, Knight, Lent, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Simmons, Benjamin Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walsh and Weaver.

Against (26)

County Councillors Aubrey, Bowden, Boyle, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Cowan, Kirsty Davies, Ford, Graham, Howells, Hyde, Margaret Jones, Kelloway, Lloyd, McEvoy, McKerlich, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Graham Thomas, Walker, Williams and Woodman

#### 170

The recommendation was carried as follows: -

RESOLVED – That the Deposit Local Development Plan 2006-2026: Deposit Plan together with the supporting documents (as set out in Appendix A and B) and the Final Sustainability Appraisal Report (as set out in Appendix C) in accordance with LDP Regulations, be approved for consultation purposes.

#### 66 : ORAL QUESTIONS

# **QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER**

#### Question: County Councillor Clark

The Senior Management restructure of the Corporate Director Operations, Corporate Director Resources, Directors, County Solicitor and County Clerk and Monitoring Officer has now been completed. Please could you outline the cost of this restructure to include salary, employer's national insurance, pension costs, job advertisement costs, recruitment consultancy support, any salary protection arrangements, redundancy/severance packages, legal advice, HR staff time in support of the appointment process, training, administrative support, office accommodation and any other relevant costs. Please could the costs be broken down as far as possible.

Please could you also outline when the Assistant Director level posts outlined in the 11 October 2012 Cabinet paper entitled "Senior Management Structure" will be filled?

#### Reply: County Councillor Ralph Cook

All the information the Councillor seeks is contained in the Cabinet Report of 11 October 2012, entitled Senior Management Structure. I don't believe that there is anything that I can usefully add at this time.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Clark

Can you clarify exactly where in the report of 11<sup>th</sup> October it collates all those costs and are all the costs included?

#### 171

# Reply: County Councillor Ralph Cook

The information we have at the moment is in the financial implications section on page 8, and further information will be available in the Council's statement of accounts at the end of the current financial year.

## **QUESTION TO THE LEADER**

#### Question: County Councillor Walker

Have you personally contacted executives from Celsa UK to discuss the company's future intentions for Lisvane and Llanishen reservoirs?

In such discussions, have you made clear the Council's desire to see Llanishen reservoir refilled and the sailing facility reinstated?

In future discussions, will the Leader also raise with new owners the overwhelming public demand to make this site into an attractive country park freely available for public use?

#### Reply: County Councillor Joyce

The Councillor will be aware that my colleague, the Cabinet member for Finance & Economic Development and I have invested an enormous amount of effort in establishing an excellent working relationship with this major employer in the city. The Council has been in discussion with Celsa's senior management team both in Cardiff and Barcelona regarding a wide range of business matters important to the company, including their need to acquire the reservoirs in order to protect the company's water supply and to facilitate their any longer term expansion plans that they may wish to explore.

The Cabinet Member and I have our next regular meeting with Celsa management next month when we will discuss a number of matters and I will take that opportunity to discuss any the reservoirs acquisition and the Council's aspirations for the site.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Howells

You mention the Council's aspirations. Does that include returning sailing to the reservoir?

# <u>Reply:</u> *County Councillor Joyce* It includes quite a few aspirations that we have for the site.

# FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

#### Question: County Councillor Robson

What measures have been put in place to ensure that spending on consultants/interim officials is value for money?

#### Reply: County Councillor Goodway

The Council implemented a new Consultancy, Interims & Specialist Strategy on 1 August 2013. The strategy places tighter restrictions on Directorates when committing external spend for these types of services and incorporates a number of key recommendations from the Wales Audit Office report – The Procurement and Management of Consultancy Services – published on 21 February 2013.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Robson

Where those documents you were referring to and situations as we saw recently reported where managers were being paid £550 a day to run services in this city?

#### Reply: County Councillor Goodway

I cannot give you the assurance that you are looking for, but I can say I share the concerns expressed by you and the sentiments that underpin your question, and I shall certainly use my best endeavour to ensure that we deal with those issues as we take matters forward.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Aubrey

Do I understand, Councillor Goodway that you have got the message - I just wondered?

Are you confident that the total costs of consultants plus the costs of the new management structure, which we will not know until next year is less than the cost under the previous arrangements?

## Reply: County Councillor Goodway

Absolutely.

## **ENVIRONMENT QUESTION**

# Question: County Councillor Dilwar Ali

I have received a number of complaints in my ward and other areas in Cardiff. The black bags which are put out for waste collection are often refused to collect when they become ripped or open for various reasons such as by seagulls or cats. What action can be taken by the Council to collect the ripped or open bags during the waste collection?

#### Reply: County Councillor Govier

I am sorry, Councillor Ali, that you have experienced complaints from residents on this matter, but if you forward those to me, I will take a look at them.

Generally, this does happen if food is kept in black bags. We are always encouraging the use of food caddies, and we have seen a significant increase in the people requesting food caddies.

On the refuse vehicles themselves, they do have the tools needed to clean up if there is a mess in the black bins, so this shouldn't happen, unless there is a significant mess, they will call the street cleansing team. But if you send me the complaints I will get them looked into for you.

#### STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

#### Question: County Councillor Bridges

How many comments have been received by Cardiff Council regarding the Gabalfa Interchange trial road safety scheme?

Please break these down into comments received by e-mail, letter, 'phone and Twitter.

#### 174

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

In total, we have received approximately 211 comments up until yesterday on the pilot scheme. Of these, 131 were by e-mail; 10 by 'phone; 70 by Twitter and nil by letter.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bridges

Thank you for that response, and I welcome the fact that you will be meeting with Ward Members next month to discuss the trial, but I am keen that the views of the public are fully considered before any decision is taken on making this scheme permanent or not.

I conducted an online poll over the last two weeks to elicit some views, and whilst it was relatively unscientific, I had over 500 responses, 80% of which say they want the Council to go back to the drawing board with the plans for the Gabalfa interchange, compared to only 20% who wanted the scheme made permanent.

Do you accept that a fully public consultation is required over this matter so that residents, motorists, and commuters can have their say, so that we don't end up implementing a permanent scheme which lacks public support?

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Thank you, Councillor Bridges. This is at loggerheads with the comments we are gathering where most people are in favour of the phase one scheme and phase two scheme on the north side and traffic is moving fairly efficiently through there.

I am sure you understand that Gabalfa interchange is the busiest junction, with 50,000 vehicles going through that interchange every week. If you have further information or would like to share that, we will certainly take that into account with the meeting we have set up.

# **ENVIRONMENT QUESTION**

# Question: County Councillor McKerlich

The ending of a waste contract with Caerphilly Council is given as a significant reason for the shortfall in income of waste management; can

175

you give the annual value of this contract and the date when Caerphilly Council stopped using the relevant service?

## Reply: County Councillor Govier

This is one of the issues that has been giving me the sleepless nights of late. There are two areas we receive income from the MRF - one is the product we procure, and the other one is third-party produced waste which we process in the MRF.

Before my time, a target was set on the MRF of  $\pm 0.5$  million to process that waste. During the budget process of last year, we were working on the fact that certain products weren't achieving the price we were looking to achieve in the market, so we covered that by building a contingency. What was unknown to me at the time was we weren't achieving the  $\pm 0.5$ million producer waste which we were also putting through the MRF. We actually only did  $\pm 40,000$  against that  $\pm 0.5$  million target, and in month one of this year, when I looked at the budget report and I saw a huge gaping hole.

I visited the MRF with the finance and operations team to find out what this was because I believed we had covered the price issue with the contingency and I was struck by the fact that one of the Operational Managers said to me "We are never going to achieve this £0.5 million."

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor McKerlich

This is a £1.1 billion business, is it not somewhat extraordinary that someone is budgeting £0.5 million for year 2011/12 and only struggles up to £40,000 that they should continue to budget £0.5 million for the ongoing year? This is Mickey Mouse economics.

#### Reply: County Councillor Govier

Yes, I think you are reinforcing the issues we were talking about. I think we were expecting too much of too few with the management. This has come through as an issue. We are putting in measures to try and address this issue, but it is a serious problem I have with the base budget, which I have identified in Cabinet, that I really have to rectify.

We have no contingency at the moment in place to address this black hole in the environment budget, but I have sent a letter to the five Prosiect Gwyrdd authorities offering the services of the MRF, and to get around the political discussion of using that MRF, and I am determined that I will claw some of that back. But it is certainly not something we will take forward in next year's budget, and I am disappointed with the lack of capacity and the risks the previous administration exposed this Council to are now coming to fruition still.

# **ENVIRONMENT QUESTION**

# Question: County Councillor Cowan

How many fines have been issued for waste being presented on the wrong day since the start of this administration and how much revenue has been generated?

# Reply: County Councillor Govier

£74,400 but that fining is ring-fenced, and I think we spent £40,000 of that on our "Usual Suspects" campaign, and the remainder is ring-fenced for education and further enforcement

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Cowan

Due to the expected huge budgetary challenges which lie ahead, will you be instructing the officers to be more proactive and vigilant to generate higher levels of fines?

# Reply: County Councillor Govier

More proactive and vigilant to ensure that we keep our streets clean; is what we want to achieve here. I would prefer a situation where we have no fines being issued and people were abiding by the environmental rules of the city.

If it was an income driver we wanted then I would have adhered to the pressures last year with the private enforcers whose goal was to bring that income. What we want to do is ensure that the residents that are abiding by the rules are not being impacted by the few that aren't.

#### STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

#### Question: County Councillor Merry

To let signs blight many streets in Cathays, and other areas, and are linked to properties being targeted by criminals. Will the cabinet member look into the possibility of banning these signs in areas of the city facing this problem?

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

I have instructed officers to re-assess the Council's stance, as a Local Planning Authority, in respect of 'To Let' signs to ensure that the necessary controls, where appropriate, are put in place. I anticipate that I will receive an officer position statement within the next few weeks, which identifies options available to the Council in terms of bringing in an effective system for the control of letting boards in defined areas.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Merry

Will the Cabinet Member learn from the failure of the last administration to deal with this in their 8 years of power, it's about putting resources into surveys and giving political leadership to show that we are a Member-led authority?

## Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

I do believe something could have been done. Regulation 7 of the Advertising Regulations can be amended to remove the permission for permitted rights and you can exclude "for sale" signs in that.

We are taking steps, and you are aware that I have asked for a Members meeting next week where I am hoping that step one of this will be consultation with Members, consultation with residents and even students. The permitted rights can be withdrawn, but it may take us a year.

#### Supplementary question: County Councillor Howells

Can I ask that when you are consulting Ward Members that you think of wards as well outside what are considered to be the student areas, because

178

certainly in my ward of Adamsdown, there is an increasing number of Houses in Multiple Occupation, and the number of "To let" boards are increasing in that area as well, and I am sure that goes for other parts of the city as well.

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Yes, there are other areas affected, in fact, my colleague Councillor Thorne mentioned it to me yesterday. So, once we have the template in place and we have got a process in place, which could take up to 12 months, but it will relieve us of that blight on our landscape.

#### **QUESTION TO THE DEPUTY LEADER**

#### Question: County Councillor Howells

The deadline for applications for the Stonewall Workplace Equality Index 2014 was the 6th September 2013. Following the disappointment that Cardiff Council did not apply last year, can you confirm whether the Council has applied this year or not?

#### Reply: County Councillor Ralph Cook

I can confirm that Cardiff Council will not be applying for the Stonewall Index again this year. With the current financial constraints placed on the Council, difficult decisions have to be made regarding how we utilise our resources and it is those services that have a direct outcome for our citizens.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Howells

In light of the fact that the Stonewall Equality Index is Britain's leading tool for employers to measure how they tackle discrimination and create inclusive work places for all their LGBT employees, this response is disappointing if not unsurprising.

Can I ask that you reconsider this decision for future years so that all the good work that Cardiff Council has done and continues to do for its LGBT employees is celebrated rather than hidden away in a closet?

179

# Reply: County Councillor Ralph Cook

I think this administration wants to create a working environment that is welcoming of diversity and encourages staff to understand they are valued. That is our central core whatever grouping they may belong to.

We have an active consultation and participation with the LGBT community who work here and, indeed, they were represented at the Works Council in June and they have given me a list of the campaign work they have done within the Council and outside during the course of this administration from May 2012. So I don't detect any concern about how we are measured because I think everyone here understands we really have to focus our funding, which is increasingly limited, on our priorities.

# FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

#### Question: County Councillor Dianne Rees

Last year your administration spent £4m of council tax payers' money on Compromise Agreements. How much have you spent so far in the first six months of this financial year on Compromise Agreements and what do you think the final sum will be this year?

#### Reply: County Councillor Goodway

This is a complex area which needs careful explanation in order to avoid the unwarranted "Daily Mail" style sensationalism that has all too often accompanied the reporting of these matters. The Councillor's reference to £4 million being spent on compromise agreements last year underscores the fact that even when information is provided in response to specific questions it is capable of being misunderstood.

For the avoidance of doubt the £4 million figure referred to by the Leader of the County Council at the June Council meeting related to the expenditure incurred during the period 4 May 2012 to 25 June 2013, which represented the entire period of this administration at that point in time and not just the 2012/13 financial year. Furthermore, I understand that the amount also represented sums resulting from decisions made by the previous administration as part of their 2012/13 budget proposals.

I'm conscious that this attracts public interest and is quite rightly a sensitive issue and one that all Members need to fully understand. It would take too long to provide an adequate response to an oral question in this Chamber and I'm therefore suggesting that I provide a written response which I will copy to all Members at the earliest opportunity.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Dianne Rees

Thank you for that, but may I add that you did actually stifle the debate on this issue rather than explaining it. It is an important matter which is clearly of concern to the public, and they are entitled to know as we are, in fact, all Councillors are.

There is some concern that the payments could possibly be used to silence whistleblowers - I know this is something that has been said - and also may be hiding incompetence or worse.

I would like to know when you do give me the answer I have asked for what have you budgeted for such payments for this year, and will you refer the issue to the Employment Conditions Committee for enquiry?

#### Reply: County Councillor Goodway

The Councillor, I am sure, will concede that I didn't personally stifle debate last time.

Certainly the medium-term financial plan provides for a significant reduction in the number of people employed by the Council, and the financial impact of reducing the headcount clearly will need to be reflected in the medium-term plan.

I think the issue at the last Council meeting was the tone of the contributions we got from the Conservative Party Group, which seemed to be an unsubstantiated attack on public servants who were losing their jobs through no fault of their own, and I have to say, on the day the Conservative and Lib Dem Government instructed the Treasury to take action to prevent a capping of bankers' bonuses who caused these people to be unemployed in the first place, to start targeting those people and the redundancy payments they receive is a step too far.

## **ENVIRONMENT QUESTION**

## Question: County Councillor Robson

Can the Cabinet Member see what provision there is to paint the railings, tidy up the verges, remove the growth on the trees and any other measures to ensure that the "warm welcome to Cardiff" extends to those using this gateway?

# Reply: County Councillor Govier

Would you enlighten me to the actual gateway you are referring to in the question?

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Robson

It is the A470, which, amongst a few issues, has some rather rusty railings if you drive down there, problems with trees, and some very nice unused bus lanes as well

Reply: County Councillor Govier

I will look into that for you.

# Supplementary question: County Councillor Bradbury

Not withstanding the obvious problems in Rhiwbina, can we have the same treatment for all wards in Cardiff, because my ward and Councillor Goodway's ward are gateways into Cardiff and the Vale, and very nice gateways too. So, if you can give us the same treatment that would be fantastic?

# Reply: County Councillor Govier

Of course.

# FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

# Question: County Councillor Love

What progress has been made to establish trading associations for micro businesses in community first areas?

182

# Reply: County Councillor Goodway

The Councillor will be aware that Communities First programmes are run and managed by third sector organisations and, as a result, I am not aware of any trading associations that have been established, or are being established, specifically for micro businesses in Communities First areas.

I am happy to ask my officials to contact Communities First organisations to ask them for details of any such initiatives if the Councillor would find that helpful.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Love

The reference to Community First areas is really a geographical reference to the deprivation that exists in those areas, and recognising that the emphasis on our community-cohesion plan is that the high streets are a real asset to those areas and, under the austerity context which we are in, I really ask the question as to whether we can establish and continue to support the micro-businesses that sustain some form of a community in these areas that have been marked as the most deprived areas in Cardiff?

#### Reply: County Councillor Goodway

I think the Councillor will appreciate that, under the backdrop of the financial settlement and the worsening position, as much as I will endeavour to protect the amount of money that we set aside to support small businesses in Cardiff, it is going to become increasingly difficult.

We have already had a discussion between Cabinet colleagues about the importance of support for small businesses at this time. We are still planning to protect the amount of money we set aside annually.

# STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

#### Question: County Councillor Bowden

Following the petition which you presented at the July meeting of the Council, will you confirm that you will not be supporting a bus lane or corridor as identified in the LDP on the A469, Caerphilly Road?

#### 183

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

The A469 remains a key public transport corridor for Cardiff and improving the attractiveness of using public transport on this corridor is vital in order for the network to accommodate the increased demands which the LDP developments will place upon it.

The Council will be exploring how this can be achieved. One option is to consider time related bus lanes together with the provision of off road parking, which might be similar to that provided as part of the recently completed scheme south of Gabalfa Interchange.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bowden

Can you just confirm then that there is going to be no negative effect for the residents who live on Caerphilly Road, with now what we are talking about a part-time bus lane rather than a full-time bus lane and that the LDP will be changed to reflect that?

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

It is an option we will explore, and I am sure we will take residents' wishes into consideration during the consultation.

#### QUESTION TO CHAIR OF PLANNING COMMITTEE

#### Question: County Councillor Carter

Could the Chair of the Planning Committee explain to what extent the concerns of Members and the public are taken into account when considering which applications are taken to the full planning committee?

#### Reply: County Councillor Michael

In a list of delegate powers approved by Planning Committee, each application is identified as being capable of determination by either a form of Planning Committee or delegated to officers for determination. Each application is categorised as such in a weekly list of applications received, and thereafter processed and determined in that way unless a Member of the Council, usually the Ward Member requests, delegated determination be table at a Planning Committee.

Such a request is at the discretion of the Chair of Planning Committee. The views of the public are taken into account in each and every case, and they themselves warrant a referral for determination by Planning Committee if there are significant number of comments received.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Carter

Under the previous administration, and in my 8 years of time I took a variety of planning applications to Committee, ranging from small house extensions to major developments with student halls of residents, and yet two months ago, when I objected to a quite substantial development in my ward of major public interest involving Cardiff Metropolitan University, I opposed, residents opposed, and yet it wasn't taken to the Planning Committee. I also hear from Liberal Democrat colleagues on the Planning Committee that agendas seem to be remarkably light in comparison to previous years.

So, would you agree to undertake a review as to the weight you give Member objections as I personally do not believe it is fair in this day and age that, if a Councillor objects to a planning application and wants it taken to the Planning Committee, it does not get there?

# Reply: County Councillor Michael

It is interesting that we have got this question. Councillor Carter asked me this about a month ago and I gave him a full-page reply, so whether he didn't understand it I am not sure.

The powers were given to the Chair of Planning by the Council that you were a Member; the powers have always been there to use. I think planning is a balance in trying to get application through. I believe I state that is exactly what we do.

We have a planning system that actually works; processes applications as quickly as possible; and takes the views of all Councillors and all objectors before I make any decision. If you have any evidence otherwise, I will be happy to look at it.

# STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

# Question: County Councillor Graham Thomas

The Green Belt is defined by the strong physical boundary of the M4

185

Motorway. Why therefore does the Green Belt stop before Creigiau rather covering all land North of the M4?

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Much of the land north of the M4 in Cardiff plays a strategically important role by forming a prominent green backdrop to the city.

Members will no doubt have their own strong visual impressions of Garth Hill, Fforest Fawr, the Wenallt, Graig Llanishen and Graig Llysfaen, which are visible from even the inner areas of the city.

The Green Belt designation includes such areas with the M4 forming a strong boundary to the south. This will provide long-term protection for the enjoyment of future generations.

However, not all land north of the M4 performs this role. Land to the south, west and north-west of Creigiau is lower lying and does not possess the attributes considered necessary for Green Belt designation in accordance with national guidance.

#### Supplementary Question: County Councillor Graham Thomas

I do, however, feel we could further still with the idea of the Green Belt north of the M4, which everyone agrees has been widely welcomed in the plan.

I appreciate it is quite a complex issue involving key strategic sites that you have put in the plan, so perhaps I could request that we meet at a further date to discuss this again?

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

It is encouraging that people are now in favour of the LDP after the earlier vote.

What I would say is that the Green Belt is a very difficult designation to achieve, as you probably know, and goes beyond the LDP actual lifespan. It takes a generation where a Green Belt is achieved. I welcome a meeting with yourself.

## <u>COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL</u> <u>QUESTION</u>

#### Question: County Councillor Cowan

Do you agree that libraries play a significant role in our communities?

Reply: County Councillor Thorne

The provision of library services certainly plays a key role within our communities.

Given the unprecedented financial times that we find ourselves in, we have a responsibility to find innovative ways to deliver these services in a cost effective way that engage with the community at every level, whether that be through our network of multi-service hubs, through our Neighbourhood Librarian services or in conjunction with our delivery partners in schools and community centres.

Our Neighbourhood Librarian services, for example, engage with members of the community more widely by promoting this ethos outside of the traditional library building. They provide an innovative approach to developing library, information and reading services to Cardiff citizens right across the neighbourhood. This includes the development of links with local community groups, schools, partners and individuals to assess and provide a range of creative and imaginative training and learning sessions.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Cowan

You will remember last year at the budget round that libraries as a whole were closed for one day a week. Can you categorically rule out today closing Rhiwbina Library next year during the next budget round?

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

I would love to give you that guarantee, but I certainly can't. We will have to go through the budget process, and I don't think any Cabinet Member here can guarantee anything, but we will try and protect as many library services as we can.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bradbury

I welcome this question by Councillor Cowan and the response by Councillor Thorne.

Would you agree, therefore, that the decision this week made about setting up a Community Hub, which will incorporate library services; be open six days a week; is a step forward in ensuring that we keep library provision at a high standard and level, and therefore make the savings necessary from the cuts that have come down from the Westminster Government?

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

I agree, and I think it is a better way because at the moment librarians in libraries actually become managers of buildings, and what we actually want them to do is actually manage a library service. Our biggest problem is our timescale taken to be able to roll that out across the city.

# SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE QUESTION

## Question: County Councillor Gordon

The Millennium footbridge in Sophia Gardens is closing for 10 weeks from the end of this month for essential repairs to the structure of the Bridge. What steps are being taken to inform the commuting public of this disruption to their journey to work across the Park?

Would it be possible to have some temporary lighting alongside the river bank path in Sophia Gardens as there will be an enormous increase in people cycling and walking along here as this is the diversion route and the path is very dark with overhanging trees?

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

I can confirm that a range of measures have been taken in respect of communications and notifications to ensure that any inconvenience caused by the works to the bridge are mitigated, and they are as follows:

Our works contractor has installed advisory signage in Sophia Gardens, at the West and East side of the bridge and at the North Gate, West Lodge and at the intersection of the late commuter route within Bute Park. In addition to this, posters advising of the closure and diversionary route are displayed in the seven notice boards within the parklands along with banners on the bridge itself and also on Fishers Bridge.

Details of the bridge works and diversionary route have been posted on the Council's intranet site and on the staff web pages of Cardiff University, Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama and Welsh Government. The Keep Cardiff Moving website has also been updated with details.

Other stakeholder networks are being used for the purpose of communications including the Friends of Bute Park and social media in the form of the Bute Park Facebook Page and Twitter. A media release was distributed on 24<sup>th</sup> September.

Finally, volunteers will be deployed in the park from the 30<sup>th</sup> September ensuring that users are familiar with the diversionary route.

I am sure that you will agree that this represents a comprehensive plan designed to minimise any inconvenience caused.

A full risk assessment was carried out earlier this month and officers will be happy to provide you with a copy of this if you wish.

Whilst I do note your comments regarding the provision of temporary lighting along the river bank path, such provision is unfortunately cost prohibitive.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Gordon

I am sure everyone is going to know that the Sophia Gardens Bridge, or the Millennium Bridge, will be closed and where they should go to get round it.

I do think we ought to ask how a bridge which is only 13 years old needs to be completely reconstructed. This isn't decorating – this is actually replacing the infrastructure and the metalwork on the bridge.

189

How are we going to persuade and stop cyclists cycling on the pavement as they come along on Cardiff Bridge, which is the diversion route?

# Reply: County Councillor Patel

With the fullest respect, the cyclists should be aware that they should not be riding on the pavements, because they will know that that can be dangerous. Obviously, if they are going to ride on the pavements, they need to be very sensible.

The Bridge was built in 1999. Its 14 years old. It's an area where it is over the River Taff as well. It's open to all the elements. What we are carrying out is major repairs of £134,000; of that, the Heritage Lottery is contributing £65,000. These major works hopefully will mean for the next 15 years we wouldn't need to carry out further work. These kinds of works need to be done, and once the bridge is completed, the bridge will have an advantage as, where the actual bridge deck is, it will also have an anti-skid section on that. So it is a complete renovation of that area.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Hyde

First, can I say to Councillor Patel that there aren't signs on both sides of the bridge -they have been removed by vandals from one side.

Secondly, cyclists do ride over the bridge – they were there riding over it on Wednesday morning; and what is even more interesting here, there are some men running across it carrying large poles. So there are all sorts of traffic on this bridge.

Because of the extensive repairs at this time on what is really a relatively new bridge in terms of years, was the bridge originally designed for the purpose it is being put to, and is the design fit for purpose that is occurring there now?

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

I can't talk about whether the design work in 1999 was suitable or not. What I can say is that it has obviously served its purpose and it still is, and that is why the renovation work is going on.

190

With the signage being stolen, I will ask the Officers to look into that and, if the signs have disappeared, I will make sure that those signs are replaced.

# <u>COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL</u> <u>QUESTION</u>

# Question: County Councillor Howells

At Council on 31 January 2013, I received assurances from the Cabinet Member for Education and Life Long Learning that all Council libraries would have free Wi-Fi available by the end of August 2013. To date, Roath Library has no such provision. Can you please let me know which libraries are still waiting to have Wi-Fi installed and what the timescale is for this installation?

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

Wi-Fi has been installed at Cardiff's library buildings as part of the Council's programme of library upgrades. As the libraries have been refurbished, Wi-Fi has been included as standard. So far, we have been able to install Wi-Fi at 8 library service points using a mixture of Council and Welsh Government funding.

As part of the Council's aim to make Cardiff a 'Super Connected City', funding has been secured to install Wi-Fi at relevant public buildings/spaces in Cardiff. I understand that our libraries are at the top of the priority list for this project and that the roll out of Wi-Fi to the remaining libraries in the city will commence later this year, with a target completion date of spring 2014.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Howells

This reply is very disappointing considering, just 8 months ago, I was promised that all libraries would have Wi-Fi by the end of August. In light of this, I have grave concerns about the future of some libraries in Cardiff.

Could you confirm whether you are thinking of closing Roath Library or not?

191

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

I will refer you to the answer I gave to Councillor Cowan a few moments ago.

# FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

# Question: County Councillor Richard Cook

The Board of Chapter were disappointed that when Cardiff Business Council was set up the inaugural Council did not contain anybody who represents the arts and cultural sector in Cardiff despite the arts and cultural sectors being considerable contributors to the city's economy. What is the Council's policy on economic development of the arts and cultural sectors and how can those organisations influence and contribute to the city's economic development?

# Reply: County Councillor Goodway

Sport, arts and the cultural sectors make an important contribution to the local and regional economy which is reflected in the Green Paper Rebuilding Momentum. They directly support over 5,000 jobs in the city and, as a result, I have recently asked Professor Ian Hargreaves, an expert in the field, to work with companies in the sector, to explore how Cardiff can best support these aspects of our economy.

I can confirm that Sian Eirian, a well-respected figure in the arts and creative sector in Wales, has recently agreed to join the Board of Cardiff Business Council.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Richard Cook

I am sure the Board of Chapter will be very pleased about that.

Would you agree that we need to embrace and expand the arts in Cardiff if we are likely to attract jobs in Cardiff so that people come to Cardiff because of the city and because of the arts and culture we have in the city? Unfortunately, because of the UK Government-imposed cuts, we are likely to be cutting tens of thousands of pounds from grants we give to arts organisations. So, I would urge you to do everything you can to

192

mitigate that and to help arts and culture organisations in Cardiff to flourish.

# Reply: County Councillor Goodway

Because of the number of jobs and the contribution that these sectors make to the Cardiff Economy, I am clearly eager to encourage that they are retained in order to maximise the Cardiff offer.

The Councillor is absolutely right, though, that the prospects of the public sector being able to continue to give the level of support that it has hitherto to these sorts of ventures is quite remote and, therefore, what I am trying to do is to explore how we can get the private sector or the Lottery Funding to invest or to continue to support these activities.

# FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

## Question: County Councillor McGarry

The old Gaiety Cinema (or Spin Bowling as it became) is a terrible 'Eyesore' in one of the main through routes in our city. It is covered in graffiti, has weeds growing out of the walls and has a few people camped outside it at the front. It is privately owned and I am told that it is structurally sound (otherwise we could enforce the owner to put it right). It is up for sale and has been for a while.

My question is: Would it be possible for the Council to invest in this building so that it could become a building for the Community? A Community Co-operative could then refurbish it, manage it and maintain it. The Council could charge a rent that was below the market rent but that was enough to make more income than it could if invested in a financial institution.

## Reply: County Councillor Goodway

I would very much like to respond positively to the proposal put forward by the Councillor in her question as I appreciate the need to deal with the negative impact that rundown buildings have on local communities. Regrettably, the scale of investment needed to acquire, refurbish and convert this building is well beyond anything which could be considered by the Council as part of our existing Neighbourhood Regeneration

programmes and budgets but I have asked officials to explore whether there is a possibility of bringing together the building's owners, local businesses and community groups to assess what can be achieved.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor McGarry

Thank you, Councillor Goodway, for your positive response.

The idea is if we could possibly quickly get rid of the look of the building - so my idea was that the Council buy it quickly, and then the local business and community ventures refurbishing it borrowing money from the local businesses, and then run it as a going concern.

# Reply: County Councillor Goodway

I do appreciate that, and I will give every consideration to it. I also want to talk to Cabinet colleagues to see whether there is a possibility that any Council services that are located elsewhere in your ward could relocate to that particular venue, and perhaps to create a sort of hub to serve the ward, and we could get some private sector activities running alongside it then that may be a feasible project for us to take forward.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Woodman

If you do actually turn this into a community co-operative - it is a very large building - will you then close Plasnewydd Community Hall?

## Reply: County Councillor Goodway

If the Councillor is putting that forward as a proposal, then I am quite happy to reflect on it.

# **ENVIRONMENT QUESTION**

## Question: County Councillor McGarry

I understand that a percentage of recycling waste cannot be recycled because it is 'contaminated. Does this mean that it has food stuck to the containers or that it contains waste that cannot be recycled, or both?

194

If this is the case, how can we ensure that people are better informed as to how and what to recycle?

# Reply: County Councillor Govier

It's not so much that the material can't be recycled – it is certainly recycled and counted towards our targets – the issue is the spirit of recycling, which is sustainability. The issue with the contamination of the product often means that we are giving that product away for free at times, so there is no charge at times for that product to be sold and at the MRF, which is a major drain on the Council's resources and really does impact on the spirit of sustainability in terms of recycling.

That is the issue we are trying to address in this consultation that I have launched: to look at the holistic picture of recycling, the sustainability agenda, and trying to deal with contamination in the product so that we can get money for our product that we sell on the market, and that will keep things like libraries open.

## STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

## Question: County Councillor Richard Cook

On 9<sup>th</sup> August 2013 SEWTA (South East Wales Transport Alliance) launched a consultation on Rail Strategy. The proposals include seventeen new stations, three of them in Cardiff at Albany Road / Crwys Road, St Fagans and St Mellons. In Canton Ward there is planning permission for over 700 houses on the Ely Paper Mill site, with space allocated for a new station. The site is constrained by the Ely River and railway lines therefore access/egress will predominantly be at the south of the site which will increase traffic on an already congested Leckwith area. Why has the Council, through SEWTA, not pushed for one of these new stations to be at the Ely Paper Mill site?

## Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

The SEWTA Task Force identified that the North West Cardiff corridor would provide either light rail or heavy rail and so would encompass potential for new stations on this corridor. Other stations are considered 'stand alone' in nature.

As part of the current application for housing at this location, the developer has identified land to be protected for the future development of a rail station.

You will be aware of the Council's efforts to secure provision of a dedicated bus route through the Ely Paper Mill site as part of the previous and current planning applications for housing. A bus-based solution is regarded as the most viable and deliverable public transport option to serve this site given its scale and physical constraints.

The SEWTA Rail Strategy is out for consultation until 30<sup>th</sup> September. The potential for a future station on the Ely Paper Mill site can be highlighted within the Council's formal response to the strategy consultation.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Richard Cook

I take it that you can confirm that the Council will be putting that forward in its response. Don't you think that should have been put forward in the response before - it is a bit late now to do that - and don't you think that perhaps the previous administration should have engaged more with SEWTA, because it seems to me that this planning application has been on the cards for five years, and it is very disappointing that this isn't in SEWTA's thinking, and I can only assume that previous Councillors haven't put it into the forefront of their thinking?

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

You are absolutely correct. I visited the site myself on Tuesday with officers, and I have asked Officers to respond before the deadline positively towards this option.

## Supplementary Question: County Councillor Aubrey

I join Councillor Cook in terms of supporting a station on the Ely Mill site. It is a development site that we are fortunate already has rail connections, and I think it is very important that where we have those connections, they are used.

There is a site to the north of this site on Cowbridge Road East which is pretty much at the junction of the City Line and the South Wales Main

Line which I am not sure is derelict at this very moment, but it is very often up for sale. It was a former car dealership. Can you tell us if any consideration can be given to the potential for that site both for rail, which would benefit not only the Ely Mill site but the areas of Canton and Victoria Park to the north of the railway line, and also the possibility for rail and bus interchange at that site?

# Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Happy to give a written response if that is easier.

# ADULT SOCIAL SERVICES QUESTION

# Question: County Councillor Love

What initiatives are being made to create elderly day care groups for ethnic minority communities across Cardiff, where language can be a significant barrier to accessing mainstream services?

# Reply: County Councillor Huw Thomas

This provision is currently being considered as part of a wider review of day services for older people across the city.

This review has also been informed by the recommendations of the Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee report entitled 'The Provision of Adult Social Care Services to Minority Communities in Cardiff', which was received by the Cabinet in May.

# Supplementary Question: County Councillor Love

Would the Cabinet Member commit to continuing this ongoing dialogue and the prioritisation of what I understand that you are very keen to respect and value the diversity of languages that are in Cardiff – certainly, the Chinese Elders are co-producers of this best-practice model for ethnic-minority people to maintain their cultural activity and heritage, and encourage early access to services and information and is a mechanism to reduce widespread isolation, preventing difficult health inequalities in some of the ethnic-minority communities across Cardiff?

#### 197

## Reply: County Councillor Huw Thomas

I am aware through you of the standards of service from the Chinese Elders. It is evident that we need to be more strategic across the city in particular when considering the reducing resources. What I intend to do through this review is to look at a package of resources for those with the greatest needs, and I'm sure there are a number of examples of good practice across the city and we will also be looking at these.

# 67 : STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS 2012/13 AND ANNUAL COMPLIANCE REPORTS

(County Councillor Walsh declared a personal interest under the Members Code of Conduct in this item. The Councillor remained in the meeting during consideration but did not vote on this item.)

The Council was recommended to approve the audited Statement of Accounts for the year ending 31 March 2013; to note the reports of the Wales Audit Office on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff Council, Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and Cardiff Port Health Authority for the year ending 31 March 2013; to note the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2012/13; and to note that formal documents will be signed at the conclusion of the meeting.

The International Standard on Auditing (ISA) 260 requires the Appointed Auditor to report to those charged with governance, on the key matters arising from the audit examination of the Statement of Accounts for the year ending 31 March 2013.

In accordance with the Council's Treasury Management Policy Statement, the Annual Treasury Management Report for 2012/13 is presented based on the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) Code of Practice.

The Cabinet Member, Finance and Economic Development commended the report to Council.

## RESOLVED - That

(1) the audited Statement of Accounts for the ended 31 March 2013 as set out in Appendix 1 of the report be approved;

- (2) the reports of the Wales Audit Office on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff Council, Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and Cardiff Port Health Authority for the year ending 31 March 2013 as set out in Appendices 3, 5 and 6 of the report be noted;
- (3) the final Letter of Representation for Cardiff Council as set out in Appendix 4 of the report be noted;
- (4) the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2012/13 as set out in Appendix 7 of the report be noted;
- (5) it be noted that the following documents will be formally signed at the conclusion of the meeting:
  - Statement of Accounts for Cardiff Council including the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund Lord Mayor and Interim Section 151 Officer
  - Annual Governance Statement (Within the accounts) Leader of the Council and Interim Head of Paid Service
  - Accounts of Cardiff Port Health Authority Interim Section 151 Officer
  - Letters of Representation for Cardiff Council, Cardiff Port Health Authority – Leader of the Council and Interim Section 151 Officer
  - Letter of Representation for Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Leader of the Council and Interim Head of Paid Services
  - Audit Certificate for Cardiff Council and Cardiff Port Health Authority – Appointed Auditor, Wales Audit Office. To be signed at a later date.

# 68 : APPOINTMENT OF THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE

Council's approval was sought of the recommendation of the Appointment Committee meeting on 17 September, 2013. The Leader of the Council proposed the unanimously agreed recommendation of the Appointment Committee to appoint Mr Paul Orders as Chief Executive of Cardiff Council. This proposal was seconded by Councillor Woodman.

#### 198

# RESOLVED – That

- (1) approves the appointment of a Chief Executive in accordance with the recommendation of the Appointment Committee, 17 September 2013;
- (2) notes that the current interim arrangement for the Head of Paid Service and Section 151 Officer will cease when a permanent Chief Executive is in post.

# 69 : APPOINTMENT OF COMMITTEE CHAIRS AND NOMINATIONS TO COUNCIL COMMITTEES

The Council received nominations to the vacant Chair of the Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee and Chair of Community & Adult Scrutiny Committee, and vacancies on Committees.

The nominations were proposed by Councillor Weaver and seconded by Councillor Phillips.

## RESOLVED - That

- the election of Councillor Lent as Chair of the Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee and Councillor De'Ath as Chair of Community & Adult Scrutiny Committee be approved;
- (2) the following nominations to vacancies on Committees be noted

Constitution Committee	Councillors Goodway and Woodman		
Community & Adult Scrutiny Committee	Councillor Simmons		
Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee	Councillors Boyle and Murphy		
Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee	Councillor Robson		
Policy Review & Performance Scruti Committee	iny Councillor Marshall		

# 70 : LOCAL AUTHORITY APPOINTMENTS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

The Council was recommended to approve the appointment of Local Authority School Governors as listed in the Appendix to the report, and as shown on the Amendment Sheet.

RESOLVED - That the following appointments of School Governors be approved: -

School	Ward	<u>Start of</u> Vacancy	Applications
Llanedeyrn High *1 year appointment	Pentwyn	<u>02/092013</u>	Mr C Lambourne
Llanishen High School	Llanishen	20/11/2013	Mr J Caddick
		20/11/2013	Prof M Pendlebury
Radyr Comprehensive	Radyr & Morganstown	06/09/2013	Miss H Burns
The Glyn Derw	Caerau/Ely	01/04/2013	Cllr E A Simmons
Michaelston Federation			
Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg	Llandaff	22/05/2007	Ms S Hughes
Glantaf	North		
Allensbank	Gabalfa	13/06/2012	Mr M Ahmed
Bryn Hafod Primary	Llanrumney	30/03/2012	Mr M B Johnson
Danescourt Primary	Llandaff	21/07/2013	Mrs J Smith
Gladstone Primary	Cathays	24/04/2013	Cllr S E Merry
Herbert Thompson	Ely	28/06/2013	Mr P Smith
Primary	•		
Llandaff C/W Primary	Llandaff	23/072013	Mr R Mynott
Ysgol Gymraeg Bro	Llanrumney	20/11/2013	Mrs E Williams
Eirwg	•		

#### 71 : UNOPPOSED COUNCIL BUSINESS

(County Councillors Cowan and Robson declared a prejudicial interest under the Members Code of Conduct in item (b) below)

The Council received for information reports in relation to

 Urgent Decision Taken by the Head of Paid Service in respect of Whitchurch High School DDA Adaptations for September 2013

201

(b) Urgent Decision Taken by Cabinet in respect of Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone

RESOLVED – That the reports be noted

(Formal Meeting closed at 20.30pm)

In accordance with pilot Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) the following Written Questions were received for considerations and response ahead of this meeting. A full copy of all written questions together with the answers were circulated to Members by email and published on the website in advance of the Council meeting and are included as a record in the minutes of the meeting.

# 72 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

# ADULT SOCIAL SERVICES WRITTEN QUESTIONS:

# <u>Question:</u> County Councillor Bradbury

Can the Cabinet Member assure me and my constituents that residents in Ty Newydd will be found alternative accommodation in the West of the City?

## Reply: County Councillor Huw Thomas

All residents and their families will have the opportunity to select their alternative accommodation from the vacancies in residential homes across the city.

Each resident at has been allocated a case manager to work with them and their family, to review their needs and their wishes, in order to ensure that the most appropriate alternative accommodation can be fund to meet those needs.

## Question: County Councillor Bradbury

Have the Council looked at taking over the Ty Newydd Site and running it as an alternative to it closing down due to the Care Provider pulling out of the Contract early?

202

# Reply: County Councillor Huw Thomas

The Council has considered a number of options. However, the option for the Council to take over the Ty Newydd site is not considered sustainable due to the considerable amount of upgrading and repairs required at the site and building. For example, expenditure costs for maintenance requirements to 2016 have been estimated at around £500,000.

Essential works required include a new main roof, access road tarmac renewal, central heating boiler renewal and electrical rewiring. This programme of work would be required in order to comply with CSSIW (Care & Social Services Inspectorate Wales) Standards.

# COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL

## Question: County Councillor Bradbury

Could the cabinet member tell me how many residents in Caerau have been forced to move due to being unable to pay the Government's new Bedroom Tax?

## Reply: County Councillor Thorne

There are currently 232 residents of Caerau who are affected by the under-occupation changes. Of these, 112 are Council Tenants and 120 are Housing Association Tenants.

181 of these tenants have one "spare" bedroom restriction and 51 have two "spare" bedrooms.

44 residents of Caerau are on the special downsizing re-housing list and 18 have been rehoused from the list so far. Other tenants may have chosen to exchange using the HomeSwapper website.

Not all tenants are choosing to move and some are finding that they can afford to pay the shortfall. For those who wish to stay, help is available at the Advice Hub with budgeting and reducing bills.

In July 2013 alone, 361 clients were helped by the Council's Advice Team and £35,000 was achieved in additional benefits and reduced bills. The Advice Team can also help tenants to claim Discretionary Housing

Payments where appropriate and, in some cases, it is possible for arrears to be written off or repayments to be reduced in order to help tenants stay in their home.

# Question: County Councillor Bradbury

How many people have been evicted as a result of the Bedroom Tax in Cardiff since it came into force?

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

I can confirm that no council tenants have been evicted as a direct result of the size restrictions on social housing (or Bedroom Tax). However, it is the case that some tenants affected by the size restrictions have been evicted due to pre-existing arrears.

Arrears recovery procedures have been reviewed and additional work is being undertaken to prevent evictions wherever possible. All tenants affected by the change will have their case reviewed at the Rent Review Panel before any Court action is taken.

A wide range of help and advice is being offered to tenants attending the Panel, including support from a Welfare Reform Officer to ensure that tenants are fully aware of the help available to them if they wish to move.

If the tenant wishes to remain in their home, referrals are made to the Advice Hub where immediate appointments are available. The Advice Team can provide help with budgeting and income maximisation and other assistance that is available. In some instances, it is possible to write off old debt to give the tenant a better chance of paying their ongoing rent.

Representatives from the Cardiff & Vale Credit Union attend the Rent Review Panel to promote the Rent Protect account (jam jar account), which helps tenants to ensure that their rent is prioritised.

As at 6<sup>th</sup> September 2013, only two applications to Court had been made for council tenants where the arrears related solely to the size restrictions. Even when a possession order has been granted by the Court, the eviction will not go ahead until officers have taken intensive action to try to

204

resolve the issue. This will include several visits, if necessary, to make contact with the tenant and find a way forward.

Unfortunately, if tenants will not engage with officers and take advantage of the wide range of help available either to move or to remain in their home and pay the rent, there is no option but to take action.

The seven main Housing Associations in Cardiff have also been asked to provide the information you have requested. All have confirmed that no evictions or Court cases have been held solely as a result of arrears caused by the size restrictions.

## Question: County Councillor Bridges

What has been the result of the evaluation of No Cold Calling zones in Cardiff?

What future plans do the administration have to extend the scheme?

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

As you may be aware, the Cold Calling Control Zone (CCCZ) scheme was considered by the Council's Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee in May this year and I have since received an evaluation and options appraisal report from officers in relation to the scheme.

Further to that meeting, I have been working with Trading Standards officers and also with members of the Scrutiny Committee to establish the best possible future for the scheme in Cardiff. I am pleased that progress is being made and I hope to be able to set out the future direction that the scheme will take in the very near future.

## Question: County Councillor Woodman

In relation to the Cardiff Tenants & Residents Association, could you please let me know in relation to their accounts for 2012/13, if you consider the expenditure of 46% of their budget being spent on travel and subsistence is acceptable?

Given that this expenditure includes monies spent on lunches and refreshments to the Federation officers who attend Gabalfa offices, is this

205

against the procedure for expenses which only covers travel to meetings, training and outside events?

If so, what measures have you put in place to prevent such claims in the future?

Finally, for 2012/13, the Federation did not spend £2,499 of the £23,200 grant from the council, and bank and petty cash balances amounted to £8,356 at the end of March 2013. Due to the council facing financial restraint, will this non spend be returned to the council or taken into account for any future grants, and will the Federation be encouraged to use their balance in the way our schools are expected to?

# Reply: County Councillor Thorne

The grant given to the Tenants Federation is to facilitate tenant participation. The current spend model has been in place for a number of years. As an independent body, the Federation is not subject to the Council's procedures for expenses.

A review of the future of tenant participation, which has been the subject of wide scale consultation, is due to be concluded soon. The review will introduce a new refreshed system of tenant participation. Meaningful tenant involvement is essential in delivering a high quality, sustainable service to our tenants.

The Tenants Federation is not funded from the General Fund budget; it is funded from the ring-fenced Housing Revenue Account. As the Federation is an independent body and will have their own priorities for spending any surplus in their budget. I am sure they are well aware of the circumstance of council tenants in the city and that this will inform their priorities.

# DEPUTY LEADER WRITTEN QUESTIONS

## Question: County Councillor Bridges

Over the past three months, what have been the ten most visited pages on the council website?

206

# <u>Reply:</u> County Councillor Ralph Cook

English	<i>Total page views during period = 1,998,445</i>
Hits	Title
29,211	Jobs
26,749	What can I do online?
26,369	Cardiff Festival homepage
20,756	Search Page
20,424	School Term Dates
20,351	Cardiff Bay Beach supported by First Choice
17,864	Cardiff Castle visitor information
15,820	Recycling and Waste
15,063	Cardiff Central Library
13,987	Llanishen Leisure Centre
12,412	Council Tax
Cymraeg	<i>Total page views during period = 11,011</i>
Hits	Title
Hits 413	Title Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates)
413	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates)
413 235	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs)
413 235	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd
413 235 183	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd
413 235 183 118	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd (Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries)
413 235 183 118	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd (Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries) Llythyr Newyddion (Newsletter for 21 <sup>st</sup> Century
413 235 183 118	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd (Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries) Llythyr Newyddion (Newsletter for 21 <sup>st</sup> Century Schools)
413 235 183 118 108 105 97	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd (Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries) Llythyr Newyddion (Newsletter for 21 <sup>st</sup> Century Schools) Digwyddiadau (Cardiff Festival Events)
413 235 183 118 108 105 97 89	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd (Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries) Llythyr Newyddion (Newsletter for 21 <sup>st</sup> Century Schools) Digwyddiadau (Cardiff Festival Events) Yr Hub (The Hub splash page)
413 235 183 118 108 105 97 89 84	<ul> <li>Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates)</li> <li>Swyddi (Jobs)</li> <li>Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd</li> <li>(What food are we serving in your primary school?)</li> <li>Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page)</li> <li>Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd</li> <li>(Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries)</li> <li>Llythyr Newyddion (Newsletter for 21<sup>st</sup> Century</li> <li>Schools)</li> <li>Digwyddiadau (Cardiff Festival Events)</li> <li>Yr Hub (The Hub splash page)</li> <li>Ysgolion (Schools)</li> </ul>
413 235 183 118 108 105 97 89	Dyddiadau Tymor yr Ysgol (School Term Dates) Swyddi (Jobs) Y bwydydd sydd ar gael yn eich Ysgol Gynradd (What food are we serving in your primary school?) Cyngor wrth Chwilio (Search Page) Croeso i Lyfrgelloedd Caerdydd (Welcome to Cardiff's Libraries) Llythyr Newyddion (Newsletter for 21 <sup>st</sup> Century Schools) Digwyddiadau (Cardiff Festival Events) Yr Hub (The Hub splash page)

Question: County Councillor Bale

What steps has the Council taken to prevent payday lenders from advertising on council billboards and websites?

#### 207

# Reply: County Councillor Ralph Cook

The Council does not currently have a formal advertising policy, but I have asked the appropriate officers to develop one.

## EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING

# Question: County Councillor Bradbury

Has there been any progress towards the building of a new high school in the West of the City, if so when will the Cabinet Member update the Council?

# Reply: County Councillor Magill

Funding of just over £8m has been approved in principle by the Welsh Government as part of the Council's  $21^{st}$  Century Schools Programme, Band A. This level of funding would enable the Council to make significant progress towards the construction of a new build school but it is insufficient for this to be achieved in one phase.

Officers will therefore continue to work with the Federation of Glyn Derw and Michaelston with a view to developing the most effective way of making progress towards achieving our shared goal of constructing a new state of the art school with excellent community facilities.

Aligned with this, the schools organisation planning consolidated financial model is being reviewed. This will enable further discussions to take place with the Welsh Government with whom we are working to establish what scope exists for achieving the additional funding needed to progress this and other priorities.

# ENVIRONMENT WRITTEN QUESTIONS

## Question: County Councillor Bridges

What have Cardiff Council done as a response to the petition submitted in July on behalf of Gabalfa ward businesses about parking in the ward?

208

## <u>Reply:</u> County Councillor Govier

I would refer you to the email that I sent earlier today inviting both you and Cllr Holden to a meeting to discuss this issue further following the two petitions submitted at Council in June and July.

## Question: County Councillor Bridges

During the last three months, how many parking tickets have been issued, by ward, between the hours 9pm and 10pm?

## Reply: County Councillor Govier

For June, July and August 2013, the requested figures are as follows:

Ward	June	July	August	Total
Adamsdown	8	8	17	33
Butetown	1	0	0	1
Caerau	8	3	0	11
Canton	28	75	75	178
Cathays	0	0	0	0
Creigiau/St Fagans	0	0	0	0
Cyncoed	0	0	0	0
Ely	0	0	0	0
Fairwater	0	0	0	0
Gabalfa	0 (8)	5 (6)	0 (5)	5 (19)
Grangetown	0	1	0	1
Heath	0	0	0	0
Lisvane	0	0	0	0
Llandaff	0	0	0	0
Llandaff North	0	0	0	0
Llanishen	0	0	0	0
Llanrumney	0	0	0	0
Pentwyn	0	0	0	0
Pentyrch	0	0	0	0
Penylan	2	8	0	10
Plasnewydd	0	0	0	0
Pontprennau/Old St Mellons	0	0	0	0
Radyr/Morganstown	0	0	0	0
Rhiwbina	7	13	6	26

209

Riverside	0	1	0	1
Rumney	0	0	0	0
Splott	0	0	0	0
Trowbridge	0	0	0	0
Whitchurch/Tongwynlais	0	0	0	0

For the Gabalfa ward, the numbers in parentheses relate to the preceding hour 8:00pm-9:00pm, indicating a Civil Enforcement Officer (CEO) presence there just before 9:00pm.

### FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

### Question: County Councillor Bale

Will the Council consider blocking access to the websites of all known payday lenders from council computer terminals, including those in libraries, hubs and council offices?

### Reply: County Councillor Goodway

I am advised that internet access at Council offices is based upon classifications of websites which are provided by a third party. We do have the ability to allow or prevent access to many categories of websites by using this management tool and the decision to block or allow certain categories and websites is based on corporate, libraries and schools policies.

I am advised that, as financial businesses, payday lenders are currently categorised as 'Financial Services', which is a category of website that is allowed for access for all areas of Internet provided by the Council – this includes staff, libraries and schools.

Cardiff provides a balanced Internet access service to its staff that allows for limited personal use. Where appropriate, this will include categories such as Financial Services, where members of staff may wish to manage their personal banking (or some sites such as the Co-operative Bank which are used for council business).

'Payday lenders' are not classified separately from Financial Services. As a result, a list of known 'payday lenders' does not currently exist.

Whilst current policy allows access to these sites, the Council could consider blocking access, if this is considered to be appropriate, but initial work would need to be undertaken (and monitored going forward) to identify what constitutes a 'payday lender' website so that Internet access can be blocked.

## Question: County Councillor Bale

Will the Council consider supporting a city wide loyalty card scheme for local businesses?

## Reply: County Councillor Goodway

I am advised that officials have previously consulted with local businesses with regard to this matter and reported little appetite for such a scheme amongst the business community.

However, I would be more than happy to receive and consider a proposal from local businesses should they wish to develop a scheme for Cardiff.

# SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE WRITTEN QUESTIONS

## Question: County Councillor Bridges

Have Cardiff Council made contact with Cardiff University to see what long-term plans exist to improve the Blackweir footbridge (for example, by addressing the long-standing structural problems with the bridge, upgrading the surface to make it less slippery, or making the bridge passable for cyclists)?

Will the relevant Cabinet Member update Members on the issue by means of a written statement at the next Full Council meeting?

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

As you may be aware, the Blackweir Bridge was installed to provide a link between the Cardiff University campus and Pontcanna Fields. A lease agreement between the Council and University is in place and is due to expire on 31 March 2017.

The conditions of the lease place responsibility with the University for maintenance and associated costs. There is no requirement through the

#### 211

terms of the lease for the University to undertake improvements or to upgrade the surface of the bridge.

I am not aware of any long-standing structural problems; however, during the term of the lease to date, the Council has drawn to the attention of the University's Estates Division various repair and maintenance issues and defects which have been addressed.

I do not anticipate that the lease agreement will be renewed and, therefore, it is likely that maintenance responsibilities will fall to the Council as land owner from 1 April 2017. In view of this, the Council will need to consider the implications of taking over responsibility for the bridge. This will involve commissioning a condition survey at the appropriate time and I will ensure that interested parties are kept abreast of developments. In the meantime, I'm sure that this written reply will assist in providing an update to Members on the current position.