

Appendix 1



Economic Green Paper Consultation Summary

Economic Green Paper Consultation

Consultation Response Summary

A public consultation was held based on the Economic Green Paper *Building More and Better Jobs*. The paper was available on the Council's website and publicised through local and social media.

In addition, specific representative groups were engaged to ensure a broad coverage of Cardiff's communities.

A number of sessions have also been held with businesses and other key stakeholders to consider the Green Paper.

Overall responses have been received from representatives of business, education, the third sector, sport, arts and culture and local government.

Respondents were not required to answer all or indeed any of the questions included in the paper. These were intended to prompt thoughts and discussion. The feedback received therefore varied considerably in length and detail. A summary of the responses is provided below.

Headline Issues

Overall, responses to the Green Paper were positive. Generally respondents supported the content, both strategically and in terms of project detail. However there were a number of issues raised that were either felt to be omitted, or require additional consideration. A summary of the 'key issues' section is provided below:

Transport and Connectivity – a large number of responses cited the importance of reducing and mitigating for congestion, as well as the need to improve transport links within the city and between cities generally. Congestion was seen as both an inhibitor to growth, whilst improvements in transport would aid both productivity growth and the accessibility of jobs. Digital infrastructure was also identified as an area in need of improvement. The Metro was also raised as an area of potential, and that more needs to be done to fit in with the opportunities this would present.

Support Business Development – it was highlighted that whilst major projects are important for Cardiff, there also needs to be more consideration of small and medium sized businesses in Cardiff. The abundance of small and medium-sized businesses throughout Cardiff's communities, including in district centres and suburban locations, were highlighted as areas of potential.

Cluster Development – it was suggested that Cardiff needs to consider areas of cluster development in Cardiff, partly to respond to the UK's Industrial Strategy, but also in terms of developing specialities to improve productivity growth. In particular the creative and digital sectors were identified as sectors with current strengths and the potential to grow. For example, the National School of Journalism and Media, the BBC R&D facility in the city centre and the burgeoning production sector presents an impressive offer to government and industry. Similarly, data analytics and cyber security are increasingly significant sectors and Cardiff has a key opportunity to build on its success with HMRC's new data analytics department and Alert Logic.

Inclusive Growth – it was identified that more recognition needs to be paid to under-represented groups, and especially those groups performing poorly economically. Whilst the Green Paper did talk of inclusive growth it was felt that more was required to respond to these issues. It was noted, for example, that employment rates for disabled people, transgender people, some BAME people, and Muslim women are far lower than average. Overall, the idea of inclusive growth struck a chord with many respondents, recognising the challenge of ensuring everyone in Cardiff can benefit from its development and success.

Skills - the support for inclusive growth ties in with a number of comments received around business and jobs, but also highlighted the importance of building a skilled workforce that can take advantage of new jobs, and connecting people with businesses. There was agreement that strengthening the presence of the knowledge economy in the city is imperative to its success, through the role of Higher Education in providing an educated labour force and promoting economic and commercial innovation.

Wellbeing – it was also highlighted that we should not look at the economy in isolation from factors such as education, health and social care, and that there needs to be alignment with the city's Local Well-being Plan. It was also noted that there needs to be consideration of environmental issues – not just in terms of the impact on local residents, but also in terms of economic opportunity.

Selected Responses

"It is great that the Council sees Cardiff growing in the future but I would be more interested in hearing about how it plans to tackle our road and transport problems which are a big issue right now."

"Overwhelmingly, the three primary concerns for SMEs responding to us [from their survey] are:

Congestion: A large number of respondents highlighted broad congestion issues in the city, and occasionally more localised issues. A number of respondents positively welcomed moves to decrease car usage in the city by investing in public transport, however a small minority were vocally opposed to increased provision of bus and bike lanes in the city centre. In general, plurality of respondents felt that congestion and public transport were key needs for the city.

Provision of infrastructure: Comments indicated that this included business premises, public transport infrastructure and digital infrastructure. Some responses suggested that the council should focus on the provision of digital infrastructure and public transport to reflect the changing nature of work.

Inequality: There is a strong sense that the benefits of economic growth and regeneration haven't been shared equitably in the city, both in terms of geographic and demographic spread."

"The Green Paper omits any mention of one of the most important issues, and opportunities; how to move to a zero-carbon economy."

"I query the overarching focus on jobs - especially the claim that jobs growth in itself is a positive - and worry that Cardiff Council may seek to achieve growth in this area indiscriminately. Quality jobs in sustainable sectors offer many gains, but I would prefer to see a broader aim to support wellbeing in the city and to explore the role of mechanisms such as timebanking to tackle the major challenges facing our city and society more generally. I therefore welcome the steps outlined in the section on making Cardiff an Inclusive Capital but would like to see a more transformational ambition and a more imaginative approach."

"We need people to have more money, so job creation is vital and paying people fairly is vital. Unless people have more money to spend, they won't be able to spend money in Cardiff to help the economy. While inward investment in jobs will help, the council could help more by paying people fairly and delivering a decent pay rise to the public sector."

"There is little recognition or explicit mention of inequalities and addressing this in Cardiff. We welcome the specific case studies and recognition of socio-economic inequalities in the city. However, employment rates for disabled people, trans* people, some BME people, and Muslim women in particular are far lower than average. Evidence of these disparities in Wales includes EHRC and Joseph Rowntree Foundation reports. These issues have not been addressed through improving educational attainment in schools alone."

We recognise that this is a strategic, high level paper. It is, however, important to identify inequalities in relation to employment and earnings and to ensure that specific, targeted actions are taken to address workplace attitudes to some groups, including pregnant women, and to support people into employment. It is also vital to address gender segregation in careers, and to ensure that access to training and career development is equitable. Some protected groups with relatively high employment rates experience disadvantage in career progression and are under-represented at higher grades in organisations.

We feel it is vital that the action plan and implementation of this strategy engages diverse communities and include targeted and specific actions to address the different experiences of diverse communities across the protected characteristics."

"NRW advocates sustainable development, informed by recent Welsh Government legislation. This would entail a focus upon total economic value (TEV), as recommended by The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity (TEEB) and integrated wealth accounting such as that being developed by the World Bank."

What should be the key indicators of success for Cardiff?

Jobs Growth - Jobs growth was recognised as core indicator of success, however it was noted that the quality and sustainability of jobs was also important. One response felt that jobs might be too crude a measure and suggested the following:

- average level of pay to indicate the quality of jobs
- demographics of those in or not in work, for example in terms of gender, race, disability
- type of work, for example part time or full time

GVA per Head - Gross Value Added (GVA) per head was recognised as a valuable indicator, along with productivity. There was also concern from some that GVA may not fully reflect the economic picture in Cardiff.

Investment - one respondent cautioned against indicators for levels of investment, feeling that although investment contributes to a strong economy, it is not an end in itself and could be counterproductive if in the wrong areas.

Visitor economy - visitor spend was highlighted as a better indicator than visitor numbers as it was more accurately represented the economic impact of tourism. Conversely high visitor numbers, without spend, could simply result in added congestion.

Business Development – it was highlighted that no indicators were included that reflected the growth in the number or performance of Cardiff businesses, and that some measure that reflected entrepreneurial performance was required. It was proposed that some of the measures in the Global Enterprise Monitor reports could be considered.

Wellbeing – it was noted that indicators should align with those used in the Local Well-Being Plan.

Inclusive Growth - there were suggestions of using the Joseph Rowntree Foundation's 'Inclusive Growth Monitor' or something similar as an indicator. This also emerged in response to Question 7: How can everyone benefit from growth?

Selected Responses

“The aim of economic development should not be reduced to the number of jobs created but measured in people who lead healthy, fulfilling and connected lives. Economic activity is not an end in itself but is, rather, about creating the conditions for these outcomes to materialise. An economically successful city is one in which measures of health and well-being are high. Health, happiness and well-being are sound indicators and can be measured (e.g. great place to work surveys). It is therefore noticeable and regrettable that the word ‘health’ is used just once in the Green Paper and that simply in a passing reference to the health board. Unless we are using economic activity to reduce health inequalities, we will fail to meet one of our fundamental purposes.

We should also consider wealth inequality as a key indicator. One potential and simple measure could be the difference between the top and bottom 10% in the city. We don’t want growth that only benefits the already wealthy. As an important aside, the concern should be about wealth not income inequality in order to deter policies to inflate asset prices (e.g. houses).

Finally, the green paper is too silent on environmental concerns. We would want to see measures that account for how economic growth is delivered in a sustainable manner.”

What should Cardiff's role be in the city-region?

There was overall agreement that the city-region concept was important for the future of Cardiff.

Leadership - responses suggested that Cardiff should take a leadership role while also building relationships and reaching out to the surrounding communities that support it. Cardiff must also ensure that the economic successes of the city spread out to the city-region.

Scale - it is important to acknowledge that for Cardiff to compete on the international scale it requires the larger urban agglomeration of the region in order to be successful. It was felt that Cardiff can position itself to compete in terms of inward investment with London, Bristol, Birmingham, and the Northern Powerhouse, but only as part of a city-region.

Governance - it was recommended that any issues beyond Cardiff that could affect the ability of the paper's proposals to succeed should be identified, be that in the City Region, Wales, or the UK. Furthermore, it was suggested that the city-region should lobby Welsh Government to support more regional working, and that Cardiff should share its experience and expertise in economic development with its partners. There is, however, a need for strong governance, which better reflects democratic accountability.

City-region relationships - there was a sense that the paper should have a greater emphasis on the role of and potential benefits for the city-region. It was also suggested that more opportunities for people and businesses outside of Cardiff to feel benefits would create stronger buy-in from the wider city-region.

Transport – predictably transport has been identified as a core focus for development for the city- region, both in terms of the impact on Cardiff's transport infrastructure (and in particular the impact on inbound commuting on Cardiff residents) as well as its ability to share the proceeds of growth in Cardiff. The role of the city-region ports was also noted as important.

Gateway – Cardiff was also identified as the gateway to Wales, and has a significant role to play in both attracting visitors to sign-post to the city-region, as well as developing a core for businesses that could link in with the supply chain across the city-region.

Selected Responses

"The vision could be strengthened by giving more opportunities and hooks for people and businesses outside of Cardiff to feel the benefit and it needs a stronger focus on the whole regional benefit of this vision to create stronger buy in and enable the wider city region to get behind this."

"ABP has three ports within the Capital Region at Barry, Cardiff and Newport. The Green Paper should therefore recognise the role that ABP can play in the regional economy and provide support for the continual improvement of port and dock facilities and operations and by encouraging development of energy and infrastructure projects that are compatible with dock operations and the attraction of inward investment for manufacturing and other industries in locations that are conveniently co-located with the Port, as well as supporting the provision of appropriate transport links to the Port."

"One of the most important developments which is on the table is the Metro system and yet this involves a lot of strategic planning, so any major development which could interfere or severely restrict this possibility, should be part of the strategic planning objectives, when major planning decisions are before us."

"My fear and suspicion is that Councils such as your own are not sufficiently incentivised to work together with others, for fear of seeing the plaudits for any collaboration reflected in the economic data for the other councils, rather than your own."

"The city region concept will not succeed if Cardiff seeks, and indeed achieves, growth almost in isolation from adjacent areas. Therefore, the economies of adjacent local authority areas are relevant to Cardiff's strategy, and the city must adopt an approach that emanates from a strategic, regional one that identifies each as having a complementary role."

How do we engage with Europe in a post-Brexit era?

There was general support for the concept that Cardiff needs to ensure it has an international outlook and continues to engage with partners in Europe. It was also identified that Cardiff needs to work to identify new sources of funding for projects in a post-Brexit world.

Funding - it was felt that active participation by organisations within Cardiff in programmes such as Horizon 2020 and Erasmus+ will go some way to ensuring that the city remains open and tolerant post-Brexit.

Trade - the concept of a Free Trade Zone (FTZ) for Cardiff was suggested, in which goods could be imported, manufactured, processed and re-exported without the payment of import taxes. A FTZ could help to incentivise businesses to remain in the UK (rather than re-locate to the EU) or even attract new investment from foreign companies that could expand by using the UK as a base for their operations.

Current Links - there was support for maintaining and developing Cardiff's twinning links, and consulting with universities on any educational, economic, and cultural synergies within these. Beyond Europe, engagement with China and Africa were also suggested, with reference to Welsh Government's Wales for Africa programme.

Sport and Culture – culture, sport, exchanges between young people and tourism were cited as ways to continue engagement with Europe.

Selected Responses

"The report rightly refers to the threat from the impact of Brexit on the ability to attract and retain skilled workers but offers no proposals to deal with this. Equally, much non-skilled work is carried out by EU citizens and we need urgent plans in place to deal with the anticipated drop in these numbers. We must, however, continue to pursue European cultural engagement as much as possible outside the EU framework. A key driver for this will be with our universities where huge amounts of international collaboration takes place. We should, therefore, place universities at the forefront on our ongoing engagement."

What can we do to improve connectivity?

Transport was cited as one of the most significant themes emerging from responses. It was seen by both businesses and residents as the main inhibitor of growth, as well as being the issue that is most sensitive to growth itself.

Cardiff Airport - Several responses indicated the need for improved links between the airport and city. There is desire for further development of Cardiff Airport, including greater frequency of flights and exploration of the possibility for more long-haul flights.

Rail - There was widespread support for proposed new railway provision at St Mellons. The Queen Street to Cardiff Bay train was viewed as inadequate, whilst it was also thought that Queen Street station could offer a more welcoming environment. The potential of the Metro to radically change and improve sustainable transport throughout the City Region was recognised.

Bus – Bus was seen as an underperforming resource, with concerns around fares and confusing routes.

Roads and Congestion - It was acknowledged that the recently opened Ocean Way link has offered a new route to the Bay area but respondents felt that other roads around the city have been neglected. Residential parking was also cited as an issue, in particular in the Bay. Doubts were expressed about the effectiveness and safety of traffic-slowing measures, including speed humps. It was also acknowledged that a major shift away from private cars is important but the car is not going to disappear. Responses recognised the opportunity for a significant modal shift in transport and the associated impacts on quality of life and public health.

Trams - A number of respondents proposed a tram system for Cardiff, citing that many UK cities have modern tram systems, including Sheffield and Birmingham.

Cycling- There were numerous calls to make cycling a priority, and to place less focus on increasing road capacity and car focussed infrastructure that would only decelerate modal shift.

Walking - In terms of city centre movement, it was reported that fewer people now cut through the arcades because of the Central Square development work. Signage therefore is and will be especially important. An audit of signage was recommended to acknowledge changes of names and highlight new areas.

Selected Responses

"It is essential that the airport is a vibrant and connected part of the infrastructure, to reduce the current tendency of many to gravitate towards Bristol Airport."

"I took the opportunity last week to present this Green Paper to 50 businesses and I asked the businesses present to share one thought on the plan and I wonder if you can guess what it was - infrastructure. Every single business in that room was concerned that this City cannot cope with the growth that is planned, it is our job as a Council to reassure them that we can."

"The Capital City Region Metro is a potential game changing proposal, which aims to radically change and improve sustainable transport throughout the City Region. Whilst it is obviously important that Cardiff, as the capital city and largest economic entity within the City Region, realises a significant modal shift towards sustainable transport, it is equally important for Cardiff residents that accessibility and connectivity is similarly enhanced outside the city boundaries. Whilst Cardiff will provide a significant number of jobs within the city, there are many times more employment opportunities outside of Cardiff that the residents of Cardiff can, and in fact do, take advantage of. As a result Metro improvements will need to improve accessibility across the region, not just within the city itself, in order to provide appropriate transport provision for Cardiff's residents and workers. This needs to be specifically addressed in the Green Paper, which currently only addresses internal and incoming movements."

How can everyone benefit from growth?

Inclusive Growth - there was recognition that the benefits of economic growth and regeneration have not been spread equitably in the city, both in terms of geographic and demographic reach. Sharing benefits with people and places across Cardiff was encouraged, as was engagement with the third sector, local charities and social enterprises. One response suggested that to try to address this, a shared understanding of what Inclusive Growth means would be needed, as well as a meaningful set of metrics with which to measure it.

Social Enterprise - the Green Paper's commitment to an expanded social enterprise sector to support the Council's estate management and other services was welcomed. It was stated that social businesses can be at the centre of strong, local economies, playing a key role in creating more balanced economies and delivering sustainable growth, while fostering positive social change and innovation. Increased commitment to the Living Wage was encouraged as a way of ensuring basic fairness.

Foundational and Circular economies - the Foundational and Circular economies were also suggested as ways to make an impact on equality in economic growth. It was urged that the public sector in Cardiff spends as much of its purchasing power as possible within the local economy to ensure that the benefits remain in the city and region.

Local Business Development - one response urged consideration of a new approach focused on developing an inclusive economy through greater emphasis on building local economies. There was concern that there is too little support for small, local traders and producers, whose profits can potentially contribute more to the local economy than large chains. On a similar note, it was suggested that if Cardiff could retain more of the business rates it generates, especially given levels of growth, the additional money could be targeted to ensure that everyone can benefit, whichever part of the city they live in.

Public Procurement - further suggestions for ensuring an inclusive economy were to explore the community benefits of public procurement beyond the transactional elements currently monitored and to develop public private partnerships that could have an important effect on some of the most deprived parts of the city.

Education and Skills - it was felt that raising the levels of education and skills of children and young adults, especially in literacy and numeracy, was needed in order for them to benefit from opportunities. Furthermore, this work needed to be in close partnership with local communities, and address equality issues including gender and ethnic background. The importance of skills was also highlighted in the context of the workplace and urged that small and medium sized businesses have access to support and funding to improve the skills development of their workforces. There was support to continue promoting and even to expand the Cardiff Commitment as a way to ensure benefits of growth can be shared with young people across the city through job opportunities.

Diverse Communities - some felt it was vital to engage with diverse communities in implementing economic strategy. It was noted that some groups with relatively high employment rates can experience disadvantage in career progression and are under-represented at higher grades in organisations, demonstrating the need to identify inequalities in relation to employment and earnings and to ensure that targeted actions are taken to address workplace attitudes.

Selected Responses

“Research shows that poverty very often severely limits the life chances of children and adults. Amgueddfa Cymru has been strongly committed, for the last decade and more, to changing these outcomes for children and communities through cultural participation. Research shows that this can be highly effective as a strategy. We lead the research and evaluation of the Welsh Government’s Fusion Programme on Culture and Poverty, and would welcome a strategic role in our work with Cardiff Council as well.”

“We would encourage all organisations to be Living Wage employers – we have been an accredited Living Wage employer since 2014 – as this is one way of ensuring basic fairness that all people who work should get a wage which is enough to live on. A commitment towards the Foundational economy and the circular economy will also make an impact. We would encourage the public sector in the city/Wales to spend as much of its purchasing power within the Welsh economy to ensure that as much of the benefits as possible stick to the city/regional/national economy.”

“The Green Paper’s proposals around creating a more inclusive capital city are welcomed. We believe that in order to create more inclusive economic growth which benefits people and places equally across Cardiff, a new approach focused on building an inclusive economy is needed through greater emphasis on building local economies. We would urge the Council to consider this.

The Council could also consider how it could support social businesses in other ways, including:

- Ensure clear signposting for the co-operative option and specialist support through any other business advice support offered by the Council
- Supporting pre and new start social businesses as current support focuses on social businesses looking to grow.
- Ensure that social businesses are given business rates relief to give them the same economic advantage as registered charities.
- Use public sector procurement regulations to stimulate opportunities for social businesses. This includes making it easier for social businesses to bid for contracts; making use of reserved contract; and embedding social business within the community benefits reporting process.

Social businesses can be at the centre of strong, local economies, playing a key role in creating more balanced economies as ways of doing business that deliver sustainable economic growth while fostering positive social change and innovation. The Green Paper’s commitment to an expanded social enterprise sector to explore establishment of community-based social enterprises to support the Council’s estate management and other support services is welcome. To fully deliver the potential of this approach, we would urge the Council to consider learning from the Evergreen Co-operative Initiative in Cleveland, Ohio and a recent similar initiative in Preston, England.”

“I think we also need to see more about how we are going to invest in local communities, whether that is local regeneration schemes rather than the bigger projects or whether that is investment in for example our local district shopping centres, again I think that is something that I’d like to see more detail about.”

How can we create more and better jobs?

Better jobs - it was acknowledged that rather than just more jobs, which may be low-paid and lacking in training and development opportunities or career progression, it is appropriate to have an emphasis on better jobs.

District and local centre development - new office space around key city transport hubs was suggested to encourage smaller employment areas outside of the city centre. The importance of district and local centres in generating employment was highlighted, alongside attracting national and international business to come to the city.

Local Procurement – it was noted that there is no mention in the Green Paper of local procurement and how local business can both support and benefit from this plan.

Range and Choice - incentives for independent start-ups and SMEs would be welcomed by some respondents, however the need for these terms to be favourable to the public interest was also emphasised.

Creative economy - it was felt that investment in the creative economy and cultural sector would make the city region an attractive destination for all business, as a thriving arts sector makes a place more desirable in terms of quality of life.

Cardiff Commitment - continuing the Cardiff Commitment was endorsed as a way to help link young people with appropriate jobs.

Inward Investment - attracting more national and international businesses to the area was recognised as important for creating jobs.

Selected Responses

“New office space around key city transport hubs would encourage also smaller employment areas outside of the city centre. In addition, local and district centres could be encouraged to have a more diverse range of shops. Whilst rightly aiming for national and international business to come to the city, Cardiff Council should also bear in mind the importance of its district and local centres in generating employment.”

“Subsidise businesses locating to Cardiff (long term); set up a science park; work in partnership with university education sector to attract start-ups; invest in creative economy and cultural sector to make the city region an attractive destination for all business (thriving arts sector makes a place highly desirable)”

“To a large extent, this is the consequence of all the other measures captured in our responses elsewhere. By and large, it is not councils that create jobs but businesses. That said, we could set Cardiff up as an ideal location to base the extra civil servants who will be needed post-Brexit to replicate the administrative work currently carried out by EU agencies. As one of the existing political centres in the UK, Cardiff would be ideally placed to do this. This aside, our role is an enabling one, creating the infrastructure for businesses and ambitious entrepreneurs to thrive.

We have to look to the sectors that are growing rather than declining, such as digital, technology and online. We need to encourage small and medium businesses to diversify rather than fight against these trends. We need plans for developing a strategy to work with employers on workforce planning.”

How can we become a smarter city?

Leadership Role - the smart agenda was recognised as an important area and one in which Cardiff could demonstrate a key leadership role for the region. One response queried whether Cardiff's Smart City officer could also advise the broader region.

Infrastructure - ensuring basic technological infrastructures, particularly broadband, are in place across the city and the region was recognised as essential for a Smart City to work. It was noted that some areas of slow internet access remain, potentially including parts of the city centre. Conversely one response recognised how much digital capacity Cardiff already has and how it is currently underutilised. It was felt that other cities would envy the amount of fibre that Cardiff has, making it a significant selling point for the city. As with the question on connectivity, there was mention of electric cars being part of succeeding as a Smart City.

Smart Working - flexible working was also highlighted as key to future success as it will lessen demand for transport, especially at peak times, enable house-bound residents to contribute to the economy, and could make Cardiff even more attractive to business in terms of fibre capacity.

Citizen Engagement - there was enthusiasm for a broad public debate about data ownership issues involved in this area, and it was suggested that opportunities could be explored for using technology to increase and enhance citizen involvement.

Selected Responses

"Finally I'd like to turn to the section on Smart Cities, Smart Cities are about how Cities use technology or data and how we use those and how we deliver services; it's about modern cities right at the forefront of development. So how are we doing at present? Well, one indication is the UK smart cities index published just in October last year by HUAWEI, and that ranks the twenty cities in the UK that are taking forward the smart cities agenda, and sadly Cardiff was ranked 19/20, we are languishing a long way behind."

What should Cardiff's spatial strategy be?

Investment Zones - there was general support for the proposed spatial strategy, with the proposed zones seen as complimenting the city's strengths and with the potential to focus and attract investment aligned with the proposed zones. Overall, the rationale for the cluster approach was welcomed by many respondents.

'Fuzzy' boundaries – it was noted that we could not be overly specific or prescriptive in terms of activities within each zone. For example, it was also highlighted that the civic centre of Cathays Park, including a number of Cardiff's most significant heritage buildings, along with Cardiff Castle and Bute Park, are designated as part of the city centre business zone. Similarly, Cardiff Bay still has a commercial focus and this needs to be reflected.

Local Centres - in addition to the proposed spatial strategy, it was indicated that possible designation of some local and district centres could be explored and that this could help with promoting the local economy.

Green Spaces - some respondents wanted to see greater commitment to incorporating green spaces and community spaces into these developments to provide vital environments for people and wildlife.

Selected Responses

"The idea of zones around the City seems a good idea. Whilst I think, and I'm sure many will feel the same, that this in principle is a very good plan, before you even begin to think about any developments, Cardiff must get its act together and sort out the horrendous traffic congestion"

"The character and charm of the Edwardian city centre must not be lost; they are central to Cardiff's quality as a good place to live. Historic character is a key part of Dublin's image and success. No more characterless development projects, of the type that could be anywhere on the planet."

"I have on a number of occasions in this Chamber spoke about, what is nobody's fault, is a historical development, the geographical problem Cardiff faces is that its cultural commercial and industrial weight, sinks to its geographical South, and this map in a way demonstrates that problem. The developments identified are geographically to the South, and what the City faces is a sort of residential layering on top or above that that cultural commercial and industrial centre."

"We feel that the 5 subdivisions of the City economy are too crude to be meaningful for the purposes of analysis or to make sense to either citizens or visitors."

"We're concerned about the zoning impulse behind this green paper. For a start, we think it's hard to manage. By way of example, there is proposal for an innovation zone in north Cardiff, presumably heavily based around the city's universities, and yet we see the universities building new campuses in the south central part of the city. It is therefore not clear how you can shoe-horn independent businesses and organisations to fit into neat lines on a map."

"I believe that cities should develop organically. The council should concentrate on providing the infrastructure to enable this rather than restricting certain activities to certain areas."

"Finally we welcome the developing spatial strategy for the city and the focus on innovation in particular."

What can we do to support business development in the City Centre?

Metro Central - the role of the regional transport interchange, based around Cardiff Central station, was recognised as vital to supporting business development in the city centre.

Connecting the City Centre - it was felt by some that although developments including Central Square have transformed the centre of the city, this has to some extent been at the expense of areas such as Queen Street and the Capitol Centre. It was suggested that these areas could be better connected with nearby student residences and also the cultural and business environment for example around City Road. There was also a suggestion of expanding the Business Improve District (BID) to include City Road, or possibly creating a smaller, localised BID around this area.

Heritage - there were concerns that in the course of new developments Cardiff's heritage buildings should not be lost, as they are key to the city's character and quality as a place to live environments for people and wildlife.

Selected Responses

"Central Station has potential reputational damage, e.g. on match days, capacity issues, homelessness. The Central Square development represents a big opportunity. City Deal funding is in the right direction and will help provide a good first impression. We must also address the length of stays decreasing – impact on retail etc."

"The movement of Brains Brewery seems like a necessity in order to achieve the above however i'm conflicted as I'm astonished as to how little value the council sees in a key part of the city's heritage and what could be such a core tourist attraction. If it must be moved, can aspects of its architectural heritage be maintained? How can it become a core attraction in a position linking the city and the bay? Could it emulate the success of the Guinness factory in Dublin?"

"Some very positive proposals in the consultation document re the City Centre. In addition, it would make sense to see the west side of Plasnewydd ward, in particularly the City Road area, counted as part of the City Centre and coming under its umbrella policy-wise Going forwards I'd like to see the Council exploring a possible mini-Business Improvement District for City Road (maybe also including Crwys Road) or, alternatively, seeing if City Road can be incorporated into the body of the main BID when/if it's renewed in a few years' time."

What can we do to support leisure activities in the Bay?

Indoor Arena - there was support for a new, larger arena to attract more visitors to Cardiff but a number of respondents highlighted the need for improved transport infrastructure to support this. There were some concerns about the potential impact on other businesses of moving the arena away from the city centre.

Events - it was suggested that the Bay would be an ideal location for festivals and open-air performances and events. Views were expressed about some of the events that regularly take place in the Bay and it was felt that there should be more emphasis on supporting home-grown talent.

Active Travel - it was noted that the journey from Cardiff centre to the Bay could be improved and people could be encouraged to walk if the route was more attractive and mixed use, whereas now it was described as "windswept and unwelcoming". Many responses recognised the need for improved sustainable transport options between the city centre and the Bay.

Culture - there was strong support from many respondents for a new contemporary art space in Cardiff Bay, including the potential benefits for tourism, communities, education and the creative industries. The importance of visual arts, and art and culture more generally, were highlighted, including for well-being, physical and mental health, social mobility, and educational attainment. It was felt that Cardiff is well-placed to host a major annual or biennial visual arts project that could act as a catalyst for different organisations and individuals to come together and present exhibitions in a range of formats, including a strong element of community engagement and the creation of opportunities for diverse communities to become producers of artistic content.

Cardiff Story - it was felt that the proposed move of Cardiff Story from its current city centre location to the Bay would be a significant change in Cardiff's cultural offer and would need careful consideration. It was noted that the current location in the Old Library building makes it accessible to shoppers and tourists, who may combine a visit with other nearby cultural attractions such as Cardiff Castle and Amgueddfa Cymru. Subsequently any development around this needs careful consideration with all key stakeholders. It was however recognised that a move to Cardiff Bay could be positive for the Cardiff Story Museum, provided it is supported with sufficient resources and as part of a wider cultural redevelopment. Cardiff Bay could provide the potential for a larger venue with specialist galleries and increased storage facilities, enabling the museum to better tell the story of Cardiff.

Mixed Use - there was some concern that, while the focus of the Green Paper for the Bay is understandably on leisure, the already significant desirable office space, studios, and creative hubs in the Bay are barely mentioned. It was felt that a successful waterfront regeneration scheme requires more than just tourism to be sustainable, and that there needs to be recognition of what is already in place and careful master planning for the Bay to flourish. It was also suggested to better join up different sections of the Bay that may currently be perceived as quite separate, for example between the Sports Village peninsula and the Mermaid Quay area.

Selected Responses

"What can we do to support leisure activities in the Bay?"

- Make it more possible for small independent cafes and restaurants to set up in Cardiff Bay. The chains are boring and of fairly low standard. So it would be great to see more around Mount Stuart Square
- Great idea to develop the area around the Graving Docks - Take inspiration from the many stories around the transformational power of major high quality Contemporary Art Galleries e.g. Guggenheim in Bilbao, Tate Liverpool, Jerwood Gallery Hastings, Turner Contemporary Margate and create such a space in Cardiff and link in a Cardiff Contemporary that matches the best that we know - Edinburgh Festival, Venice Biennale....
- Continue with your excellent Marathons - they bring fresh dynamic energy to the area
- Pedestrianise the bottom of Bute St from the Cardiff Bay train station to Mermaid Quay, add some trees and out door seating .
- Make the walk from the city centre to the Bay more attractive. Once upon a time Lloyd George Avenue was going to be the new Ramblas. Couldn't this long straight walk way have markets?
- Make Cardiff Bay a place that you want to explore - it has so much history and culture already"

"Successful European Capital Cities have a strongly developed, modern cultural infrastructure. Despite some having two national cultural venues (St Fagans and the Millenium Centre) of truly international standard, and one other (National Museum Cardiff) with outstanding internationally significant collections but otherwise poor facilities, Cardiff as a whole does not have a cultural infrastructure that is up to European standards."

"I agree that the institution should have a contemporary focus however I would suggest it could take the form of a museum that covers both contemporary art and design from 20th century onwards. Why add design? It's all around us – in everything we do, own and experience. By including design and design education in Wales' agenda we open up key opportunities for engaging visitors, and crucially local communities with design education that supports long term business opportunities and economic growth."

"A landmark contemporary art gallery is about so much more than the visual arts. It displays a bold confidence from a city which, in part, says that the city is stepping up in to a national and international dialogue around arts and culture that extends way beyond city or country borders."

"I would suggest that, despite challenging financial circumstances, a long-term objective should be for Cardiff to have a more distinctive 21st century space or spaces of scale which would generate real excitement amongst artists and audiences, and enable Cardiff's contemporary arts offer to be more visible within the national and international landscape."

"Cardiff Bay offers a unique and inspiring waterside setting for businesses within our coastal capital, both supporting and flourishing alongside its impressive culture and leisure offering. Established commercial residents include international players such as ARUP, Atradius, Lloyds Bank and KPMG as well as an eclectic mix of creative, financial and professional services companies of all sizes. They have chosen it for its open space, inspiring views, easy access, safe and secure atmosphere and choice of excellent accommodation."

"A significant improvement to the cultural offer is imperative to increase visitors and keep them returning. Galleries are an excellent way to celebrate a culture and the other cultures of the world as well as posing challenging ideas and offering a platform for discussion. The gallery and museum offer in Cardiff is small in comparison to all other European and UK cities."

"[The Bay] lacks a heart and the opportunity to browse shops. Whilst appreciating the trend to on-line shopping, many consumers (particularly when they are visiting an area) like to shop for unique products that are not widely available from retail chains. This could be an opportunity for the development of Cardiff Bay. "

"I support the development of the area near to the Coal Exchange and think encouraging young, vibrant, independent businesses is key to assisting the bay to achieve the 'cool' edge its drastically missing. I'd be keen to understand how the council will support small/local businesses through reduced business rates - not just in the initial year but over a decent period which would allow businesses to thrive and create long term economic development in the area."

"Bringing international professional artistic exhibitions to the city would also bring people to Wales. For example, the way in which the FA cup broadened the city's reach for Sport, a contemporary art gallery that could house shows from London, New York, Paris, would bring people from all over the UK and Europe to see the exhibitions bringing a massive investment into the city through local businesses. Contemporary art is a massive part of everyone's daily life and has to be an integral part of the development of a capital city. So please build a new contemporary art space and let the city be known for culture."

"Galleries are successful at attracting a broad range of visitors; they are particularly effective at attracting younger and older visitors as well as those from minority ethnic groups."

"What has been done to the Cardiff Bay railway station, nothing absolutely nothing a true disgrace. So I will object as usual, I know it is a waste of time but I do my duty as a concerned citizen standing up against the money men destroying our environment."

"There is already significant desirable office space - much of which has recently been sold to a large investor - and there are also the BBC studios / Gloworks creative hub which barely get a mention. A successful waterfront regen scheme needs more than just tourism to be sustainable, and if the Bay is to flourish suggest there needs to be a recognition of what is already in place and properly considered masterplanning for the future."

"The 'High Line Nine' galleria, a subset of this new gallery collection, was inspired by European gallerias but takes the concept to a new level. It is a collection of nine full service and highly amenitized boutique exhibition spaces, ranging from 650 sf to 1800 sf, located along a central thoroughway directly under the High Line. All of the spaces in the 'High Line Nine' have skylights over art walls ranging from 13' to 22' high and ability to add private offices and/or storage. Centralized restrooms are provided and there is even a wine bar/café and catering kitchen to service all of the many events."

What can we do to develop Cardiff West as a sporting destination?

Role of Sport - Cardiff's role in sport, particularly in terms of high-profile events, was not disputed. Attracting large-scale sporting events was recognised as important for Cardiff and its development as a sporting destination. It was suggested however that the city could give greater recognition to facilities elsewhere in the region that seek to promote community-based sporting activity in conjunction with professional organisations.

The Centre for Sporting Excellence in Ystrad Mynach, was given as an example of a community-focused approach yet serves the needs of both local and professional clubs active within the region through its establishment of links with the FAW, WRU and the Dragons region. It was also felt by some that sport is already at saturation point as an economic asset for Cardiff and that greater emphasis should be given to arts and culture.

Spatial Strategy - there was some concern that the spatial strategy does not acknowledge the existence of important sporting clusters in the city centre such as the Principality Stadium, Arms Park Stadium and the former SWALEC stadium in Sophia Gardens. It was felt that this significant cluster of facilities should be mentioned in addition to sporting infrastructure in Cardiff West.

Infrastructure and Development - the existing transport infrastructure afforded by the Cardiff Bus depot and Ninian Park railway station was noted as a valuable asset for Cardiff West's sporting offer. There was agreement with the proposal to redevelop Sport Wales, investing in facilities fitting for a capital city setting. It was acknowledged from some that the potential for a new stadium for the Cardiff Blues should be explored but it was felt that this should not be a 'multi-purpose' venue that might compete with other venues including the proposed multi-purpose arena and lead to saturation in Cardiff.

Selected Responses

"Sport Wales needs major investment – the facilities are tired and not what you would expect of a capital city."

"The International Sports Village area currently lacks character and identity and the arena could help boost transport links to this part of the city which needs more development than the preferred site."

"Cardiff West, especially around Leckwith Road/Sloper Road is developing as a sporting destination already. With the Cardiff Bus depot and Ninian Park railway station located in the vicinity any future developments can use this easy transportation access to get supporters to and from their event."

What opportunities are there to support industry in Cardiff East?

Spatial Strategy - there was some concern around the exact extent of the industrial area proposed in the spatial strategy, and whether this would include streets to the south of the railway line. It was felt that key central roads in the area such as Splott Road and Clifton Street have huge potential for small businesses in existing units but are often perceived as areas where no investment takes place, with the exception of the new rail bridges. One response hoped that industrial development would maintain historical parts of the area and support the growth of small businesses.

Sector focus - it was felt by some that an industrial strategy should focus on a shift to sustainable industries of the future and transitioning away from fossil fuel-based industries.

Transport links - it was seen as vital that transport infrastructure is improved so that goods can be more easily moved from this area, largely eastward from Cardiff towards England. It was felt that congestion around Rover Way needs to be addressed and the Eastern Bay Link Road completed. There was widespread support for the proposed new rail infrastructure at St Mellons, strengthening the position of industry in Cardiff East, but desire for assurance that this would be sensibly placed so as not to disrupt key residential areas of Splott. It was acknowledged that the location of the Port of Cardiff and Euro Freight Railway Terminal make East Cardiff an advantageous site for manufacturing and logistics firms, and that this development would build on existing uses and occupiers.

Trade - The Free Trade Zone (FTZ) idea that was suggested as part of engagement with Europe post-Brexit could have benefits for industry, encouraging businesses to remain in the Cardiff or event attracting new investment from foreign companies that could expand by using Cardiff as a UK base for their operations.

Selected Responses

"It is essential that the transport infrastructure is improved so that goods can be moved more easily from this area mainly towards the east of Cardiff (towards England). In this sense congestion around Rover Way has to be addressed and the need for the Eastern Bay Link Road to be completed is high, particularly as new investment in facilities in this area will add to the congestion. Sufficient land in close proximity is needed to support the organic growth of existing industrial companies. In order to provide the right competitive conditions for the types of businesses desired, give an incentive by way of reduced business rates for recycling companies."

"ABP recognises and supports that the East of Cardiff area is proposed to be the key industrial and logistics employment area of the City (associated with the Port and the Rail Freight Terminal). The proximity of the port to the East of Cardiff area, providing multimodal facilities (rail, road and sea) to the UK, ensures a significant opportunity for the City and Capital Region to locate value added manufacturing near to the port as a key logistics hub."

It is important however that the Green Paper recognises that in support of the employment proposals in the East of Cardiff, that appropriate key transport infrastructure is delivered linking such areas with the Port."

"Any industrial strategy should focus entirely on a shift to sustainable industries of the future and transitioning away from dirty, fossil-fuelled industries."

"You need to concentrate on the people of Splott the long term residents give them grants to do up their properties and maintain them"

What opportunities are there to support innovation in North Cardiff?

Spatial Strategy - the proposed Innovation Campus was welcomed as a good idea and a high priority for the city. Cardiff's dominance within the region in terms of knowledge-based industries was recognised and it was agreed that the city needs to operate as strongly as it can in these areas in order to maximise benefits not only for the city but also the region as a whole. New development of this type in the north of the city was supported as it will consolidate Cardiff's role within the regional context.

Approach to Innovation - The development of co-working campus environments was encouraged, as it was felt the commercial model is increasingly based on flexible, attractive workplaces that cluster companies around common goals and sectors. It was suggested that an open and innovative approach to investment models would be required and there could be income stream opportunities from both public and private sector occupiers for more flexible lease packages and easy access to common areas.

Selected Responses

"Our Innovation Campus, reputation for world leading research and impact, and our ability to attract and recruit the best talent (Wales, UK and internationally) to the city are just three examples of where we can work more strategic with the Council to leverage greater, and mutual, added-value to the City and regional economy."

How should we use events to support the city's economy?

More 'Local' Events - responses included recognition of the success and impact of major international events but also highlighted the potential for more home-grown, local events that can deliver for the people of Cardiff and build on the success of City of the Unexpected. One response emphasised that major sporting events should not prevent local traders from earning their living.

Hotel Space - in addition to transport concerns, some respondents felt that hotel stock in Cardiff is insufficient for major events, leading to large price increases at times of key demand. In particular, the lack of high quality 5* hotel provision in the city was noted.

Culture - it was felt by some that there is a tendency to focus on sports events and that the wider cultural offer should also be developed, in order to enhance Cardiff's reputation and enable the city to compete on the international cultural stage.

Transport - there were concerns around transport provision for major events, suggesting that a more coordinated approach may be needed between relevant partners to ensure an adequate transport offer for residents and visitors.

Music Strategy - Cardiff's Music Strategy was supported and described as a good example of the Council listening to its community. Securing the future of live music in Womanby Street was recognised as significant and the opportunity to feed into the music strategy to reflect the music community as a whole. There was enthusiasm for Cardiff to bid for UNESCO City of Music status as an outcome of the strategy.

Selected Responses

"While we believe it is important to attract major cultural events into the city, we welcome the focus on developing home grown events and festivals to deliver for the people of Cardiff and the desire to build on the success of City of the Unexpected. Securing the future of live music in Womanby Street is crucial and Creative Cardiff has appreciated the opportunity to feed into the music strategy which will reflect all of the music community. We are also keen that Cardiff bid for UNESCO City of Music status as an outcome of the strategy. "

"One of the key areas where Cardiff needs to develop is with its accommodation, which has lagged behind the increase number of major events. To get a hotel room during events is often difficult and certainly expensive. This sector needs to be enhanced with additional hotel rooms enabling more visitors (both during and outside of events) to Cardiff."

"Major events are vital to the city's economy and tourism. Greater collaboration with local businesses is needed to ensure the likelihood of major events having a positive impact is increased. Open consultation with local residents and academics / Universities is also needed to evaluate the success of events and calculate their economic impact e.g. UEFA 2017 Final."

"Major sporting events shouldn't prevent local traders from earning their living. The Sunday Riverside market has had to be cancelled multiple times, including at short notice, due to major sporting events. This shutting out of small trader means that it's predominantly the massive companies that benefit from these events.

"The lack of support for local farmers' markets is disgraceful, in my opinion. Despite the noise made about increasing sustainability, it feels like the Council are not actually interested in supporting those traders who work far harder and contribute far more to the local economy - as more of local producer's profits return locally, as opposed to large chains whose profits are squirrelled away elsewhere."

"The wider cultural offer must be developed, as there is a tendency to focus on Sports events. Without a strong cultural sector, Cardiff will struggle to compete on the international cultural stage."

Creative and Cultural Cardiff

In addition to the issues identified above there were a lot of responses that suggested that Cardiff should promote and develop its cultural and creative sectors. A selection of relevant comments have been provided below:

Selected Responses

"Extensive research (for example in London) has demonstrated that a city's creative economy depends upon two other crucial requirements:

- (i) A creative society
- (ii) A strong cultural sector"

"We would broadly agree with the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats outlined. Cardiff's cultural assets are a huge strength; from the National Companies to Artes Mundi, the UK's biggest contemporary arts prize based in the historic National Museum which houses one of the largest impressionist collections in the world.

We believe there is real scope for growth in the city's creative sector. In the period since the formation of Creative Cardiff in 2015 we've seen an uplift in the number of creative economy jobs listed on our website and have noted the creation of many small creative industries businesses, as well as the phenomenon of coworking spaces where freelancers and micro businesses can thrive. Our planned research for 2018 includes mapping creative hubs for British Council Wales and with a team of Cardiff University researchers, re-mapping Cardiff's creative economy to note growth since our 2015 findings of 2,788 creative companies, organisations and freelancers in the Cardiff area."

"How can the city host or facilitate growth for the creative sector and financial and professional services? Is there another city which has been an active rather than a passive partner in this process? Many other cities that I have looked into almost appear to have achieved this by accident, and those that have tried to play an active role have lacked authenticity and engagement from the community they seek to support."

"The creative sector is ambitious and international, with vision beyond its borders. The art school is producing some talented young artists and excellent research from the staff. However, there are currently not enough spaces in the city to support the growth of the creative community"

"The sector where Cardiff has the strongest employment specialisation is Music, performing and visual arts, with 1.2x as much activity as the UK average although this is felt to be made up of performing arts, where Cardiff performs strongly. The visual arts need further support and investment to compete and contribute on a larger scale."

"A centre for contemporary art in Wales should invest in its creative community and act as a learning resource/educational outreach space with schools, colleges and universities, but also the professional art community. It should act as a hub, with multiple spaces for artists of varying career levels - including a collection of works, test bed spaces for emerging ideas and accomplished exhibitions of more resolved ideas."

"For the purpose of this consultation we propose to place art into a larger context of "creative placemaking," a term that holds pivotal meaning for durational social, economic and regeneration projects. Through exploring how the creative placemaking construct is playing out in the larger field of arts and culture we can see how this can intersect the benefits of arts and culture with the economic development of Cardiff.

We believe that the arts can not only engage in the City's development but if positioned as a strategic partner can help shape the social, physical and cultural identity and its people by supporting economic development and the future well-being of communities. We believe that rather than standing outside plans and developments looking in, arts and cultural organisations

(existing and new) can step inside it and be a strategic partner for Cardiff Council from the onset working with agents in transport, regeneration, housing, environment, health and well-being and additional systems necessary for a stronger, more equitable City.”

“We urge that, as a result of the Consultation, Cardiff will expand its economic strategy to include a Cultural Strategy. Otherwise Cardiff will continue to be deprived of one of the most significant drivers of economic growth and jobs, and will lag behind every other successful Capital City in its development.”

General Comments

International Branding - increased communication with the outside world based on a strong social media offering was suggested, to encourage both businesses and potential visitors to consider Cardiff. A number of responses suggested the need for Cardiff to improve its international promotion

Third Sector - it was felt that the third sector needed to be better consulted and integrated into plans for Cardiff's economic development.

Community Engagement – local projects should ensure they are developed in consultation with their neighbouring communities.

Tourism - some responses focused particularly on tourism in Cardiff and it was proposed that the city could act more as gateway for tourism to the rest of Wales. There was some concern that the length of visitors' stays in Cardiff is decreasing, which in turn has an impact on other elements of the economy including retail and food and drink.

Well-being – there was also a wider recognition of the need for the economic agenda to be more closely aligned with areas such as health and well-being.

Sustainable development – sustainable development was seen as both a necessary requirement of interventions, as well as an area of opportunity. In particular the movement towards a zero carbon agenda was seen as an area that Cardiff could develop a competitive advantage in.

Governance – it was also recognised that local authorities currently have very little flexibility in resourcing economic development objectives, and that new ways of supporting development should be explored.

Industrial Strategy – Cardiff needs to provide a coherent and deliverable response to the UK's Industrial Strategy

Waterways – Cardiff should not forget that it is a waterfront city and should explore how it can connect more with its waterfronts.

Selected Responses

"We need to ramp up the communication to the outside world. Both businesses around the initiatives in the report and to potential visitors via a strong social media offering. I live here and I'm active across all of SM. I've yet to see a sponsored (PPC) link for any event in Cardiff or surrounding areas."

"Centre for Research on Socio-Cultural Change researchers have argued that the provision of foundational goods and services has been overlooked by industrial and economic policy in the UK and Wales, whose focus tends to be on high-tech processes and sectors."

"We view Cardiff's Economic strategy as an opportunity to build upon its growing reputation as a City that can deliver for both Government and emerging innovative sectors in the creative digital, cyber security and fin tech sectors. This is at a time when Government is beginning to once again invest in its property requirements, growing into new roles in regulation and looking to have a proactive industrial strategy that links up with strong growth clusters. We have 3 principal recommendations to the questions set out in the consultation

1. Maintain a strategic and senior relationship with UK Central Government at a pivotal time in Brexit planning. Cardiff to build upon its proactive approach to Government around relevant national policy areas as set out above.

2. Building Blocks Offerings; Build an offering to Government and Innovative Industry sectors from existing assets and success stories. For instance the National School of Journalism and Media, the BBC R&D facility in the City Centre and the burgeoning production sector present building blocks towards securing relocation of not just Channel 4 but wider Departmental requirements from DCMS. Similarly, all parts of Government are investing in data analytics and cyber security and Cardiff has a tremendous opportunity to build upon its success stories with HMRC's new data analytics department in Cardiff and Alert Logic.

3. Develop Co-Working Campus Environments; The future commercial occupancy model is increasingly predicated upon flexible, attractive, centrally located workplaces that clusters companies around common goals and sectors. This requires an open and innovative approach to investment models and for Cardiff Council there will be income stream opportunities from both Government and Private sector occupiers willing to pay a premium rent in return for a more flexible lease package that provides easy access to common areas."

We believe that the arts can not only engage in the City's development but if positioned as a strategic partner can help shape the social, physical and cultural identity and its people by supporting economic development and the future well-being of communities. We believe that rather than standing outside plans and developments looking in, arts and cultural organisations (existing and new) can step inside it and be a strategic partner for Cardiff Council from the onset working with agents in transport, regeneration, housing, environment, health and well-being and additional systems necessary for a stronger, more equitable City."

"We urge that, as a result of the Consultation, Cardiff will expand its economic strategy to include a Cultural Strategy. Otherwise Cardiff will continue to be deprived of one of the most significant drivers of economic growth and jobs, and will lag behind every other successful Capital City in its development."

