

COMMITTEE DATE: 01/03/2017

APPLICATION No. **16/02939/MJR** APPLICATION DATE: 20/12/2016

ED: **BUTETOWN**

APP: TYPE: Listed Building Consent

APPLICANT: Mr Morse

LOCATION: THE COAL EXCHANGE LIMITED, THE COAL EXCHANGE,
MOUNT STUART SQUARE, BUTETOWN, CARDIFF, CF10
5EB

PROPOSAL: APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR
THE PHASE 1 WORKS ASSOCIATED WITH THE CHANGE
OF USE (REF: 16/01024/MJR) TO PROVIDE 170 NO.
HOTEL SUITES WITH ASSOCIATED USES, INCLUDING
RECEPTION, FUNCTION SPACE, HERITAGE ZONE,
RESTAURANT/BARS, SPA AND CIRCULATION.

RECOMMENDATION : That, subject to referral to Cadw under Regulation 13 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990, that Listed Building Consent be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions :

1. C02 Statutory Time Limit - Listed Building
2. This consent relates to the works indicated on drawing references:

1506	E	(SP)	001	Rev -	Existing Site Plan
1506	E	(Site)	001	Rev C	Site Location Plan Car Park Structure
1506	E	(SP)	001	Rev -	Proposed Site Plan Inc Street Furniture
1506	E	(B00)	001	Rev -	Existing LG Plan
1506	E	(00)	001	Rev -	Existing GF Plan
1506	E	(01)	001	Rev -	Existing 1st FI Plan
1506	E	(02)	001	Rev -	Existing 2nd FI Plan
1506	E	(R)	001	Rev -	Existing roof Plan
1504	E	(EL)	001	Rev -	Existing Elevations A,B,C,D,E,F,G
1504	E	(EL)	002	Rev -	Existing Elevations H and I
1504	E	(EL)	003	Rev -	Existing Elevation J
1506	E	(CP)	001	Rev-	Existing Car Park Sections Ground and Basement
1506	P	(S)	003	Rev-	Existing & Proposed Basic Sections Indicative section C-C
1506	E	(EL)	004	Rev-	Existing Lightwell Elevations Bank & NW Lightwell
1506	P	(EL)	004	Rev-	Proposed Lightwell Elevations Bank & NW Lightwell
1506	E	(EL)	005	Rev-	Existing Hall Elevations Internal Hall
1506	P	(EL)	005	Rev-	Existing Hall Elevations Internal Hall
1506	P	(00)	003	Rev-	Proposed Grnd FI Plan Hall and Ante Rooms

1506	E	(00)	020	Rev-	Existing Grnd FI Plan Bank and Ante Rooms Plans/Elevations/Finishes	
1506	P	(LG)	001	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	
1506	P	(00)	001	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	General Arrangement
1506	P	(01)	001	Rev E	Proposed 1st FI Plan	General Arrangement
1506	P	(02)	001	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	General Arrangement
1506	P	(00)	020	Rev-	Existing & Proposed GF Bank Plans and PDR Plans/Elevations/Finishes	
1506	P	(STLG)	001	Rev -	Proposed LGnd FI Plan Indicative Staircase 04 and 07	
1506	P	(ST00)	001	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan Indicative Staircase 04 and 07	
1506	P	(ST01)	001	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan Indicative Staircase 04 and 07	
1506	P	(ST02)	001	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan Indicative Staircase 04 and 07	
1506	P	(LG)	002	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone1
1506	P	(LG)	003	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone2
1506	P	(LG)	004	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone3
1506	P	(LG)	005	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone4
1506	P	(LG)	006	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone5
1506	P	(LG)	007	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone6
1506	P	(LG)	008	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone7
1506	P	(LG)	009	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone8
1506	P	(LG)	0010	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone9
1506	P	(LG)	0011	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone10
1506	P	(LG)	0012	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Zone11
1506	P	(00)	002	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 1
1506	P	(00)	003	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 2
1506	P	(00)	004	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 3
1506	P	(00)	005	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 4
1506	P	(00)	006	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 5
1506	P	(00)	007	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 6
1506	P	(00)	008	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Zone 7
1506	P	(00)	002	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Bar and Back Bar
1506	P	(00)	004	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Kitchen and Back of House
1506	P	(01)	002	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 1
1506	P	(01)	003	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 2
1506	P	(01)	004	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 3
1506	P	(01)	005	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 4
1506	P	(01)	006	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 5
1506	P	(01)	007	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 6
1506	P	(01)	008	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 7
1506	P	(01)	009	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 8
1506	P	(01)	010	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Zone 9
1506	P	(02)	002	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 1
1506	P	(02)	003	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 2
1506	P	(02)	004	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 3
1506	P	(02)	005	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 4
1506	P	(02)	006	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 5
1506	P	(02)	007	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 6

1506	P	(02)	008	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 7
1506	P	(02)	009	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 8
1506	P	(02)	010	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Zone 9
1506	P	(LG)	200	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Ceiling Layout
1506	P	(00)	200	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Ceiling Layout
1506	P	(01)	200	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Ceiling Layout
1506	P	(02)	200	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Ceiling Layout
1506	P	(LG)	001	Rev -	Proposed LG FI Plan	Demolitions Openings and Infills
1506	P	(00)	100	Rev -	Proposed Grnd FI Plan	Demolitions Openings and Infills
1506	P	(01)	100	Rev -	Proposed 1st FI Plan	Demolitions Openings and Infills
1506	P	(02)	100	Rev -	Proposed 2nd FI Plan	Demolitions Openings and Infills
1506	P	(D)	001	Rev-	Proposed Door Details	Door Schedule and
1506	P	(S)	001	Rev-	Proposed	Partition Details Fire Stopping Details for Pipework
1506	P	(B00)	050	Rev -	LG FI Plans & Sections	Proposed Bin Store

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt

3. Notwithstanding the submitted plans and documentation, No works shall be commenced in any room or space within the building or to any part of its exterior until such time as the proposed works have been detailed to the local planning authority in the form a Coal Exchange 'Building Fabric Worksheet' which shall have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing prior to the commencement of works.

The Building Fabric Worksheet shall photographically record the condition of the affected room/space or affected building fabric, provide a written statement of intention, and a methodology of working against a pre-agreed room/space reference number.

Reason: To ensure for an appropriate assessment and approval for each detailed element of works and for the compilation of an appropriate building record as restoration/conversion works in the building progress.

4. Notwithstanding the submitted plans and documentation, No alteration of existing, or provision of new, external surfaces, external steps or handrails to the building shall be undertaken until such time as the proposed works have been detailed to the Local Planning Authority in the form a Coal Exchange 'Building Fabric Worksheet' which shall have been submitted to and approved by the local planning authority in writing prior to the commencement of works.

The Building Fabric Worksheet shall photographically record the condition of affected area/steps or handrail, provide a written statement of intention, and specification of works or product detail.

Reason: To ensure for an appropriate assessment and approval for each element of works and for the compilation of an appropriate building record as restoration/conversion works to the building progress.

5. Prior to insertion, full details of the proposed new internal staircases shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, together with a methodology of fixing, and finishing details,
Reason: To ensure that the aesthetic of the staircases will be appropriate to the building, and that no damage will result to the building as a result of their insertion.
6. Prior to the conversion of any lightwell to an internal space, full details of the works shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, including a methodology for providing foundations; roof support; and drylining and finishing details.
Reason: To ensure that the works will not result in any undue damage to the historic structure and that existing window provisions will be adequately protected within the conversion of the space.
7. No penetration of the existing building fabric shall be made to accommodate M&E insertions without full details of the necessary works first having been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
Reason: To ensure that the works will not result in any undue damage to the historic structure.
8. Notwithstanding the submitted plans and documentation this consent does not approve any works to windows or works of stone repair.
Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and because such works are consented elsewhere under Listed Building Consents 16/02026 and 16/02037.

1. DESCRIPTION OF WORKS

- 1.1 The application seeks Listed Building Consent for proposed modification of external and internal fabric of the building, including provision of new finishes, and decoration to provide for approximately 170 hotel rooms and ancillary spaces; a reception area; function space; restaurants; bars; spa; heritage zone; and circulation and access changes to the building.

2. DESCRIPTION OF SITE/SURROUNDS

- 2.1 The site encompasses the whole of The Exchange building central to Mount Stuart Square.

- 2.2 The building is Grade II* (Two Star) listed for its historic importance as a one of the most important commercial buildings in Wales.
- 2.3 Architecturally, the building is a cream and grey limestone composition of three floors over basement in French Renaissance style. The Western elevation of the building differs significantly from the other elevations in that it is poorer in terms of construction and materials (Brickwork) and has a more utilitarian appearance. The Main trading hall is the principal asset of the building both architecturally and historically and is capped with a rooftop lantern, but this was obscured by the insertion of a false ceiling in the 1970s, which was recently replaced to improve the interior aesthetic.
Externally, two asymmetrical projecting wings enclose a Circa 1970s concrete forecourt which is also the roof of a fortified concrete carpark which is topped by cast concrete baluster urns to the street.
- 2.4 The building has been in a semi-derelict condition for very many years, but over the last nine months has been acquired by new owners, and has seen significant ongoing repair works to address issues of water ingress, fire damage, dry and wet rot, and to replace missing or unviable floors and ceilings. Repairs to the external envelope of the building are ongoing in terms of roof repairs and drainage systems; and repairs to the external elevations and rooftop masonry are due to commence shortly, including stonework and brickwork repairs and the removal of destructive vegetation.
- 2.5 Mount Stuart Square Conservation Area comprises a variety of buildings of differing architectural form and scale, from Classical Victorian Terraced buildings to late 20th Century flatted development, and also includes a number of other Listed Buildings .
- 2.6 The Exchange is surrounded by Baltic House offices to the south, A surface level car park to the South West, Mixed use (office and residential) properties to the west (Aberdare House and St. Stephen's Mansions), further residential accommodation to the north (Empire House and St. James' Mansions), interspersed with office uses, and other commercial (A3) and office premises (A2/B1) to the east.

3. **PLANNING HISTORY**

16/01024	PP	-	Change of use of the coal exchange to form circa 200 bed hotel with function rooms, restaurant / bar, heritage exhibition space and spa Granted July 2016
16/1727	LBC	-	Demolition of Car Park Granted October 2016
16/ 01764	LBC	-	Hard Strip Granted October 2016

16/1879	DoC	-	Disch Conds 20/21 of 16/01024 Granted August 2016
16/1935	LBC	-	Show Rooms Granted February 2017
16/2026	LBC	-	Stone Repairs Granted October 2016
16/2037	LBC	-	Window Restoration Granted November 2016
16/2656	LBC	-	Replacement false ceiling within main hall Granted January 2017
A/14/56	ADV	-	Lettering and images to perimeter safety hoarding Granted March 2014
13/374	VAR	-	Variation of condition 1 of listed building consent 06/764/c to extend the time period within which the works must be begun; so that the permitted works shall begin no later than 4th march 2018 (s19 - planning (listed buildings and conservation areas) act 1990. Withdrawn
13/371	VAR	-	Removal of condition 8 of listed building consent 06/764/c to enable the approved demolition works to take place prior to a contract for the new build works being signed (s19 - planning (listed buildings and conservation areas) act 1990. Withdrawn
12/15	VAR	-	Variation of condition 1 of planning permission 06/00760/c to extend the commencement period of development by five years Resolved to Grant April 2012 (Subject to Deed of Variation, never signed)
06/764	LBC	-	Partial demolition and mixed use development comprising: residential, commercial office, retail and cafe/restaurant space including the exchange hall retained for public access Ministerial approval further to 'call in' April 2008.
06/760	FPP	-	Mixed use development comprising: residential units; commercial office space; retail and cafe/restaurant uses at ground and lower ground

floors. The exchange hall retained for public access.
Permitted March 2007

04/00633/C	FPP	Disabled Ramp Permitted 2004
04/00632/C	LBC	Disabled Ramp Granted 2004
01/02225/C	LBC	Extension to Existing Bar Facility, Provision of Cellar within Basement and Ground Floor Access via Lift and Staircase Granted 2002
86/01849/R	FPP	Demolition of existing "lean-to" porch and making good walls; Form new fire escape door within existing window opening Granted 1987

4 RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

4.1 Planning Policy Wales Chapter 6

WO circular 61/96 Planning and the Historic Environment

WO Circular 1/98 Planning and the Historic Environment

4.2 Other Material Considerations

Cardiff Local Development Plan 2016

KP17: BUILT HERITAGE

EN9: CONSERVATION OF THE HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT

4.3 Mount Stuart Square Conservation Area Appraisal

5 INTERNAL CONSULTEE RESPONSES

5.1 None Undertaken

6. EXTERNAL CONSULTEE RESPONSES

6.1 The 7 **Amenity Bodies have been consulted:**

No representations have been received

The Victorian Society have asked if they may visit the building. This request has been passed to the building owner.

6.2 **South Wales Fire Service**

Have written to advise of the applicant's responsibility to ensure adequate water supply and access arrangements are in place for fire fighting purposes. This communication is not relevant to this application, but has been forwarded to the applicant to set up a dialogue with the fire service to ensure their advice/requirements are addressed in any fire strategy .

7. **REPRESENTATIONS**

7.1 The application has been advertised on site and in the Local Press.

7.2 Eighteen representations have been received from:

"Save the Coal Exchange Ltd" (SCE)** and from individuals, at Brynbala Way, Trowbridge; Wentloog Road Rhymney; Lewis Road Llandough; Leamington Road Rhiwbina; Llwyn-on Close, Caerphilly; Plasturton Ave, Pontcanna; Taff Embankment, Riverside; Corporation Road, Grangetown; Holmesdale Street, Grangetown; Caerphilly Road, Birchgrove; Hunter Street, Butetown; Westgate Street, City Centre; Roath Court Road, Roath; Mount Stuart Square, Butetown; Penstone Court Butetown; Fairfield Avenue Canton; and Dr Elaine Davey.

*** n.b. This organisation has no connection with "The Coal Exchange Ltd" who are an unrelated, but similarly named organisation.*

7.3 The grounds of objection are

- Insufficient progress has been made
- The development is not the same as printed in the papers
- The car park is no longer to be removed as shown in early images
- The Roof lantern is no longer to be exposed as seen in early images
- Roof not restored
- Walls not restored
- Drainage not resolved
- Plant Growth yet to be removed
- Reneged on promise to fix the roof and make the building watertight
- Lack of external works are a pre-cursor to demolition proposals
- Fear of the building being condemned or demolished
- Fluidity of Proposals
- No programme of work
- No prioritisation of work
- The developers use social media to illicit support
- Procurement of the building
- Use of Public Monies
- Loans given to the developer
- Funding Mechanism/Perceived Lack of funding
- Conduct of the Council/ Lack of Action by the Council
- Proposals do not follow those recommended by Capita to Welsh Government

- Lack of collaborative working between WG, the Council, and the Developer
- Reservations in respect of Window Glazing
- Lack of appointment of professional conservation architects /surveyors/advisers
- Lack of historic reference and understanding of surrounding spaces
- No Safeguarding of heritage features within the building
- No/Non compliant Disabled Access provisions
- Relocation of the War Memorial
- Proposed sharing of space between the Heritage zone and Bute Town History and Art society.
- Will not provide for small businesses; Cooperatives, Artists and will not be publicly accessible
- Out of Accord with Memorandum Of Understanding
- Distrust of the developer
- Fire Security
- Absence of a conservation management plan
- No statement of how areas of significance will be retained for the future funding

7.4 The grounds of Support are:

- The proposals are predicated on the preserving/reinstating the existing structure
- Hotel use complementary to the cellular form of the building
- Museum on Ground Floor
- Café/Bar Restaurant in former bank
- Smart re-use of darker deep plan spaces as Spa and gym areas

8. **ANALYSIS**

8.1 **Background/Update**

8.2 Members will recall their approval of Planning Permission for the change of use of the Exchange building to a hotel in July 2016; at that time, it was noted that a Listed Building Consent application(s) which would detail how the conversion would be undertaken would be forthcoming.

8.3 Further to the approval of planning permission last summer, a number of Listed Building Consent applications have already been submitted and approved to allow for the stripping back of the building, and in respect of establishing a control framework to manage the magnitude of repair works which will be necessary.

8.4 Soft strip works have seen the building cleared of the majority of rubbish and furniture and other loose items in order to reveal the underlying arrangement of rooms and finishes; It has been surveyed, and all rooms and spaces have been identified and allocated a reference as per conditions applied to the planning

permission to establish a baseline for proposed future works. This has also been undertaken in respect of the external envelope of the building.

- 8.5 The building has been 'hard stripped' of non-historic fixed fittings and furnishings (shelves and wall heaters, modern toilet cubicles; office fixtures; over cladding, suspended ceilings, modern partitions etc); and has, and is continuing to be cleared of unviable fabric (dry and wet-rot damaged fabric and detritus, and of fabric subject to fungal decay etc) which is far more extensive than was first envisaged, but which has been revealed as repair works and reinstatement of floors and ceilings have been undertaken.
- 8.6 The South East fire damaged wing of the building has been opened up to investigate the condition of the internal skin of the building, and its connection (or not) with the outer facade, any masonry loss and lintel damage and to investigate options to ensure the future integrity of the structure. Currently a methodology to allow for new joist insertions to be made are being developed to allow for the reinstatement of floors which were lost in the fire.
- 8.7 The South West corner of the building is subject of an engineering survey and the roof structure in the NW corner remains inaccessible at the current time. Engineering recommendations for an appropriate methodology of stabilisation /repair of the structure are currently being considered by the applicant.
- 8.8 External roof repairs have been undertaken, and drainage systems exposed and repaired or modified. These works are ongoing.
- 8.9 All of the above works have been agreed/monitored by the Planning Officer and the contractors are in regular dialogue with the Planning Officer in respect of proposals and repairs which are also photographed for record purposes as a part of the consenting process.
- 8.10 Treatment of Buddleia and of other destructive vegetation is reported to be imminent, and the plant roots will thereafter be removed and stonework and brickwork repairs undertaken in due course.
- 8.11 **This application**
- 8.12 This application is the first major Listed Building Consent submission, and describes how it is intended to convert the building in terms of the use of rooms and spaces within the building, the typical philosophies and methodologies to be employed, the extent of any demolitions and interventions proposed, as well as the likely phasing of works to enable the hotel to become operational, and thereafter the building to be restored.
- 8.13 This application confirms the applicant's intentions in respect of the nature of the conversion proposed; the basis of proposals for repair, alteration, extension and reinstatement, and new works over the four floor levels of the building. The application confirms intentions for the building at this point in time, and identifies which works are currently proposed as 'Phase 1' works, and sub phases thereof, and those which are proposed as 'Phase 2' works. These

phases may be subject to change for technical, practical or operational reasons. The Planning Officer has also been advised that a further LBC submission is imminent which will detail further longer term aspirations for the building such as the re-revealing of the roof lantern and trusses above the main hall, but these proposals are not detailed or considered here.

8.14 It is not therefore the intention of this report to seek Committee's approval for every finite change in every room or space within the building (although this will be the role of officers in the future as works progress); but rather more to advise and seek the approval of Members in respect of the principle of how the building is intended to be converted, and of the philosophies and typical methodologies to be employed.

8.15 The detailed assessment and proposals for each room and space is recommended to be controlled by the use of planning condition, as has been proven to be an effective mechanism of control in respect of former approvals for hard stripping of the building; and which has also been accepted by Cadw in respect of a control mechanism for future window repairs and stonework repairs.

8.16 **Statute, Regulation and Guidance**

The Coal Exchange is Listed as a building of Architectural and Historic Interest Grade II*. (Two Star)

8.17 As such, the Planning Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act 1990 (As Amended) places a duty on Local Planning Authorities, when considering Applications for Listed Building Consent to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

8.18 Further Guidance is provided by Welsh Office Circular 61:96 Planning and the Historic Environment; Most relevantly guidance contained in Annexe D to that document and the appendix to that annexe.

8.19 A British Standard BS7913 also exists; as do many other practical, philosophical and theoretical texts from which a number of maxims of conservation have been derived.

8.20 When faced with proposals for the change of use of Listed Buildings, the generally adopted approach is to attempt to realise the change of use of the building with minimum change to the building structure; to work with the layout and fabric of the building; and to achieve any conversion with the minimum necessary intervention; Repairs are recommended to be undertaken with traditional materials and using traditional repair technologies; and for any new works to be sympathetic; and ideally to be structurally reversible, without loss or damage to the building; and to retain and celebrate its most important features.

8.21 The proposed works are therefore considered in the context of such guidance and best practice.

8.22 The Works Proposed Under this Application

8.23 Structural Building Changes/Extensions/Alterations

8.24 Structural Building Changes

The submitted drawings indicate that the proposed conversion is based on the existing cellular layout of rooms. The envisaged end product is fundamentally based in the repair and reinstatement of the existing building structure. There are no substantial demolitions or changes to the existing layout proposed and this is wholly welcomed.

8.25 Extensions

Extensions are limited to the provision of some additional interior spaces in the area of the building's lightwells. This will provide for additional kitchen and operational spaces, and the new roof areas created will accommodate Air Conditioning condensers and plant to avoid an excess of rooftop accretions, or unsightly installations on the exterior of the building. These works are also considered beneficial in removing areas which have been problematic to access and maintain in the past as well as providing useful and serviceable additional space in areas not readily visible to users of the building.

8.26 Elements of building alteration/interventions

Submitted drawings show the extent of the removal of limited areas of masonry walls, the blocking of some existing doorway openings and provision of new openings to deliver the desired arrangement of rooms within the cellular layout. Overall these interventions are quite modest in respect of the scale of works proposed and this is considered appropriate and to follow both national and local conservation policy.

8.27 Use of different floor levels

Submitted drawings and documentation indicate that the Basement level will provide for service areas for the hotel; for a restaurant, spa/gym, a heritage zone, and plant and back of house areas, as well as second phase hotel rooms.

The Ground floor is shown to consist of a reception area, lounge/lobby, the main hall, and ante room spaces, as function space and bar, Hotel rooms and an open access restaurant within the former bank at the NE corner of the building for hotel guests and non-guest use.

The First and second floors will consist of hotel rooms only.

All floor levels will contain ancillary storage and operational spaces.

8.28 Key Spaces

It is intended that the higher order spaces will be retained as such,

The main hall and ante rooms lend themselves to use as the main multi-function space within the hotel for wedding receptions, conferences, exhibitions etc. There are no works of alteration to this space proposed at this time, however as indicated above, it has been confirmed that future proposals will likely include for the restoration and exposure of the roof lantern and trusses, however these proposals are not yet finalised and are not considered here. The retention and use of this space as the principal asset of the building is appropriate and welcomed.

The M&E strategy for this area of the building suggests that underfloor heating would be the most appropriate way of heating such a large space and would avoid the need for external piping and radiators, or electrical cabling to radiant heaters. No details are submitted with the application, but the concept is not objected to in principle and will likely be beneficial to the interior joinery in maintaining a constant temperature level as opposed to extreme variances in temperature which can occur from radiant heaters.

The exiting bar area within the ante rooms will be retained and upgraded to accept more modern fixtures and fittings. This will not impact on any historic fabric. New WCs, including an accessible WC are proposed to be constructed behind the ante-rooms, which will provide for WC provision immediately accessible from the multi-function space.

The detail of construction of all of the light well insertions will need to be subject of detailed control, and will also need to incorporate provision for the illumination of the windows currently fronting the space. However the benefits of capping the lightwells at a low level, and of resolving previously problematic drainage is considered to outweigh the loss of the originally conceived space, which will in any event remain at upper levels of the building. As such these works are supported.

- 8.29 **The lobby entrance area** at ground floor will be subject to minimal alterations and will be used as a reception and lounge bar area / breakout space for when the main hall is in use. The other spaces within the lobby area are proposed to be used as offices and back of house areas associated with the hotel.

It should be noted that significant effort has already been made to secure the retention of the ornate ceiling plasterwork in this area, as the above floor was subject to significant dry rot and had to be replaced. The contractors should be commended on their efforts to retain this ceiling.

Within the lobby space an opening is proposed to be formed to connect the proposed bar lounge with the main reception area. This will result in the loss of original fabric, but this fabric is only of modest significance and the removal of an element of the wall is not considered to impact unduly on the character of the building and will allow for the space to be used more meaningfully as a

reception/lobby. Connecting the two spaces together will have minimum impact on the existing features, and on this basis there is no objection to this proposal.

The existing fireplaces and features within the entrance lobby and hall ante rooms are to be retained, although it is proposed to relocate the tidal clocks (Lion Clocks) back into the main hall where they were previously sited. Again there is no objection to this.

- 8.30 **The former Bank**, located to the NE corner of the ground floor of the building is proposed to be used as a restaurant with access from the rear of the hotel as well as from the hotel interior. The conversion will retain the timber panelled former Manager's Office as a private dining room. and will see the light well adjacent to the bank capped and dry lined up to first floor level to provide kitchen space directly adjacent to the restaurant.

The bank, when opened up had lost most of its ceiling and beam coverings, and was an academic exercise in fruiting bodies and fungal growth. Remaining beam coverings and unviable fabric have now been removed and the interior will be refinished with new surface finishes. The timber panelling to the former manager's office will likely need to be removed to address dry rot behind it, but intentions are to investigate the manner in which the panelling has been applied and it is hoped to be able to remove and then reinstate it after treatment of the walls. The relatively modern teller's counters and security screens were not of any architectural significance and have now been removed.

8.31 **Offices**

- 8.32 The conversion of the former office spaces into hotel rooms is proposed to follow the approach adopted for the three trial room fit outs granted listed building consent earlier this year. For external rooms this provides for the repair of the internal side of the external wall, including the repair and servicing of windows where viable, or provision of new corded sash windows of replica design where not; the addition of secondary glazing to improve sound and thermal insulation; the making good of skirting boards and preservation/restoration of any period features such as interior grills or ventilators together with the redecoration of the interior wall to the full room height. Further into the room, this work is then supplemented by the provision of a coffered ceiling and ultimately the provision of a dropped bulkhead ceiling to the room entrance and bathroom areas. These works together with a system of overcladding of the remaining walls allows for the room to be brought up to appropriate fire resistance ratings and also to be finished in whatever interior finish is desired (panelling, tiling, paper or fabric finishes etc) without the necessity to interfere with existing fabric, or to chase plasterwork or modify joinery to accommodate new pipework, cabling and air conditioning installations.
- 8.33 It must be noted that this approach cannot be considered to constitute a restoration of the existing fabric, and would be resisted by many purist building conservators, as it does not repair or restore existing finishes, rather more it utilises the existing fabric as a support framework to accommodate new

finishes, and this has therefore been subject of extended dialogue with, and cause of further justification of the approach to Cadw.

- 8.34 The downside of the approach in historic building restoration terms is that although the system retains the existing cellular layout of rooms in the majority of instances, it also obscures the majority of existing finishes and detailing of the rooms. Welsh Office Circular advice would encourage existing cornice and plasterwork details to be repaired, and joinery profiles to be similarly renovated and supplemented with matching profiles as opposed to being obscured.
- 8.35 However, this must be balanced against the quality of the actual fabric concerned, which, is not particularly unusual or decorative, and must also be noted to have been lost, adapted, damaged or removed in many rooms as a result of many previous conversions and adaptations of the building, including the previous systematic removal of all fire places, provision of stud walls, and provision of surface mounted electrical switches, sockets and coms cables to skirting/joinery profiles.
- 8.36 Positively the approach does not destroy or remove any existing skirtings or cornice details, but simply obscures them. It should also be noted that much of the areas proposed for hotel room conversion correspond to the areas of secondary fabric detailed within the inspector's report for a former conversion of the site, which again would likely have been needed to be modified under that scheme which was approved by WG Minister.
- 8.37 The applicant has provided additional justification for this methodology in terms of meeting required fire safety standards, in terms of concealing otherwise visually poor but necessary plant and M&E installations; cost and time, and in respect of providing new finishes which are fit for purpose for the new use.
- 8.38 Overall the benefits of this methodology are considered to outweigh the impact of the works of the existing fabric, which as noted is of very variable condition, and which would not be lost as a result of the works which are also noted to be relatively easily reversible if desired in the future.
- 8.39 In dialogue, Cadw have suggested that there may be rooms within the building where overcladding is less appropriate and where greater energies should be expended in exploring the use of intumescent coatings to achieve compliant fire resistance. The proposed conditions recommended to Committee would allow for that possibility, as rooms would be considered on a room by room basis.
- 8.40 **The North West lightwell** Most recently this area was used as a back of house area to service the main hall. It has also been a convenient location to locate operational plant, but also as a dumping ground for old equipment. Broken or blocked drainage gutters and downpipes have also scarred the interior elevations of the lightwell with algae and fungal growth.
- 8.41 The proposal is to retain the back of house access on the lower ground floor of the lightwell as a service area. At ground floor level, a new floor will be

constructed to provide additional storage space to the main hall and a back of house entrance to the staff room and kitchen areas.

- 8.42 Again, subject to the approval of detail, there are no objections to these proposals.

8.43 Phasing

Outside of ongoing repair and maintenance works, the works applied for here are proposed in two principal phases over the three floors levels of the building and basement.

- 8.44 The indicated Phase 1 works exclude works to the basement and to the rear NE and NW corners of the building at ground floor level, and to approximately the northern half of the building at first and second floor levels. All of these works are indicated as being Phase 2 works.

- 8.45 There are no objections to the phasing proposed, subject to the integrity of the building being maintained.

8.46 Issues Raised By Objectors

- 8.47 Members will note from the representations section of this report that the conversion of the building to a hotel by the applicant remains an emotive subject for a particular group and for individuals, and that there are a number of representations expressing particular opinions and concerns as to how the building was procured, how the development should be managed; what the development should consist of; of the prioritisation of works; timescale of execution; and fluidity of intentions for the building.

- 8.48 It is quite understandable, that those with an interest in the building, will be keen to understand what is proposed and what the short and long term plans of the owner are for the building; However such matters are ultimately at the discretion of the building owners; and Members are advised that the applicant's programme of works, speed of execution, or order of priority are not generally matters which fall to be considered under a Listed Building Consent application.

- 8.49 The planning Officer would also remind Members that there are other mechanisms available within the Planning Acts which allow the Local Planning Authority to intervene if the Local Planning Authority consider that actions or inactions of the building owner are putting the building at risk, but that currently there is no intention to use these, as the applicant is evidently making best efforts to address the problems inherent in the building.

- 8.50 Members are therefore advised that Committee's role here is to consider only the acceptability, or otherwise, of the works proposed.

- 8.51 From those issues raised by objectors, the following are considered material to the determination of this application and are considered here.

8.52 *Reservation in respect of Window Glazing*

Window repair/refurbishment/replacement is considered in detail and controlled under Listed Building Consent 16/02037. Matters of secondary glazing provision are controlled under this application as part of any new works proposals. The applicant has indicated that they will make best efforts to refurbish all existing window stock, but that there are instances where windows are rotten and missing, and it will be intended to replace them with replica frames where this is the case.

It has also been confirmed that it will not be necessary to replace any original glazing where secondary glazing is proposed as there will be significantly less risk of breakages where secondary glazing is in place. Alternatives to replacement glazing, such as applied safety film are also being considered where warranted.

Each window will be considered on its merit in respect of age, approximate age of glass, frame condition, etc.

Secondary glazing design will also be considered on a window by window basis dependant on the design of the window frame; architrave and window reveal design and materials.

8.53 *Relocation of the War Memorial*

There are no proposals to move the war memorial under the proposals in this application. However there would seem no particular requirement to keep the war memorial in its current location if a suitable alternative location were to be proposed, and the merit or otherwise of any such proposals would be considered as a building alteration.

8.54 *Non DDA compliance*

Access provision for those who are mobility impaired is often a challenge in historic buildings, especially those where the concept of design sought to express the grandeur or importance of a building via the provision of an elevated principal floor level served off stepped entrances.

The proposals submitted indicate the provision of Lifts within the building, and concept designs for the building frontage have suggested a platform lift, or utilisation of the existing ramp for those with access needs, these are being considered.

As a business providing a service, the hotel will need to make reasonable efforts to provide services on an equal basis to all users of the facility, and the interpretation of what is reasonable, will need to include for an assessment of what impact any changes to the building will have on its architectural interest. What is clear however that is whatever the final arrangement, that these issues are being considered by the applicant, and any alterations will be covered by

the process of LBC control. A condition is therefore recommended to allow for the consideration of any proposals.

8.55 *No Conservation Plan*

Firstly it must be acknowledged that a Conservation Management Plan is not a statutory component of a Listed Building Consent Application Submission. The determination of this application is not reliant on the submission of such a document.

This said, the applicant accepts the value of such a plan as a very useful document for capturing and understanding the value of the building as a historic asset, of quantifying it's special interest, and of the constituent physical parts of the building, or historical events, or changes, that make up that interest; and thereafter describing how those things will be protected, and preserved, and managed in the future.

The applicant has started such a plan, and has been in dialogue with the Local Planning Authority as to the most appropriate content of the plan, of its nature, direction and usefulness as a meaningful guiding document to describe proposals and intentions for the immediate, mid and long term management of the conservation of the building.

It is unfortunate therefore that a plan has yet to be made for the building, however it is evident that the developer is committed to the preservation of the building, and the absence of such a document should not distract members of committee or the public from the very positive works that are being undertaken on site, and which are applied for here.

8.56 *Proposed sharing of space between the Heritage zone and Bute Town History and Art society.*

The management of floorspace within the building is again a matter for the applicant/hotel operator to decide. However it is clear that as well as providing a heritage zone, for use as an archive depository for the Butetown History and Arts Society, that the applicant envisages the unique offer of the hotel to be based around the history of Coal, of its export through Cardiff Docks and the role the Coal Exchange played in its sale. Memorabilia, physical objects and references to the same will be displayed throughout the hotel, which will in itself be a vehicle for promoting the history and architecture of the area.

8.57 *Lack of appointment of professional conservation architects /surveyors/advisers*

The submitted Design and Access Statement suggests that the statement is to be read in conjunction with the previous design and access statement prepared by Purcell, recognised conservation professionals, and the applicant advises that they have also appointed a number of other professional advisors, the most recent being Burroughs Engineers who have advised on the restoration of

the SE Tower and who are to make recommendations in respect of the NW corner of the building.

Ultimately there is no scheme of accreditation for conservation advisors in Wales, nor any requirement for applicants to use them to advise or submit schemes for planning permission or Listed Building Consent. Planning Authorities and Members of Committees must therefore make decisions on the basis of information provided, which in this case the planning officer considers sufficient to understand the proposals to the level of detail necessary to make a recommendation to Planning Committee.

The submitted drawings indicate typical solutions proposed to be employed to particular areas of the building, and will allow finite details of the conversion to be agreed with the Local Authority Conservation Officer with Reference to Cadw.

This is considered appropriate on such a large scale project.

- 8.58 - *Lack of historic reference and understanding of surrounding spaces*
- *No Safeguarding of heritage features within the building*
- *The building will not be publicly accessible*

Not concurred with. The applicant appears very aware of the context of the development, of what is valuable in terms of heritage features, and their future incorporation into the project, and as a hotel with a heritage zone, bar / restaurant and function space, the facility will be accessible to the public.

10. CONCLUSION

- 10.1 The proposals have been considered in the light of extant advice and best practice, but also considered against the extremely poor condition of the building; and the enormity of the scope of works necessary to restore the building to a standard where it shows both special regard for elements of architectural and historic interest whilst providing for a viable building fit for purpose for the proposed hotel use.
- 10.2 It is accepted that the conversion does not accord with conservation advice in some areas, most notably the overcladding of wall surfaces in former offices; However, neither do the works damage or harm the fabric of the building, and given the merit of the fabric affected, are considered to be acceptable.
- 10.3 It is also considered that the works proposed do broadly accord with building conservation advice and guidance in respect of causing no harm to the existing building; in being able to be undertaken with minimum intervention or change to the existing fabric; in being sympathetic; and ultimately reversible with no undue harm to the existing structure.
- 10.4 Overall the works proposed are concluded to be beneficial to the building, and the Planning Officer remains of the opinion that the conversion of the building to

a hotel, continues to be the best chance that the building has of being saved for future generations.

- 10.5 On this basis, subject to the consideration of detailed matters, which can be appropriately controlled by means of condition, it is recommended that Listed Building Consent be GRANTED.

.

Revision

Rev	Date	Description
A	16.06.16	Car Park area identified
B	09.08.16	Show rooms identified
C	17.11.16	Full planning application



SITE LOCATION PLAN
1:1250

APPLICATION SITE ———

NOTES
This drawing is copyright of Signature Living
Do not scale from this drawing
Use figured dimensions only
All dimensions to be checked on site

16/02939



SIGNATURE LIVING
60 Victoria Street
Liverpool
L1 6JD

Tel: 0151 236 0166
e: design@signatureliving.co.uk
www.signatureliving.co.uk

Status	PLANNING/LBC	Drawn	Checked
		-	-

**The Coal Exchange
Mount Stuart Square
Cardiff - CF10 5EB**

Title	Site Location plan- Car Park structure		
Dwg No	1506-E-(Site) 001	Revision	C
Scale	1:1250	Date	November 2016