

Ref: RDB/RP/TE/05.12.2017

7 December 2017

Mr Tim England,  
Natural Resources Wales,  
Rivers House,  
St Mellons Business Park,  
Fortran Road,  
St Mellons,  
Cardiff,  
CF3 0EY.



Dear Tim,

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 5 December 2017**

On behalf of the Committee I would like to thank you and other officers from Natural Resources Wales for attending the Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting on Tuesday 5<sup>th</sup> December to discuss the delivery and implementation of the Roath Flood Scheme. I hope that you found the opportunity to discuss the merits of the scheme in a public forum a worthwhile exercise.

It is important to note the extent of the remit of the Committee; it does not have the ability to force changes to the proposed scheme. Similarly, the Committee wished to provide all parties with the opportunity to present their views, but does not explicitly endorse either the scheme proposed by Natural Resources Wales or any alternatives presented.

As previously explained the Committee discussed the Roath Flood Scheme during the way forward section of the meeting and collectively agreed the following comments:

- The Committee note the range of consultation activities delivered by Natural Resources Wales during the development of the scheme and thank Gavin Jones for providing the Natural Resources Wales document titled 'Roath Flood Scheme – Key public consultation events,' which detailed the extent of this consultation. The document was dated 27<sup>th</sup> February 2017.

- It was explained during the item that the works to Roath Brook would actually reduce the overall dry land surface area of the parks within the scope of the scheme. Natural Resources Wales acknowledged that this was the case, however, were unable to accurately quantify the exact area that would be lost. I would be grateful if you could provide confirmation of the overall dry land surface area that will be lost as a result of this scheme at this location once it is available.
- During the meeting Dr Johansson referenced a number of potential alternatives for helping to manage flood risk issues along Roath Brook. The Committee would like assurance that these alternatives have been considered and evaluated as a part of the development of the scheme.
- The Committee note that the overall proposal involves the removal of 140 trees and that these will be replaced by 122 new trees. The process for deciding which types of trees to use has been supported by an arboreal study that has been funded by the scheme. The removed trees will be replaced with appropriate specimens; some of these will be mature and approximately four or five metres in height. The overall loss of mature trees will be 18 in total. The Committee notes that there will be an additional 200 saplings planted by Natural Resources Wales.
- It was stated during the meeting that approximately eight of the trees were removed on request from the Council, and that these trees would ordinarily have been felled as a part of a one to three year programme. Natural Resources Wales has accepted the financial cost for removing these trees.
- The Committee note that some of the consultation material used had incorrectly stated (between 13th October 2016 to 3rd March 2017) that over 400 properties were at risk of flooding in a 1:5 chance event. Natural Resources Wales acknowledged this error and have since clarified that the material should have stated that 405 properties were at risk of flooding in a 1:75 chance event. Natural Resources maintain that all consultation prior to the 13<sup>th</sup> October 2016 used the correct figures. Where a scheme

involves complex flood risk calculations, it is imperative that Natural Resources Wales is able to articulate this to the public in as accurate and accessible a way possible.

I would be grateful if you would note the comments of the Committee on the Roath Flood Scheme and provide feedback to this letter where appropriate. Should you have any questions or queries about the content of the letter or meeting don't hesitate to contact me. Once again thank you for taking part in the meeting,

Regards,

The image shows two handwritten signatures in black ink. The signature on the left is 'Ramesh Patel' and the one on the right is 'Paul Isaac'. Both are written in a cursive, flowing style.

Councillor Ramesh Patel  
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

Gavin Jones – Natural Resources Wales  
Paul Isaac – Natural Resources Wales  
Dr Melissa Johansson  
Ed Gilbert  
Sarah Jones  
Lee Fisher  
Carol White  
Sylvia Harris  
David Lee  
Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee