THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at City Hall, Cardiff on Thursday 29 January 2015 to transact the business set out in the Council Summons dated 23 January 2015.

Present: County Councillor Margaret Jones (Lord Mayor in the Chair);

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, Cowan, Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Evans, Ford, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Graham, Groves, Hinchey, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lloyd, Lomax, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Morgan, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Benjamin Thomas, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walker, Walsh, Weaver, White, Craig Williams, Darren Williams and Woodman

(Council on 26 February 2015 amended these proceedings as indicated in bold italics on Page 392))

123 : APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Councillors Manzoor Ahmed, Kirsty Davies, Elsmore, Goddard, Keith Jones, Love, Simmons and Graham Thomas

124: WEBCASTING AND RECORDING OF PROCEEDINGS

Members were reminded of a decision of the Constitution Committee on 10 July, 2008 to webcast the Council meeting. Members were also reminded that the Constitution Committee had previously agreed that Council proceedings be recorded for administrative purposes.

125 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 27 November 2014 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson subject to typographical errors on page 287 and 294.

126 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Lord Mayor reminded Members of their responsibility under Article 16 of the Members' Code of Conduct to declare any interest, and to complete Personal Interest forms, at the commencement of the item of business.

The following declarations were made:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Interest</u>
Councillor Bale	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme

Councillor Boyle	Item 9: - Oral Questions - Question 27	Personal Interest as spouse is employed at Cardiff
Councillor Boyle	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	University. Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Bridges	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Burfoot	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Chaundy	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme:
Councillor Clark	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Ralph Cook	Item 7 – Education Statement	As a School Governor appointed by the Council to Eastern High School.
Councillor Richard Cook	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Cowan	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor De'Ath	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Evans	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Ford	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Goodway	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme

Councillor Groves	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Holden	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Howells	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Hudson	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Javed	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Jones	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Kelloway	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Knight	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Magill	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Marshall	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor McKerlich	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Merry	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Michael	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme

Councillor Phillips	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Dianne Rees	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Robson	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Sanders	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Thomas	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Thomas	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Walker	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor White	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Craig Williams	Item 14: - Establishment of a Local Pension Board	Personal interest in the Local Government Pension Scheme
Councillor Woodman	Item 8 - Annual Council Reporting Framework – Report of the Director of Social Services	Personal Interest as Honorary Member of organisation that provides Direct Payments

The Lord Mayor advised the meeting that the Corporate Director Resources and the County Clerk & Monitoring Officer had indicated that they wished to declare an interest under Article 8 of the Code of Conduct for Employees in relation to Item 9 Oral Questions 1, 2, 4, 13 and 18 and indicated that they would leave the meeting during consideration of these questions.

127 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

(i) Holocaust Memorial Day

The Lord Mayor was pleased to have participated in the Inter-faith Wales National Commemoration of Holocaust Memorial Day event at City Hall on 27 January 2015, which had been a moving occasion on the 70th anniversary of the liberation of Auschwitz, and a time of reflection and remembrance for those who lost their lives and those who survived.

(ii) Former Deputy Lord Mayor Granville Tatham

Sadly former Deputy Lord Mayor of Cardiff and City & County Councillor Granville Tatham passed away on 18 December 2014. Councillor Tatham represented the Heath Ward for the City Council and Cardiff County Council Shadow Authority up to 1996. On behalf of the Council the Lord Mayor had sent a message of condolence to his sons and their families.

(iii) Recognition and Awards

New Year's Honours Recognition

The Lord Mayor wished to congratulate two members of staff working in Cardiff schools recognised in the Queen's New Year's Honours List for services to education and communities in Cardiff.

Jennifer Ann Morgan, recently retired Senior Manager at Woodlands High School became a Member of the Most Excellent Order of the British Empire for her services to Special Education and the community in Cardiff.

The British Empire Medal has also been awarded to Theresa Condick, who is Pupil Support Manager at Glyn Derw High School, for services to education and to the community in Ely and Caerau.

It was great to see that the commitment, hard work and contribution made to the city. of Jennifer and Theresa had been recognised in this way.

<u>Home to School Passenger Transport Services – Best Public Sector Procurement Project 2014</u>

Congratulations to all those involved in a project to procure Home to School Passenger Transport Services named Best Public Sector Procurement Project 2014. The project delivered more than half a million pounds worth of savings for the Council, and building on this success a system, is now being used to secure residential and nursing packages and a service for mental health services users. This will provide increased flexibility and choice for services and make such a difference to the lives of a great many people in the city.

(iv) Welcome

The Lord Mayor welcomed Mrs James Morse to the meeting. It had been a long held ambition for her to attend a meeting of the Council, and to see democracy in action.

The Lord Mayor also extended a welcome to Lizz Roe an Independent Member of the Standards and Ethics Committee who was in attendance.

(v) Lord Mayor's Charity

The Lord Mayor expressed her thanks to everyone for all their support in raising funds for the Lord Mayor's Charity Tenovus. Over the last couple of months many generous contributions had been received. The Lord Mayor thanked the Charity Committee for all their hard work, and Councillors Cowan and Robson for all their support with the Charity Christmas cards.

The Lord Mayor was pleased to accept a generous donation of more than £4,500 from the Cyd Cymru Community Fund collective energy buying scheme for Tenovus and the Foodbank, Councillor Morgan's charity last year. Donations had also been received from Councillors Dilwar Ali and Susan White following their Charity coffee morning, and the Charity Christmas Carol Concert for Members and Staff.

The Lord Mayor was delighted to receive at the meeting a cheque from Councillor Michael for donations raised at a recent Greek-Cypriot Evening.

128 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

PUBLIC QUESTION 1

Public Question from Ms Ella Mayer

All experts agree that literacy is crucial to the development of young people's education. How can Cardiff Council propose to withdraw funding from branch libraries and specifically my local library at Rhiwbina, when libraries are such important education resources?

Reply from County Councillor Bradbury

We have no proposals to close library services but we are seeking to deliver a new model of community tailored services.

I completely agree with you that the delivery of literacy is crucial to the development of young people's education.

We do have to deliver a balanced budget for the Council and we have recently concluded the public consultation on these draft budget proposals and all the comments will be used to inform any final decision.

Supplementary Question from Ms Ella Mayer

How will the proposals for the stand alone Library services support the importance of literacy and access to books if branch libraries funding are being cut?

Reply from County Councillor Bradbury

Well, as I stated in my previous answer, it was a budget consultation. We've gone to consultation, we've taken on board the responses, and we're working on the responses.

It's important to note that we're working with other agencies as well. We are in a financially difficult position as a Council, but we are absolutely committed to trying to keep these important branch libraries open but, at the same time, we need to work with agencies to allow that to happen, given the challenges of £124m worth of cuts over four years.

I am happy to meet with you or any other Rhiwbina residents to discuss this further, and I've met with your Ward Councillors.

I absolutely agree with you that literacy is massively important and we need to do everything we can to keep these services going.

PUBLIC QUESTION 2

Public Question from Ms Sophie Gwilt

The famous philanthropist Andrew Carnegie said 'A library outranks any other one thing a community can do to benefit its people. It is a never failing spring in the desert'. How does the Council believe that the proposed re-organisation of library services in Cardiff will support this?

Reply from County Councillor Bradbury

As I stated in my previous answer we have no proposals to close library services but we are seeking to deliver a new model of community tailored services. The response to the public consultation has demonstrated how highly valued libraries are in Cardiff.

Through building on community relationships, I am hopeful that opportunities exist to work collaboratively in order to build a sustainable library service. This will give communities greater involvement and control over how their local library and community buildings are run.

Supplementary Question from Ms Sophie Gwilt

Libraries are important for accessing of books for free as well as the internet. How will the Cabinet Member explain to residents that they can no longer access free books from their local library?

Reply from County Councillor Bradbury

As part of the proposal – the original library strategy – the book fund has been protected so books will be available for free and will be delivered locally across your neighbourhood area. A service will still be available to you as a neighbourhood and a community.

On your wider point, yes, I agree that libraries are important but for your generation and future generations we need to find sustainable ways forward, given the cuts that have been passed down by central government.

PUBLIC QUESTION 3

Public Question from Ms Madhu Khanna-Davies

In light of the public opposition to the proposal to withdraw funding from Rhydypennau Library put forward in the Changes for Cardiff consultation document, I ask the Council what measures will they put in place to ensure that a publicly funded library remains at this site?

Reply from County Councillor Bradbury

We have no proposals to close library services but we are seeking to deliver a new model of community tailored services.

These are very difficult decisions and, from very early on, we have recognised the need to give community and commercial partners both more time and more support in order to ensure that popular libraries in Cardiff do not close.

The Council's budget for 2015/16 will be set in February and, if the library proposals are accepted, we will ensure that implementation is phased in order to ensure that any new community or commercial provision has the maximum chance of success.

Supplementary Question from Ms Madhu Khanna-Davies

What will the Council offer to safeguard Rhydypennau Library, should no commercial or community partner come forward under their new model of community-tailored services, given that they don't want to see the closure of any community libraries?

Reply from County Councillor Bradbury

Well, firstly, I would be looking to avoid that situation completely. I cannot stand here at the moment and tell you that at the moment because we are working on trying to find a solution.

As we discussed, I think the friends group that you are setting up is a very commendable and very worthwhile voice for that community. I am very happy to meet with you and work with you to try and find new and creative ways to save Rhydypennau Library and make sure it has a sustainable future in the long term.

PUBLIC QUESTION 4

Public Question from Mr Joel Williams

Will you agree with me, that the senior leadership hierarchy of the Council, many of whom earn in access of £120,000 per year should have performance related pay and your administration should refuse to pay "gagging orders" to former and departing employees, which in recent years has cost the tax payer of Cardiff millions of pounds? If not, why not?

Reply from County Councillor Hinchey

- 1. First of all, it is simply not the case that many of the Council's senor leadership earn in access of £120,000 per year. As outlined in the Council's agreement [Annual Pay Policy Statement 2014/15] this year (which excludes Schools), there are only two posts in the senior leadership team within the Council which attract a salary of in excess of £120k the Chief Executive and Corporate Director are those two posts.
- 2. Secondly, the Council as highlighted in that Pay Policy, which is published on the Council's website has spot-point salaries.
- 3. Finally, Cabinet took the decision on 26th January, last week, to cease use of the settlement agreements, which are referred to as "gagging orders", other than in exceptional circumstances.

Supplementary Question from Joel Davies

Would you agree with me that *fat-cat* Officers and Cabinet Members who cannot carry out their roles and responsibilities without the help of external agencies, costing the Cardiffian taxpayer millions of pounds a year, should stand aside?

And, finally, would you agree that your administration has been swinging the lead to the citizens of Cardiff in relation to this senior leadership shambles, with many officers earning well over £100,000, which does not include pension contributions?

Reply from County Councillor Hinchey

Absolutely.

Well, firstly, you wouldn't be surprised that I absolutely do not agree with you and, as Councillor Bradbury said earlier on, the Council – all Councils across Wales as did in England a couple of years ago – are facing massive budget cuts.

£124m – I'm sure you've seen the video – £124m over the next three years against Cardiff. So, we have a massive gap to find against the population growing.

Public services in Wales are under starvation. There is absolutely no question about that. Well, let's hope that after May the 7th, being as you've politicised it, maybe – just maybe – that we have a government that supports public services and keeping people in public jobs.

PUBLIC QUESTION 5

Public Question from Ms Gwenda Owen

Cardiff Cycle City launched a manifesto on 29 January 2015 which over 700 people have fed into. It is supported by cycling groups and individuals across Cardiff. Evidence shows that the return on investment in cycling terms of health and economics is significant and the Manifesto identifies key actions that could help achieve this ambition. Does the Cabinet agree that our capital city should lead the way in encouraging and enabling people to cycle?

Reply from County Councillor Patel

I welcome this question because improving conditions for cycling in Cardiff is an important part of our transport strategy. I agree that Cardiff, as the Capital City of Wales, should be playing a leading role in the delivery of the new Active Travel duty here in Wales.

Work is continuing to implement cycling improvements through the Strategic Cycling Network Plan, which has already delivered schemes including Cathays Terrace, Cardiff Bridge and Cowbridge Road East, with improvements to Penarth Road and Colum Road planned for delivery by the end of the financial year.

We will continue to deliver schemes in the Strategic Cycle Network Plan making the best use of available resources and funding.

We are also working with six major UK cities in collaboration with Sustrans to develop a Bicycle Account for Cardiff, taking inspiration from the Copenhagen model, in order to track Cardiff's progress towards becoming a cycle-friendly city.

Supplementary Question from Ms Gwenda Owen

As you may know, today we launched Cardiff Cycle City Manifesto. This has been done by us working together. Cyclists are notorious for not agreeing, but we've come together because we think that Cardiff could be a great city for cycling.

Would you accept an invitation to meet with us but also bring along the executives from across departments? Because we've done it by stopping silo working – we think that, to make Cardiff work and to save the city money, we need to work with transport, with health, with everyone who has a stake. Cycling pays – we can provide evidence that investment in cycling will save this council money. So we'd invite you to meet with us to look at cycling outside just the little department and look at where it fits in for the city as a whole. So we extend that invitation to you.

Reply from County Councillor Patel

I certainly would welcome that and I certainly would be happy to attend, so thank you very much.

129 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were submitted:

- 1 <u>Councillor Boyle</u> 1171 signatures against the closure of the Howardian Music Studio.
- 2 <u>Councillor Ahmed</u> over 100 Signatures against the loss of funding for concierge at Loudoun & Nelson House Flats
- 3 Councillor Clark 127 signatures against the closure of Cathays Library.
- 4 <u>Councillor Groves</u> over 400 signatures against the closure of Whitchurch Youth Centre
- 5 <u>Councillor Evans</u> 51 signatures raising concerns about the staff restructure at Tongwynlais Primary School.
- 6 <u>Councillor Hunt</u> over 750 signatures against the withdrawal of school transport funding.
- 7 <u>Councillor Cowan</u> –552 signatures against the closure of Rhiwbina and Whitchurch Libraries
- 8 <u>Councillor Robson</u> 1845 signatures against the closure of Rhiwbina Library.

- 9 <u>Councillor Robson</u> a second petition of 1443 signatures against the closure of Rhiwbina Library.
- 10 <u>Councillor Sanders</u> 93 signatures children from Llanishen Fach Primary School against the closure of Rhiwbina Library.
- 11 <u>Councillor Howells</u> additional 18 signatures to add to a previous petition against the closure of Roath Library
- 12 <u>Councillor Lloyd</u> additional 469 signatures to add to a previous petition against the closure of Rhydypenau Library.
- 13 <u>Councillor Garry Hunt</u> 1510 signatures against the closure of Canton Community Hall

130 : LEADERS STATEMENT

(The Lord Mayor advised that 30 minutes was allocated for questions on the Leader and Cabinet Member statements)

Corporate Plan

The Council's draft Corporate Plan was circulated to all Scrutiny Committees for their consideration in early February alongside the draft budget proposals for 2015/16. In developing the Plan the Cabinet has sought to be as open as possible. The Leader had attended the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee meeting in December to outline the Plan's structure and how it would address the points raised by the Committee in recent years and by the Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment. The draft Corporate Plan was considered by the Challenge Forum in early January and received positive feedback, particularly in relation to its tight focus on a limited number of priorities and the balance struck between being ambitious for Cardiff and tackling the stark financial realities facing public services. Last week, all Members were also invited to a workshop with the Cabinet and the Council's Senior Management team to hear about, and give views on the development of the Plan.

The Corporate Plan will be presented to Cabinet and Council for formal consideration in March. This marks a departure from previous years when it was considered alongside the budget at Council in February. This change reflects the Cabinet's intention to afford a greater opportunity for Members to engage with the Plan, and not to have it overshadowed by sharing a Cabinet and Council agenda with the budget.

A short, public facing version of the Corporate Plan will also be published at this time.

Artes Mundi

The Leader had attended the Artes Mundi_6 Awards Ceremony at the National Museum of Wales in Cathays Park. Artes Mundi has established itself as one of the UK's biggest and most exciting contemporary visual art awards and this year attracted very positive media coverage for Cardiff, being covered by the New York Times, The Independent and the BBC.

Building high quality, affordable homes in Cardiff

Development Company, Bellerophon and Registered Social Landlords, RCT Homes, held a 'ground-breaking' event on the 14 January to mark the start of the construction of 152 new affordable homes on brownfield land in the Cardiff Bay Sports Village. It is an important development, not least because of the new finance model developed and applied in Wales by Bellerophon and partners Porthcwlis (a subsidiary of RCT Homes). The new finance model is designed to lessen the requirement for public subsidy, hopefully allowing Wales to deliver much needed high quality affordable homes. The project has been backed by one of the UK's biggest investment firms, M&G, who have invested £19m in order to deliver over 100 affordable and social rent properties across three sites without the need for grant funding.

Cardiff is projected to be the fastest growing UK core city over the next 15 years, which means that the city and wider region must provide sufficient affordable housing in well designed, connected and sustainable communities. To deliver our vision of being a liveable city, new homes in Cardiff must be surrounded by great public spaces, must be served by great public transport and not viewed as "new homes", but one new community.

SPIDER: Public Service Innovation and Eurocities

The Leader advised that he had attended the SPIDER Project Conference held in Cardiff on 29 January 2015 on Service Design for Public Services. Through the SPIDER (Supporting Public Service Innovation using Design in European Regions) project, the Council is working in partnership with Cardiff Metropolitan University and partner cities and universities in France, Belgium and Ireland to develop new ways of delivering services through designing them around the needs of the users. The project has focussed on two areas: services which tackle youth unemployment and those extending independent living for older people, specifically those suffering from dementia. Cardiff's involvement in the project is wholly funded by the European Commission and the Welsh Government.

To coincide with the SPIDER Conference, the Eurocities working group on smart social inclusion also met in Cardiff. The meeting was chaired by The Hague and attended by Eurocities members from Milan, Riga, Talinn, Nantes, Brno and Cardiff - all coming together to discuss, share knowledge and exchange ideas around public service innovations.

A number of matters were raised on the Leader's statement in relation to affordable housing; infrastructure and the Corporate Plan. Members were also keen to have an update on any discussions with the Minister on the proposed merger of Local Authorities in Wales.

Members questioned the value of some of the networks the Council was singed up to and the need to control costs of membership, affiliations and weigh these against the value and benefits.

131: STATEMENT OF CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & SKILLS

(Councillor Ralph Cook declared an interest under the Member Code of Conduct as a Local authority appointed School Governor at Eastern High School. Councillor Cook remained at the meeting for consideration of this item).

School Standards

A report on the annual performance of Cardiff schools had been considered by Scrutiny and Cabinet earlier in January. Since the 2014 monitoring visit by Estyn, the Cabinet Member had been appointed as Chair of the Advisory Committee of the Central South Consortium Joint Education Service and Cardiff's Chief Executive had taken on the role of lead Chief Executive. Cardiff now has a central role within the Consortium and is working in partnership towards significant re-focusing of the work of the Consortium with Cardiff schools, alongside the development of a peer-to-peer, schools-led improvement strategy, known as the *Central South Wales Challenge*.

In Cardiff, the Local Authority *Education Development Plan* and the *Estyn Action Plan* priorities addressed the six recommendations made by Estyn in February 2014. The focus is on improving standards, provision and leadership in schools.

The results for the 2013-14 academic year in Cardiff indicated that the priority actions in these plans, taken together with the refocusing of the work of the Consortium and the development of school-to-school improvement practices, have begun to have a positive impact.

Notable features of improved outcomes were:

- a significant rise of 3.9% on the Level 2+ measures at age 16;
- improvement in the percentage of pupils making two levels of progress in the first three years of secondary school;
- a reduction in the number of secondary schools where less than 40% achieve Level 2+ from 11 in 2013 to 6 in 2014;
- attendance at both primary and secondary school has improved from a very low base 5 years ago - Cardiff is now ranked 7 and 10 respectively out of the 22 Wales local authorities, compared to 17 and 18 three years ago;

- a welcome reduction in the attainment gap between pupils eligible for free schools meals and those not eligible; and
- improvement in attainment for all minority ethnic learners at Key Stage 2, and at Level 2, narrowing the gap with White UK pupils.

However, more remains to be done including:

- the extent of the variation in outcomes between schools with similar contextual factors indicates that the good practice in some schools is not being extended to all:
- at age 16, the wider attainment measures of Level 2 and the Core Subject Indicator are not improving fast enough;
- Mathematics remains the weakest of the core subjects in secondary schools;
 and
- Whilst Estyn has judged some schools in the city to be excellent, some have been judged in monitoring visits or inspection by Estyn to be making insufficient improvement.

Priorities for further improvement in view of these results are:

- further strengthening of the tracking of pupil progress and targeted follow up for those who are underachieving;
- supporting improvement in the teaching of literacy and numeracy, and especially in mathematics in secondary schools;
- sharpening the focus and improving consistency of challenge and support to schools, through the work of Consortium challenge advisers and through the use of local authority powers where this is warranted;
- increasing steps to improve governance in schools;
- building on the peer-to-peer improvement strategies to extend and disseminate the most effective practice in schools in the Central South region so that it becomes the standard for all schools; and
- identifying, supporting and developing school leaders at all levels in schools.

School Organisation Developments

In November 2011, the Council submitted a 21st Century Schools Programme bid to Welsh Government. The level of Capital investment contained within that Programme - predicated upon 50% Welsh Government funding, 50% Authority funding- known as "Band A", was £137m and this was approved in principle in December 2011. "Band A" is in place until March 2019, on the 1st April 2019 "Band B" will commence.

Since 2011, nine school projects have been successfully completed under "Band A" and some £25.5m of grant funding has been utilised.

Ysgol Gymraeg Treganna - new 3FE Welsh Medium Primary

- Pencaerau Nursery English medium consolidation & new nursery unit.
- Trelai Primary increased nursery places.
- Whitchurch Primary consolidation of 2.5FE English Medium Primary
- Ysgol Melin Gruffydd

 consolidation of 2FE Welsh Medium Primary
- Ysgol Gymraeg Y Wern (phase 1) remodelling to 2FE
- Coed Glas Primary (phase 1) remodelling to 2FE & nursery unit.
- Llysfaen Primary consolidation at 2FE & nursery unit.
- Thornhill Primary consolidation at 2FE & nursery unit.

There are currently nine further projects for which investment has been committed within "Band A":-

- Millbank Primary consolidation at 1FE & new nursery unit
- Hywel Dda Primary consolidation of 2FE English Medium Primary
- Adamsdown Primary remodelling to 2FE & nursery unit.
- Mount Stuart Primary remodelling to 2FE & nursery unit.
- Pontprennau Primary New 2FE Primary School with Community Centre
- Coed Glas Primary (phase 2) consolidation of 2.5FE
- Ysgol Gymraeg Y Wern (phase 2) consolidation of 2.5FE
- Eastern High New 8FE High School and partnership with Cardiff and Vale College
- Fitzalan High New Science Block

Total Investment in projects committed: - approx £70m (subject to tenders).

The Programme is in the process of being realigned to take account of changes since 2011. The realigned programme will address the current administration's priorities to raise attainment as well as ensuring sufficiency of places in the most cost effective way possible. It will also address the unacceptable sharp differences in educational attainment in different parts of the city.. Cardiff has also experienced notable population growth in recent years which leads to challenges with the sufficiency and supply of school places. Wherever possible are also seeking to maximise the wider use by communities of school facilities.

Future housing development within the Local Development Plan will require significant additional expansion of schools provision in the future up to 2026.

Eastern High

Eastern High was inspected by Estyn between 1st and 5th December 2014. An Acting Headteacher, Mr Armando Di Finizio, has been appointed and is working with the Governing Body to draw up the school's improvement plan in response to Estyn's recommendations. These will be set out in the inspection report which is expected to be published on 6 February, 2015. The Council is continuing to work closely with the school to support its improvement under their new leadership.

Members raised a number of matters relating to Education attainment, performance and improvement; concerns in relation to the Estyn Inspection report due to be published for Eastern High School and the importance of Members being kept up to date with developments. It was accepted that lessons should be learnt, but that there was a need at this time for Eastern High School to have the opportunity and space to deal with the challenges; the importance of the Council and Governing body working together to strengthen governance and provide the necessary support for the school its pupils, teachers and parents. The School Improvement Plan needed to be embedded and other measure taken to ensure staff and teachers have the right support and training going forward.

(The Lord Mayor advised that the time limit on questions on the Leader and Cabinet Members Statement had been reached)

The following statements were noted

132 : STATEMENT OF CABINET MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT

Volunteering

The Cabinet Member was pleased to report that at the close of Quarter 3, the parks service has recorded in excess of 17,000 volunteer hours through the partnerships and networks in place with constituted Friends Groups, volunteers and third sector stakeholder organisations that include Vision 21, the Cardiff Rivers Group, Keep Wales Tidy and the Wales Community Rehabilitation Company, formerly the Wales Probation Trust. The opportunities provided by the Council meet a variety of needs for participants and also serve to add value and capacity to services delivered by the Council.

Green Flag Status of our Parks

A number of the Council's Green Flag parks were subject to assessment prior to Christmas and through a mystery shopper approach. This assessment which falls outside of the more formal assessment process ensures that local authorities are maintaining standards throughout the entire year and not just at the time of formal assessment.

The outcome of the mystery shopper assessment was positive with the Council retaining status for the parks assessed.

Organic Waste

At the meeting of Full Council on 23 October 2014, a report was presented concerning the appointment of a Preferred Bidder for the Organic Waste Treatment Project – a 15 year partnership between the City of Cardiff Council and the Vale of Glamorgan Council for the treatment of Organic Waste.

The Final Business Case which was appended to the October report was submitted to Welsh Government, and the Welsh Government have awarded a Revenue grant of £282,380 per annum to support the food waste element of the contract. This is the total grant supporting both partner Authorities. The grant award remains subject to Terms & Conditions, as well as the successful completion of the Fine-Tuning stage of the procurement.

The submission and approval of the Final Business Case was also the final milestone in relation to the Food Waste Treatment Procurement grant from Welsh Government. The City of Cardiff Council therefore received the final instalment of £250,000 on 16 January 2015.

Waste Consultation

The consultation on the Outline Waste Strategy concluded on the 12 January 2015 and over 1400 people took part in this important survey. We are now looking carefully at the responses as we shape the future of our recycling and waste service. It is vitally important we raise our recycling rates and we are working with Welsh Government to ensure our new strategy achieves the challenging new recycling targets and brings about a more efficient and better value for money service for our residents. Gauging the public view as we take this crucial strategy forward is hugely important to us and we await the consultation results.

Really Rubbish Campaign

Central to the Cabinet Member's philosophy on the future of recycling is the education of our children and young people and the Really Rubbish education campaign is now 10 years old, and the Cabinet Member was pleased to have attended a number of their events in schools and which is totally inspirational. He recently visited Greenway Primary School to see The Gregory Brothers perform their recycling education show and the reaction of the children was inspirational. The children could teach us a thing or two about our attitude to the environment and the Cabinet Member has been invited to attend 10 year celebrations at some of the first schools involved in the campaign.

Chinese Lanterns Ban

As of the 1 January 2015 the Council has banned the release of Chinese sky lanterns and large bunches of balloons into the sky from Council buildings and venues, due to growing evidence of environmental damage and danger to wildlife. While we accept the popularity of mass balloon releases for charity and Chinese sky lanterns as it can be a striking sight, people have to realise that what goes up must come down. We are increasingly concerned that livestock and wildlife are swallowing or becoming entangled in a lantern's wire or bamboo frame.

We hope many more Councils and organisations will follow our lead on this and use their powers to stop this messy and hazardous practice.

133 : STATEMENT OF CABINET MEMBER FOR CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE

<u>Contact & Assessment Team – Implementation of the service and team into Connect to Cardiff</u>

The Cabinet Member advised that he had recently visited the Connect2Cardiff, which includes the Council's Contact & Assessment Service, whose integration into C2C had recently been completed, having begun in May 2014.

Over the last 6 months the performance of the team has significantly improved and a more streamlined service delivered, with no break or interruption of service as the service became part of C2C. This success can be attributed in part to the amount of time spent engaging with the team, scoping out the processes and understanding the service prior to the move. Close working between staff in C2C and social care to deliver the service and to meet the needs of often vulnerable people has been a great example of the One Council approach.

Challenge Forum

The Challenge Forum in January discussed the Draft Corporate Plan for 2015-17 that is being considered by Scrutiny in the coming weeks. This year's Plan has a tighter focus on the Council's priorities, reflecting the practice in Core Cities, and responding to previous Wales Audit Office criticism of previous plans. The Forum endorsed this approach, and welcomed the clarity of the document and the clear lines of accountability that it contained. The Forum also welcomed the distinction drawn between work with partners to secure city wide outcomes, and the delivery of key outcomes for which the Council is singularly accountable.

The Challenge Forum also received feedback on improvements to the Council's Performance Management arrangements, and on the accelerated improvement work in both Children's Services and Education. Across all of these important areas of work progress was noted, but it was equally recognised that there remains much to be done to secure the level of performance to which we aspire.

When the Forum next meets it will consider the Council's progress against the whole range of issues raised in the Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment, and use this to determine its future work programme. I will be reporting to Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee's March meeting on the work of the Forum alongside the Quarter 3 Performance report.

134 : STATEMENT OF CABINET MEMBER FOR EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN & FAMILES

The Cabinet Member advised that as part of her commitment to keeping Council in touch with key developments in Children's Social Services she wished to draw attention to the following four areas of focus:-

- 1. Child Sexual Exploitation as indicated, in the last statement to Council this issue remains a key priority for the Cabinet Member and she was encouraged that further dialogue continues at senior level with the Police, both in Cardiff and on a South Wales wide basis, involving the Director of Children's Services and the Chief Executive. A recent initial review of partners' readiness to meet the challenges, indicates that we have reason to be confident that all known individual cases are robustly followed up, leading to serious consequences for offenders. An initial local plan is now being jointly prepared by a lead senior police officer and senior council officers to project manage the key steps that we need to take in order to improve our strategic attack on this very serious issue.
- 2. Disabled Children Members will know that the needs of disabled children are a matter of long-standing concern for the Cabinet Member and she was pleased to advise that joint agreement had been reached with education, health and social services partners to joint fund a Change Manager post in order to redesign services for disabled children based on a national best practice model for 0- 25 year olds. The post would be advertised shortly and it was hoped that a new service would be operational during early 2016/17. This is a very exciting agenda and will be welcomed by Members who had close involvement in the 2013 Scrutiny Enquiry.
- 3. Improved Performance overall performance is steadily improving in Children's Services as a result of greater stability, a significantly improved recruitment position and a clearer and stronger focus on good practice. Sickness absence has declined, better use is being made of the Performance and Development Review Process and we are attracting growing interest to work in Cardiff from social workers in other councils.
- 4. Education of Looked After Children the Cabinet Member and the Cabinet Member for Education and Lifelong Learning and Julia Magill welcomed the significantly strengthened joint commitment of Children's Services and Education Directorate to improving the life chances of Looked After Children as reflected in a joint plan focusing on this and other key areas of interest in common, including safeguarding.

135 : ANNUAL COUNCIL REPORTING FRAMEWORK – REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR OF SOCIAL SERVICES 2013-14

The Council received the fifth Annual Report of the Director of Social Services (Appendix 1) in accordance with 'Statutory Guidance on the Role and Accountabilities of the Director of Social Services' issued under Section 7 of the Local Authority Social Services Act 1970.

The Lord Mayor invited the Cabinet Member for Early Years, Children and Families, Councillor Lent to propose the report. This was seconded by Councillor De'Ath.

The Cabinet Member introduced the report which was a reflection of outcomes for 2013-2014. The systems and processes established to inform the report had been refined and developed to take account of learning from previous years. The report was an in-depth analysis of the effectiveness of social care services which had involved the engagement of all service managers and staff in a structured challenge process.

The report had been submitted to the Care & Social Services Inspectorate, Wales (CSSIW) for review and analysis. This analysis formed the basis of the development of an individual Inspection and Review Plan for the Council, in addition to any other themed reviews or inspections included in the inspectorate's annual programme. The priorities for action identified in the Annual Report were reflected in the 2014-15 Business Plans for Health & Social Care and Children's Services Directorates.

The Cabinet Member welcomed the positive feedback from CSSIW on the overall improvement in securing the conditions for better performance. The key messages from that analysis include comments on the significantly stronger strategic approach and leadership and a positive management culture; the strong corporate support for Social Services and vision in Children's Services. It recognised the established partnership arrangements to deliver Health and Social Services Integration; the proactive re-ablement service and improved client engagement. It recognised the work undertaken on the 'More than Just Words' framework for services to citizens in the Welsh language.

There had been good inspection results for Adoption and Fostering Services Children's Home inspections; effective responses to previously identified improvement areas and improved educational attainment for Looked After Children.

There were a number of areas recommended for improvement which would require increased partnership working and a strategic approach including reducing delayed transfers; improving Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services and reviewing the commissioning for mental health. It was recognised that there were improvements to be made in the quality of assessments and the effectiveness in relation to Personal Education Plans for Looked After Children

The Cabinet Member indicated that there was a clear need to improve the opportunity for citizens who use or are eligible for social services; and a need for a level of challenge on performance and services; and for lessons to be learnt.

The draft Director's Report had been considered by a joint meeting of the Children & Young People and Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committees and there feedback had been taken on board prior to submission to the CSSIW. The Cabinet Member indicated that although significant improvements had been made to the process of preparing the Annual Report, it was clear that the report would have benefited from earlier consideration by Scrutiny and Cabinet. The plan for the 2014-15 process therefore was bring the process forward for consideration before the summer recess.

The Lord Mayor invited debate and Members raised a number of matters relating to performance and repeated missed targets; significant year on year savings targets; increasing demands; effect on in- year budget. Members noted the improvements in recruitment and retention; but raised matters relating to caseloads; statutory assessments and care plans and their quality; and significant concerns about identification of cases of exploitation. Observations were made about Senior Management Review and the number of changes and whether combining the roles of Director of Health and Social Care with responsibilities for Adult Services and the Director of Children's Services was prudent at this time. Members recognised that there were practices and areas of work that crossed both disciplines; and that there was a need for greater collaboration with partners; a need for training including in addition to Welsh Language training, other awareness training

The Cabinet Member responded to the matters raised and advised that in 2014/15 significant improvement had been made in performance and outcomes some of which had been noted in the Quarterly Performance reports to Cabinet and Scrutiny. Members were aware of the significant budgetary challenges in-year and future years. The importance for the Council was to meet its statutory responsibilities to the most vulnerable and those in need of support in the city.

RESOLVED – That the Annual Report of the Director of Social Services for 2013-14 be approved.

136 : ORAL QUESTIONS

(Councillor Boyle declared a personal interest under the Member Code of Conduct in Oral Question 27 as his wife is employed with Cardiff University. Councillor Boyle remained at the meeting for consideration of the question).

(The Corporate Director Resources and the County Clerk & Monitoring Officer under the Code of Conduct for Employees declared an interest in Oral Questions 1, 2, 4, 13 & 18 and left the meeting during consideration of each of these questions).

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY (CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CLARK

In October 2012 the Labour Cabinet agreed to create a new tranche of Senior Managers. Just over 2 years later, in January 2015 the Labour Cabinet has agreed a further major restructure of their senior management team. What will the total cost of both these restructures be for each of the following items:

- Vacancy advertising and external recruitment consultancy support;
- Salary protection arrangements;
- Redundancy/severance packages;

- Legal advice;
- Officer time including HR support;
- Induction and training costs;
- Office/IT support?

Reply

I understand that you asked a similar question about the costs of the 2012 Senior Management restructure at Council in September 2013. From the response provided to you at that time, I can confirm that the updated associated one-off costs, including advertisements, executive recruitment support, assessment centres, external legal/HR advice, redundancy/severance settlements and office/IT support time were around £679,000.

We do not hold specific costs of induction and training. The Council does not have any salary protection arrangements.

For the avoidance of doubt, the Cabinet has not yet agreed a restructure of the Council's senior management team. At our meeting on Monday this week, proposals were put forward for consultation as part of the 15/16 budget proposals. The outcome of the consultation will be considered by Cabinet and Council in February. Therefore, at this stage, it is neither possible nor appropriate to put any costs around the partial restructuring, although it is reasonable to deduce that costs will be less than those accrued in 2013.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Clark

One thing I do need to say with regard to my previous question is that I didn't get a break down answer by those different areas, so that was something that I was seeking clarity for.

Whatever the outcome of the consultation, there is obviously a restructure on the table and I am very concerned that having such a restructure will leave to further hiatus in progress and instability for all levels of staff. Keeping in mind so much money, Officer time, and effort is bound to be wasted on just facilitating alone these Senior Management changes, do you agree with me that this Labour administration, in having two reorganisations so quickly, is squandering the Council Tax payments of hardworking residents in this city? In fact, money is being poured down the drain due to this scheme of musical Senior Management chairs. Do you agree?

Reply

I could say no, just no, but I'd probably like to go on from that.

What the public is saying in the Cardiff Debate is recognition, absolutely, that Local Government and Public Services in general are well staffed – we've talked about that on a few occasions and I'm sure it'll come up this afternoon.

Overall, the restructure will reduce our Senior Management costs. As we move through the years, this is not going to be our first and only year when we're looking at savings – they will go on for a number of years and both Welsh Government and Central Government understand that austerity is here for some years to come.

So, once we have done that restructure, I think people have recognised that both the WAO report is saying that we need to focus on particular areas. And we are – Education is certainly no change. I think the focus and the green shoots that I talked about early on in Children's Services are coming to light.

The other issues I think are around Core City data that we have looked at in preparing this report. Our Senior Management is certainly much wider than other cities – and I think the average is about five or six – so, we're moving I think, I worked out to be an overall 36% reduction in Senior Management, if the structure goes forward, but with a more focussed operation need at the lower levels.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Craig Williams

Just following on Councillor Clark's point and Councillor Hinchey the one you made 'Yes, *Minister*' would be very proud in the way you have not answered any of the numbers in that.

But, in terms of the amount of money spent in the initial structure, the cost of the structure to date and now this embarrassing U-turn, do you think the taxpayers of Cardiff have had value for money in the structure?

Reply

Talking about numbers, you will see in the budget report one of the lines there is reduction of Senior Management at £650,000. Obviously, we are tied within legislation that advertising under Welsh Government guidance has £100,000 has to go out. We've seen some of the other authorities in the press recently – and we talk about Pembroke and Caerphilly – where it has not gone very smoothly.

One thing that is absolutely clear, in terms of voluntary severance, Cardiff has reduced or will reduce the voluntary-severance packages. People want the money – what crucial money we've got around, we want to use in targeting into services. We have a cap in Cardiff on voluntary severance, whereas other authorities don't.

The Trade Unions have said quite rightly – we've been talking about the settlement clause going for sometime – "can you do it immediately?" and, absolutely, we did it immediately, and only in exceptional circumstances will it stay. Again another saving of £30,000.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PARTNERSHIPS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

Why does the Leader now think that his own ruling group's decision to restructure at senior level in 2012/13 was so flawed?

Admittedly there was strong representation from opposition parties, but that was ignored. The financial and forward pressures have changed little since those changes took place. Does he now consider, like many others of us, that the first restructuring was a huge and costly mistake?

Reply

The fact that a Senior Manager restructure is proposed as part of the 15/16 budget proposals does not mean that the 12/13 restructure was flawed. There were clear rationales provided at that time, not least this administration's serious concerns at the capacity issues and performance that we inherited back in 2012. One of the key points highlighted at that time was the need to reduce the number of interim appointments and consultants in senior-management roles and to bring into the Council some permanent appointments and expertise.

The current budgetary pressures within the Council require savings to be made from all areas and this includes the senior-management structure. The proposed restructure meets the objectives, which were outlined in the report to Cabinet earlier this week, of ensuring that the budget available to deliver services is allocated effectively throughout the organisation and to ensure the efficiency of the Council to enable it to respond flexibly to the challenges ahead.

This proposal reflects an evolution of the current structure and seeks to retain a balance between stability and change, and we can build upon the findings of the peer-review report as well.

Supplementary question from County Councillor Walker

I understand the embarrassment the Leader faces in answering "yes" to this question, but it is the only logical answer he can give. Why otherwise would he be correcting it at such huge cost at such short notice? That's the issue, and I think we all understand the answer. I understand it's difficult for you to say.

So, would you agree that it was a correct decision?

Reply

I seriously don't think you were listening to what I said earlier. There were serious concerns about the performance and management capacity in this organisation in 2012. We needed to bring in additional resources to do that.

We've already heard from the Director of Social Services' report that we are seeing real improvement in some service areas. The Cabinet Member's report on Education, again showing serious improvement in performance. That's what residents in the city want to see, and that's what we did when we introduced the original structure.

Things have changed significantly since that time. We are now reflecting on the comments that have come back from the public in terms of the Cardiff Debate. We also recognise that the Council needs to change fundamentally if we are going to drive out some of the reductions in budget that we need to find in the years ahead – £124 million has been said earlier. The structure needs to be much leaner and much more responsive to some of those challenges we face, we need service areas to be working much closer together. We feel this structure, subject to consultation, will do just that.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Ralph Cook

If we have managed to sort out Social Services – Children's and Adults' – in less than a year because of the brave decision to expand our management across the board, then was that not worth it? Especially as, in 2012 when we took power, there was talk about the risk to children of actually dying under our watch.

Reply

I think you make some valid points there, Councillor Cook.

We absolutely have to focus on quality of service delivery. That's what the public are telling as matters to them. This proposed structure that's been undertaken, it's undertaken a real review with Hay Consultancy – they've looked across the board at other Councils. We do have levels of Senior Management that are above similar-sized cities – we have to address that. I think, judging by the comments of the Public Services Minister in the chamber only this week, he recognises that Councils across Wales have to get to grips with some of their senior-management costs. We're doing that now and I think that's the right thing to do.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURY (COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES & SOCIAL PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR COWAN

Rhiwbina Library has issued more books than any other branch library in the City, since May 2009, month on month without exception. Bearing this in mind, can you guarantee that the Council will continue to fund this much used and much loved essential resource indefinitely?

Reply

There is no question that the performance of Rhiwbina Library is demonstrative of the support that it has from the community which it serves, which is why we need to ensure that is has a sustainable future and as I stated already tonight, we have no proposals to close library services but we are seeking to deliver a new model of community-tailored provision.

As you are aware, we have recently concluded the public consultation on these proposals and are currently reviewing all feedback.

We have invited the community to take a larger role in the provision of library services, but I am steadfast in my view that Rhiwbina should continue to be supported by Neighbourhood Development Librarians, IT, and books, as well as being offered library support services moving forward.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Cowan

Assuming you are determined to press ahead with the proposal to cut the funding, what will you do if a community group is unsuccessful in generating tens of thousands of pounds each and every year to help keep their library open?

Reply

As I've always stated, I am a lot more optimistic than you are and I think there are community groups and not just community groups – it doesn't have to be a community group – there are other public-sector bodies as well. There's a question from Councillor Holden later on, which I'll address then.

It doesn't have to be a community group – we can work with other agencies to make sure that we deliver a sustainable library service in any area in Cardiff, including yours.

It is, however, tough to deliver a balanced budget, and this has left us in the unfortunate position of having to review the current library provision in Cardiff, and, given that you have stated your love of public services, I do hope that when we come to the budget proposals that you put forward this year, we won't see a Council Tax cut in them.

Supplementary Question from Craig Williams

Can I just tease this issue out? Because you've been asked this a couple of times now and I do believe you haven't answered it. If no community group comes forward, and if nobody else comes forward with a budget to match it, what would happen to a library if you cut the funding?

Reply

It's a hypothetical question and it is my policy to try and give these libraries a sustainable future. That's the line I've given. The Library Strategy aims to give it a sustainable future. And I tell you what – if you think this is winning you any friends across Cardiff, given the amount of cuts that your government are pushing on us in Wales and in Local Government, then you've got another thing coming.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PARTNERSHIPS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Will the Leader of the Council apologise to the people of Cardiff and the council workforce for wasting millions of council tax pounds on an unsustainable senior management restructure?

Reply

The fact that a senior management restructure is proposed as part of 15/16 budget proposals does not mean that there is a need to apologise for the previous restructure that was agreed in October 2012.

One of the key points highlighted at that time was the need to reduce the number of interim appointments and consultants in senior-management roles, one of which – as you'll know, Councillor McEvoy, because you were deputy leader at the time – was earning £1500 a day, and to bring the Council some permanent appointments and expertise.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McEvoy

It seems that we have a U-turn which isn't a U-turn. If I understand the Leader, there were things to fix in 2012 and we've made progress and the job is done. I think that's what you're saying, more or less.

If that is the case, why didn't you appoint people on fixed-term contracts?

Reply

I think the rationale at that time was made very, very clear that we wanted to internalise that expertise. Far too often in this Council, we've brought in people in a temporary arrangement, that knowledge and expertise hasn't been able to develop and grow within the organisation. We have now got a structure in place where we believe we have got some very talented individuals who are delivering for the people of Cardiff, and that's something that I certainly am not going to apologise for.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McKerlich

It's clear that, when you came in, you made a reasonable case for bringing in a reasonable number of new Corporate Directors but you went overboard and appointed far too many without proper thought.

Whatever one may think about the number of Directors one needs, there can be no doubt that we need people who are competent and skilled, and there are a diminishing number of people at the top of local government who can do these jobs to a satisfactory standard.

One of the more concerning things about this whole episode is the collateral damage which you have done to Cardiff's reputation because when, time after time over a very short period of years, you see adverts appear in the national press for a large numbers of Corporate Directors. People who are in this small body of people competent to do this job know how short has been the duration in post of previous applicants. You have to be concerned about the reputational damage done to the City of Cardiff with this *Grand Old Duke Of York* business of appointing lots of people and, two years later, disappointing them.

Reply

I would urge you just to Google "council cuts". Right across the country, councils are cutting out senior Management costs because that's what people want to see, that is exactly what Councils are having to deal with, with the scale of the challenges that we're facing at the moment.

This is not unusual to Cardiff – it's something that we feel comfortable with, it's the Chief Executive's proposals – he's considered this in great detail and I think it's something that we will obviously reflect on in terms of the consultation, but it's in there – it's a significant budget line, and I think it's something that we absolutely have to consider, rather than cutting further into frontline services.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WEAVER

How does Cardiff Council seek to prevent people dropping litter?

Reply

If I had an answer to this question, Councillor, I'd be a very rich man but I'll give you the answer I've been provided with, anyway.

The Council carries out many activities to raise awareness of the consequences of littering and to support prevention. Examples include:

- Providing smoking litter bins to businesses
- Raising awareness and delivering anti-littering campaigns in schools (the Gregory Brothers roadshows, talks, poster competitions, and workshops – and that's very good)
- Providing "stubbi" pouches to residents at outreach sessions
- Supporting environmental groups such as Environmental Champions with literature, information, and other equipment.
- Publishing details of successful court prosecutions of people that fail to pay their fines
- Providing zero-tolerance messages on social media and in the press.

Equally, we work with community groups to deal with the consequences of the irresponsible few that do drop litter:

- We provide litter-pick packs and bags to community groups;
- We provide resources and collections to Keep Wales Tidy for community litter picks; and
- Work with fast food drive-throughs to issue littering fines on their land.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Weaver

You listed a number of good things that the Council does do to try and stop litter but, in our ward just over a year ago, a resident who was studying trialled an anti-litter measure based on Nudge Theory. It's a novel way of trying to stop people dropping litter, and he had green footprints pointing to bins. This has been heavily trialled in Copenhagen, I believe there is work going on in Bristol at the moment, at various local authorities around the country.

Would you be happy to read his report and get senior officers to read his report and look at some of these genuinely innovative ideas that are relatively low-cost and can be carried out either by the Council or community groups and see if there is a way that we as an authority can actually take a lead on this and promote it or do it ourselves if it is feasible? Thank you.

Reply

Thank you for that. Yes, we're always more than happy to explore any potential avenues to improve the situation as it is and I am aware of what you're referring to there, Councillor, and I'll certainly ensure that if they're not already doing so that

Officers will have a good look at the report and we'll feed back to you any thoughts that we have.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Bowden

Would you agree with me that one of the most things is the provision of bins in areas where we have high footfall, and takeaways, and whatever.

I've been waiting, in my ward, for a bin to be replaced. I have asked and asked and asked. It's by a school and unfortunately, when the other bins get full, everything gets thrown on the floor. I don't know what the problem is, but it seems like Cardiff has a problem getting bins attached to the railings. So perhaps it's something you can investigate for me. Thank you.

Reply

Yes, when it comes to bins, I wouldn't say it's the most important thing. My view is that, when people have got litter that they provided, even if there isn't a bin around, there's no reason why they can't take it home with them and deposit it there. So, the bin isn't the crucial thing. Lots of places don't actually provide bins and you're expected to take it home. I've been on walking trips, I've gone miles without seeing a bin and I didn't just throw the litter down. That's the problem – the problem is people themselves.

I will, however, have a look at the area that you're talking about in providing the litter bin and see what we can do about it.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOWELLS

With many libraries, leisure centres and other outlets running out of food waste bags earlier this month, can you confirm that all are now fully stocked?

In addition, can you ensure that there are adequate re-ordering procedures in place so that this situation doesn't happen again?

Reply

Some stockists did experience delays in their replenishments due to a supplier delivery issue that was beyond the Council's control.

However, the online and ring and request service remained available through the short period and did have bags to supply.

We did experience delays from our supplier, who failed to deliver the required quantities of bags. The matter is being discussed with our supplier with support from the Council's procurement team in order to ensure that future supplies are delivered on time.

I would add, however, that one of the problems we have when it comes to the food bags is that we cannot maintain high stocks of them because of the biodegradable nature of them, and if we keep them for any length of time then they'll just perish. So that does cause a bit of a problem in that we cannot keep a huge stock and so, when there is a short-term problem, it does have that sort of impact.

I would also point out, by the way, that many councils have to charge people for these bags and we are still providing them free.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Howells

With food waste at the end of the year considerably higher than at other times of the year, surely an analysis of the stockholding should have been undertaken before then.

If we are to increase recycling rates, we have to make it as easy as possible for people to recycle and not put up barriers, such as not having bags available.

Residents in my ward who took the initiative to go to Lamby Way with their food waste were just told to dump it in with the general waste.

So, my supplementary is: can you make sure that we do regular assessments of our stockholdings, particularly at peak times such as the yearend? And, secondly, can you also look at whether it's feasible to include food waste as a waste that can be accepted at our household-waste-recycling centres.

Reply

I'll reiterate my first point that we cannot keep large supplies of these bags in stock and, therefore, we are reliant on suppliers making sure that they deliver when they are supposed to.

However, there are always issues, as I am sure you are well aware, when occasionally things go wrong and there is that gap. So I can't say to you "that will never happen again" because we cannot keep a large supply.

In terms of your second question, however, I am more than happy to agree with that and it is something that we do consider.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Bowden

Councillor Derbyshire, would it help you to know that I discovered last night a hidden

source of caddy bags? Strangely enough, the Maes Y Coed Community Centre staff ordered a considerable number of them before Christmas, and they told me last night they had five large bags of them. It's a centre that doesn't get used very often, so I wonder perhaps residents who are listening to this might want to go and visit the Maes Y Coed Community Centre and get some, Councillors may wish to, but you may also wish through your own staff to pull some of those back and put them into centres that are more easily accessible. Thank you.

Reply

Thank you for those very helpful comments, Councillor, and I'll certainly on a personal level ask officers to have a look at that.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

Friends Groups contribute substantial amounts of their free time to the running and improvement of our parks and woodland. They rely on the deployment of park rangers to supervise safe and appropriate work, often at weekends. Will the proposed reduction in park ranger capacity in any way reduce the effectiveness or productivity of Friend's Groups?

Reply

I think this comes back to the old thing about the budget again. It's a strange business, isn't it? People get criticised when you put out stuff and then you get criticised again when you consult over things.

However, a decision on this particular savings proposal has yet to be made, as you well know, and the Cabinet will be taking into consideration the responses that we received from the recent consultation exercise as well as from other areas such as scrutiny and whatnot.

I fully recognise the important role that our network of Friends Groups and volunteers play in the management, maintenance and, indeed, the development of our public open provision, which is why, if you looked at my statement, there was a comment in there about that.

In considering this proposal and potential implications, I will be exploring what mitigating measures and actions can be taken in order to minimise the impact on the level of support that can be offered to Friends Groups and volunteers, should the proposals be accepted.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Walker

In your response you sort of acknowledged that we cannot afford to lose the support and the input of these Friends Groups, who do an enormous amount of work in their own time for nothing which adds value to the Council's facilities and work for nothing. Could you at least, please, write to the Leaders of the Friends Groups and brief them in terms of what's happening? Because they're contacting Councillors and they're very insecure and worried about the future. I think it would be right for you to do that and, in so doing, could you also write to Councillors who have got parks which are affected by Friends Groups, letting them know exactly what the future holds?

Unless you do that, I think that some Friends Groups are just going to collapse, they won't be able to recruit new members. So, this is a very important service – it's a bit like the neighbourhood services that had money withdrawn from a year ago which then disappeared. If we don't watch it, we could lose this very important and vital facility.

Reply

Yes, like you, I value strongly the Friends Groups. They have an important role to play and, actually, when you suggested I write to them, I've already asked officers to see if we can arrange a meeting with the representatives of the Friends Groups in a group so that I can actually talk to them first hand.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Evans

The point has been made that the reduction in Park Rangers will prevent some Friends Groups from applying for funds from other sources and this could actually result in the Council incurring increased costs.

Can you assure us that you are looking at this risk very closely?

Reply

I am looking at all the risks around this particular issue very very carefully. Of course, as you well know, at the end of it, it won't be me that actually makes the final decision on whether or not we make that change to the provision of Park Rangers — it will be the people in this chamber who make that decision — all I'm doing is exploring the best ways that we can minimise the impact of it if it actually goes ahead and, obviously, that is one of the things that we need to take into account.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR LENT ON BEHALF OF ELSMORE (HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR SANDERS

What are the key specific actions that the Local Authority is undertaking to meet the needs of older people in Rhiwbina?

Reply

Actions are being taken to ensure equity of access for older people to services across the city and in particular to assess where further third-sector or preventative services are required.

In the current financial year, a pilot Healthy and Active Partnership project has been commissioned and, as part of this, Age Connects is undertaking a mapping exercise of existing preventative services within communities.

The second phase is establishing a volunteer-based service to link up older people with support and engagement with services and local groups with an aim to reduce social isolation.

Officers from the Health and Social Care Directorate are working closely with colleagues within the Communities, Housing, and Customer Services Directorate to develop opportunities for older people at the Hubs and in other venues.

The most recent evaluation of the Healthy and Active Partnership project has shown that a number of referrals have been received for older people living in Rhiwbina. In addition, a number of volunteers from that area have come forward to work on the project.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Sanders

The Cardiff North Neighbourhood Action Plan has as one of its priorities the avoidance of social isolation – you mentioned that in your update – by promoting social inclusion across the area. One of the best of doing this is through community engagement in communal settings, meeting together in places such as libraries, where not only book borrowing takes place, but opportunities for learning new skills as well as social occasions that stimulate that wellbeing. Do you agree with that?

Reply

Yes, I certainly do agree with that, and it is important that older people can access facilities that are used by everybody in the neighbourhood – that they're not sectioned off as an older group. Obviously, the communal settings do include libraries and, as has been said earlier, our intention is to keep the library open in Rhiwbina, albeit that it may be run in a different way but we would certainly hope that it will be accessible to all of the community. And I think that I would also like to point out that, particularly in areas like Rhiwbina, the church groups do an awful lot as well to help older people to be less isolated.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Dianne Rees

I wonder if you could outline for me any specific actions that have been taken to address the needs of people in my ward, Pontprennau and Old St Mellons. And have you got any links planned with the community councils in the areas of Cardiff North?

Reply

I haven't got any specific information on Pontprennau other than to say that, obviously, we would want to encourage the same sorts of facilities and opportunities wherever they live in the city. If there's any specific information that you think we would have, then you are welcome to ask me afterwards. Obviously, I can pass that on to Councillor Elsmore when she's back, as well.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PARTNERSHIPS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Will the Leader of the Council accept my invitation to meet the young people who use Waterhall Youth Centre and explain why he and his colleagues are proposing to close it?

Reply

There is currently a very constructive dialogue with a range of community groups and organisations to put in place a sustainable future for this centre.

The views of young people are very important to this Council in moving all services forward and hundreds of young people from both Pentrebane and Fairwater have taken part in our consultation on local youth-provision. Young people will be directly involved in commissioning the service for their area, as well.

If you have told people that the centre is closing then I would urge you to, obviously, correct them in that case because that's certainly not the discussions we are having at the moment.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McEvoy

I'm sort of quite pleased to hear that.

So what you're saying is, in Full Council, that you guarantee that Waterhall Youth Centre will remain open. Is that the case? I'd be delighted if it is.

Reply

What we're saying at the moment is that we're in discussions on a range of options to make sure that that service and that facility stays open. It's exactly the message

that we've been giving in terms of libraries, as well. We're doing everything we can in terms of working with partners to make sure that these facilities can continue. It may involve a different partnership arrangement, but absolutely, that is something that we are committed to doing at the moment.

We're also in regular dialogue with the Youth Council as well so that conversation with young people in the city can continue.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Dianne Rees

Are you aware, first of all, that at the recent Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee a large number of representatives of young people from the Youth Centres in Cardiff attended the Scrutiny meeting and put forward their views as to why youth centres should not be cut in the budget?

Significant points were raised that may be of concern to you as Leader. Among those were many groups from the southern arc of the city representing the view that, if the Youth Centres were closed, there could be a danger of radicalisation of some youth groups because the youth centres are providing training and they are very useful in keeping young people on the right track towards being good citizens of the country and also of the city of Cardiff.

There is also the issue of the risk of repeating antisocial behaviour.

I wonder whether you are aware of those needs?

Reply

Clearly, there are a number of issues with all of the budget proposals that we're going to have to consider very carefully over the next couple of weeks.

I can reassure you that we are in discussions around that specific Prevent agenda. I think it's a very important resource within the city, not least because of some of the issues that we are seeing emerging not just in Cardiff or in Wales or in the UK but actually across the world.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR PATEL (TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GORDON

Have there been any applications to explore shale gas and does Cardiff Council have a policy on fracking?

Reply

No applications or approaches to date have been received for exploratory test drilling in Cardiff.

There is currently no policy on fracking. However, I would be happy to meet with you to discuss the issue.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Gordon

I do think that, as there is a lot of opposition on environmental grounds, that we should at least be prepared in case there was such an approach in the future. So I think the Council needs to look into it.

Reply

I'd be more than happy for you and anyone else who wants to come around to discuss this issue.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Walker

Will you accept there are many benefits of shale gas? Natural gas produces far fewer emissions than coal-generated energy. And, after, a short period of drilling, the system is silent and pollution-free.

By the way, are there any shale areas in south Wales, to your knowledge, or immediately in the Cardiff area?

Reply

Like with anything there are benefits and a lot of dis-benefits as well. And, as I said, we need to actually look into these things.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY (CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

How many employees of Cardiff Council over the age of 65 have been offered and taken voluntary severance during 2014/15 & 2013/14, and how much money has been paid out to those?

Reply

In 2013/14, 21 employees aged 65 and over took voluntary severance, totalling £273.506.

In 2014/15, 29 employees aged 65 and over took voluntary severance, totalling £439,106.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER (ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PARTNERSHIPS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McKERLICH

I would like to commend you on the work you are doing in the UK, Europe and further afield with Cardiff Business Council to bring large companies and well paid jobs to Cardiff.

You will be aware that in the public examinations of the LDP developers and council officers are stating forthrightly that residents in the north west and north east will be induced to leave their cars at home in favour of walking or cycling to work; this will be a necessity as it is intended to make road travel by private car either unpleasant or impossible.

Clearly this will be a health benefit for the people attracted to Cardiff to accept the well paid jobs which you have worked hard to create.

Do you and Nigel Roberts intend to publicise this benefit as a major argument to persuade big investors to locate their businesses in Cardiff and will you invite Mr Roberts to make this point to the LDP Inspector at the session on transportation?

Reply

Cardiff is projected to be the fastest growing major British city over the next decade.

In terms of selling the city to investors, this growth, driven by a young and highly skilled demographic, is one of Cardiff's greatest assets.

However, if the city is to function well for business, this growth will need to be managed in a sustainable and resilient way. The LDP sets out how this will be done.

As you are fully aware, the policy approach set out in the LDP for delivering sustainable transportation solutions goes far beyond walking and cycling – it's about enhancing public transport opportunities, which in turn will improve access to jobs.

The independent Inspector manages the LDP examination process following national guidance. In this respect, the contribution of both individuals and organisations speaking at upcoming Hearing Sessions has already been resolved, as reflected through previous submissions made by participants in the process.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McKerlich

I do accept that what you have said is meant with all sincerity and you are working very hard to achieve an importation of high-quality jobs. But, as you will know, the LDP examination started last week. There have been two weeks of it, eight sections. I have attended many of them. They are lengthy and what's depressing is that there is no solution to how people are going to move.

Not only are the current local residents protesting but, actually, Rhondda Cynon Taff have joined in, pointing out how many houses are going to be feeding cars onto the northwest system of roads, and they are just as concerned as local residents.

Now, the very key session which relates to this is on Wednesday 11 February, and I would like to ask that you and your Cabinet Member and possibly Nigel Roberts will come, because you will be impressed to find the developers and Council staff repeating "the phasing is going to work, we are going to get a modal shift, but in any event it's going to be so unpleasant driving that people are going to walk or cycle." Now that is not going to appeal to the people doing the kind of jobs you are trying to attract.

Reply

The whole point of the independent inspection process is the thoroughly investigate and test the plan and once the we have the result of exactly what that Inspectors Report has found we will obviously we'll reflect on it.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Aubrey

Yes, there was an inspection process, but the inspection process depends on what the policy is and what the evidence is. Now, there's a huge important point here — when the scrutiny was being undertaken originally, we were told that it was a 50/50 modal shift across the city as a whole. Now, I described that as the "star car ban" — basically, if you lived in the star area, you would be banned from having a car because the only way to get a 50 percent modal split was to have 95/98 percent car use in those areas.

What we are now hearing – and it's a very different shade – we're being told is that the 50/50 modal split is possible from the new developments themselves. I would put it to you that that is insane. There is no other word for it – that is absolutely crazy. Now, will you confirm that it is your belief that the actions, not merely the policies – because this is Councillor McKerlich's point - that the policy says 50% will be achieved by hook or by crook – are you confirming that, as far as you are aware, as far as you believe, the things that the Council is actually doing, not just saying - but actually doing - in the LDP, the actual public-transport improvements that it is making – do you really believe that those would deliver a 50% modal shift? Because I have to say to you -- I don't believe that for a second.

Reply

This administration is absolutely committed to achieving modal shift across the city. You've heard earlier from the public question around some of the initiatives we're doing with cycling in the city – that's something we are determined to push forward in the future.

There are major investment and transport-infrastructure plans as well – the electrification of the Valley lines and also the metro project as well from Welsh Government.

I think we need to do an awful lot more, obviously, but we are absolutely committed to making sure that public transport and that modal-shift agenda is achieved as per the policy guidance laid out in the LDP.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY (CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR ROBSON

In light of the proposed new Senior Management structure, how will the Cabinet ensure expenditure on consultants does not rise?

Reply

Controls are already in place to manage and monitor expenditure on consultants and this will continue to be reinforced as part of the new senior management arrangements, which are now up for consultation as we discussed earlier.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Robson

I am worried. You will recall, Councillor Hinchey that we didn't in this group oppose the original Senior Management structure on the basis of the reduction in the amount of consultants that would be saved, and we had a few reservations and tweaks and things. I am worried that actually it seems to me that, listening to the Leader's gallivanting about how the Council's improved in areas such as Social Services, that if you come to this Council and you do a good job, you get made redundant, seems to be the message that we are sending out by our actions. As a result of that, we then go back to the state of needing consultants to then bring in the expertise that we have lost because we made our senior officers redundant.

I'm just concerned about that consultant's expenditure and that it doesn't go back up. Whatever you decide to do with your Senior Management structure, the consultants expenditure was in many cases money wasted, in my view. Can you assure as that that will be kept under control and not go up above what it currently is?

Reply

Absolutely, I can give you that assurance. In terms of any consultant needed, we need a business-justification form filled in and sent in to the Chief Executive – [looking towards Chief Executive's place] who we've just lost temporarily.

Any proposal is also subject to consultation with the trade unions, as you know. That kind of thing would require knowledge transfer and suchlike.

Going back to the question, expenditure on consultants has been reduced year on year since 2011/12. With these controls, and the proposed new senior-management arrangement, it is envisaged that this trend will continue in future years.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Walker

In an answer to an earlier question, the Leader said, to the approval from your benches, that of course Local Government cuts were across the country – those were his words – and this was exactly the point that we made on these benches when the original Director structure, which was the largest in the Core Cities, was proposed. These were not cuts, this was empire building, wasn't it?

But do you agree now that now is the time to admit that the extensive structure that was created then needed to be changed?

Reply

I'm sure that we could go back over history to discuss in depth why Central Government is cutting Public Services. £1.7 billion less coming into Wales has been well documented. In terms of why we are going forward, and I think I've said earlier on and the Leader has said, Local Government is taking savage cuts from Central Government. You can see that £124 million coming out over the next three years -- £48 million this year, £48.3 million next year.

I would propose that, in terms of consultants and restructure, it is absolutely crucial that we look at top-layer managers. When you look at the Cabinet report you asked questions on earlier on, we're 14th but we're top in the number of top-tier managers. I think the justification is there. Local government first cost is people cost. I think the justification in terms of Cardiff Debate – there are a number of things why we're reducing.

Do I believe that we were wrong then? I think there was a need at that time – we had to focus on Children's Services, we had to focus on Education improvement, and we can see now some of those green shoots have come through. This is a different time – now, we know where we are going with Public Services under this Government.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Could the Cabinet Member explain the discrepancy between projected savings on Waungron Road Recycling Centre his last answer on savings at Council?

Reply

Unfortunately, I think you need to be a bit more specific about the discrepancies you claim exists. I asked officers and nobody could quite work out what your question meant.

But I can confirm that, in terms of Waungron Road – something that you're probably already aware of because I've told you before –that in terms of operational and recycling performance at the remaining HWRCs, they have increased and therefore diverted more waste away from more expensive treatment and disposal processes of landfill for energy from waste. So confirm again that the required savings have been made as well as improving the environmental performance of the council.

And if you've still got a query on your other comment, I'm more than happy for you to drop me a note or even come and see me.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McEvoy

The discrepancy that I'm talking about, really, is the poverty of ambition that you clearly have as a Cabinet Member that the Council now clearly has because Waungron Road was recycling 5181 tonnes of material per annum. Now, if that had continued, then Waungron Road would have been saving the taxpayer £143,000 a year – they're your figures.

So, I don't accept your argument about the transfer of staff to Lamby Way, which is very difficult to access, Bessemer – people can't get near it. What you're doing is that you've missed out on the opportunity to recycle and will you consider reopening Waungron Road?

Reply

I'm afraid you don't seem to give my answers when I give them to you. My answers specifically tell you, every time you've asked a question, recycling in HWRCs has actually gone up. Not down – up. So, we're not losing any money by closing Waungron Road – we've saved money by not having that place any more. Recycling continues to increase and the use of those centres continues to increase.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DARREN WILLIAMS

Has there been a measurable increase in the dumping of large unwanted domestic items since the Council introduced charging for bulky waste collection?

Reply

This is another issue that it'd be nice to put to bed but, no doubt, I'll keep getting asked it.

The short answer is no, there has not been an increase. In fact, there's been a decrease.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Williams

That's good news. Will you continue to monitor the situation and, if it appears that it has been a significant increase over time, would you be prepared to review the current charging policy?

Reply

Absolutely.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Holden

Just a minor point – has there been a decrease because you have decreased the number of Officers looking for it and actually it's because you're not finding it and that's why there's been a decrease?

Reply

No, we're going on the reported incidents – it's got nothing to do with the number of Officers – it's the reported incidents. We collect the waste, it is then weighed, and because a lot of it can be recycled, the tonnages are going down.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR MAGILL (EDUCATION AND SKILLS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN

Headteachers and Governing Bodies have been told that the costs of severance in 2014/15 will be £2.121 million in excess of the budget allocated and that the Council is intending to claw this money back from schools over a 5 year period. How did the

Council overspend by so much, and how will the proposed clawback be determined to ensure fairness?

Reply

Current information indicates that the overall cost of schools severances will be in the region of £3.3 million for the 2014/15 financial year.

Of this, £1.5million relates to the closures of Llanedeyrn High, Llanrumney High and Rumney High schools. This is in alignment with the assumptions made in respect of the School Organisation Financial Model.

The total cost of severances is in the region of £2 million in excess of the budget that was allocated in 2014/15.

This issue has been the subject of many discussions at a variety of fora involving Headteachers, Governing Bodies, and Trade Unions over the past 12 months. The Council has recognised that schools would find it challenging to absorb this cost in one financial year. In response, it has been agreed to spread the costs in 2014/15 over the next five financial years to soften the financial impact on schools. The annual contribution will be met by a top slice from schools budgets before they are distributed.

The changes to the Voluntary Severance Scheme that were approved by the Cabinet in June 2014 and earlier this week will result in future school severance costs being reduced significantly on a case-by-case basis.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Bowden

I don't think you've answered the second part of my question, which was "how will the proposed clawback be determined to ensure fairness?"

I'm looking in terms of a small primary school or a small-to-medium-sized primary school possibly having to subsidise secondary school redundancies. Or is the secondary sector going to take a bigger hit than the primary sector. This is a large amount of money and it's going to have to be found from the school budgets over the next five years. At the moment, it's indeterminable.

Reply

In terms of the actual details of the distribution, I have to get the detail for you, rather than trying to answer that now on a school-by-school basis, but I will get the information to you.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Boyle

I think the pressure on school budgets is something we have to pay closer attention to than we currently are. We talk about standards, and that's absolutely right, but the

impact on standards of a school struggling with their budget is going to become really serious. I mean we heard and scrutiny recently the head of Ty Gwyn School praising the magnificent building that they've moved in to but admitting that the revenue budget implications are really serious, and he said "we will struggle to maintain the quality of the new building." The implication being that the quality of the building resulted in the effectiveness of the service they were giving the children, or the education they were giving the children.

I know governing bodies have increased responsibility, increased delegation, and we're hearing it a lot. I know you've talked about the need to strengthen governance, and I completely agree with that, but that takes a long time. Strengthening governing bodies does not happen overnight, especially in relation to financial expertise.

I want to know what the local authority is going to, whether it has the capacity to support schools in dealing with the increasing pressure of the financial situation.

Reply

I absolutely agree with you that one of the things that I think is an issue that needs to be strengthened in the way that we go forward with the Capital Programme and the 21st Century Schools Program as part of this realignment is that it is no good creating beautiful new buildings that we let disintegrate over the years to the extent that we're now having the problems that we have with £70-80 million worth of backlog maintenance that's required in schools.

So, we need to use the realignment of the 21st Century Capital Programme and other mechanisms to create good new buildings but, also, to build in the maintenance costs so that they are maintaining that fabric over subsequent years.

So, yes, I agree that that is something that we need to be working on at a strategic level.

In terms of supporting schools, can I get back to you with some of the detail on the work that's being done on that?

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR PATEL (TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

Back in April 2014, in response to an oral question from me, you stated:

"We remain committed to providing an online application and payment facility [for resident parking permit applications] and the required software is currently being developed by the Council's ICT team so that it can be integrated with the Council's new website. The current estimated date for completion is by the end of June."

Six months on from that deadline, why is no online system in place? What have you personally done to redress this failure?

Reply

There have been delays with the delivery of this project due to issues associated with the requirements of Data Protection legislation. I have asked senior officers to meet as a matter of urgency in order to expedite the delivery of this project.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Bridges

I'm sorry, but that just isn't good enough. We aren't breaking new ground by doing this. I've just done a quick Google search – I've found Newcastle, Sheffield, even Newport councils have online parking permit renewals.

Why doesn't someone get on the phone and ask them how they do it? This shouldn't be beyond the wit of man. And, at a time when this Council is having to make cuts to budgets, why are we not looking at a really simple way to save lots of resources and money by removing the obligation on residents to have to physically send an application and a cheque by post for a resident permit renewal. We can say the same about school applications, which have to be done on paper and posted and then put onto the system. This is just pathetic.

My question said "what are you personally going to do about this?"

Reply

As I have already made very clear to you, Councillor, I have had dialogue with the Officers.

We have got the software, which does take online payments for penalty charges, but, as I said, there are data-protection issues and I'm dealing with it.

If you don't like that question, then I'm sorry but that is the answer.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Cowan

I understand from Councillor Bridges he mentioned a number of local authorities who are already implementing this measure. So will you be speaking to them to see if we can move this forward more quickly and will you update the Council in due course?

Reply

I think what is important, as I said, there is dialogue going on with the Officers and it's only right that we carry on talking to the Officers. I am sure the Officers are doing all of that work but I am going to be meeting with the officials to discuss a number of

issues so I think that is only right and proper that we have that dialogue with the officials.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY (CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HUDSON

In terms of the restructuring at director level, what were the total costs of recruitment and selection, including associated costs in 2012/13?

What will be the projected costs for the proposed restructuring in 2015?

Reply

I would refer you to the answer that I provided earlier to Councillor Clark and Robson earlier on. That figure was £679,000.

In terms of your second part, therefore it is neither possible – I'm just repeating what I said in the earlier question – nor appropriate to put any costs around the [video glitches].

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRADBURY (COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES & SOCIAL ENTERPRISE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOLDEN

In light of the ever expanding hub network across the city, what thought has been given to developing the libraries planned for closure into new community hubs as opposed to closing them?

Reply

As I have already stated, we have no proposals to close library services but we are seeking to deliver a new model of community-tailored provision.

The Hub strategy that was approved last September identified a number of opportunities for new Hub developments across the city.

The proposals were based on a robust needs analysis and identified opportunities for bringing a range of public-sector services together. These hubs deliver significant savings due to the co-locations of existing services and the popularity of this integrated service approach is clear.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Holden

That is clear, but what isn't clear is your answer. The question was "if we've got hubs across the city in former libraries, why aren't we doing that with these libraries that are planned to be closed?"

Might I try and elicit from you, if you withdraw the funding from something, what happens to that facility if no further funding comes? It closes. That's the definition of closure.

So, actually, I need the answer to the question, which was "why can't we turn them into hubs", not some garble about some speech or policy that you've made. What I want is an actual answer to my question. Thank you.

Reply

There's actually no reason why they can't become Hubs. Why do we have to lead it? In Butetown, we have a Hub now that is led by Health – it's not led by us, it's led by Health and we've got services in it.

We're looking right across the city for these opportunities and working with partners to do it. There's no reason why we can't do it. Even where it is not possible to bring together publically funded services, where there are no budget lines, this principal of integration is still important to the whole library service. It's a simple answer. We are looking at it but it doesn't have to be us that delivers it.

What we're trying to do with the Hub strategy that we deliver is find ways of integrating services that we run and rationalising buildings and putting things under one roof of Council services. That's what we've done successfully, and that's what we're trying to do further in other areas.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Stubbs

Will you agree with me and Welsh Government Minister Ken Skates that the Hubs Policy has actually been a huge success? Especially in mind that the best is still to come – that being the STAR Hub.

Reply

I do. I think the best Hub is in Elv and Caerau.

The fact of the matter is it has been a success. The Welsh Government Minister applauded us on it. It is testament to the previous Cabinet Member, who is in the chamber, and other people who recognise that co-location of services can work. And we've just got to be a little bit more open minded about traditional services and how they are delivered. And I think that is important as we go forward in the next debate.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR MAGILL(EDUCATION AND SKILLS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Can the Cabinet Member explain the process which led to proposal no.199 being included in the Draft Budget for Consultation 2015/16, justify this in light of the disproportionate effect its implementation would have on the Welsh language/access to Welsh-medium education in many parts of the city as highlighted by the Equality Impact Assessment and state if he has been assured that it complies with Cardiff Council's Welsh in Education Strategic Plan and Welsh Language Scheme?

Reply

Non-statutory schools transport subsidies have already been removed for Secondary Schools and replaced with commercially operated bus services facilitated by the Council, and that was agreed by Council in February 2014.

It is proposed that Primary school transport will now follow the same process where subsidies for non-statutory school transport will be replaced by a commercially operated service that is, again, facilitated by the Council.

We will proceed with discussions with private operators, assuming that this is accepted as part of the budget, to provide services from September 2015 and communicate changes to parents and schools at the earliest opportunity.

The Welsh in Education Strategic Plan and Welsh Language Scheme will still be supported as non-statutory school transport bus services will be replaced by commercial operators facilitated by the Council.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McEvoy

But you are aware that children that go to Welsh-medium schools travel from a much greater area? That was, in fact, accepted by your Corporate Director back when we had the call-in some time ago.

I was looking for some reassurance, really, but I don't seem to be having it. But I'll ask you anyway – I wonder whether you can reassure parents of children who attend Welsh-medium school in this city that you will not imposing what amounts to a Welsh-language tax on them.

Reply

As I said, this is actually applying to primary schools. This is not between Welsh-medium, English-medium, or faith provision in this instance. This is the non-statutory support, so it only affects children who live within two miles of the school, so the fact

that Welsh-medium children tend to travel longer distances wouldn't be caught by this policy.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Carter

Let me come back on the point that Councillor McEvoy made. I am conscious that he made a point about people going to Welsh-language schools having to travel by far the furthest distance.

A slight challenge to that – and I'm conscious about the amount of children who travel to Faith-based schools, which have a similar catchment area and a similar number of faith-based schools as we have Welsh-medium schools – and I seek my own reassurance, Lord Mayor, to Councillor Magill, that people who are going to faith-based schools are not disadvantaged by Council cuts and they will be treated equally in the savings that this authority is trying to make.

Reply

Yes, just to be clear, there are statutory responsibilities to provide school transport. We are only talking about children who are not entitled to school transport because they live within two miles.

What we're also saying is that, although we are withdrawing the subsidy, we are working with commercial bus services to replace the services so there will be a bus for the children to use and that will be whether they are within two miles and they're from an English-medium school, a Welsh-medium school, or a Faith-based school but it is the children within two miles.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH (SAFETY, ENGAGEMENT AND DEMOCRACY PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McGARRY

Would it be possible to liaise with Highways to use the mobile cameras that monitor moving traffic offences to be used at night to find out who is fly tipping in rear lanes and side streets at night?

Reply

Waste and Highways officers do work together wherever possible on waste issues that may have been captured on camera.

The cameras utilised to monitor moving traffic offences are fixed cameras that are attached to lighting columns or specific posts. They can be moved from site-to-site, but are not mobile as they need power to work.

The Waste Management Service does use covert cameras with night vision, but there are stringent legal controls in place around when and where such cameras can be used. This tends to prohibit their use in any situation that will encroach on people's privacy, including use to enforce incorrect waste presentation.

Waste officers do investigate fly tipped waste and, where a strong evidence of repeated fly-tipping by individuals is demonstrated, consideration is given to the use of both covert and overt cameras.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor McGarry

We have a lot of lanes in our ward that seem to persistently have things like mattresses and settees and things. Does that mean that they can be concentrated on by a camera and that these people can be caught? Because, quite often, there are lorries that drive down from anywhere and just tip the rubbish into the lanes. So you're saying that we could catch them doing that?

Reply

To reiterate, we couldn't use cameras that are used moving-traffic offences. Waste Management do own six cameras that, in certain circumstances and meeting certain legal requirements, can be used.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Woodman

I understand Community Safety also have cameras, covert and overt, as well as Waste and I would ask why these are not being deployed in lanes and wooded areas. I do know that they need a lighting column to be able to be operational, but I am a bit confused because the fly tipping, we've just been told, has not been increasing. So, I just wonder why this question came in the first place.

Reply

It's not been increasing but it's still a problem. The Housing ASB team has six overt cameras that, as you say, need lighting and they can be used. But the introduction of fly-mapping software for Council Officers is another cause of the reduction in fly tipping. I'm happy to talk you through that if you're not aware.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY (CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR CLARK

How many working days have been lost due to Cardiff Council staff being on sick leave due to stress and related conditions during:

- 2012/13;
- 2013/14;
- 2014/15?

For each of these years what was the:

- Total number of working days staff were contracted to work;
- Total number of working days staff lost due to sickness absence?

Reply

The questions you've asked require a full set of numbers and I'll send you the numbers but I'll keep them rounded for the essence of time.

Total FTE days lost due to stress including work-related stress in 13/14 and to date in 15 are 22,000, 20,000, and 16,000. I'll send you the exact figures, obviously.

Total FTE days lost for work-related stress, they are 2,173 for 2012/13, 2013/14 were 5,783, and from April to December this year 4,710.

In terms of total FTE days lost in those three years, in 2012/13 they are 138,043, in 2013/14 118,854, and in 2014/15 to date it's 83,401.

Year	Total FTE days lost (stress) inc.	Total FTE days lost (work-related	Total FTE days lost	
	work-related stress	stress)		
2012/13	22,735	2,173	138,043	
2013/14	20,353	5,783	118,854	
2014/15 (Apr-Dec)	16,669	4,710	83,401	

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Clark

I am very concerned that we have got quite high stress levels of staff and, obviously, the instability caused by the proposed senior-management restructure is likely to aggravate the problem.

What are your plans to address staff absence due to stress and to support staff?

Reply

I'm sure Councillor Clark is well aware of our review of the Health and Wellbeing policy recently where we reported back to Cabinet this year that overall sickness had dropped by 13,000 days.

Needless to say, as a Manager myself, I am very much aware that health and wellbeing and stress-related illnesses are very much on the increase – they're the number one in any organisation be it small, medium, or large. And we're working in partnership, as you know, with the trade unions to try and address those issues and support those people who are going through a period of change.

Inevitably, any organisation that goes through change will cause stress and anxiety to members. We absolutely accept, and I'm sure everybody in the chamber accepts that. But there are mitigating circumstances that we can put in place but we're constantly working with both trade unions and individuals on supporting them through that.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR HINCHEY (CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

Does the Cabinet Member consider that, in the future, the Council will need to deploy 338 members of staff receiving £595,000 a year in standby payments?

Reply

As part of the Single Status Agreement effective from 1st April 2012, a consistent approach to standby arrangements across the Council was introduced. Payment for being on 'stand-by' reflects the level of inconvenience and disruption to the employee's normal home life that is incurred in the particular circumstances for which each directorate's operational requirements.

At the Audit Committee meeting that was held last week, it was acknowledged that there is a wide and diverse range of services where officers are required to be on standby outside normal office hours.

Of those Officers receiving payment that were referred to in the report by the Audit Committee, some employees have this built into their contracts of employment.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Walker

My question was whether you think into the future 338 members of staff will need to receive £600,000 in that payment. Maybe you might say yes, and this is the reason I suggest you might – if you look at it very closely – you might say "I hardly think so."

Reply

I'm not sure if that was a question, or a comment. Absolutely, I am more than happy to look at that with you when we have more time.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MERRY

Is there scope within the licensing of Houses in Multiple Occupation for tenants to raise concerns about the behaviour of their letting agents or landlords?

Reply

Should a tenant of a licensed HMO wish to raise issues about either the behaviour of a landlord or letting agent or the condition of their property, the Housing Enforcement team will investigate the matter directly or refer it to other agencies within the Council, depending on the nature of the complaint.

The HMO Licensing team regularly takes enforcement action against landlords and agents where they fail to comply with the HMO licensing or health and safety requirements and we hold a record of these prosecutions which may also assist in determining fitness and propriety of any landlord or agent to hold a licence.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Merry

Home Sweet Home is a local group that has been talking to private tenants in Cathays. Would you consider meeting with the group to hear some of the rather worrying stories that they've heard from private tenants even with licensing in Cathays?

Reply

I'm sorry to hear that there may be some issues there. As you know, we've met in the past. I'm more than happy to meet and talk about them again at any time you'd like.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Clark

It would be very valuable to have an update in the area of Cardiff now which has got the license if HMOs and additional licensing scheme (i.e. Cathays), to have the details of how many properties have been licensed in Cathays, and that are eligible out of the total number which are waiting to get licensed; and what proportion of those still need work to be done to meet the conditions of the licence?

Reply

I'm sure you won't be surprised to hear that I haven't got the answers off the top of my head, but I will provide you with them.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH (SAFETY, ENGAGEMENT AND DEMOCRACY)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR HOWELLS

Did the Council submit an entry for the Stonewall Workplace Equality Index 2015?

Reply

The Council has not completed an entry in the Stonewall Workplace for some time now.

I know this is an issue you feel very strongly about, I know you've asked a question about this to Councillor Bradbury, who promised to look into it. I've looked into it.

It isn't a matter of money it just takes a significant amount of Officer time to complete the process, to provide the supporting information as well. At this time, they would be unable to do it.

This does not, however, dilute our commitment to equality in all of its forms. We will do all we can in years to come to support the dignity and human rights of all our employees and citizens.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Howells

As you said, I think most people are aware that I've raised this issue before and I was seriously hoping for a change of decision on this, with a new Cabinet, so to say I'm disappointed is an understatement.

We entered the Stonewall Equality in 2010 and by 2011 we were considered the 38th best employer in the UK. Now, the only Welsh council in the index is Carmarthenshire and I congratulate them on their achievement. Congratulations also to Cardiff University, who are 24th, and the Welsh Assembly, who are the 4th best employer for LGBT employees in the UK.

If your commitment to equality is as you say it is, then can I ask you please to reconsider this decision for next year?

As the largest Council in Wales, I sincerely believe we should be setting an example on this.

Reply

I am certainly happy to see what we are able to do. It's just that the Equalities team has been reduced radically over the years. But if there's any other way that this can be possible, I'm happy to consider it.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR PATEL (TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GORDON

How are the Council progressing with the requirements of the new Active Travel Act?

Reply

The Council will progress the production and publication of the map of existing Active Travel routes in Cardiff following completion of the field surveys of the existing Active Travel networks in local authority areas across Wales currently being undertaken from Sustrans.

Once survey data has been received, there will be a period of public consultation on the existing route map but, at this time, we are unable to indicate firm dates of when this will take place.

Following finalisation of the existing route map, it will be submitted to the Welsh Government for approval by September 2015.

The integrated network map will be subject to public consultation and, once finalised, it will need to be submitted to Welsh Government by September 2017.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Craig Williams

I am sure, Councillor Patel that you are aware of your responsibilities under Section 9 of the Act in terms of placement of highways signs on cycle lanes, and I was wondering whether you could explain what you're doing to make sure that tenders and, indeed, work done by the Council are aware of their responsibility under Section 9? Because, if you look for example at Tyndall Street, you have placed a lot of signs in the middle of the cycle lane, contrary to the Act and your responsibilities.

Reply

Clearly, if there is a contravention, I would be happy for you to email those details and I would certainly forward those on to the officials and get an investigation carried out on those areas.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR MAGILL (EDUCATION AND SKILLS PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR EVANS

What comments would you make about:

- a) the performance of Cardiff-based universities in the Research Excellence Framework 2014 and
- b) the collaboration between this Council and the local higher-education sector?

Reply

Well, this is really good news.

I would like to congratulate our city's universities for their superb results as part of the 2014 Research Excellence Framework. Cardiff University is now ranked fifth in the UK – alongside Oxford and Cambridge – as a leading global institution for research. And, in terms of research impact, it ranked second in the UK. A truly outstanding performance.

Cardiff Metropolitan is the highest ranked post 1992 "modern" university in the UK, while the University of South Wales doubled its amount of research rated as "world leading". So that's a really fabulous set of results.

It is, therefore, important that we do collaborate with higher education to support what they do, but also to support the wider development of the city. Cardiff Council is currently collaborating on a number of EU-funded projects, looking at a range of activities from energy efficiency through to public service. We've also had support from the sector in undertaking research and the Council is also in regular contact including the progression of Cardiff University's Innovation Campus.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Evans

I think it's really important to appreciate the importance of these results, particularly the performance from Cardiff University. In football terms, this is a Premier League university with a Champions League spot. It is really important for the city as a whole.

I am very pleased to hear about the collaborative initiatives between the Council and the local higher-education sector.

I'd like to hear a little bit more about the focus and whether that is being coordinated, as it were.

Reply

I think what I set out was a range of activities.

One area where I really do feel that we need to focus and are working closely with our universities now is looking for their support in developing these arrangements around governance for schools. I think that's something where there have been a lot of projects around the city from universities which have been extremely valuable.

They've supported the teaching of mathematics and so on. But, now, what we need to do is to actually focus their energies in a way that means we are really targeting things like the gap in attainment between those on free school-meals and those not, and supporting schools generally to improve attainment and standards. I think that is where more focussed work with universities could bring real gains for schools in the city.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Boyle

I think the important point is you mentioned in terms of the way we collaborate with the universities and I think it's absolutely true that great cities have great universities. I think that's a given.

It's easy to see that collaboration in terms of the sciences and technologies in business parks and technology centres, but also it's important that we use the universities' strengths in the arts sectors as well. And I'd like to make a cry out for the arts as well as science and technologies.

Reply

In addressing things like the attainment gap between those on free school-meals and those who aren't, actually it's not just the STEM projects that are important. What is clear is that it is actually giving young people in that situation access to cultural, artistic, musical – all of those sort of enriching experiences. And, clearly, the universities have a huge capacity to help us in those respects as well.

So, I think that there are a number of ways they can help – the STEM subjects we've talked about, that we've talked about, and it's also in terms of getting teaching and learning into the vanguard of understanding around the forefront of research experience and so forth in improving teaching and learning as well. So, there are many many ways that we can actually work to the benefit of the education system.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR DERBYSHIRE (ENVIRONMENT PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR JOYCE

When will food waste bags be supplied again?

Reply

As you will be aware from my answer to Councillor Howells' question some stockists did experience delays in their replenishments due to a supplier delivery issue. We are seeking to ensure that all stockists now have supplies.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Cowan

I was advised today that there has been an issue with supplies. So I was just wandering why you didn't include this important issue in your statement, because there have been issues in Rhiwbina with lots of Tweets and Facebook messages and calls and I know there has been a question today.

So I was wondering why you didn't include it in your statement, as it is of importance to all the Members and our constituents.

Reply

Probably because I was aware there was a question.

QUESTION TO COUNTY COUNCILLOR LENT (EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN AND FAMILIES PORTFOLIO)

QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR RALPH COOK

The CSSIW Performance Evaluation Report 2013-14 for Cardiff City Council is complimentary about the appointment of a Director of Social Services and a Director for Health and Adult Social Care, crediting these decisions with being innovative and bringing stability in leadership and direction within the department. It also states that the challenge over the coming year is maintaining and improving quality while managing a service with increased demands and a shrinking budget. In Areas for Improvement the Council is encouraged to take forward plans to recruit to agreed senior leadership and managements posts within the department.

Can you outline for Council how the planned amalgamation of the two social services Directorships will ensure that we can continue to ensure stability in leadership and direction within the department within the context of increasing demands and shrinking budget?

Reply

It is true that there is both an increasing demand and shrinking budget within Social Services. This makes it all the more important that resources are reviewed and streamlined across both Directorates.

The proposed structure gives a clear and singular role for the Director of Social Services consistent with best-practice guidance in Wales and enables the statutory Director to discharge his function more effectively. The proposed structure will also assist the continued development of the Council's partnership working arrangements with Health, as well as with other Council directorates. In addition, the transition for service users between children's and adult social care can be more aligned.

The proposed Director of Social Services post will align the statutory role more clearly across both Directorates, providing singular and unified professional leadership, advice on strategic direction and responsibilities, as well as strong performance and improvement arrangements.

And I should add that, clearly, there will still be senior managers in both directorates.

Supplementary Question from County Councillor Ralph Cook

I think my concern is that, after 15 years as a Councillor here, this is the best report I've seen from CSSIW. And it is because, I believe, that we have introduced these two managers.

Now, I recognise there are synergies between the two departments. I recognise that is potentially possible to combine through one leading person and get everything working well together. But our experience of the past is that it hasn't worked, and that is what I'm concerned about.

The difference, would you agree, is that the difference between the needs of deeply scarred children and end-of-life adults are very, very significant. There is almost no synergy there. And I just feel both of those two groups of vulnerable people need the forensic glare of somebody at the top of the game.

Reply

Prior to 1999, of course, we did have a Director of Social Services with Assistant Directors underneath. I don't think that the problems in Social Services stemmed from the fact that we had the old system with the Director and separate Directors underneath – I don't think that it was really anything to do with that. We've had this sort of system – well, a variety of systems – over the last 15 years, actually. At one point we had a Corporate Director who covered Education, as well, which is not a good idea in my view.

I think this system is perfectly sensible. I've been around long enough to remember generic teams, where everything was done in the same team, and nobody's suggesting that. We would want clear lines of responsibility. And I think the reason that there's been such clear improvements, particularly in Children's Services, is that we've had good leadership from senior people who are not agency people, they're not highly paid consultants – they've got a commitment to the department and they're encouraging that commitment in their staff.

137 : COUNCIL PROCEDURE RULES – WRITTEN QUESTIONS

Council was requested to approve on a trial basis a change to the current procedure for Members' Questions is set out in Part 3 of the Council Procedure Rules, were approved by Council on 27 March 2014 as proposed by the Constitution Committee following its meeting on 15th January 2015.

The Cabinet Member for Safety, Engagement and Democracy, Councillor De'Ath. proposed the report which was seconded by Councillor Hunt. Councillor De'Ath presented the report and the recommendations of the Constitution Committee to change the procedures for Written Questions so that

- a) Any Member who wishes to submit more than 5 Written Questions will be invited to prioritise the 5 questions to be answered at the Council meeting;
- b) The answers to any additional Written Questions will be given at the following Council meeting; and
- The Monitoring Officer to be given discretion to instruct that a composite answer may be given to related Written Questions, wherever she considers this appropriate;

The Lord Mayor invited debate where a number of matters were raised in relation to the changes proposed; the ability of Members to get full and accurate response to questions; and the introduction of a limit.

It was proposed by Councillor Cowan and seconded by Councillor Robson under Council Procedure Rule 25 (iv) to refer the matter back to the Constitution Committee and for a discussion with Leaders and Whips.

A vote was taken on the reference back. The reference back was LOST

RESOLVED – That Council approved, on a trial basis for 6 Council meetings, the recommended amendments to Rule 17(f) of the Council Procedure Rules in respect of Written Questions.

138: NOTICE OF MOTION

The Lord Mayor advised that three notices of motion had been submitted and included on the Summons for the meeting. There were no amendments.

MOTION 1

The Notice of Motion was proposed by Councillor Craig Williams and seconded by Councillor McKerlich as follows:

Council calls upon the Cabinet to respond meaningfully to the clear message arising from consultation over budget proposals to remove the subsidy from 7 local libraries, as set out in line 32 of the budget proposals. Residents of Cardiff have attended

consultations and organised protest marches and other protests; they have signed petitions in huge numbers. If consultation is to be taken seriously, this level of opposition to the proposed saving cannot be ignored.

Accordingly, Council requests the Cabinet to find an alternative saving to replace in the plan year the saving of £283,000 which budget line 32 would have achieved. This will allow time and opportunity to devise a considered medium term strategy for the provision of library services.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on Motion 1. Following the debate request was made for a recorded vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor Craig Williams.

For (31)

Councillors Aubrey, Bowden, Boyle, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Cowan, Davis, Evans, Ford, Gordon, Graham, Groves, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hyde, Kelloway, Lloyd, McEvoy, McKerlich, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Ben Thomas, Walker, Craig Williams and Woodman

Against (33)

Ali Ahmed, Ali, Bale, Bradbury, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Goodway, Govier, Hinchey, Hunt, Javed, Joyce, Knight, Lent, Lomax, Magill, Marshall, McGarry, Merry, Mitchell, Morgan, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, Stubbs, Thorne, Walsh, Weaver, White and Darren Williams

Abstain (1)

Councillor Huw Thomas

The vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor Craig Williams was LOST

MOTION 2

The Notice of Motion was proposed by Councillor De'Ath and seconded by Councillor Darren Williams as follows:

This Council opposes the introduction of schemes which force job seekers into unpaid work or face losing their benefits - schemes popularly known as workfare.

This Council is concerned that there is no evidence workfare assists job seekers in finding work and in fact working a 30 hour week makes that more difficult; that workfare is replacing paid work; and that workfare stigmatises benefit claimants and locks them further into poverty.

This Council pledges not to use any workfare placements and will also encourage

partners not to use the scheme.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on Motion 1. Following the debate a vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor De'Ath was taken.

The Motion was CARRIED

MOTION 3

The Notice of Motion was proposed by Councillor Robson and seconded by Councillor Sanders as follows:

Rhiwbina Library has issued more books, month on month, than any other branch library in Cardiff, dating back to May 2009. This statistic has been provided by Cardiff County Council.

Taking this into consideration, this Council calls upon the Cabinet to recommend that the Council continue funding::-

1 Rhiwbina Library

2 All other Stand Alone Libraries

The Lord Mayor invited debate on Motion 3. Following the debate request was made for a recorded vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor Robson.

For (29)

Councillors Aubrey, Bowden, Boyle, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Cowan, Davis, Evans, Ford, Gordon, Graham, Groves, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hyde, Kelloway, Lloyd, McEvoy, McKerlich, David Rees, Robson, Sanders, Ben Thomas, Craig Williams and Woodman

Against (33)

Ali Ahmed, Ali, Bale, Bradbury, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Goodway, Govier, Hinchey, Hunt, Javed, Joyce, Knight, Lent, Lomax, Magill, Marshall, McGarry, Merry, Mitchell, Morgan, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, Stubbs, Thorne, Walsh, Weaver, White and Darren Williams

Abstain (1)

Councillor Huw Thomas

Not Registered (2)

Councillors Dianne Rees and Walker

The vote on the motion as proposed by Councillor Robson was LOST

139: URGENT BUSINESS

In accordance with the pilot Council Procedure Rule 3(xv) the Lord Mayor advised that she had not been notified of any urgent matters for this meeting.

UNOPPOSED COUNCIL BUSINESS

140 : LOCAL AUTHORITY APPOINTMENTS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

The Council was recommended to approve the appointment of Local Authority School Governors as listed in the Appendix to the report, and as shown on the Amendment Sheet. There were no contested seats.

RESOLVED - That the following appointments of

(1) School Governors be approved as follows: -

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Applications received	
Cantonian High School	Fairwater	28/11/2014	Ms Justine Cass	
St Teilos Church In Wales High School	Pentwyn	05/01/2015	Miss Sarah Griffiths	
The Glyn Derw Michaelston Federation	Caerau/Ely	28/01/2015	Mrs Pamela James	
Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg Plasmawr	Fairwater	23/09/2014	Mrs Catrin James	
Christ the King RC Primary School	Llanishen	18/12/2014	Mrs Sarah Beal	
Grangetown Primary School	Grangetown	20/11/2014	Mr Jeff Hobden	
Greenway Primary School	Rumney	03/10/2014	Mrs Emily Daly	
Lakeside Primary School	Cyncoed	17/05/2014	Mr Edward Brown	
Moorland Primary School	Splott	05/11/2014	Ms Truda Bell	
St Bernadette's RC Primary School	Pentwyn	21/06/2014	Mr Martin Cocks	
Windsor Clive Primary School	Ely	03/06/2014	Mrs Charlotte Thomas	
Ysgol Gymraeg Melin	Whitchurch	4/12/2014	Mrs Joanne Gordon-Smith	
Gruffydd		13/12/2014	Mr Owen Griffiths	
Woodlands High School	Caerau	17/12/2014	Mrs Abigail Phillips	
Tremorfa Nursery School –	Splott	23/04/2014	Mr Alun Vaughan-Thomas	
Baden Powell Primary School	Splott	25/03/2015	Miss Melanie Shanahan	
Coryton Primary School	Whitchurch	26/02/2015	Mr Michael Jones- Pritchard	

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Applications received
Greenway Primary School	Rumney	03/03/2015	Mrs Korin Jones
Gwaelod-Y-Garth Primary School	Pentyrch	24/02/2015	Mrs Sara Brown
Herbert Thompson Primary School	Ely	25/03/2015	Mrs Barbara Cooke
Hywel Dda Primary School	Ely	25/03/2015	Mr Bryn Thomas
Kitchener Primary School	Riverside	26/02/2015	Mr Jaswant Singh
Lakeside Primary School	Cyncoed	26/02/2015	Cllr Kate Lloyd
Pen Y Bryn Primary School	Llanrumney	23/02/2015	Mrs Val Cousins
Rhydypenau Primary School	Cyncoed	23/02/2015	Councillor Kate Lloyd
St Peter's RC Primary School	Plasnewydd	26/02/2015	Mrs Julia Houlston Clark

(2) Temporary Governing Bodies be approve as follows:

School	Ward	Start of Vacancy	Applications Received
New Pontprennau Primary School – 1 x Parent Governor	Pontprennau	11/9/2014	Ms Catrin Lewis

141: ESTABLISHMENT OF LOCAL PENSION BOARD

(Members declarations of interest under Article 10 of the Members' Code of Conduct as set out in Minute Number 126 were noted)

Council's authority was sought to proceed with establishing a Local Pensions Board as required by the Local Government Pension Scheme Regulations

RESOLVED - That

- (1) the proposed Local Pension Board Terms of Reference were approved, subject to any amendments required by the Local Government Pension Scheme Regulations; and
- (2) delegated authority be given to the Corporate Director Resources to proceed with the establishment of a Local Pension Board and the appointment of Board Members, in consultation with the Chair of the Pension Investment Advisory Panel

142 : APPOINTMENT TO COMMITTEE VACANCIES

The Council receive nominations from party groups to current Committee vacancies in accordance with the allocation of seats as agreed by Council at its Annual Meeting on 29 May 2014.

RESOLVED – That the nominations received for the vacancies on Committees be approved as follows:

<u>Committee</u> <u>Nomination</u>

Constitution Committee Councillor Susan White Children & Yong People Scrutiny Councillor Derrick Morgan

143: TIMETABLING OF FULL COUNCIL MEETINGS 2015 - 18

The Constitution Committee at its meeting on 15 January 2015 consider a timetable Full Council meetings from June 2015 – April 2018 to effect the discharge of Council business and its decision making. The Council's Constitution requires the consideration of Council meeting dates by the Full Council.

The timetable included in the report was based on the revised number of Full Council meetings as agreed by Annual Council on 29 May 2014.

RESOLVED – That the timetable of Full Council Meetings for 2015 -2018 as set out in the report be approved.

(Meeting closed at 22.55pm)

144: WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with Council Procedure Rules, Rule 17(f) Written Questions received for consideration and response are included as a record in the minutes of the meeting.

<u>COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE</u> (COUNCILLOR PETER BRADBURY)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

When will Llanedeyrn library be provided with more heaters, as previously advised to staff?

Reply

The temporary heating was fitted on 8th & 9th January and is fully installed. There are 4 heaters located in the main library and staff at Llanedeyrn Library have advised that the heaters are proving effective.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

How often is Maelfa centre and its surrounding walkways inspected for health and safety defects?

Reply

I can advise you that the majority of footways around the Maelfa shopping centre are not adopted highway and, therefore, do not fall within the highway inspection regime.

The adopted highway in general consists of the main roads through the estate such as Llanedeyrn Drive and Round Wood. At the shopping area, these roads are located, in general, at the rear of the shops where the garages and loading areas are situated.

The adopted carriageways are, in accordance with the guidelines provided in the Code of Practice for Highway Maintenance Management, inspected annually and the footways bi-annually.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

When did Cllr Bradbury provide for Cllr Woodman to be contacted with alternative potential dates to try and arrange a meeting to discuss redevelopment of Maelfa centre, following him cancelling their meeting arranged for December 2nd 2014?

Why has he been unable to arrange an alternative meeting, as per the council statement in SW Echo?

Reply

As you should be aware a meeting to discuss the redevelopment of the Maelfa Centre has been arranged with you and your ward member colleagues on 4th February 2015.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What has the financial status been of each council leisure centre in Cardiff be provided over the last ten years, outlining balance sheets, capital investment, grants, subsidies and number of service users?

Reply

The Council has a responsibility to prepare its accounting statements in accordance with the Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting. This Code sets out the Council's requirement to consolidate its financial position at each year end in respect of assets, liabilities and reserves on the balance sheet. As such, there is no separate balance sheet for leisure facilities that the Council prepares or is required to prepare.

You have already been provided with the figures for capital investment in leisure centres for the period from 2008 to date in response to your Written Question in November 2014. I can further confirm that £5,281,409.82 was spent during the period from 2005 to 2008. However, please note that these figures do not include capital expenditure associated with the development of the Cardiff International Pool (£34,502m) and the Cardiff International Sports Stadium (£7.389m).

Attendance figures for the past four years is provided below (data for period pre-2010/11 is not available):

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14
Western Leisure Centre	212,172	235,516	261,949	270,475
Eastern Leisure Centre	220,846	249,088	251,633	251,261
Fairwater Leisure Centre	186,874	206,418	233,519	274,656
Pentwyn Leisure Centre	274,488	281,846	252,601	287,354
Llanishen Leisure Centre	444,928	467,127	471,684	482,261
Splott Swimming Pool	70,103	94,194	69,518	73,644
Maindy Swimming Pool	244,404	246,615	246,071	271,452
Channel View Centre	163,253	78,222	85,701	80,878
Cardiff International Sports Stadium	114,418	146,915	154,631	186,665
STAR Centre	94,878	98,255	90,349	89,142

Attendances at Channel View Centre declined in 2011/12 mainly because a training provider (Military Preparation Training College) using the facility 5 days a week for the whole year moved out to another venue.

Detailed information on the revenue subsidies per centre and major grants to Leisure Services since 2005/06 will be provided to you in writing following this month's Council meeting.

CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE (COUNCILLOR GRAHAM HINCHEY) WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How much does the lowest paid person earn on Cardiff Council and how many times does that divide into the Chief Executive's salary, including the CEO's pension contribution?

Reply

The lowest pay rate we have in the Council is the Living Wage which equates to a ratio of 1:12. In 2012 the ratio was 1: 15.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Who holds ultimate responsibility for spending council tax payers money on partitions in county hall?

Reply

The Council's Facilities Management service holds the repairs and maintenance budget for County Hall, which is used to ensure that the building is safe, weather tight and warm. They also manage the asset renewal budget for non schools buildings, which is used for asset renewal works to the fabric of the buildings.

The budget for the refurbishment of the buildings is held as part of the Office Rationalisation Project and all spend from this budget has to be approved by the project board under the governance arrangements of the Council's Organisational Development Programme.

Directorates have also funded works directly from their revenue budgets, albeit this must be done in consultation with the other two aforementioned parties.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What are the pay packages, including pension for all grades of officer above £50,000 a year? Please specify the grades, the number of staff at those grades and the overall cost to the public purse.

Reply

Following a similar question you asked in relation to numbers, grades, etc for officers above £50,000 pa at Council in October 2014, please see the information provided below:

	EMPLOYEES			OVERALL COST (including on costs)		
GRADE	Council	Scho ol Post	Tota I	Council	School Post	Grand Total
JNCs Chief Exec and Chief Officer - Asst Dir &			00			
above	20		20	£2,887,816		£2,887,816
Leadership- Central Education	3		3	£278,644		£278,644
Leadership - Asst/Dep Headteacher		140	140		£10,421,136	£10,421,136
Leadership - Headteacher		119	119		£10,365,034	£10,365,034
OM1	32		32	£2,673,939		£2,673,939
OM2	35		35	£2,423,324		£2,423,324
Soulbury	10		10	£734,901		£734,901
Grand Total	100	259	359	£8,998,625	£20,786,171	£29,784,795

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What is the total bill, including pension contributions for the senior management team advertised on the Council website on 01-10-2014 and what was the total bill including pensions for the senior management team of the Council on 01-01-2012?

Reply

The total wage bill for the senior management team (including on costs of pension and NI) is as follows:-

October 2014 = £2.70m

January 2012 = £1.86m

Note: The figure for October 2014 includes reduction of 2.7% to take into account the Workforce Package reduction currently in place.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How much revenue would be generated by an increase of 1% in Council Tax in the financial year 2015?

Reply

An increase of 1% in council tax for 2015/16 would generate additional income of £1.351m.

However, it should be noted that, since responsibility for the Council Tax Reduction Scheme (CTRS) transferred to the Council in 2013/14, increases to council tax rates impact upon the level of support that the council pays under CTRS. Assuming a constant CTRS demand, a 1% increase in council tax would increase the level of support paid by 1%; a sum equivalent to £292,000 based on the 2014/15 budget.

After taking into account the impact on the CTRS budget, the net additional income to the Council from a 1% council tax increase is therefore £1.059m.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What equity was obtained in which companies as part of the Capital Cardiff Fund initiative 2008-12 and when were the shares sold, with reference to Written Question 20 in November 2014's Council?

Reply

In addition to the three subsidiary companies and one joint venture that the Council has an interest in, as set out in the Council's Statement of Accounts and in the answer provided to your Written Question in November, I can confirm that, between 2008 and 2012, the Capital Cardiff Fund also secured an equity stake in two companies: Medaphor Ltd and Q Chip Ltd.

In addition, since 2012, the Capital Cardiff Fund has also taken an equity stake in the following companies:

- The Electrode Company
- Microcosm games Ltd
- Time for Medicine Ltd
- Amateur Sports Channel
- Pwinty Ltd
- Object Matrix Ltd

No shares have been sold in any of the companies in which the Council has an equity investment as part of the Cardiff Capital Fund.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What's the total money paid in council tax bills by Cardiff County Council since 1st May 2012?

Reply

The total council tax received by the Authority between 1st May 2012 and 31st December 2014 was £360,811,729.

EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN AND FAMILIES (COUNCILLOR SUE LENT)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What percentage of children in care achieved 5 C grade GCSEs and above in 2013?

Reply

	Children educated in	achieving Level 2	Number (%) achieving Level 2 threshold inc Eng/Wel & Mat
2013	33	12 (36.4%)	2 (6.0%)

Twelve pupils achieved 5 GCSEs A*-C.

Two pupils achieved 5 GCSEs A*-C including English and Mathematics

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What percentage of children in care in Cardiff achieved less than 5 grade C GCSEs in 2013? Please note the number of children also.

Reply

19 of the 33 pupils (58%) achieved less than 5 grade C GCSEs.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What percentage of children in care in 2013 achieved no qualifications and how does it compare with the overall cohort?

Reply

All pupils in care in Year 11 in 2013 achieved at least one qualification.

EDUCATION AND SKILLS (COUNCILLOR JULIA MAGILL)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN

In his letter to Headteachers and Chairs of Governors, the Director of Education and Lifelong Learning has stated that school budgets for 2015/16 will increase by £1.204 million before consideration of any demographic pressures but that cost pressures will exceed the additional funding by £1.5 million. This effectively leaves schools with a significant cut in their budgets. How does the Council intend to maintain standards in schools when teaching places will be lost and resources reduced?

Reply

Following discussion at the School Budget Forum, the Director of Education and Lifelong Learning wrote out to all Headteachers and Chairs of Governing Bodies outlining the potential impact of the budget settlement for schools for the 2015/16 financial year. The timing and content of the letter has been welcomed by schools and has formed the basis of further discussions at the School Budget Forum, the strategic briefing for Chairs and, most recently, a city-wide Headteachers meeting.

I can confirm that the letter stated that the proposals in the current Budget Strategy was to increase school budgets by £3.573million, which equates to £2.369million above the protection figure of £1.204million set out by the Welsh Government. This is at a time when all other council services will be faced with significant reductions in their budgets.

Schools like all other public sector services will face additional cost pressures in the 2015/2016 financial year. The letter estimated that these may equate to £1.5million figure, which would represent 0.7% of the total delegated school budget (which is approximately £200million). The pressures are estimates as some may change depending on actions taken by schools – for example, the figure for SEN complex needs will be subject to decisions being taken by schools in this financial year.

The Council is facing a very difficult financial challenge and, whilst we have done as much as we can to soften the impact on school delegated budgets, it cannot avoid them completely.

The potential efficiencies in the schools budget of 0.7% needs to be viewed in the context of a number of council services that are facing potential reductions of up to 20% of their current budget.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What percentage of youth provision is spent on Welsh medium provision?

Reply

There are a number of organisations in Cardiff who offer youth and play provision through the medium of Welsh. The Council does not have access to the information needed to give a figure for the amount spent on this provision for the City as a whole. WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What is the total amount in all secondary schools bank account in Cardiff?

Reply

The total balances for Secondary Schools in Cardiff as of 31 March 2014 is £2.671million deficit.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What is the total amount in all primary schools bank account in Cardiff?

Reply

The total balances for Primary Schools in Cardiff as of 31 March 2014 was £2.358million surplus.

ENVIRONMENT (COUNCILLOR BOB DERBYSHIRE)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN

Can you please provide councillors with the details of the criteria that are being applied to the disposal of council owned surplus land and spaces which was mentioned at Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee in 2014, together with details of areas of land which have already been identified for disposal?

Reply

You may be aware that at the November meeting of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee I undertook to provide details of the methodology that has been used to undertake quality value assessments for parks and green spaces and clarify the proposed review process for potential land disposals. This information was forwarded to the Chair of the Committee following that meeting.

In terms of proposals for particular sites/areas of land, the Committee was advised that this information would be made available during the final quarter of 2014/15 and I underlined the Council's commitment to consult on any proposals.

I will ask officers to contact you directly to explain this approach and the related criteria in more detail.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

How many fines have been issued in each of the last twelve months for dog fouling?

Reply

A total of 38 fines have been issued for dog fouling offences in 2014 by Waste Officers and Park Rangers.

Jan-14	5
Feb-14	6
Mar-14	2
Apr-14	2
May-14	0
Jun-14	1
Jul-14	0
Aug-14	0
Sep-14	2
Oct-14	2
Nov-14	13
Dec-14	5

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR GRAHAM THOMAS

What is the street and pavement sweeping schedule including routes for the ward of Creigiau and St Fagans?

Reply

A Street Cleansing Team is scheduled to visit Creigiau and St Fagans once a week, usually on a Thursday. As part of its duties, the Team will empty all litter bins, litter pick the inhabited areas where required and report any fly tipping present in the Adopted Highway areas.

A Large Mechanical Sweeper is also scheduled to sweep the main commuter roads every couple of weeks.

Additionally, cleansing resources will be asked to attend an area within the ward if any urgent requests for cleansing type work are received.

If any particular areas are causing concern, please let me have details and I will arrange for an Officer to investigate.

HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING (COUNCILLOR SUSAN ELSMORE) WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

In relation to council employees who clean council owned communal courtyards at blocks of flats, sheltered accommodation etc, what product do they use to afford protection to those employees in relation to the removal of dog faeces?

Do employees use a product called "Screen" and if so is it proven to be effective against animal viruses or diseases?

If another product is used, please give details and confirm its effectiveness.

Reply

I can confirm that Caretaking Services Operatives used "Screen" as a cleaning product until recently when it was highlighted that it was effective for human viruses and diseases, but that there is no tested evidence of effectiveness against animal born viruses. Therefore, the use of this product was suspended with effect from 20th October 2014.

A review has been carried out in conjunction with health & safety officers and the risk assessment for this work has been updated, along with the method statement in relation to the safe removal of dog fouling.

In addition to the operatives' standard Personal Protection Equipment (i.e. gloves, boots, face masks), they have also been issued with equipment such as a 'pooper-scooper' tool. The dog faeces is then bagged and disposed of in general waste bins. This equipment is stored separately within work vehicles and cleaned with disinfectant or bleach.

SAFETY, ENGAGEMENT AND DEMOCRACY (COUNCILLOR DAN DE'ATH)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What have been the viewing figures each month for the webcast since its inception, or as far back as possible?

Reply

Full Council Meetings 2014	Total Hits	Live Webcast	Archive Webcast
27 November 2014	1385	679	706
23 October 2014	1884	650	1234
25 September 2014	1383	482	901
24 July 2014	1841	462	1379
26 June 2014	2120	849	1271

29 May 2014	898	42	856
17 April 2014	1344	208	1136
27 March 2014	1699	335	1364
27 February 2014	3139	634	2505
30 January 2014	1835	380	1455
	17,528	4,721	12,807
Full Council Meetings 2013	Total Hits	Live	Archive
		Webcast	Webcast
19 December 2013	1615	139	1476
21 November 2013	1930	122	1808
24 October 2013	1964	351	1613
26 September 2013	1987	254	1733
25 July 2013	1952	353	1599
27 June 2013	1814	347	1467
23 May 2013	1318	64	1254
25 April 2013	2085	273	1812
28 March 2013	2499	417	2082
28 February 2013 (*no live webcast)	2664	0*	2664
31 January 2013	2344	416	1928
	22,172	2,736	19,436
Full Council Meetings 2012	Total Hits	Live	Archive
		Webcast	Webcast
13 December 2012	3215	827	2388
22 November 2012	2028	422	1606
25 October 2012	1189	279	910
27 September 2012 (*no live webcast)	1113	0*	1113
19 July 2012	1333	104	1229
19 July 2012 21 June 2012	1333 973	104 53	1229 920
21 June 2012	973	53	920
21 June 2012 17 May 2012	973 1012	53 136	920 876
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012	973 1012 822	53 136 85 84 87	920 876 736
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012	973 1012 822 713	53 136 85 84	920 876 736 629
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012	973 1012 822 713 583	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011 15 December 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast 36	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast 477
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011 15 December 2011 17 November 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits 513 430	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast 36 66	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast 477 363
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011 15 December 2011 17 November 2011 20 October 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits 513 430 353	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast 36 66 47	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast 477 363 305
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011 15 December 2011 17 November 2011 20 October 2011 22 September 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits 513 430	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast 36 66 47 68	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast 477 363
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011 15 December 2011 17 November 2011 20 October 2011 22 September 2011 21 July 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits 513 430 353 391 425	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast 36 66 47	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast 477 363 305
21 June 2012 17 May 2012 22 March 2012 23 February 2012 26 January 2012 Full Council Meetings 2011 15 December 2011 17 November 2011 20 October 2011 22 September 2011	973 1012 822 713 583 12,981 Total Hits 513 430 353 391	53 136 85 84 87 2,077 Live Webcast 36 66 47 68	920 876 736 629 496 10,903 Archive Webcast 477 363 305 323

459

14 April 2011	333	41	292
24 March 2011	452	106	345
27 January 2011	416	127	289
-	4,108	701	3,404
Full Council Meetings 2010	Total Hits	Live Webcast	Archive Webcast
16 December 2010	208	30	177
18 November 2010	229	54	175
21 October 2010	238	41	197
23 September 2010	392	141	249
22 July 2010	423	63	360
17 June 2010	603	73	527
20 May 2010	312	32	280
22 April 2010	636	170	463
25 March 2010	591	151	434
25 February 2010	435	87	348
28 January 2010	394	35	359
	4,461	877	3,569
Full Council Meetings 2009	Total Hits	Live Webcast	Archive Webcast
17 December 2009	405	27	375
19 November 2009	412	63	349
22 October 2009	525	44	481
24 Sept 2009	398	27	370
16 July 2009	717	42	674
25 June 2009	471	57	414
14 May 2009	571	22	543
23 April 2009	424	63	361
19 March 2009	489	17	472
26 February 2009	644	62	582
22 January 2009	629	44	579
	5,685	468	5,200
Full Council Meetings 2008	Total Hits	Live Webcast	Archive Webcast
18 December 2008	569	43	526
20 November 2008	525	45	480
16 October 2008	765	74	690
25 September 2008	352	15	337
	2,211	177	2,033

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What is the level of seniority of the source of answers provided regarding ASBIT?

Reply

Answers to your previous questions in relation to ASBIT have been provided to you by the relevant Cabinet Member.

TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY (COUNCILLOR RAMESH PATEL)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

Now that Cardiff Council has the powers to enforce moving traffic offences, will you consider stationing a camera near to Allensbank Primary School to take action against motorists parking across the zig-zag lines, which is currently happening on a daily basis and causing a danger to pedestrians and pupils alike?

Reply

The Council is currently procuring a vehicle based enforcement camera that will be utilised outside schools. This vehicle is programmed to be operational at the end of February 2015. The Council will then commence enforcement outside as many schools as possible in due course following appropriate testing of the vehicle.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

How many vehicles registered outside the UK currently have Cardiff Council resident parking permits?

Reply

The resident parking permit process does not require applicants to provide information on vehicles apart from the vehicle registration and, therefore, the Council does not hold information as to vehicles registered outside the UK.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Could you provide details of all road relaying in Riverside 2010-present?

Reply

Please see below details of the road resurfacing and surface treatment works that have been undertaken in the Riverside ward since 2010, which applied to the full length of the road unless indicated otherwise:

Financial Year	Resurfacing	Reconstruction	Surface Treatment (micro asphalt)
2010-11	Teilo Street (part street)		
2011-12	Ninian Park Road (part street)		
2012-13	Cathedral Road (part street) Brook Street Bloom Street Kings Road		
2013-14	Cowbridge Road East (part street) Hadfield Road (part street) Meadow Street William Street		Conway Road Llanfair Road Beacon Street
2014-15 *(Please note not all work completed to date)	Cathedral Road (part street)	Sophia Walk (part street)	Severn Grove Turberville Place

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many square metres of land are earmarked for development in Cardiff's LDP?

Reply

The total land allocated for development in the Deposit LDP is approximately 10,188,500 square metres.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What is the level of charge for the community infrastructure levy on brown and greenfield sites?

Reply

Cardiff does not have a Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) in Place as the Regulations state that CIL can only be put in place alongside an up to date Development Plan. In advance of the adoption of the Local Development Plan, the Council has commenced preparation of CIL through a public consultation on a Preliminary Draft Charging Schedule which was concluded on 22 December 2014. The initial consultation proposed a CIL charge on all residential development of £100/sq.m and a charge of £250/sq.m on all retail development over minimum thresholds.

Following consideration of the evidence and responses received, the Council will prepare a Draft Charging schedule and have a further public consultation prior to submitting the proposed CIL to the Planning Inspectorate for independent Examination. Upon receipt of the Examiner's Report the Council will have the option to agree the recommendations and formally adopt a CIL for Cardiff. It is envisaged, subject to the adoption of the LDP, that Cardiff could be in a position to adopt a CIL in 2016.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What was the cost of the Director of Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transportation's letter to residents of Tangmere Drive and surrounding streets prior to the referendum trigger meeting in Fairwater in 2014?

Reply

The total cost of the mail shot to residents in Fairwater was £377.30.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How much section 106 money does Cardiff keep in savings?

Reply

Financial contributions are secured through S. 106 on the basis of direct impact of development on existing/proposed services, and the evidenced based need for additional funding to alleviate any negative impact.

As such, the Council does not keep any monies in savings, in the sense that it can only be used for the purposes specified in the legal agreement.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How much section 106 money is available in Cardiff?

Reply

The amount of S. 106 monies received at any one time varies, depending on the trigger dates for submission of the financial contributions of various sites. In addition, financial contributions received may not be immediately drawn down for spend, given the need to monitor the stage at which individual projects are progressed. As such, it is not possible to give a precise figure.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What liaison has taken place between the health board, the local NHS Trust and the Council concerning the increased demand which will be placed on the Heath Hospital due to LDP City expansion?

Reply

I can confirm that the Council has undertaken ongoing liaison with the Cardiff & Vale University Health Board (UHB), which is responsible for the management of the University Hospital of Wales, during the preparation of the LDP. The UHB is listed as a specific consultation body in the agreed LDP Delivery Agreement and has been consulted on the Plan at all preparation stages.

Preparation of the LDP commenced in 2010 and the Council has had ongoing dialogue during this time through the numerous consultation stages on the Plan and through the preparation of Health Impact Assessments on the Plan, which were undertaken at Preferred Strategy and Deposit Stage.

The Council has also had dialogue with relevant health-related bodies in the preparation of the Infrastructure Plan, which forms a supporting document to the LDP. This document sets out the infrastructure and funding necessary to deliver the growth strategy set out in the LDP. As part of this process, the UHB and the Council have set out a strategy to deliver primary and secondary healthcare facilities over the Plan period to support the level of growth proposed in the Plan.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many extra car journeys in Cardiff will be caused by the completion of Caerffili's LDP?

Reply

The potential impact of commuting trips from Caerphilly was accommodated into the work that was undertaken to develop Cardiff's LDP. A number of data sources were used to inform this process. As you will be aware, the Council's LDP is currently subject to examination.

The impact of commuting into Cardiff will be mitigated by joint working with Caerphilly and other regional partners in the Cardiff Capital Region, as part of a strategy to encourage regional commuting by sustainable transport in preference to car use.

Chairperson: _	
·	
Date:	